IS LONG-TERM ECOLOGICAL FUNCTIONING STABLE: THE CASE OF THE MARINE BENTHOS?

C.L.J. Frid* and B.A. Caswell

School of Environmental Sciences, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, L69
3GP, UK.

*Email: cljfrid@liverpool.ac.uk, Tel: +441517954382.

ABSTRACT

It is widely acknowledged that human activities are contributing to substantial biodiversity loss and that this threatens ecological processes underpinning human exploitation of 'ecosystem services' (defined by the Millennium Ecosystem Assessment as 'the benefits people obtain from ecosystems'). In the present study we consider three 'intermediate ecosystem services' in both contemporary and ancient marine systems and although 'ecosystem services' per se did not exist in the Jurassic our study seeks to consider the future provision of these services and so the term is retained. We consider the temporal patterns in benthic marine ecosystems: (1) spanning four decades at two offshore stations in the North Sea, UK; and (2) over millennial scales in Late Jurassic UK palaeocommunities. Biological traits analysis is used to link changes in taxonomic composition to variations in ecological functioning and the potential supply of three 'intermediate' ecosystem services: the ability to provide food to fish and other predators, benthic nutrient regeneration and carbon cycling. We examine whether changes in taxonomic composition drive temporal variation in functioning, whether this variation increases over time and the extent to which species turnover is comparable in contemporary and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29 ancient systems. Taxonomic variability was of a similar magnitude in all three
30 systems and there was evidence for changes in functioning linked to changes
31 in several (key or rivet) taxa. During other periods resilience maintained
32 functioning in the face of taxonomic change. These results suggest that in
33 these benthic systems the Biodiversity–Ecosystem Functioning relationship is
34 idiosyncratic, but a degree of temporal stability in functioning is maintained
35 such that the ecosystem services they underpin would also be stable during
36 decadal and longer-term changes.

37

38 **Key words:** Dove Time Series, ecosystem services, nutrient regeneration,
39 food supply; Jurassic; Kimmeridge Clay Formation; biological traits analysis;
40 long-term.

41 INTRODUCTION

42 Global biodiversity loss is one of the most marked changes that the biosphere
43 is experiencing in response to anthropogenic activities. Biodiversity loss has
44 been observed in terrestrial, freshwater and marine ecosystems and the IUCN
45 lists 22,103 species, of the 1.73 million species described, as being
46 ‘threatened’. The proportion of total global biodiversity that this represents has
47 not yet been accurately ascertained as only 4% of the total species described
48 have been evaluated (IUCN, 2014) and because true global biodiversity is
49 currently unknown (although it is estimated at ~19 million species).

50 Biodiversity loss is predicted to continue to increase (Cheung et al., 2009,
51 Perreira et al., 2010) for example, the bioclimate envelope models of Cheung
52 et al. (2009) predict a 60% turnover of marine biodiversity from present levels
53 by 2050. Biodiversity loss has severe impacts on the way that ecosystems

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54 function (e.g. Cardinale et al., 2012) and thus is often cited as a significant
55 threat to the delivery of the ecosystem services that underly human well-being
56 and livelihoods (United Nations, 2005). Marine ecosystems provide many
57 important ecosystem services such as providing ~15% of our dietary animal
58 protein, natural sea defences, waste treatment and recreational services and
59 high diversity systems consistently provide more ecosystem services with less
60 variability in delivery (Worm et al., 2006, Beaumont et al., 2007).

61
62 Most studies of the ecological functions, that underpin the delivery of
63 ecosystem services, are of short duration (<5 years) and small scale.
64 Research on small temporal and spatial scales may grossly underestimate the
65 affects of diversity loss on ecosystem functioning because diversity effects
66 increase in both time and space (Cardinale et al., 2012) therefore the results
67 of small scale short term studies cannot simply be scaled up and used to
68 inform management decisions (Worm et al., 2006). Understanding the
69 temporal patterns of ecosystem service delivery is important because it has
70 clear management implications when considering the recovery and restoration
71 of habitats that have been compromised by human activities (LaPeyre et al.,
72 2014). For example, La Peyre et al. (2014) followed variations in three
73 ecosystem functions of restored oyster reefs over four years, these functions
74 were: improving water quality, stabilising the shoreline and enhancing
75 estuarine habitat for fish and invertebrates. La Peyre et al. (2014) found that
76 each of the three ecological functions were delivered by the restored reefs but
77 restoration of functioning followed very different trajectories. There was no

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

78 simple relationship between the time since restoration and the recovery of
79 functioning and therefore ecosystem service provision by the oyster reefs.
80
81 The biological processes associated with sea floor ecosystems contribute to a
82 number of important ecological functions and in turn key ecosystem services,
83 including food production (fish and shellfish), genetic resources (including
84 pharmaceutically active compounds), climate regulation, natural hazard
85 protection, and maintenance of water and sediment quality (Beaumont et al.,
86 2007). It is becoming increasingly clear that biodiversity underpins a range of
87 critical ecosystem services and that changes in the composition and
88 abundance of species, genes and habitats can have effects ranging from
89 small scale (local) to major, cascading, impacts on global processes, such as
90 the biogeochemical cycles of nutrients and carbon (Naeem et al., 2012).
91 Understanding the effects of these biodiversity changes requires both the
92 classic reductionist experimental approaches to understanding the biodiversity
93 – ecosystem function relationships and large scale (temporal and spatial)
94 investigation of patterns of ecological and functional change (Raffaelli and
95 White, 2013).
96
97 While populations show spatial and temporal variability in their abundance
98 such that communities appear to undergo changes over time, if the net result
99 of these changes is that individuals of one taxa are substituted (in the simplest
100 terms) by those of another species with similar biological attributes the impact
101 of this species turnover on the functioning of the system may be small. This
102 extension of the ‘redundancy model’ of Biodiversity-Ecosystem Functioning

103 (BEF; Walker, 1992) leads us to propose the following hypotheses; (i)
104 ecosystem functioning will show less temporal variation than species
105 composition, and (ii) that longer time series will show greater variation in
106 functional composition than short time series. Furthermore, we can ask
107 whether the degree of species level change that does cause a change in
108 functioning is similar in contemporary communities to those in the deep past.
109 We examine these three assertions by drawing on two recent studies
110 (Caswell and Frid, 2013; Frid, 2011) that have considered the temporal
111 variations in ecosystem functioning to understand the potential of benthic
112 systems to deliver ecosystem services in the face of long-term variations in
113 the environment. We consider data for a contemporary shelf sea system in
114 which species composition is known to vary on decadal and inter-annual time
115 scales in response to varying food input, and a palaeocommunity from a shelf
116 sea ecosystem subject to fluctuating periods of deoxygenation. Gogina et al.
117 (2014) have shown that contemporary benthic systems subject to hypoxia
118 have reduced diversity and they hypothesised, but were unable to confirm that
119 this led to a decreased ability of the system to maintain functioning through
120 compensatory mechanisms. Here we consider derived measures of ecological
121 functioning and proxies for 'intermediate ecosystem services', where
122 intermediate services are benefits derived from the ecosystem but which are
123 not directly traded in a market (sensu Norris, 2012), so 'food for fish'
124 underpins the 'final' service of food (fish) production.

METHODS

Decadal Scale Change: The Dove Benthic time series

Three multi-decadal time-series are collected off the northeast coast of England in the central-west North Sea (Clark and Frid, 2001; Fig. 1a-b). Originally established by staff from the University of Newcastle's Dove Marine Laboratory, data collection continues using the same methods as when the time series commenced (Clark and Frid, 2001). One series considers mesozooplankton and is not considered further. The other series are of benthic macrofauna at two offshore stations located in areas away from local river discharges.

