**The Long-wavelength Mantle Structure and Dynamics and Their Implications for
Large-scale Tectonics and Volcanism in the Phanerozoic**

Shijie Zhong and Xi Liu

Department of Physics
University of Colorado
Boulder, Colorado 80309
USA

szhong@colorado.edu

Tel: 1-303-735-5095

Fax: 1-303-492-7935

Submitted to Gondwana Research

March 20, 2015

Revised on July 16, 2015

Abstract. The Earth's lower mantle structure, as revealed by seismic tomography studies, is best characterized by two large low seismic velocity provinces (i.e., LLSVP) beneath Africa and Pacific and their surrounding, circum-Pacific seismically fast anomalies. This mantle structure, sometimes called degree-2 structure, has been the most robust feature of all the seismic tomography models for the last 30 years. The dominantly degree-2 mantle structure explains the long-wavelength geoid anomalies including the geoid highs over Africa and Pacific. The LLSVPs are suggested to be the source regions for hotspot volcanism and large igneous province (LIP) events that are compositionally distinct from that for mid-ocean ridge basalts, thus holding the key to understanding mantle geochemistry. The degree-2 structure and LLSVPs have also been used as a reference frame to reconstruct paleogeography and true polar wander (TPW) history of the Earth for the Phanerozoic (i.e., for the last 500 Ma). This paper presents a comprehensive review of studies on the degree-2 mantle structure. While seismic tomography inversion and models are discussed, the main focus of the paper is on the dynamics of long-wavelength mantle convection, plate tectonics and large-scale volcanism. Important topics in the paper include: 1) the long-wavelength seismic structure for the present-day mantle, its possible relation to the long-wavelength geoid anomalies, volcanism and magmatism, and plate motion history, 2) the time evolution of the long-wavelength mantle structure in the Phanerozoic and its relations to Pangea assembly and breakup and history of volcanism/LIP events, and 3) the physics that controls the dynamics of long-wavelength mantle convection. The paper also provides a critical assessment on the validity of the hypothesis of spatially stationary Africa and Pacific LLSVPs since the early Paleozoic and its implications.

48	Contents
49	1. Introduction
50	2. Long-wavelength structure and dynamics of the present-day Earth's mantle
51	2.1. Seismic observations of the long-wavelength mantle structure
52	2.2. Long-wavelength mantle structure, geoid anomalies, and the style of mantle
53	convection
54	2.3. LLSVPs as large-scale chemical heterogeneities and the style of mantle
55	convection
56	2.4. Hotspot volcanism, mantle plumes and the LLSVPs
57	3. Dynamic models for long-wavelength mantle structure
58	3.1. Semi-dynamic models for seismic structures of the mantle
59	3.2. Fully dynamic models – numerical modeling results
60	3.3 A broad view on long-wavelength structure from fully dynamic models
61	4. Long-wavelength mantle structures in the geological past
62	4.1 Observational constraints and previous studies
63	4.2. A scenario with a spatially stable degree-2 mantle structure
64	4.3. A scenario with alternating degree-1 and degree-2 mantle structure
65	4.4. Are the stationary LLSVPs insensitive to surface plate motions?
66	5. Conclusion and future directions
67	Acknowledgement
68	References
69	
70	

1. Introduction

The first global seismic tomography model of the Earth's mantle was published about 30 years ago [Dziewonski, 1984; Woodhouse and Dziewonski, 1984] and it has profoundly shaped our understanding of the Earth's dynamics. The seismic model demonstrated that the Earth's lower mantle is characterized by two major seismically slow anomalies below Africa and Pacific that are surrounded by circum-Pacific seismically fast anomalies, i.e., a spherical harmonic degree-2 structure. This seismic imaging of the mantle has made it possible to integrate and understand a variety of observations including plate tectonics, long-wavelength gravity and topography anomalies, true polar wander, hotspot volcanism, and geochemical anomalies. It has also posed challenging questions to geodynamics regarding the origin and dynamics of such long-wavelength mantle structure. While the seismic structure represents a snapshot of the present-day Earth's mantle, recent studies have also started to explore time-evolution of mantle structure in Earth's geological history.

This paper presents a review of studies on long-wavelength mantle structure and its dynamics. This paper intends to address the following questions. What are the general characteristics of present-day's mantle structure as seen from seismic studies? What is the relationship between the long-wavelength, degree-2 mantle structure and hotspot volcanism and large igneous province events (LIP)? How is the long-wavelength mantle structure related to the positive gravity/geoid and residual topographic anomalies in the African and Pacific regions? What are the dynamic origins of and controls on the long-wavelength mantle structure? What are the possible scenarios of time evolution of mantle structure in the geological history? How can the time evolution of mantle structure be

constructed and constrained? The paper is divided into three main sections. The first section is on the present-day mantle structure as seen in seismic tomography studies and its implications for other geophysical and geological observations and for geodynamics. The second section is on convection models of long-wavelength mantle structure. The third section discusses possible scenarios of time-evolution of long-wavelength mantle structure in recent geological history (i.e., since the early Paleozoic for the last 500 Million years) and its implications for the geological observations.

2. Long-wavelength Structure and Dynamics of the Present-day Earth's Mantle

2.1. Seismic observations of the long-wavelength mantle structure

Dziewonski [1984] and Woodhouse and Dziewonski [1984], published about 30 years ago, are the two seminal papers on the three-dimensional (3-D) structures of the Earth's mantle. In Dziewonski [1984], P-wave travel time residual data from the International Seismological Center (ISC) bulletins were used to construct a 3-D P-wave model for the lower mantle. In Woodhouse and Dziewonski [1984], surface wave seismograms from International Deployment of Accelerometers (IDA) and Global Digital Seismograph Network (GDSN) were used in waveform modeling to construct a 3-D S-wave model for the upper mantle. These models had relatively low resolution due to the limited data available at the time. The upper mantle S-wave model was represented by spherical harmonic functions up to degree and order 8 in the azimuthal directions (i.e., a resolution of ~5000 km) and by cubic polynomials in depth (i.e., a resolution of ~200 km) [Woodhouse and Dziewonski, 1984]. The P-wave model for the lower mantle had up to degree and order 6 in spherical harmonics (i.e., a horizontal resolution of ~7000 km) and 4-th order Legendre functions in the radial direction (i.e., ~500 km resolution)

[Dziewonski, 1984]. Despite the coarse resolution, the upper mantle S-wave model showed clearly signatures of surface tectonic provinces: seismically fast anomalies in continental shields and slow anomalies beneath the mid-ocean ridges, which are consistent with early studies on regional scales [e.g., Brune and Dorman, 1963]. Distinct features of the P-wave model for the lower mantle include the circum-Pacific fast speed anomalies from a depth of 1000 km to the core-mantle boundary (CMB), and slow speed anomalies below Africa and Pacific near the CMB (i.e., a spherical harmonic degree-2 structure) [Dziewonski, 1984]. Although the upper mantle S-wave and lower mantle P-wave models employed entirely different techniques and data, the upper mantle and lower mantle structures showed some continuities from the upper to lower mantles [Woodhouse and Dziewonski, 1984].