Station P (55° 07' N, 01° 15' W) lies 18.5 km off the northeast coast of England in 80 m water depth (Fig. 1a-b). The sediments at Station P are silty-sand with a greater than 50% silt-clay content, of which approximately 20% consists of faecal pellets. The benthic community at Station P is the *Brissopsis lyrifera*-*Amphiura chiajei* variant of the *Amphiura filiformis* community type (Petersen and Boysen-Jensen, 1911). The station was initially sampled in January 1971 and the dataset analysed here covers samples taken in January/February of each year from 1971 to 2006. In 1998 no samples were collected as the weather and operational constraints prevented sampling.

The second station M1 (55° 07' N, 01° 20' W) lies some 10.5 km off of the Northumberland coast (Fig. 1b). The station has a predominantly sandy sediment, with a 20% silt-clay content and lies in 55 m of water (Frid et al., 1996, Frid et al., 1999). Benthic sampling commenced in September 1972

151 and the dataset analysed here covers samples taken in March of each year
152 between September 1973 and 2005. No samples were collected, due to
153 weather or operational constraints, in March 1998.

154

155 On each sampling occasion at least five 0.1m² grab samples were collected,
156 and each was gently sieved over a 0.5 mm mesh and the residue fixed in 4%
157 buffered formalin. All organisms were identified to species level, where
158 possible and enumerated. Buchanan and Warwick (1974) and Buchanan and
159 Moore (1986) describe the methods of sampling in detail.

160

161 The macro-infaunal data are originally recorded to species or the lowest
162 practical taxon, but for this study the data were aggregated to genera (data at
163 lower taxonomic resolution remain unchanged) to give total abundance of
164 genera per 1 m² based on five (or more) replicate samples. This approach
165 reduced any problems due to misidentification at the species level and
166 changes in taxonomy leading to problems with homonyms. Genera richness
167 and total abundance of individuals are based on the entire 'genera
168 aggregated' data set.

169

170 For multivariate analyses of community composition the dataset was reduced
171 to make computation manageable and reduce any influence of very rare or
172 under-sampled taxa. For the more diverse M1 station, only those genera
173 representing more than 0.1% of the individuals recorded (i.e. more than 15
174 individuals found during the entire survey period) were included in these
175 analyses, leaving 89 genera in the ordination at M1. At station P the original

176 dataset included 262 taxa, which was reduced to 173 genera (or higher taxa)
177 all of which were included. For multivariate analyses of the community
178 composition the dataset was transformed ($\text{Log}(x+1)$) to reduce the influence
179 of common taxa.

180 ***Millennial Scale: The Kimmeridge Clay Formation Series***

181 The palaeocommunity data comprise the benthic species composition and
182 abundance data (number, expressed as percentage, per 0.2 m^3 of rock
183 sampled) collected by Wignall (1989, 1990) from coastal exposures of the
184 Kimmeridge Clay Formation (KCF), Kimmeridge, UK (Fig. 1a and c). Wignall
185 (1990) classified these data into 21 unique associations, hereafter refer to as
186 palaeocommunities. The 21 palaeocommunities spanned between 0.05 m–
187 24.4 m of vertical rock and had an average thickness of 0.90 m equivalent to
188 an average temporal duration of ~7000 years based on the cyclostratigraphic
189 timescale of Weedon et al. (2004).

190
191 The links between changes in the palaeoenvironment and benthic community
192 functioning were investigated using geochemical proxy data, measured from
193 bulk rock samples, collected from the KCF exposed on the coast (i.e. the
194 same facies as those from which the palaeontological data were collected)
195 and two nearby boreholes sections (Fig. 1a and c). The KCF represents the
196 longest period (~8 million years; Weedon et al., 2004) of organic carbon
197 accumulation during the Mesozoic (Jenkyns et al., 2002) although not the
198 most severe (cf. Caswell and Coe, 2013), and was deposited under
199 fluctuating levels of oxygenation (Pearce et al., 2010) that ranged from

hypoxic (low dissolved oxygen, 1-30% of saturation) to anoxic (the absence of oxygen) to euxinic (oxygen absent and toxic H₂S present).

Biological traits and ecosystem functioning

Biological traits analysis (BTA) replaces biological identities with a profile of biological traits, such as feeding mode, degree of locomotion, longevity etc. BTA has previously been shown to provide a sensitive measure of changes in the system (Charvet et al., 1998, Doleddec et al., 1999, Usseglio-Polatera et al., 2000a, Charvet et al., 2000). Each trait has a number of modalities associated with it, i.e. for feeding trait the modalities represented different feeding types. Each taxon in the database was scored for its affinity to each trait modality using a scale of 0 to 1 (0= no affinity to 1 = high affinity). Scores were given using the 'fuzzy scoring' method which allows the taxa to exhibit more than one modality for any given trait, but the total score per trait always had a value of one (Bremner et al., 2003).

For the Dove Benthic Series five trait categories (size, trophic role, burrow depth, bioturbation capacity, and longevity) (Table 1) were used. For each taxa identified, by SIMPER, as being a major contributor to the between period shifts in assemblage composition the biological traits profile was determined (Frid, 2011). Trait information was derived from the University of Liverpool's trait database (Frid et al. unpub.), the BIOTIC database maintained by the Marine Biological Association UK (<http://www.marlin.ac.uk/biotic/>) and by targeted literature searches to fill any gaps.

225 For the Kimmeridge Clay Formation eight biological traits were selected to
226 represent aspects of the organisms morphology, life habit, feeding patterns
227 and life histories (Table 2). Each trait comprised five modalities, except for
228 *sociability* that comprised only three (Table 2). This assignment was based on
229 published accounts of the palaeobiology of each species and information from
230 The Treatise of Invertebrate Palaeontology (Geological Society of America
231 Inc., 1953-2009), The Palaeobiology Database (<http://palaeodb.org>), and for
232 extant taxa the BIOTIC database (<http://www.marlin.ac.uk/biotic/>). When
233 information was not available at the species level data used were based on
234 accounts of other members of the genera or, more rarely, the family. When no
235 information on a particular trait was available for a taxon, zero values were
236 entered for each category and, therefore, the taxon did not contribute to the
237 trait weightings.

238
239 The frequency of each trait modality in the two datasets was calculated by
240 weighting the category scores by the abundance of each taxon exhibiting that
241 modality (Charvet et al., 1998). This resulted in a sample by trait table
242 showing the abundance of biological traits for each palaeocommunity/
243 assemblage over the interval studied.

244
245 The composition of the assemblage in terms of the abundance of each of the
246 trait modalities (Table 1, Table 2) present was analyzed for all the scored
247 traits by non-metric MDS and then for combinations of traits that mapped on
248 to the principle intermediate ecosystem services carbon cycling, provision of
249 food for fish and nutrient cycling/regeneration. The traits were deemed to be

1 250 associated with ecological functions (Frid et al., 2008), and the ecological
2 251 functions in turn were deemed to support intermediate ecosystem service
3
4 252 provision (Hussain et al., 2010). For example, ecological processes that
5
6
7 253 contribute to sediment turnover are assumed to underpin organic matter
8
9 254 breakdown and nutrient regeneration. The intermediate ecosystem service,
10
11 255 nutrient regeneration, in the modern ocean underpins our use of the seas as a
12
13 256 repository and treatment option for organic waste. High carbon cycling was
14
15
16 257 associated with small body size and thus short longevity, high value as a food
17
18 258 source for fish with a large body size, and a surface or shallow burrowing
19
20 259 habit whilst nutrient cycling/regeneration was indexed by high or moderate
21
22
23 260 bioturbation, deep burrowing and a deposit feeding habit.
24
25

26 261
27
28 262 Similarity between each pair of palaeocommunities was calculated using the
29
30 263 Bray-Curtis index (after a log (x+1) transformation of the abundance data to
31
32 264 reduce the influence of dominant species) and a dendrogram of similarity of
33
34 265 species composition of the palaeocommunities was produced. All multivariate
35
36 266 analyses were carried out using the statistical software PRIMER v. 6
37
38 267 (PRIMER-e, Plymouth, UK; Clarke and Warwick 1994) and univariate
39
40 268 comparisons were made using SPSS v. 20 (IBM, Ltd).
41
42
43
44
45

46 269 **RESULTS**

47
48 270 The species composition and ecology of the three systems has been
49
50 271 described extensively elsewhere (see Frid, 2011, Frid et al., 2009b, Frid et al.,
51
52 272 2009a and references therein) but the following summary is offered to provide
53
54 273 context for the subsequent analyses and their interpretation. A total of 516
55
56 274 taxa, from 327 genera, have been recorded at the Dove benthic station
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

275 M1(Frid et al., 2009b). The macro-infaunal assemblage may be considered a
 276 variant of the classical Petersen *Amphiura filiformis* benthic community
 277 (Petersen, 1913), except that it is often dominated by small-bodied
 278 polychaetes with *Prionospio fallax* (Söderström) being the top-ranked species
 279 in most years (Table 3; Frid et al., 1996). During the period 1973–2005, the
 280 total abundance of infauna at M1 in March, the seasonal low, averaged 380
 281 individuals per 0.1m⁻² (Table 3; range 104–720 per 0.1m⁻²) whilst genera
 282 richness ranged from 63–124 genera (with a mean of 94). Throughout the
 283 time-series the top ten genera, comprised four taxa of polychaete worms, one
 284 phoronid worm, four bivalve molluscs and one brittlestar and together
 285 accounted for approximately 43% of all the individuals observed (Table 3).
 286
 287 At the Dove benthic station P, the ten most abundant genera accounted for
 288 ~70% of the individuals present, and in total 173 genera (or higher taxa) were
 289 recorded (Table 3). The polychaete *Heteromastus* accounted for nearly 30%
 290 of all the individuals recorded in the time series, and over the 36 year period
 291 *Heteromastus* was the dominant taxon every year except between 1973 and
 292 1977 when the polychaete *Levinsenia* was dominant. Although polychaetes
 293 dominated the benthos, the top ten taxa also included nemerteans, an
 294 amphipod, a bivalve mollusc and an ophiuroid (Table 3).
 295
 296 The KCF assemblage included a total of 99 taxa, mostly true species, with
 297 taxa richness of individual assemblages varying between seven and 42. The
 298 dominant taxa were bivalve molluscs, followed by gastropods, and
 299 brachiopods (Table 4). The bivalves *Protocardia morinica*, *Isocyprina*

300 *minuscula* and *Corbulomima suprajuresnis* accounted for ~70% of all
 301 specimens found (Table 4) and together dominated 16 of the 21
 302 palaeocommunities. The species composition of two assemblages (E6 and
 303 E9) were highly distinct (Bray-Curtis similarity <5%) from each other and all
 304 the other samples and so were omitted from the cluster analysis and
 305 ordinations of the taxonomic composition because they were sufficiently
 306 distinct as to cause the remaining samples to ordinate in one tight cluster
 307 making it impossible to distinguish patterns.

308 ***Ecosystem functioning will show less temporal variation than species***
 309 ***composition***

310 The species composition at station M1 showed a high degree of consistency
 311 between years with successive years (i.e. 1972 to 1973) having a Bray-Curtis
 312 similarity of >80% (Fig. 2a). The exceptions to this pattern have been used to
 313 define periods of change in species composition and generally resulted in a
 314 shift to a 'new configuration' of species in the assemblage that persisted for a
 315 number of years before undergoing a further shift. These patterns were
 316 observable from both the pairwise similarities (Fig. 2a) and the non-Metric
 317 Multidimensional Scaling ordinations (nMDS; Fig. 3a). For the station M1
 318 samples collected in March there were four main taxonomic groups (with a
 319 Bray-Curtis similarity >77%; Figs 2a and 3a) these were 1973-1985, 1986-87,
 320 1988-1991, and 1992-2005. There were more minor shifts between 1997-
 321 1999 (1998 missing) and between 2002-2003 (Fig. 2a).

322

323 At station P Bray-Curtis similarity between successive years was generally
 324 >70% (Fig. 2c) except, as at M1, when the system under went a 'shift'
 325 suggesting that the composition of species in the assemblage was quasi-

326 stable for a number of years before undergoing a change to a new
 327 configuration of species. This pattern is visible from both the pairwise
 328 similarities (Fig. 2c) and the nMDS ordinations (Fig. 3c). At station P the
 329 'stable' periods with Bray-Curtis similarity > 69% (Fig. 2c and 3c were 1971-
 330 81 (plus 1987), 1982-1986, 1989-1991, 1992-1999 and 2000-2006 (1988 was
 331 an outlier).
 332
 333 At both station M1 and P the species composition of the macro-infaunal
 334 community exhibited periods of relatively high stability (Bray-Curtis similarity
 335 >~70%) in species composition that persisted for 4-14 years and then shifted
 336 to a different species composition. At station M1 the trait composition is more
 337 variable than the species composition with four groups being defined by a
 338 Bray-Curtis similarity of 70% (cf. 77% for taxonomy, Figs 2b and 3b) and with
 339 less congruency with the temporal separation of samples. At station P five
 340 groups of years (~65% similar, Fig. 2c) and a singleton with distinct taxonomic
 341 composition occur and for trait composition four groups and a singleton were
 342 identified (~75% similar, Fig. 2d). However, the temporal structure evident in
 343 the taxonomic clustering is not repeated in the trait composition based
 344 analysis (cf. Figs 2d and 3d). For example, the species composition at Station
 345 P was similar during 1982-86 (Figs 2a and 3a) whereas the trait composition
 346 for the same period differs (Figs 2b and 3b). The trait composition shows
 347 1982, 1984 and 1986 clustered together but 1983 and 1985 occurred in
 348 different clusters to each other and the other three years (cf. Figs 2c and 2d).
 349 Such patterns suggest that while changes in species composition were often
 350 minor, in terms of species abundance patterns, species changes often