Tanimoto [1990] constructed a 3-D global S-wave model for the whole mantle by using long-period body waves and surface waves, and the model was represented by 11 layers in the radial direction and spherical harmonics up to degree and order 6. The general characteristics of mantle structure in Tanimoto's model were consistent with those from Woodhouse and Dziewonski [1984] and Dziewonski [1984], for example, the association of mantle structure with surface tectonic settings. However, Tanimoto [1990] highlighted the predominance of the degree-2 structure throughout the mantle, although the power of seismic anomalies was relatively small in the mid-mantle, compared with that at shallow depths and near the CMB. The degree-2 lower mantle structure in the S-wave model in Tanimoto [1990] was similar to that revealed in the P-wave model in Dziewonski [1984]. The degree-2 structure was also found to exist in the transition zone in a study of Earth's free oscillations and overtones [Masters et al., 1982]. Remarkably,

such a degree-2 mantle structure and its dominance in the mantle have been one of the most robust features in all the subsequent seismic tomography models that have employed larger datasets, higher resolutions and more advanced techniques [Su et al., 1994; Su and Dziewonski, 1997; Li and Romanowicz, 1996; van der Hilst et al., 1997; Masters et al., 2000; Ritsema et al., 1999, 2011; Grand, 2002; Grand et al., 1997; Montelli et al., 2004; Zhao, 2004; Panning and Romanowicz, 2006; Houser et al., 2008]. This dominantly degree-2 mantle structure and its depth-dependent spectra are shown in Figure 1a-c from a recent high-resolution S-wave model [Ritsema et al., 2011].

Although this paper focuses on the long-wavelength (e.g., degree-2) mantle structure, it is helpful to discuss briefly some general characteristics of the seismic models. More thorough reviews can be found in Thurber and Ritsema [2007], Romanowicz [2003] and Garnero [2000]. Three different inversion approaches have been used, and they are to invert separately for P-wave and S-wave speed models [e.g., Dziewonski, 1984; Tanimoto, 1990] and jointly for S-wave, P-wave or bulk-sound speed models [e.g., Su and Dziewonski, 1997; Masters et al., 2000; Houser et al., 2008]. These models have been parameterized using either mathematical basis functions (e.g., spherical harmonic functions or polynomials) [e.g., Dziewonski, 1984] or cells [e.g., Grand, 2002]. The most recent high resolution S-wave model used spherical harmonics up to degree and order 40 (~1000 km horizontal resolution) [Ritsema et al., 2011] or cells with horizontal spacing of ~300 km [e.g., Grand, 2002; Houser et al., 2008], and had vertical resolution of ~150 km. Some recent P-wave models were parameterized in cells with horizontal spacing as small as ~100 km [Fukao and Obayashi, 2013].

The P-wave models, similar to Dziewonski [1977, 1984], were constructed using the ISC and also hand-picked travel time data for direct arrivals, reflected phases and differential phases (e.g., P and PP). Due to the large number of data (e.g., ~10 million travel times in Fukao and Obayashi [2013]), the P-wave models tend to have high spatial resolution in well-sampled regions of the mantle, such as subduction zones, thus providing insights into associated physical processes such as subduction dynamics [e.g., van der Hilst et al., 1997; Zhou, 1996; Zhao, 2004]. For example, some P-wave models suggest that subducted slabs might have stalled at least temporarily in the upper mantle or around ~1000 km depths [Fukao et al., 2001; Fukao and Obayashi, 2013], although some other slabs extend to the CMB [e.g., Grand, 2002; van der Hilst et al., 1997].

The S-wave models often use long-period waveforms, in addition to travel times. The S-wave models have better resolution in oceanic upper mantle due to the sampling power of surface waves and in relatively hot or seismically slow regions of the mantle due to the high sensitivity of S-wave to temperature variations than the P-wave models [e.g., Romanowicz, 2003]. For example, the S-wave models for the upper mantle clearly showed the thickening of oceanic lithosphere with distance from the mid-ocean ridges, thus helping illuminate dynamic processes affecting the evolution of oceanic lithosphere [e.g., Ritzwoller et al., 2004; Goes et al., 2013]. The two major seismically slow anomalies in the bottom 100's of kilometers of the mantle beneath Africa and Pacific (i.e., now often called as the large low shear wave velocity provinces or LLSVP) (Figure 1a), as the most important part of the degree-2 structure, are best seen in the S-wave models [e.g., Tanimoto, 1990; Su et al., 1994], although they were first reported in the P-wave model [Dziewonski, 1984]. It should be pointed out that although different S-wave

models show similar morphology for the LLSVPs, the detail may still differ significantly [e.g., Becker and Boschi, 2002; Masters et al., 2000; Panning and Romanowicz, 2006; Ritsema et al., 2009, 2011; Houser et al., 2008]. The S-wave and bulk sound speed models from joint inversions will be discussed in a later section on possible large-scale chemical heterogeneities in the lower mantle.

2.2. Long-wavelength mantle structure, geoid anomalies, and the style of mantle convection.

The 3-D seismic models have not only applications in seismology (e.g., more accurately locating earthquakes and predicting seismic wave propagation) but also implications for geodynamics. Generally speaking, mantle materials of the same composition with a slower seismic speed would have a higher temperature and a smaller density. Therefore, 3-D seismic structures of the mantle are expected to have implications for buoyancy and temperature fields in the mantle, hence the flow in the mantle and the gravity anomalies and volcanism at the Earth's surface. The 3-D seismic models also have implications for compositional structure of the mantle and the style of mantle convection (i.e., the whole mantle versus layered mantle convection).

There had been two competing models of the mantle as the global seismic models were being constructed in 1980's: the whole mantle convection and layered mantle convection (Fig. 2a-b) [e.g., Davies, 1984]. The layered mantle convection model was mainly based on geochemical evidence such as isotopic difference between oceanic island basalts (OIB) and mid-ocean ridge basalts (MORB) [e.g., Hoffmann, 1997], and the model stated that mantle convection would happen separately in the upper and lower mantles with insignificant mass exchange between them (Fig. 2b). In the whole mantle

convection model, on the other hand, the upper and lower mantles form a single convective system with no significant barrier to flow in between (Fig. 2a). Seismic tomography models constructed in 1980's and the early 1990's provided strong support for the whole mantle convection [e.g., Davies and Richards, 1992]. It was recognized that the circum-Pacific seismically fast anomalies in the lower mantle were closely associated with the past subduction zones [Diezwonski, 1984; Su and Diezwonski, 1994; Tanimoto, 1990]. High-resolution seismic models showed that subducted slabs extend to the lower mantle [e.g., van der Hilst et al., 1991; Grand, 1994; Grand et al., 1997], although as pointed out earlier, some recent studies suggested a rather complicated dynamics as the slabs descend to the CMB [Fukao and Obayashi, 2013]. More discussions on this classic debate of the whole mantle convection versus layered mantle convection can be found in Davies [1999].

The early studies on 3-D global seismic models made attempts to explain the Earth's long-wavelength gravity/geoid anomalies [Diezwonski et al., 1977; Masters et al., 1982; Diezwonski, 1984]. The geoid anomalies (i.e., the non-hydrostatic components of the gravitational potential anomalies) are predominated by their long-wavelength components with the degree-2 geoid that accounts for >50% of the total geoid power (Fig. 3a) (e.g., Lerch et al., 1983). The degree-2 geoid anomalies consist of equatorial positive geoid anomalies (i.e., degree $l=2$ and order $m=0$) and the two broad positive geoid anomalies over the Pacific and Africa (i.e., $l=2$ and $m=2$). The positive geoid anomalies correlate well with the two seismically slow anomalies beneath the Pacific and Africa in the lower mantle (i.e., LLSVPs) (Fig. 1) [e.g., Diezwonski, 1984; Su and Diezwonski, 1994; Tanimoto, 1990; Ritsema et al., 2011]. Hager et al. [1985] showed

that the long-wavelength geoid anomalies could be explained in a whole mantle convection model with buoyancy force derived from the global seismic model [Diezwonski, 1984]. In deriving buoyancy from seismic anomalies, a simple scaling relation is often assumed for a mantle with the same composition (i.e., the whole mantle convection), for example for S-wave model V_s , $\delta\rho/\rho=c\delta V_s/V_s$, where ρ is the density, and c is a conversion factor [Karato, 1993]. In determining the geoid anomalies, such mantle flow models considered dynamic compensation effects of the mantle buoyancy at the surface and CMB, i.e., dynamic topography [Richards and Hager, 1984; Ricard et al., 1984]. Since the dynamic compensation depends on mantle viscosity structure, the geoid anomalies have been used to constrain the lower mantle to be about two orders of magnitude more viscous than the upper mantle [e.g., Hager and Richards, 1989; Ricard et al., 1993]. Besides explaining the long wavelength geoid, the dynamic models also predicted ~1 km dynamic topography highs in the central Pacific and Africa above the two LLSVPs, which is consistent with the inferred residual topography highs in these regions [e.g., Davies and Pribac, 1993; Nyblade and Robinson, 1994; Lithgow-Bertelloni and Silver, 1998]. The success of the dynamic geoid models provided further support for the whole mantle convection [Hager and Richards, 1989].

2.3. LLSVPs as large-scale chemical heterogeneities and the style of mantle convection.

By the mid-1990's, with the clear association of seismically imaged fast speed anomalies in the lower mantle with subduction zones at the surface and the success of the dynamic flow models for the geoid, the whole mantle convection at least on the large scale had become widely accepted in geodynamics [e.g., Davies and Richards, 1992].

However, it remained unclear how the whole mantle convection could be reconciled with some of the geochemical observations. For example, the isotopic difference between OIB and MORB may require different, isolated source regions or reservoirs in the mantle, and the reservoir for OIB may represent enriched and possibly primitive mantle [e.g., Hoffmann, 1997]. The concentration of ^{40}Ar in the Earth's atmosphere may imply that only some fraction of the mantle has been processed or molten by the tectonic and volcanic processes [e.g., Allegre et al., 1983, 1996]. The whole mantle convection, if operating for the entire history of the Earth, would have homogenized and processed the whole mantle, thus making it difficult to account for the geochemical observations [van Keken and Ballentine, 1999].

Kellogg et al. [1999] proposed a new layered-mantle model attempting to reconcile the seismic and geochemical observations (Fig. 2c). The model was partly motivated by the apparent disappearance or weakening of fast P-wave anomalies (i.e., subducted slab signals) at a depth of ~ 1700 km [Karason and van der Hilst 1999]. Although the bottom layer (i.e., for the more primitive and less processed mantle) in Kellogg et al.'s model had a smaller volume than that in the conventional layered mantle model, it might still be sufficient to explain the geochemical observations in mass balance calculations. In this model, the intrinsic density increase across the compositional boundary was relatively small such that the boundary would have 100's km topography (Fig. 2c), making it difficult to be detected seismically [Kellogg et al., 1999]. Although seismic studies searching for such a layered mantle structure did not produce any confirmation [e.g., Castle and van der Hilst, 2003], Kellogg et al.'s model inspired new lines of thinking for the structure and dynamics of the mantle.

In the late 1990's and early 2000's, a number of seismic studies indicated that the LLSVPs in the bottom 400 km of the lower mantle might be compositionally distinct from the rest of the mantle [e.g., Masters et al., 2000; Wen et al., 2001]. The joint inversion studies for P-, S- and bulk sound speeds showed that S-wave and bulk sound speed anomalies were anti-correlated in the African and Pacific LLSVPs [Su and Diezwonski, 1997; Kennett et al., 1999; Masters et al., 2000]. This anti-correlation was suggested to result from compositional difference between the LLSVPs and the ambient mantle [Masters et al., 2000]. A normal mode study suggested that the density in the LLSVPs might be higher than the ambient mantle [Ishii and Tromp, 1999], although the uniqueness of this result was challenged [Resovsky and Ritzwoller, 1999]. Waveform studies for seismic waves grazing along the edges of the African LLSVP found that the seismic wave speeds might vary too rapidly (e.g., ~3% over 50 km distance) there to be explained by thermal anomalies alone, suggesting a compositional difference between the LLSVP and the ambient mantle [Wen et al., 2001; Ni et al., 2002; Wang and Wen, 2004]. Similar inferences were made for the Pacific LLSVP, although the Pacific LLSVP may be more heterogeneous than the African LLSVP [He and Wen, 2010; 2013].