351 resulted in certain trait modalities disappearing from or appearing in the
 352 assemblage.
 353
 354 The Bray-Curtis similarity in species composition between the 21 KCF
 355 palaeocommunities was lower than the similarity between the contemporary
 356 communities at stations M1 and P, from the successive years, and Bray-
 357 Curtis similarity was generally >60% between the KCF samples compared to
 358 ~70% in the two contemporary series. With the most extreme outliers (E6 and
 359 E9) excluded the palaeocommunities formed three distinct groups that were
 360 60% similar (A/E1, B1-B3; E2a and E5; B4, E2e, E4, and E7; and A1, E1a,
 361 E1b, E2b, E2c, E3 with E8 being an outlier; Fig. 2d), these groupings were
 362 less apparent in the nMDS ordination (Fig. 3d). The trait composition of the
 363 21 palaeocommunities (NB all palaeocommunities included) had a Bray-Curtis
 364 similarity of 45% and delimited three groups and two singletons (Fig. 2f). As
 365 was found for the contemporary communities the grouping of
 366 palaeocommunities by trait composition showed little similarity to that for the
 367 taxonomic composition. For example, the two extreme outliers in the
 368 taxonomic analysis (E6 and E9) ordinated in the largest cluster of trait
 369 composition (Fig. 3e-f) while palaeocommunities A1 and B5, which had been
 370 nested within groups in the taxonomic analysis, formed the singletons in the
 371 traits based analysis (Fig. 2e-f).
 372
 373 The main influence on the taxonomic composition of the two Dove time series
 374 appears to be temporal with shifts in community composition occurring at,
 375 approximately, decadal intervals with a major shift occurring in the late 1980's

at both sites (Figs 3a and c). In the KCF data the main effect on taxonomic composition is the separation of sites with high total organic carbon (TOC; E1a, E2d, E2e, E4, E5, E6 and E9), indicative of deoxygenation, from the remainder (Figs 3e–f). Ordinations of the biological traits composition for the Dove time series (Figs 3b, d and f) showed samples were spread in a band across the centre of the ordination space (suggesting a trend rather than step wise changes). In comparison the KCF trait composition of the palaeocommunities from the deoxygenated periods (as indexed by TOC) differed significantly from the others (Pair wise ANOSIM, $R = 0.449$, $p = 0.001$).

In all three data sets the degree of variation in taxonomic composition and trait composition was similar (Fig. 2). However, it is also apparent that the variation in trait composition was not simply a reflection of the changing taxonomic composition, as in each case the patterns observed from cluster analysis were distinct from each other (Figs 2 and 3).

Longer time series will show greater variation in functional composition than short-term series

In both of the Dove series the decadal scale shifts in taxonomic composition suggest that longer time series show greater total variation in taxonomic composition than shorter time series. However, the intermingling of samples from across the time periods in the ordinations of trait composition (Figs 3 b and d) points to the existence of a stabilising mechanism maintaining trait composition in the face of taxonomic change. For the KCF the relative distribution of palaeocommunities in taxonomic ordination space and trait

ordination space are distinct from each other, and both show a clear influence of deoxygenation (Figs 3 e and f; Caswell and Frid, 2013).

Is the degree of species level change that causes a change in functioning similar in contemporary and ancient benthic communities?

When considering the delivery of ecological functions, Dove station M1 showed the most variability in the amount of function delivered by the assemblage (Fig. 4a). This pattern is primarily driven by the inter-decadal patterns of total abundance: when there were more individuals in the community it delivered a greater amount of service. At Dove station P, the intermediate service ‘food for predators’ showed an increase in the latter part of the series, after the shifts in the late 1980’s (Fig. 4b), again associated with increased numbers of individuals of some taxa (Frid, 2011). However, the delivery of nutrient regeneration and carbon sequestration was remarkably consistent throughout the 33-35 years (Fig. 4b). This is also the case in the KCF where the delivery of the three intermediate ecosystem services varied little between the different levels of deoxygenation (Fig. 4c), in spite of large-scale changes in the taxonomic composition of the infauna.

DISCUSSION

The result of this study show that in two contemporary benthic time series and one ecologically comparable palaeoecological data set ‘background’ taxonomic turnover resulted in samples with a taxonomic composition that is ~70% similar. It is also clear that environmental drivers periodically caused larger scale changes in species composition (Caswell and Frid, 2013, Frid et al., 2009a, Frid et al., 2009b). Biological traits can be used to index the ecological functioning of assemblages and one might expect large-scale

changes in taxonomic composition to result in changes in trait composition and hence ecological functioning. Our data show that trait composition in the three data sets had comparable variability but critically the pattern of changes in trait composition did not match the changes in taxonomic composition. At times the trait composition, and hence ecological functioning, was maintained in the face of taxonomic changes, implying a degree of redundancy in the system. In other instances trait composition changed to a greater extent than taxonomic composition suggesting that 'key' taxa, i.e. those that were critical in supplying certain traits, changed. Thus, in both the long-term palaeoecological systems and the shorter (still multi-decadal) contemporary systems there is evidence of both ecological redundancy and the existence of key or rivet species (Walker, 1992, Cardinale et al., 2006, Cardinale et al., 2012).

Although fisheries during the 1980s were shown to have impacted the benthos at station P both of the Dove benthic stations show, approximately, decadal shifts in species composition (Fig. 3). However, these changes involve species turnover in the sub-dominant taxa (Frid et al., 2009a, Frid et al., 2009b) such that the distribution of biological traits in the assemblage does not change markedly (Frid, 2011; Fig. 2b and d). At station M1 the increase in total infaunal abundance and inter-annual variability (Frid et al., 2009b) in the late 1980s and 1990s drove an increase in the delivery of all three intermediate services (Fig. 4a). In contrast, changes in the total infaunal abundance at station P were much less marked (Frid et al., 2009a) and only resulted in changes in the delivery of one of the intermediate services (Fig.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

451 4b). This lack of separation in the ordination of traits and the overriding effect
452 of macro-infaunal abundance on the delivery of ecosystem services suggests
453 that over decadal scales the functioning of these communities and the types
454 of ecosystem service they could deliver is conserved although the quantity of
455 available service varied with inter-annual variations in infaunal abundance.
456 This inter-annual variation is driven to a large extent by the input of food
457 (Pearson and Rosenberg, 1986, Buchanan, 1993). So does this quasi-stability
458 extend beyond multi-decadal timeframes?
459
460 A recent study, of plant communities, also concluded that ecosystem
461 functioning did not vary greatly over multi-decadal time scales (Vellend et al.,
462 2013). Using a systematic review and meta-analysis of 168 published studies
463 with data from over 16,000 sites and Vellend et al. (2013) showed that plant
464 diversity change did not differ significantly from zero over periods of 5-260
465 years. Sites were as likely to experience an increase in plant diversity (mainly
466 through post-disturbance succession) as they were to undergo a decrease in
467 diversity (mainly driven by species invasions). Although the authors did not
468 directly assess functioning they asserted, on the basis of the diversity
469 changes, that functioning probably did not significantly vary either.
470
471 The processes of preservation in the KCF mean that the data for the KCF
472 includes a degree of 'time averaging' such that decadal scale changes in
473 species (relative) abundances are not discernible at this sampling resolution.
474 However, the dominant driver of change in these benthic assemblages is the
475 degree of oxygenation. The changes in environmental conditions, associated

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

476 with regional scale changes in oxygenation, caused a shift in the taxonomic
477 composition (Fig. 3e) of the benthos whereby only the most severe
478 deoxygenation (as indicated by high sedimentary TOC (>~3.8%)) resulted in
479 changes in the composition of the biological traits (Fig. 3f). These changes in
480 biological traits only produced changes in the delivery of the intermediate
481 service nutrient regeneration, presumably this is a reflection of the greater
482 abundance of infaunal/bioturbating taxa during oxic conditions in the surface
483 sediments (Wignall, 1990).

484
485 The analyses presented in this study depend on two assumptions, (1) that the
486 biological traits of a taxon can be used to infer its ecological role (functioning),
487 and (2) that these can be mapped on to 'intermediate ecosystem services'
488 (sensu Norris, 2012). In addition, for the KCF data we must assume that none
489 of the taxa responsible for a major (in terms of quantity or uniqueness)
490 contribution to ecosystem functioning have been so poorly preserved that they
491 do not feature in the fossil record (as either body or trace fossils). This does
492 not seem unreasonable considering that although some trace fossils are
493 reported sporadically in a few oxygenated intervals of the KCF (Wignall 1991)
494 they are rare (Oschmann, 1988, Wignall, 1990, Wignall, 1991) (Morgans-Bell
495 et al., 2001) and none are reported from the hypoxic strata (Oschmann 1988).