It is important to point out that the CMB region (i.e., the D'' region) is rather complicated based on seismic and mineral physics studies (see Garnero and McNamara [2008] for a review). It has been proposed that in addition to the possibly chemically distinct African and Pacific LLSVPs, there are two other seismically distinct features. First, an endothermic phase change of perovskite to post-perovskite exists ~300 km above the CMB in mostly seismically fast regions (i.e., underneath the circum-Pacific subduction) [Sidorin et al., 1999; Murakami et al., 2004; Lay and Garnero, 2007] and

causes a sharp seismic discontinuity [Lay and Helmberger, 1983]. Second, ultra-low velocity zones (ULVZ) with a thickness of tens of kilometers exist as isolated patches immediately above the core and mostly below the LLSVPs [Lay et al., 1998; Garnero, 2000; Garnero and McNamara, 2008]. The ULVZ must be chemically distinct and may be associated with partial melting or enriched in Fe [Garnero and McNamara, 2008]. However, this paper's emphasis is on the large-scale feature of the LLSVPs, and the detail discussions on the ULVZ and perovskite to post-perovskite phase change can be found in Garnero and McNamara [2008].

Therefore, a new thermochemical mantle model as a revision from Kellogg et al. [1999] would have the Pacific and African LLSVPs as chemically distinct, heavy reservoirs or thermochemical piles (Fig. 2d) [e.g., McNamara and Zhong, 2005; Boyet and Carlson, 2005; Garnero and McNamara, 2008]. The volume of the LLSVPs was estimated to be ~2% of the mantle [He and Wen, 2010; Hernlund and Houser, 2008]. Many questions remain unanswered about this model, including the origin of the chemical heterogeneities (i.e., the LLSVPs) and how the model accounts for geochemical observations. For example, are the LLSVPs the residue of early Earth differentiation processes (e.g., a basal magma ocean [Labrosse et al., 2007] or overturn of cumulates following solidification of shallow magma ocean cumulates [Boyet and Carlson, 2005]) or the recycled oceanic crust [Christensen and Hofmann, 1994; Li et al., 2014; Nakagawa and Tackley, 2014]? With the small volume and mass for the LLSVPs, would this model adequately account for the geochemical observations of the difference between OIB and MORB and other noble gases [Hofmann, 1997; Tucker et al., 2012; Gonnermann and Mukhopadhyay, 2009]?

Finally, it should be pointed out that some studies have indicated that the classic, isochemical whole-mantle convection model, if considering the perovskite to post-perovskite phase change and mantle sub-adiabaticity, may account for all the seismic observations including the anti-correlation between the shear wave and bulk sound speed anomalies with no need for large-scale chemical heterogeneities [e.g., Bunge, 2005; Bunge et al., 2001; Davies et al., 2012; Schuberth et al., 2009, 2012]. For example, Schubert et al., [2009] suggested that isochemical whole-mantle convection models could produce large horizontal gradient in shear wave speeds immediately above the CMB at 2800 km depth that might explain the seismic observations of the African LLSVP [Ni et al., 2002; Wen et al., 2001]. However, it should be pointed that the large horizontal gradient associated with the African seismic anomalies occurs at much shallower depths (~2000-2400 km) [Ni et al., 2002; Wen et al., 2001] where isochemical whole-mantle convection models seem to produce much smaller horizontal variations [Schubert et al., 2009]. Nevertheless, it remains an important subject of studies to determine to what extent the LLSVPs are chemically heterogeneous.

2.4. Hotspot volcanism, mantle plumes and the LLSVPs.

Hotspot volcanism has had a unique global significance in geodynamics [e.g., Davies, 1999]. Hotspot tracks and volcanism ages have helped constrain global plate motion and provide a reference frame for plate motions [e.g., Gordon and Jurdy, 1986]. The sources for hotspot volcanism appear relatively stationary with respect to each other and are often thought to be mantle plumes that ascend from the deep mantle and possibly the CMB region [Morgan, 1971]. The plume model helps explain the formation of not only hotspot volcanism but also large igneous provinces (LIP) [e.g., Campbell and

Griffiths, 1990; Richards et al., 1991; Hill et al., 1992]. Topographic swells associated with hotspots have also been used to constrain buoyancy flux and heat flux of mantle plumes that are interpreted as a measure of heat flux out of the core [Davies, 1988a; Sleep, 1990].

Chase [1979] noticed that the hotspots were preferentially located in regions with long-wavelength positive geoid (e.g., the central Pacific and African regions) (Fig. 3a and 3b). Anderson [1982] proposed that the upper mantle in the central Pacific and Africa might be relatively hot due to supercontinent Pangea's insulation effect, and the hot mantle would produce the positive geoid anomalies and hotspot volcanism at the surface. The global seismic models [e.g., Diezwonski, 1984; Ritseman et al., 2011] showed that the mantle beneath Africa and Pacific is indeed seismically slow and likely hot, but mainly at large depths in the lower mantle (i.e., the LLSVPs), not as much in the upper mantle as proposed by Anderson [1982]. In their dynamic geoid models, Hager et al. [1985] demonstrated that such lower mantle buoyancy structures were critical to produce the positive dynamic topography and geoid at the surface and broad mantle upwellings in the central Pacific and Africa. Therefore, Hager et al. [1985] suggested that the hotspot volcanism might be related to the African and Pacific LLSVPs (Fig. 3b). It should also be noted that Anderson [1982] proposed that the true polar wander (TPW), by aligning the maximum moment of inertia axis with the spin axis, would play a role in causing the geoid highs and hotspots near the equator.

However, due to the small radius and transient dynamics of mantle plumes [e.g., Campbell and Griffiths, 1990; Zhong et al., 2000a; Lithgow-Bertelloni et al., 2001], it is challenging to image the plumes in seismic studies [e.g., Wolfe et al., 2010; Montelli et

al., 2004]. This makes it difficult to examine any possible relation between hotspot volcanism and deep mantle processes and structures including the LLSVPs [Courtillot et al., 2003]. However, some interesting spatial correlations between hotspots/LIPs and the LLSVPs have been noticed [Davaille, 1999; Jellinek and Manga, 2004]. Thorne et al. [2004] suggested that hotspots, if projected vertically down into the D'' regions, tended to occur in regions where seismic speeds vary more rapidly in the LLSVPs. Torsvik et al. [2006; 2010] proposed that after being restored to their original eruption sites using plate motion history models, the LIPs of the last ~300 Myrs would appear to occur mostly along the edges of the LLSVPs as defined by -1% contour level in an averaged S-wave model, S_{mean} [Becker and Boschi, 2002] (Fig. 3b). However, the statistical significance of the correlation of LIPs with the edges of the LLSVPs has been questioned [Davies et al., 2014; Austermann et al., 2014].