496
497 Biological traits analysis, and similar approaches, focus on functional groups
498 or specific sets of morphological or life history traits are routinely being used
499 to index ecological functioning in a range of ecosystems (Werner and Peacor,
500 2003, Usseglio-Polatera et al., 2000b, Kleyer et al., 2008, Bremner, 2008,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

501 Paganelli et al., 2012). Although these approaches are limited by the available
502 information on the biology of the taxa involved, and is more challenging for
503 offshore taxa than terrestrial (Webb, 2012), the traits approach allows us to
504 make a number of predictions about changes in relative functioning (and
505 hence intermediate ecosystem service delivery) even if we are not certain that
506 our current level of biological knowledge covers all of the ecological functions.

507

508 The biological assemblages present within the sea floor deliver a range of key
509 ecosystem services (Beaumont et al., 2007) and undergo temporal variations
510 on a range of scales that are driven by biotic (food supply) and abiotic
511 (climate, hypoxia) factors. Our analyses suggest that changes in macro-
512 infaunal abundance (which can vary by a factor of 7 or more over a decade;
513 Frid et al., 2009a) drives changes in the quantity of some intermediate
514 services. Furthermore, there is considerable stability in ecosystem functioning
515 and hence the types of service potentially being delivered and the quantity
516 delivered over time. These findings are preliminary and are of necessity
517 constrained by the available data and the assumptions required to link
518 taxonomic composition to ecosystem service delivery. However, if further
519 analyses of these and other data sets confirm the pattern established in the
520 present study, it will suggest that benthic ecosystem functioning conforms to
521 some broad patterns, such as 'evolving' into a configuration that maximises
522 the recycling of nutrients and 'efficient' food web structures, concepts that
523 would be recognised in the writings of the first generation of ecosystem
524 scientists back in the 1960s (Odum, 1969).

525

In this study we examined three hypotheses concerning the temporal stability of ecosystem functioning (i) *ecosystem functioning will show less temporal variation than species composition*; (ii) *longer time series will show greater variation in functional composition than shorter time (i.e. decadal) series*; and (iii) *the degree of species level change that causes a functional change will be similar in contemporary and ancient marine communities*. As ecosystem functions deliver the ecological goods and services that human societies derive from the natural world, understanding these three hypotheses may offer insights into the scale of the challenges that wide spread environmental changes may pose. It is generally believed that biodiversity confers stability and provides a level of insurance against losses in ecological function (Worm et al., 2006). Our results show that in both contemporary and ancient marine ecosystems the natural assemblages do contain ecological redundancy that can protect functioning in the face of species turnover. However, in all of the communities investigated there were also instances of small changes in taxonomic composition resulting in more significant changes in functioning (and hence the potential delivery of ecosystem services). This implies that in these benthic systems ‘idiosyncratic’ models (Pueyo et al., 2007) best describe the Biodiversity-Ecosystem Functioning relationship, representing a considerable challenge for managers attempting to predict and mitigate the impacts of anthropogenic environmental change.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The CLJF is greatly indebted to the late Jack Buchanan for starting the Dove benthic series and trusting him with its continuation. We acknowledge the financial support at various times of DEFRA, DETR, DOE, NERC,

Northumbria Water Plc and the Universities of Newcastle and Liverpool. We would also like to thank the master and crew of the RV *Bernicia* and RV *Princess Royal*, Angela Coe, Leonie Robinson, Peter Garwood, Matt Spencer, Robin Clark, Kirsty Nicholas, Kirsty Harwood, Julie Bremner and colleagues at the Dove Marine Laboratory. The manuscript was greatly improved as a result of advice from the editor and two referees, and we thank them for their assistance.

REFERENCES

- Beaumont, N. J., Austen, M. C., Atkins, J. P., Burdon, D., Degraer, S., Dentinho, T. P., and Deros, S. 2007. Identification, definition and quantification of goods and services provided by marine biodiversity: implications for the ecosystem approach. *Marine Pollution Bulletin*, 54: 253-265.
- Bremner, J. 2008. Species' traits and ecological functioning in marine conservation and management. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 366: 37-47.
- Bremner, J., Rogers, S. I., and Frid, C. L. J. 2003. Assessing functional diversity in marine benthic ecosystems: A comparison of approaches. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 254: 11-25.
- Buchanan, J. B. 1993. Evidence of Benthic Pelagic Coupling At a Station Off the Northumberland Coast. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 172: 1-10.
- Cardinale, B. J., Duffy, J. E., Gonzalez, A., Hooper, D. U., Perrings, C., Venail, P., Narwani, A., Mace, G. M., Tilman, D., Wardle, D. A., Kinzig, A. P., Daily, G. C., Loreau, M., Grace, J. B., Larigauderie, A., Srivastava, D. S., and Naeem, S. 2012. Biodiversity loss and its impact on humanity. *Nature*, 486: 59-67.
- Cardinale, B. J., Srivastava, D. S., Duffy, J. E., Wright, J. P., Downing, A. L., Sankaran, M., and Jouseau, C. 2006. Effects of biodiversity on the functioning of trophic groups and ecosystems. *Nature*, 443: 989-992.
- Caswell, B., and Coe, A. 2013. Primary productivity controls on opportunistic bivalves during Early Jurassic oceanic deoxygenation. *Geology*, 41: 1163-1166.
- Caswell, B. A., and Frid, C. L. J. 2013. Learning from the past: functional ecology of marine benthos during eight million years of aperiodic hypoxia, lessons from the Late Jurassic. *Oikos*, 122: 1687-1699.
- Charvet, S., Kosmala, A., and Statzner, B. 1998. Biomonitoring through biological traits of benthic macroinvertebrates: perspectives for a general tool in stream management. *Archiv Fur Hydrobiologie*, 142: 415-432.

- Charvet, S., Statzner, B., Usseglio-Polatera, P., and Dumont, B. 2000. Traits of benthic macroinvertebrates in semi-natural French streams: an initial application to biomonitoring in Europe. *Freshwater Biology*, 43: 277-296.
- Cheung, W. W. L., Lam, V. W. Y., Sarmiento, J. L., Kearney, K., Watson, R., and Pauly, D. 2009. Projecting global marine biodiversity impacts under climate change scenarios. *Fish and Fisheries*, 10: 235-251.
- Clark, R. A., and Frid, C. L. J. 2001. Long-term changes in the North Sea ecosystem. *Environmental Reviews*, 9: 131-187.
- Doledec, S., Statzner, B., and Bournard, M. 1999. Species traits for future biomonitoring across ecoregions: patterns along a human-impacted river. *Freshwater Biology*, 42: 737-758.
- Frid, C. L. J. 2011. Temporal variability in the benthos: Does the sea floor function differently over time? *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 400: 99-107.
- Frid, C. L. J., Buchanan, J. B., and Garwood, P. R. 1996. Variability and stability in benthos: Twenty-two years of monitoring off Northumberland. *Ices Journal of Marine Science*, 53: 978-980.
- Frid, C. L. J., Clark, R. A., and Hall, J. A. 1999. Long-term changes in the benthos on a heavily fished ground off the NE coast of England. *Marine Ecology-Progress Series*, 188: 13-20.
- Frid, C. L. J., Garwood, P. R., and Robinson, L. A. 2009a. The North Sea benthic system: a 36 year time-series. *Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom*, 89: 1-10.
- Frid, C. L. J., Garwood, P. R., and Robinson, L. A. 2009b. Observing change in a North Sea benthic system: A 33 year time series. *Journal of Marine Systems*, 77: 227-236.
- Frid, C. L. J., Paramor, O. A. L., Brockington, S., and Bremner, J. 2008. Incorporating ecological functioning into the designation and management of marine protected areas. *Hydrobiologia*, 606: 69-79.
- Geological Society of America Inc. 1953-2009. *Treatise on Invertebrate Paleontology: Part A-W*, Geological Society of America, Inc. and the University of Kansas Press Lawrence, Kansas.
- Gogina, M., Darr, A., and Zettler, M. L. 2014. Approach to assess consequences of hypoxia disturbance events for benthic ecosystem functioning. *Journal of Marine Systems*, 129: 203-213.
- Hussain, S. S., Winrow-Giffin, A., Moran, D., Robinson, L. A., Fofana, A., Paramor, O. A. L., and Frid, C. L. J. 2010. An ex ante ecological economic assessment of the benefits arising from marine protected areas designation in the UK. *Ecological Economics*, 69: 828-838.
- IUCN 2014. The IUCN red list of threatened species. International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources. URL: <http://www.iucnredlist.org/> (accessed: 12/08/14)). IUCN.
- Jenkyns, H. C., Jones, C. E., Grocke, D. R., Hesselbo, S. P., and Parkinson, D. N. 2002. Chemostratigraphy of the Jurassic system: applications, limitations and implications for palaeoceanography. *Journal of the Geological Society, London*, 159: 351-378.
- Kleyer, M., Bekker, R. M., Knevel, I. C., Bakker, J. P., Thompson, K., Sonnenschein, M., Poschlod, P., Van Groenendael, J. M., Klimeš, L., Klimešová, J., Klotz, S., Rusch, G. M., Hermy, M., Adriaens, D.,

- Boedeltje, G., Bossuyt, B., Dannemann, A., Endels, P., Götzenberger, L., Hodgson, J. G., Jackel, A.-K., Kühn, I., Kunzmann, D., Ozinga, W. A., Römermann, C., Stadler, M., Schlegelmilch, J., Steendam, H. J., Tackenberg, O., Wilmann, B., Cornelissen, J. H. C., Eriksson, O., Garnier, E., and Peco, B. 2008. The LEDA Traitbase: a database of life-history traits of the Northwest European flora. *Journal of Ecology*, 96: 1266–1274.
- LaPeyre, M. K., Humphries, A. T., Casas, a. M., and LaPeyre, J. F. 2014. Temporal variation in development of ecosystem services from oysterreef restoration. *Ecological Engineering*, 63: 34-44.
- Morgans-Bell, H. S., Coe, A. L., Hesselbo, S. P., Jenkyns, H. C., Weedon, G. P., Marshall, J. E. A., Tyson, R. V., and Williams, C. J. 2001. Integrated stratigraphy of the Kimmeridge Clay Formation (Upper Jurassic) based on exposures and boreholes in South Dorset, UK. *Geology Magazine*, 138: 511-539.
- Naeem, S., Duffy, J. E., and Zavaleta, E. 2012. The function of biodiversity in an age of extinction. *Science*, 336: 1401-1406.
- Norris, K. 2012. Biodiversity in the context of ecosystem services: the applied need for systems approaches. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences*, 367: 191-199.
- Odum, E. P. 1969. The strategy of ecosystem development: An understanding of ecological succession provides a basis for resolving man's conflict with nature. *Science*, 164: 262-270.
- Oschmann, W. 1988. Upper Kimmeridgian and Portlandian marine macrobenthic associations from southern England and northern France. *Facies*, 18: 49-82.
- Paganelli, D., Marchini, A., and Occhipinti-Ambrogi, A. 2012. Functional structure of marine benthic assemblages using Biological Traits Analysis (BTA): A study along the Emilia-Romagna coastline (Italy, North-West Adriatic Sea). *Estuarine Coastal and Shelf Science*, 96: 245-256.
- Pearce, C. R., Coe, A. L., and Cohen, A. S. 2010. Seawater redox variations during the deposition of the Kimmeridge Clay Formation, United Kingdom (Upper Jurassic): Evidence from molybdenum isotopes and trace metal ratios. *Paleoceanography*, 25:1-15.
- Pearson, T. H., and Rosenberg, R. 1986. Feast and Famine: Structuring factors in marine benthic communities. *In* *Organization of communities: past and present*, pp. 373-398. Edited by J. H. R. Gee, and P. S. Giller. Blackwell Scientific.
- Perreira, H. M., Leadley, P. W., Proença, V., Alkemade, R., Scharleman, J. P., Fernandez-Manjarrés, J. F., Chini, L., Cooper, D. H., Gilma, E. L., Guenette, S., Hurtt, G. C., Huntington, H. P., Mace, G. M., Oberdorff, T., Revenga, C., Rodrigues, P., Scholes, R. J., Sumaila, U. R., and Walpole, M. 2010. Scenarios for global biodiversity in the 21st century. *Science*, 330: 1496-1501.
- Petersen, C. G. J. 1913. Valuation of the sea. II. The animal communities of the sea bottom and their importance for marine zoogeography. Report of the Danish Biological Station, 21: 1-44.

- Petersen, C. G. J., and Boysen-Jensen, P. 1911. Valuation of the sea. Animal life of the sea bottom, its food and quantity. Report of the Danish Biological Station, 10: 1-76.
- Pueyo, S., He, F., and Zillio, T. 2007. The maximum entropy formalism and the idiosyncratic theory of biodiversity. *Ecology Letters*, 10: 1017-1028.
- Raffaelli, D., and White, P. C. L. 2013. Ecosystems and their services in a changing world: an ecological perspective. *Advances in Ecological Research*, 48: 1-70.
- United Nations. 2005. Millennium Assessment. Living beyond our means: natural assets and human well-being, UN.
- Usseglio-Polatera, P., Bournaud, M., Richoux, P., and Tachet, H. 2000a. Biological and ecological traits of benthic freshwater macroinvertebrates: relationships and definition of groups with similar traits. *Freshwater Biology*, 43: 175-205.
- Usseglio-Polatera, P., Bournaud, M., Richoux, P., and Tachet, H. 2000b. Biomonitoring through biological traits of benthic macroinvertebrates: how to use species trait databases? *Developments in Hydrobiology*, 149: 153-162.
- Vellend, M., Baeten, L., Myers-Smith, I. H., Elmendorf, S. C., Beauséjour, R., Brown, C. D., Frenne, P. D., Verheyenb, K., and Wipf, S. 2013. Global meta-analysis reveals no net change in local-scale plant biodiversity over time. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 110: 19456-19459.
- Walker, B. H. 1992. Biodiversity and Ecological Redundancy. *Conservation Biology*, 6: 18-23.
- Webb, T. J. 2012. Marine and terrestrial ecology: unifying concepts, revealing differences. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution*, 27: 535-541.
- Weedon, G. P., Coe, A. L., and Gallois, R. W. 2004. Cyclostratigraphy, orbital tuning and inferred productivity for the type Kimmeridge Clay (Late Jurassic), Southern England. *Journal of the Geological Society*, 161: 655-666.
- Werner, E. E., and Peacor, S. D. 2003. A review of trait-mediated indirect interactions in ecological communities. *Ecology*, 84: 1083-1100.
- Wignall, P. B. 1990. Benthic palaeoecology of the late Jurassic Kimmeridge Clay of England. *Special Papers in Palaeontology*, 43: 1-74.
- Wignall, P. B. 1991. Dysaerobic trace fossils and ichnofabrics in the Upper Jurassic Kimmeridge Clay of southern England. *Palaaios*, 6: 264-270.
- Worm, B., Barbier, E. B., Beaumont, N., Duffy, J. E., Folke, C., Halpern, B. S., Jackson, J. B. C., Lotze, H. K., Micheli, F., Palumbi, S. R., Sala, E., Selkoe, K. A., Stachowicz, J. J., and Watson, R. 2006. Impacts of Biodiversity Loss on Ocean Ecosystem Services. *Science*, 314: 787-790.