Although the spatial correlation of hotspot volcanism and the LLSVPs was recognized in 1980's [e.g., Hager et al., 1985; Anderson, 1982], its significance had not been fully explored in geodynamics possibly for two reasons. First, the disparity of length scales between the LLSVPs (i.e., ~10,000 km) and plumes (i.e., ~100's km) makes it difficult to model their dynamic interaction [e.g., Zhong et al., 2000a]. Second, it was suggested that mantle plumes might only transfer a small fraction (~10%) of convective heat flux out of the Earth's mantle, hence not as important from the global energetics point of view [e.g., Davies, 1999]. Plume heat flux inferred from swell topography at hotspots was ~3.5 TW or ~10% of the Earth's total convective heat flux [Davies, 1988a; Sleep, 1990; Hill et al., 1992]. The plume heat flux was considered to represent the heat flux out of the core (i.e., the cooling of the core). This suggests that mantle convection

would be mainly driven by the internal heating (i.e., radiogenic heating and secular cooling of the mantle) with an internal heating ratio at ~90% [Davies, 1988a; Sleep, 1990] and that the cold downwellings should be the primary heat transfer agent and structure in the mantle [e.g., Davies, 1999]. Indeed, mantle buoyancy models were constructed by including subducted slabs over the last 120 Myr and ignoring any active mantle upwellings such as the LLSVPs, and such buoyancy models were used to successfully model the geoid and mantle flow [Ricard et al., 1993; Lithgow-Bertelloni and Richards, 1998].

However, our understanding of plume dynamics and the core heat flux has evolved significantly in the last ten years. Recent studies suggest that the core heat flux should be significantly larger than previously estimated and that the mantle upwelling structures including the LLSVPs play an important role in the dynamics of the lower mantle. Recent mineral physics studies indicate that the thermal conductivity of the core materials is probably three times larger than previously estimated, and that the core heat flux is ~15 TW [de Koker et al., 2012; Pozzo et al., 2012; Gomi et al., 2013], although smaller thermal conductivity is also suggested [Zhang et al., 2015]. Seismic observations of the post-perovskite phase change, together with mineral physics studies on its Clapeyron slope, constrain the CMB heat flux at 10-16 TW [Lay et al., 2006, 2008; van der Hilst et al., 2007; Hernlund et al., 2005; Hernlund, 2010]. For a review on the core heat flux, see Hernlund and McNamara [2015].

Can the large core heat flux be made compatible with the much smaller plume heat flux inferred from observations and its implied dynamic state of the D'' regions [e.g., Davies, 1999]? It has been suggested that the plume heat flux does not represent the core

heat flux based on simplified convection models (in either Cartesian, cylindrical geometry or 2-D) [Labrosse, 2002; Yoshida and Ogawa, 2005; Mittelstaedt and Tackley, 2006]. However, 3-D spherical models of mantle convection with realistic mantle rheology showed that the plume heat flux immediately above the CMB represented 80-90% of the core heat flux using [Zhong, 2006; Leng and Zhong, 2008], thus confirming the proposal by Davies [1988a] and Sleep [1990]. These model calculations also demonstrated that due to excessive adiabatic cooling for hot plumes, the plume heat flux would decrease by about three times as plumes ascend from the D'' to the upper mantle. Taking the plume heat flux in the upper mantle to be 3.5 TW as constrained by swell topography, these studies suggest that the CMB heat flux would be ~12 TW or ~35% of the total convective heat flux at the Earth's surface [Zhong, 2006; Leng and Zhong, 2008], consistent with the other estimates discussed earlier. Bunge [2005] reported that plume excess temperature near the CMB region is significantly larger than that in the upper mantle in 3-D spherical models of mantle convection due to mantle sub-adiabaticity [Bunge et al., 2001], and suggested that CMB heat flux could be significantly larger than that inferred from swell topography. By quantifying plume heat flux, Leng and Zhong [2008] found that mantle sub-adiabaticity may indeed account for ~25% of plume heat flux reduction from the CMB to the upper mantle, but excessive adiabatic cooling of hot plumes is the most important for the plume heat flux reduction. Importantly, the large CMB heat flux suggests that the large-scale seismically slow anomalies in the lower mantle including the LLSVPs are significant for the dynamics of mantle plumes and heat transfer, and that the LLSVPs may contain significant thermal component.

3. Dynamic Models for Long-wavelength Mantle Structure

The long-wavelength (i.e., predominantly degree-2) mantle structure revealed in seismic tomography and its spatial correlation with the geoid, topography, and hotspot volcanism suggest the importance of long-wavelength mantle dynamic processes. An important goal in geodynamics has been to understand the origin of the long-wavelength mantle structure and its relation to surface observables. However, the dynamics of the mantle is very complicated with temperature- and pressure-dependent thermodynamic parameters and non-linear viscosity. The Rayleigh number for the mantle that measures convective vigor is supercritical by possibly 4 orders of magnitude, leading to thin top and bottom thermal boundary layers and narrow upwellings and downwellings. To deal with these challenges, geodynamic models are often formulated with assumptions and simplifications with a goal to understand the key dynamic process. For understanding the long-wavelength mantle structure, two classes of mantle convection models have been formulated: semi-dynamic and fully dynamic models. The semi-dynamic models use prescribed plate motions as surface boundary conditions, while the fully dynamic models employ free-slip or free-stress boundary conditions without imposing any kinematic constraints. In this section, we will first review semi-dynamic and full dynamic models that have been built for understanding the long-wavelength mantle structure for the present-day Earth's mantle. We will also discuss dynamic models for time-evolution of mantle structure in the Phanerozoic.

3.1. Semi-dynamic models for seismic structures of the mantle

It was recognized in one of the first global mantle flow models that plate motions as imposed surface boundary conditions have important controls on mantle flow patterns

[e.g., Hager and O'Connell, 1979]. Beneath surface plate convergence (divergence) is mantle downwelling (upwelling) flow. Although these early models did not solve for time-dependent mantle structures, subsequent time-dependent 2-D convection models using velocity boundary conditions (i.e., semi-dynamic models) showed similar effects of plate motions on mantle flow and temperature structures [e.g., Davies, 1988b]. Semi-dynamic models have a number of advantages, mostly in linking surface observations with mantle dynamics. For example, semi-dynamic models with imposed plate motions help understand the dynamics of lithospheric instability and its effects on the ocean-depth and age relationship [e.g., Huang and Zhong, 2005]. Semi-dynamic models of mantle convection with plate motion history may help understand the origin of seismic mantle structure, as done on a global scale [e.g., Bunge et al., 1998] and also on regional scales for the western US [e.g., Liu et al., 2008; Liu and Stegman, 2012] and Alaska subduction zone [e.g., Jadamec and Billen, 2010].

Semi-dynamic models of uniform composition (i.e., isochemical or purely thermal models of mantle convection) using plate motion history for the last 120 Myrs [Lithgow-Bertelloni and Richards, 1998] as surface boundary conditions (Fig. 4a-b) reproduced well the circum-Pacific seismically fast structure (i.e., subducted slabs), although they had only some limited success in explaining the large-scale seismically slow structures (i.e., LLSVPs) [Bunge et al., 1998, 2002; Bunge and Grand, 2000]. Recently, similar isochemical, semi-dynamic models showed improved fit to the LLSVP structures and were used to explain the LLSVPs as purely thermal origins without revoking chemical heterogeneities [Davies et al., 2012; Schuberth et al., 2009]. The lower mantle viscosity in these models is about 10^{23} Pas, and this probably represents the upper bound of the

lower mantle viscosity inferred from post-glacial rebound studies [Mitrovica and Forte, 2004; Simons and Hager, 1997] that may still have rather limited constraining power on mantle viscosity profiles [e.g., Paulson et al., 2007].

Including chemically dense materials with a volume similar to that inferred seismically for the LLSVPs (i.e., ~2% of the total mantle volume) [He and Wen, 2012; Hernlund and Houser, 2008], the semi-dynamic models reproduced both the African and Pacific LLSVPs and the circum-Pacific downwelling structures (Fig. 5) [McNamara and Zhong, 2005; Bull et al., 2009; Bower et al., 2013] with a wide range of lower mantle viscosity [Zhang et al., 2010], consistent with the seismic studies that suggest for a chemical origin of the LLSVPs [e.g., Masters et al., 2000; He and Wen, 2012]. These thermochemical semi-dynamic models showed that the volume and intrinsic density of the chemically distinct materials above the CMB played an important role in forming the LLSVPs [e.g., Zhang et al., 2010]. Generally speaking, the larger the density difference between the chemically distinct materials and the normal mantle is, the less undulating the compositional interface is. When either the density difference or the volume of the dense material is too large, the CMB would not be exposed to cold downgoing slabs [McNamara and Zhong, 2005; Zhang et al., 2010], making it difficult to explain the presence of the post-perovskite phase changes [e.g., Hernlund et al., 2005] and the LLSVPs. However, the density difference cannot be too small either, in order to keep the LLSVPs stable in the deep mantle against gravitational overturn. Another factor affecting the thermochemical structure is convective vigor or Rayleigh number [e.g., Tackley, 1998].

The semi-dynamic models utilize the observed plate motions to make model predictions that could be tested against observations of seismic structure [e.g., Bunge et al., 1998; McNamara and Zhong, 2005; Bull et al., 2009; Schuberth et al., 2009], dynamic topography, and heat flux [e.g., Zhang et al., 2012; Zhang and Zhong, 2011], and they have been a powerful tool in geodynamic studies. However, these models have a number of disadvantages. First, they do not really provide any mechanistic explanation on the formation of the long-wavelength plate motions, although the models predict the long-wavelength mantle structure using the imposed plate motions. This topic will be discussed in the next sub-section. Second, caution must be exercised to avoid introducing excessive kinematic energy and dissipation from the imposed plate motions to the convective system [e.g., Davies, 1989; King et al., 1992; Han et al., 1996]. One possible practice is to choose Rayleigh number such that the magnitudes of flow velocity and heat flux from convection models with free-slip boundary conditions approximately match that from the semi-dynamic models at the same Ra [McNamara and Zhong, 2005; Zhang et al., 2010].

While the preceding two issues were discussed previously in literature, the third difficulty with the semi-dynamic models was only recently recognized and is related to the dynamic consistency of plate motion reference frames (i.e., net rotation of lithosphere) with model viscosity structure [Rudolph and Zhong, 2014]. Plate motion models are often given in a hotspot reference frame and they often have significant net rotation of lithosphere relative [e.g., Gordon and Jurdy, 1986]. When they are used as surface boundary conditions in semi-dynamic models, depending on mantle viscosity structure (i.e., the lateral variations in viscosity), modeled differential rotation between

lithosphere and the mantle may not be sufficient to match with what is implied in the plate motion models, as known in dynamic models for the present-day plate motions [e.g., Ricard et al., 1991; Zhong, 2001; Becker, 2006, 2008; Conrad and Behn, 2009; Gerault et al., 2012]. Rudolph and Zhong [2014] found that with thick continental keels, the modeled differential rotation of lithosphere would match that in plate motion model of Seton et al. [2012] for the last 25 Myrs, but not for early time periods especially when the net rotation is larger than $0.5^\circ/\text{Myr}$. Such a deficiency may not affect previous results on the long-wavelength (e.g., degrees 1 and 2) mantle structures, but its effects on mantle plume trajectories and such defined plate motions [e.g., Steinberger and O’Connell, 2000; O’Neill et al., 2005] remain unclear [Rudolph and Zhong, 2014]. The effects of plate motion reference frames on mantle structure have been explored in Shephard et al. [2012].

3.2 Fully dynamic models – numerical modeling results

If one postulates that plate tectonics emerges from mantle convection with surface plates as the cold and stiff convective boundary layer at the surface, then an ultimate answer to the long-wavelength mantle structure must reside in the dynamics of mantle convection without imposed surface plate motions [e.g., Bercovici, 2003]. Indeed, convective wavelength and structure has been extensively studied in dynamically self-consistent mantle convection models in the last 30 years. These studies [Jaupart and Parsons, 1985; Bercovici et al., 1989a-b; Zhang and Yuen, 1995; Tackley et al., 1993; Tackley, 1993, 1996a; Bunge et al., 1996; Zhong and Gurnis, 1993; McNamara and Zhong, 2005; Zhong et al., 2007; Yoshida and Kageyama, 2006] have revealed that the most important controlling parameter on convective wavelength is the mantle viscosity

structure, while other relevant parameters include Rayleigh number (Ra), endothermic phase change, and mantle compressibility.

Early 3-D global dynamic convection models using a spectral method were computed for constant viscosity at a relatively small Ra due to computational limitations (note that thin thermal boundary layers for large Ra convection would require high numerical resolution and more computational resources) [e.g., Bercovici et al., 1989a,b]. These studies showed that at Ra less than ten times of the critical Ra, convection would form stable either cubic or tetrahedral pattern (i.e., degrees 3 or 4) (Fig. 6a). Convection at a larger Rayleigh number and/or with internal heating would have time-dependent convective structures of shorter wavelengths with sheet-like downwelling and cylindrical upwelling structures [e.g., Bercovici et al., 1989b] (Fig. 6b). While the downwelling and upwelling structures resemble subducted slabs and mantle plumes, convective structure from the constant viscosity convection models has much shorter wavelengths than the degree-2 for the Earth's mantle [Tackley et al., 1993; Bunge et al., 1996; Zhong et al., 2000a, 2008].