Figure 1. (a) Map of the UK showing location of the Dove stations offshore of the Tyne estuary, Newcastle and the village of Kimmeridge, Dorset, UK. (b) The location of the Dove benthic stations M1 and P in the central western North Sea. The dark shaped area is the extent of the main *Nephrops* fishing ground. (c) Location of the coastal exposure of the Kimmeridge Clay Formation type section; the positions of the Swanworth Quarry and Metherhills borehole (from which samples for the geochemical analyses were collected by Morgans-Bell et al. 2001).

Figure 2. Dendrograms showing Bray Curtis similarity of taxonomic composition (a, c and e) and biological trait composition (b, d and f) for Dove benthic station M1 (a and b; transformed data Log (X+1) for both), Dove benthic station P (c and d) and the Kimmeridge Clay Formation palaeocommunities (e and f; species composition data transformed Log (X+1)).

Figure 3. Non-metric multi-dimensional scaling ordinations of the Bray Curtis similarity of taxonomic composition (a, c and e) and biological trait composition (b, d and f) for Dove benthic station M1 (a and b; both transformed Log (X+1)), Dove benthic station P (c and d) and Kimmeridge Clay Formation palaeocommunities (e and f; species composition data transformed Log (X+1)). Kimmeridge Clay Formation palaeocommunities are grouped by the mean total organic carbon content of the sedimentary deposits. Note: E6 and E9 omitted from the taxonomic ordination for the Kimmeridge Clay Formation as the palaeocommunities were so dissimilar to the remaining stations that it obscured the detail for the remaining stations (see text for details of data sets).

Figure 4. Differences in the delivery (arbitrary units scaled with abundance; mean $\pm$ SE) of three ‘intermediate’ ecosystem services provided by benthic communities from (a) Dove Benthic station M1, (b) Dove Benthic station P and (c) palaeocommunities from the Kimmeridge Clay Formation (KCF; Late Jurassic). For the Dove series the data are presented by decade and for the KCF by degree of deoxygenation, as indexed by the total organic carbon (TOC) content where high TOC suggests deoxygenated and low TOC oxygenated conditions (see text for details).

Table 1. Traits and trait modalities used to classify the Dove benthic time series from stations M1 and P, North Sea, UK.

Trait	Modality
Body size	(1) Small (<10 mm), (2) Large (>10 mm)
Longevity	(1) 1–3 years, (2) >3 years
Bioturbation	(1) Low, (2) Moderate, (3) High
Life Zone	(1) Surface (Epibenthic), (2) Shallow infauna (<5 cm), (3) Deep infauna
Feeding Mode	(1) Deposit, (2) Filter, (3) Omnivore, (4) Carnivore

Table 2. Traits and trait modalities used to classify the 21 Kimmeridgian benthic palaeocommunities.

Trait	Modality
Organism body size	(1) <10 mm, (2) 10-50 mm, (3) 50-100 mm, (4) 100-200 mm, (5) >200 mm
Skeletal composition	(1) Chitin, (2) Aragonite, (3) Calcite (low Mg), (4) Calcite (high Mg), (5) Phosphate
Skeletal thickness	(1) <0.1 mm, (2) 0.1-0.5 mm, (3) 0.5-1 mm (4) 1-5 mm, (5) >5 mm
Adult movement	(1) Sessile, (2) Burrowing, (3) Crawling, (4) Swimming, (5) Gliding
Living habit	(1) Semi-shallow infaunal, (2) Mid-deep infaunal, (3) Epifaunal attached, (4) Epifaunal free living, (5) Borer
Feeding habit	(1) Deposit feeder, (2) Grazer, (3) Suspension/filter feeder, (4) Scavenger/carnivore, (5) Chemosymbiont
Sociability	(1) Solitary, (2) Gregarious, (3) Colonial
Reproductive method	(1) Asexual budding, (2) Planktotrophic larvae, (3) Lecithotrophic larvae, (4) Brood to larvae, (5) Brood to juvenile

Table 3. The mean abundance (per m⁻²) and percent contribution of the top ten ranked taxa to the total abundance of macro-infauna encountered during 33 years of sampling at benthic station M1, and 35 years at Dove station P, off the Northumberland coast, North Sea, UK.

Taxa		Mean no. individuals (m ⁻²)	Contribution to total abundance (%)
Dove station M1			
Polychaete	<i>Prionospio</i>	495.11	10.09%
Polychaete	<i>Levinsenia</i>	257.79	5.26%
Polychaete	<i>Chaetozone</i>	198.19	4.04%
Ophiuroid	<i>Amphiura</i>	193.54	3.95%
Bivalve	<i>Thyasira</i>	191.03	3.89%
Bivalve	<i>Abra</i>	186.98	3.81%
Isopod	<i>Mysella</i>	158.62	3.23%
Polychaete	<i>Phoronis</i>	153.67	3.13%
Polychaete	<i>Pholoe</i>	150.86	3.08%
Bivalve	<i>Nuculoma</i>	140.81	2.87%
Total		4906.64	43.35%
Dove station P			
Polychaete	<i>Heteromastus</i>	659.44	29.01
Polychaete	<i>Levinsenia</i>	208.09	9.15
Polychaete	<i>Prionospio</i>	151.11	6.65
Polychaete	<i>Chaetozone</i>	101.60	4.47
Polychaete	<i>Paramphinome</i>	97.77	4.30
Polychaete	<i>Ophelina</i>	90.21	3.97
Nemertean	<i>Nemertea</i> spp.	73.99	3.25
Amphipod	<i>Harpinia</i>	73.40	3.23
Bivalve	<i>Abra</i>	70.24	3.09
Ophiuroid	<i>Amphiura</i>	61.46	2.70
Total		1587.31	69.83

Table 4. The mean abundance and percent contribution of the top ten ranked taxa to the total abundance of macrofossils found throughout the 21 palaeocommunities of the Kimmeridge Clay Formation, Dorset, UK.

Taxa		Mean abundance per palaeocommunity	Contribution to total abundance (%)
Bivalve	<i>Protocardia morinica</i>	1134.87	30.57
Bivalve	<i>Isocyprina minuscula</i>	986.57	26.58
Bivalve	<i>Corbulomima supajurensis</i>	580.46	15.64
Bivalve	<i>Liostrea multififormis</i>	176.14	4.75
Bivalve	<i>Nicaniella extensa</i>	89.36	2.41
Gastropod	<i>Pseudorhytidopilus latissima</i>	73.07	1.97
Bivalve	<i>Grammatodon longipunctata</i>	65.62	1.77
Bivalve	<i>Nanogyra virgula</i>	60.93	1.64
Gastropod	<i>Quadrinervus ornatus</i>	59.09	1.59
Brachiopod	<i>Lingula ovalis</i>	44.93	1.21
Total		3271.03	88.12

Figure(s)

Fig. 1 Frid & Caswell

Figure(s)

Fig. 2. Frid and Caswell JSR

Figure(s)

Fig. 3 Frid and Caswell JSR

Fig. 4. Frid and Caswell JSR

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1:

This paper brings together established two benthic data sets, one decadal and one centuries to millennia, to explore the variation in biological traits over time. These traits are then linked to intermediate ecosystem services. The data sets are of excellent quality and the authors are experts in their fields having pioneered these ideas for several years now.