Introducing depth-dependent thermal conductivity and coefficient of thermal expansion, and mantle compressibility would help increase convective wavelengths [e.g., Hansen et al., 1993; Zhang and Yuen, 1995; Yoshida and Santosh, 2011]. An endothermic phase change from spinel to post-spinel that corresponds to the 670-km seismic discontinuity was found to increase convective wavelengths in global compressible mantle convection models with constant viscosity at modest Rayleigh number [Tackley et al., 1993]. However, this effect is only significant for relatively large Clapeyron slope of the phase change [Tackley, 1996a; Christensen and Yuen, 1985].

Recent studies of seismology suggest that the Clapeyron slope is probably ~ -2.5 MPa/K [e.g., Fukao et al., 2009], and mineral physics experiments indicate that the Clapeyron slopes for ringwoodite or postspinel phase change range from -0.5 to -2.0 MPa/K [e.g., Litasov et al., 2005; Fei et al., 2004]. These values are significantly smaller than that used in the previous convection studies [e.g., Tackley et al., 1993; Tackley, 1996a]. Additionally, the role of the phase change in mantle dynamics is significantly weakened by temperature-dependent viscosity that would enhance slab penetration into the lower mantle [e.g., Zhong and Gurnis, 1994] but were not considered in the previous convection studies [e.g., Tackley et al., 1993].

Thermal convection with temperature-dependent viscosity in mobile-lid convection regime has larger convective wavelengths relative to that with uniform viscosity at moderate Ra in 3-D Cartesian [Tackley, 1993] and spherical models [Ratcliff et al., 1997; Zhong et al., 2000a; 2007] (Fig. 6c). The increased convective wavelengths may be mostly due to the depth-dependence of viscosity resulting from the temperature-dependence (e.g., strong top and weak bottom thermal boundary layers due to the temperature effect) [Tackley, 1996b]. By adjusting activation energy and internal heating ratio, different depth-dependent temperature and viscosity profiles may be obtained, and some viscosity profiles may lead to predominantly degree-1 convection at modest Ra – the longest wavelength for a spherical geometry [McNamara and Zhong, 2005b; Yoshida and Kageyama, 2006]. The main controlling parameter for generating long-wavelength convection is the viscosity contrast between the lithosphere and its underlying mantle, and when this viscosity contrast is between 200 and 10^3 , predominantly degree-1 and -2 convection may occur [McNamara and Zhong, 2005b]. A similar conclusion was also

reached in studies of Martian mantle convection using depth-dependent viscosity (i.e., 1-D viscosity) [Harder, 2000]. However, at relatively large Ra (but still smaller than the Earth's Ra), the dominant convective wavelengths reduce to degree 5 to 6, insufficient to explain the observed degree-2 mantle structure [McNamara and Zhong, 2005b].

It was also suggested that an increase in mantle viscosity of a factor of 30 from the upper to lower mantles, as inferred from the geoid studies [Hager and Richards, 1989], would also lead to increased convective wavelengths relative to uniform viscosity models, but the dominant wavelengths were found at degrees 5-8 for convection at modest Ra and with depth-dependent (i.e., 1-D) viscosity but without lithosphere [Bunge et al., 1996]. However, it was found that the viscosity increase at the 670 km depth was not efficient in increasing convective wavelengths as Rayleigh number increases [Tackley, 1996a]. Indeed, the dominant convective wavelengths in convection with a factor of 30 viscosity increase in the lower mantle and moderately temperature-dependent viscosity (Fig. 6d) are even smaller than that from convection with the temperature-dependent viscosity alone (Fig. 6c) [Zhong et al., 2000a; 2007].

Zhong et al. [2007] found that the most robust way to produce long-wavelength convective structures (e.g., degree-1 or 2) would be to combine both a moderately strong top thermal boundary layer (i.e., lithosphere) and a viscosity increase of a factor of 30 at the 670 km depth. Predominantly degree-1 convection may be generated using this type of viscosity structure with lithospheric viscosity that is about >100 times stronger than the upper mantle (but not so strong to cause stagnant-lid convection [Moresi and Solomatov, 1995]), independent of Ra (i.e., at least up to the Earth-type of Ra), heating mode and initial conditions (Fig. 6e) [Zhong et al., 2007]. The required viscosity

contrasts between the lithosphere and upper mantle and across the 670 km depth for producing these long-wavelength structures are broadly consistent with those inferred from the geoid [e.g., Hager and Richards, 1989] and lithospheric dynamics [Flesch et al., 2000; England and Molnar, 1997]. By adjusting these viscosity contrasts, mantle convection of vastly different wavelengths (i.e., from degree-1 to degree-10) can be robustly generated [Liu and Zhong, 2014] (Fig. 7).

3.3 A broad view on long-wavelength structure from fully dynamic models

It should be pointed out that predominantly degree-1 mantle convection may be relevant to dynamic processes in other planetary bodies in the solar system including the Moon, Mars and Enceladus, because they display degree-1 or hemispherically asymmetric features on the surface. These features include the crustal dichotomy and Tharsis volcanism on Mars [e.g., Zuber, 2001], and global asymmetries in mare basalts (i.e., on the nearside) on the Moon [e.g., Wieczorek et al., 2006] and re-surfacing and deformation (i.e., on the southern hemisphere) of Enceladus [e.g., Spencer and Nimmo, 2013]. The radially stratified viscosity structure may lead to degree-1 stagnant-lid mantle convection that may help explain the crustal dichotomy and Tharsis Rise on Mars [Zhong and Zuber, 2001; Roberts and Zhong, 2006; Ke and Solomatov, 2006; Zhong, 2009], and radially stratified viscosity or a small metallic core may explain the global asymmetry of the lunar mare basalts [e.g., Zhong et al., 2000b; Parmentier et al., 2002]. Although the present-day Earth's mantle structure is predominately degree-2 as discussed earlier, degree-1 convection may be relevant in early geological time, for example, for supercontinent Pangea formation [Zhong et al., 2007], as to be discussed later.

Although the numerical models demonstrate the effect of radially stratified viscosity structure on convective wavelengths (Fig. 6c-6e and 7), it remains a challenge to understand the underlying physics of the modeling results. Three types of analyses may be helpful in understanding formation of convective structures. First, a classical linear stability analysis is sometimes used to infer dominant convective wavelengths. For 2-D basal heating convection in an isoviscous fluid with free-slip boundary conditions, critical Ra is the smallest when the horizontal and vertical dimensions of convection are about the same, suggesting that the preferred convective wavelength is about twice of the depth of the flow [Turcotte and Schubert, 2002]. However, similar linear stability analyses for convection with two-layer viscosity structure showed that convection would be confined in the weaker layer with reduced horizontal scales of convection when the weak layer is sufficiently weak (e.g., by a factor of ~ 70) relative to the strong layer [Buffett et al., 1994]. This suggests that the effect of radial stratified viscosity on convective structures for large Ra convection may not be explained by the linear stability analyses. This may be because the linear stability analyses are valid only for convection at Ra near critical Ra.