The paper is quite well written, though needs revision in several places. In particular, the Introduction is disjointed and the various threads needs to be better integrated so that the reader can more clearly see the flow and where the paper is heading. At present there is:

- a paragraph on a specific review (Velland et al) on plant biodiversity loss (which I haven't read, but seems to make a silly statement (line 40-45, of Intro of present paper about ecosystem functioning when traits don't seem to have been examined, only species richness);*
- a paragraph on changes in restored oyster reefs, the point of which was lost on me;*
- a paragraph which is a description of some marine ecosystem services;*
- a final paragraph stating the aims of the paper.*

I'm sure that now the authors have had time to reflect on the Introduction, they could write something a little more focused and meatier. At present, the paper could start at paragraph 4 with no loss.

We have redrafted the Introduction to take on board these comments and to provide a clear set of hypotheses.

The data are competently analysed and seem to show that whilst there is evidence that different years can be separated in an NMDS space, this is due more to changes in absolute abundance for the Northumberland stations, and also for the palaeo data, except for extreme de-oxygenation events. If I have miss-interpreted this, than I apologise, but it is likely that other readers will do likewise, and if so, some clarification will be required. Assuming my reading of the results is correct, I'm not sure what extra information the biological traits analysis provides, since these are species characteristic. If the species do not change significantly (see also point made below), then it is unlikely the traits will. Or am I missing something here? I would have been more impressed if the species turnover had been much larger and ecosystem functioning had been preserved in the face of that. Because of the lack of change in the communities, it is hard to be surprised at the conclusion: functioning hasn't changed.

Of course if species composition/abundances do not change then traits will not but if taxonomic composition DOES change, even if this is not 'significant' it is perfectly possible that the trait composition will change. In an extreme case, if one trait modality is only represented by one species and that species disappears, it may not effect the community composition unduly but it would affect the trait composition.

But therein lays the main point. What do the authors consider "significant" changes in community composition? The reader will be wondering: how much change in community composition would be required to significantly affect ecosystem functioning? If the authors could pose those questions, I think the manuscript would be much improved. At present I don't have any feel for whether the Northumberland system has really changed or not.

The original ms did not present the evidence in detail for the taxonomic changes in the series, particularly the Dove as these have been published on extensively and these papers were cited in the Introduction and Discussion. However, on reflection we agree that the argument developed is much clearer when restructured around the stated hypotheses and with a degree of revisiting of the taxonomic comparisons (all of which we have now done). These are now presented more fully and a new figure (Fig. 2) has been included to allow us to do this. So we take as the basis of the work the fact that there have been 'ecologically significant' (as well as ANOSIM 'significant') shifts in taxonomic composition and then examine the degree to which these are reflected in changes in trait composition (and by extension –

ecological functioning and potentially intermediate ecosystem services (for contemporary systems)).

Finally, in my copy of the paper downloaded from the Springer site, there were many lacunae in words in the later pages as well as question marks in the text which I suspect are not in the authors' original files and are probably a glitch that needs carefully checking. Also, my References section was repeated.

The uploaded file appears to be OK in terms of formatting,

Reviewer #2:

This paper reanalyses two time series benthic data sets, the contemporary Dove Benthic Series and the palaeo benthic community of the Kimmeridge Clay Formation (KCF) examining abundance data and benthic traits. It then attempts to map specific benthic traits as proxies for ecological function and hence of intermediate ecosystem services. This use of benthic traits as a proxy for function, and more so for services, is somewhat tenuous as the authors themselves more or less acknowledge in the main body of the text. However, the tenuous nature of the links is not acknowledged at all in the abstract, nor is the fact that the proxy is for intermediate services rather than final services which is extremely misleading: Abstract Page 2, lines 40-47, states: "Biological traits analysis is used to link changes in taxonomic composition to variation in ecological functioning and these are mapped to the supply of three ecosystem services - the ability to provide food to fish and other predators, nutrient regeneration and carbon cycling". These are at best intermediate or supporting services. Arguably they are simply ecological functions. Page 4 lines 2-10 even confirm that the authors realise that these are not even intermediate services and here they called them proxies. In the discussion on page 15 the authors indicate that by mapping biological traits to ecological role and then hence to intermediate services they have made very large and linked assumptions. I am not aware of any evidence that would validate or substantiate this approach. It would have given credibility to the approach if references had been provided to support it, even if they are terrestrial. This is a considerable weakness in the paper.

We have addressed the terminology issues, the use of 'intermediate services' is well recognized and we build a logical argument of biodiversity – functioning – intermediate services – final services. The analysis is really about biodiversity – functioning with a logical argument for how this would impact on the stability of supply of intermediate services. This is now made more explicit.

The paper is conceptually flawed given that it is half built around developing understanding of changing support for the provision of ecosystem services by late Jurassic benthic communities even though humans had not evolved then! Ecosystem services are, by definition, a human orientated construct so it seems totally artificial to refer to support for their provision by benthic communities. Unfortunately, I therefore do not believe that this re analysis of the data provides anything that is sufficiently well developed to recommend publication.

We obviously disagree. The approach is not flawed, we did not state that ecosystem service delivery changed in the Jurassic. We commented on the degree of changes in ecological functioning and discuss the potential, if this pattern holds in contemporary systems (and of course we also present two contemporary but shorter series), for this pattern of change to maintain ecosystem services. We recognize that this is speculative but it is about trying to learn important lessons from the deep past to understand the change in modern systems on time scales relevant to large scale environmental change i.e. climate change. We have redrafted the introduction, abstract and more extensively the Discussion to make this approach and it's speculative nature clearer.

Furthermore I was surprised that the paper was poorly written or edited in several places. For example, page2, lines 1-3 I think meant: Because functions/processes show temporal stability it is likely that the ecosystem services that they support were also stable in the face of

decadal and long term changes. The discussion section particularly would have benefited from good editing to improve the flow of ideas (for example page 15, line 7 sentence starting "In addition" would be better placed closer to a corresponding sentence at the end of the paragraph), grammar and typing errors (e.g. Page 14, line 12 and page 16, line 15).

We have thoroughly edited the discussion to improve the flow of ideas.

Methods section queries:

Page 9 in reference to lines 36-49, Why was such a small proportion of the genera found at M1 and P included (Figure 1).

We have included a fuller explanation of how the data were selected, treated and used in the Methods.

Page 10 line 42, What software was used for the MDS? No reference or detail given for statistical analysis approach.

We have now added text to the methods to describe the statistical analyses undertaken and the software used to do so.

Page 10 line 55, High carbon cycling does not necessarily imply support of carbon regulation, potentially the opposite.

Hopefully this is now clearer – we use carbon sequestration to refer to processes that might support carbon regulation and carbon cycling to refer the dynamics of the food web where carbon is moving around the system and producing productivity.

Page 12 line 19, What is Bray-Curtis <5%? Presumably this means Bray-Curtis dissimilarity?

This has now been clarified in the text.

Page 12, line 41,: It would have been helpful to provide a table of the TOC at each of the KCF assemblages or to indicate TOC levels using symbols on the MDS.

The TOC levels have now been incorporated into the MDS (Fig. 3).

Introduction

Page 4, line 57 onwards: 3 x show in one sentence!

Page 5, line 1: Delete comma. Change "lead" to "led".

Page 5, line 7: Change "form" to "from".

Methods

Page 6 line 30 + line 45: Insert "f" to read "five".

Page 10 line 52: Change "in turn supported to" to "in term were deemed to support".

We have addressed all the typo's and modifications identified by both reviewers.