The second approach is based on the premise that a preferred convective wavelength is such that leads to the most efficient heat transfer [e.g., Turcotte and Schubert, 2002]. For 2-D basal heating convection in an isoviscous fluid with free-slip boundary conditions, the efficiency of heat transfer or Nusselt number, Nu, can be determined from a boundary layer theory, and the preferred convective wavelength that maximizes Nu is twice of the depth of the flow, similar to that from the linear stability analysis [Turcotte and Schubert, 2002]. A boundary layer theory analysis for 2-D

convection with vertically stratified viscosity [Busse et al., 2006; Lenardic et al., 2006] found that the preferred wavelength (i.e., the wavelength that maximizes Nu) would scale with the viscosity contrast between the strong and weak layers to $1/4$ exponent. This scaling relation is consistent with 2-D thermal convection at different Ra from numerical models [Lenardic et al., 2006]. The 2-D numerical models of Lenardic et al. [2006] also showed that a moderately strong lithosphere would promote long-wavelength mantle convection for internally heated convection, consistent with 3-D spherical models of mantle convection discussed earlier [McNamara and Zhong, 2005; Zhong et al., 2007]. Lenardic et al. [2006] proposed that the weak layer would reduce lateral dissipation, which is the key to increased convective wavelength and more efficient heat transfer. This work has been expanded further by Hoeink and Lenardic [2008] in 3-D convection models.

While the analyses by Lenardic et al. [2006] are appealing, some cautionary notes are warranted here. To determine preferred convective wavelengths by maximizing heat transfer has always been controversial in fluid dynamics [e.g., Koschmieder, 1993]. Indeed, different stable convective planform could exist with different wavelengths and heat flux in models of the same parameters including viscosity structure and Ra, as shown in Lenardic et al. [2006], suggesting that convective wavelengths are not necessarily associated with the most efficient heat transfer. 2-D convection models showed that convection with larger wavelengths would have smaller heat flux [Zhong and Gurnis, 1994; Grigne et al., 2005], which again seems to suggest a complicated relation between heat transfer and convective wavelengths. It is also unclear why reduced lateral dissipation would lead to longer convective wavelength and more efficient heat

transfer, considering that the total dissipation of convection is linearly proportional to surface heat flux with a larger dissipation leading to higher surface heat flux [Hewitt et al., 1975; Jarvis and McKenzie, 1980].

The third approach to determining preferred convective wavelengths is to consider a simple Rayleigh-Taylor instability analysis [e.g., Turcotte and Schubert, 2002; Ribe and de Valpine, 1994; Conrad and Molnar, 1997]. Typically, a two-layer model is formulated with the top layer of a larger density overlying the bottom layer of a smaller density (i.e., gravitationally unstable) to determine the growth rates of instability at different wavelengths (Fig. 8a). A preferred wavelength is that with the fastest growth rate of the instability [Turcotte and Schubert, 2002]. Rayleigh-Taylor instability analyses were performed in models of a spherical geometry to determine the preferred wavelengths for different viscosity contrast between the top and bottom layers, η_t/η_b (where η_t and η_b are the viscosities for the top and bottom layers), and radial location of the density interface (Fig. 8a) [Zhong et al., 2000b; Zhong and Zuber, 2001]. When the two layers have the same viscosity ($\eta_t=\eta_b$), the longest preferred wavelength is at spherical harmonic degree 5 when the two layers have similar thickness (i.e., the density interface is at the mid-mantle depths), but the preferred wavelengths are shorter when either the top or bottom layer gets thinner (Fig. 8b). The preferred wavelengths increase for radially stratified viscosity structure with either $\eta_t>\eta_b$ or $\eta_t<\eta_b$. The preferred wavelengths could get to degree-1 and -2, when a relatively thin top layer is $>\sim 100$'s times more viscous than the bottom layer or when the top layer is 100 's times weaker than the bottom layer (Fig. 8b). Although the Rayleigh-Taylor analysis did not consider the energy conservation equation, the predicted preferred wavelengths explain well the

712 predominant convective structure and wavelengths from 3-D mantle convection models,
713 for example, how a moderately strong lithosphere [McNamara and Zhong, 2005b; Zhong
714 et al., 2007] or a weak upper mantle would lead to degree-1 or -2 convection [Zhong et
715 al., 2007; Roberts and Zhong, 2006; Ke and Solomatov, 2006; Sramek and Zhong, 2010].

716 In summary, it seems that all these three approaches have potential drawbacks in
717 explaining convective structures from 3-D spherical models of mantle convection at large
718 Ra , which would require more studies to illuminate the controlling physical process
719 beyond what have been done so far [Buffett et al., 1994; Lenardic et al., 2006; Zhong and
720 Zuber, 2001].

721 A final remark is on the lithospheric viscosity. The mobile-lid convection models
722 suggested an important role of lithospheric viscosity in generating very long-wavelength
723 mantle convection (Fig. 6e and 7) [e.g., Zhong et al., 2007]. Lithospheric deformation in
724 plate tectonic type of convection occurs mainly at plate boundaries via faulting and
725 yielding [e.g., Bercovici, 2003]. However, the mobile-lid convection models presented
726 here (Fig. 6e) did not consider any faulting and yielding deformation mechanisms.
727 Therefore, the lithospheric viscosity in these mobile-lid convection models represents an
728 averaged effective viscosity of plate boundaries. Some attempts have been made to
729 account for these plate boundary processes or their proxies in mantle convection
730 calculations [e.g., Bercovici, 2003; Moresi and Solomatov, 1998; Zhong et al., 1998;
731 Tackley, 2000; Richards et al., 2001; Foley and Becker, 2009; Yoshida and Santosh,
732 2011; Bercovici and Ricard, 2014]. However, lithospheric deformation and rheology is
733 highly non-linear and complicated and significant progress in mantle and lithospheric
734 dynamics may require multi-disciplinary approach to lithospheric rheology involving

laboratory [Mei et al., 2010; Warren and Hirth, 2006], modeling in-situ observations [e.g., Zhong and Watts, 2013] and theoretical studies [Bercovici and Ricard, 2012].

4. Long-wavelength Mantle Structures in the Geological Past

Given that the present-day Earth's mantle structure is predominantly at degree-2, an intriguing question is what the mantle structure has been in the past. A large number of studies on thermal evolution of the Earth's mantle have been done in the past but mostly on mantle potential temperature in parameterized mantle convection models [e.g., Davies, 1993; Korenaga, 2008]. Although 3-D convection models display significant time-dependent dynamics at modest to large Ra [e.g., Bercovici et al., 1989a; Tackley et al., 1993; Bunge et al., 1998; McNamara and Zhong, 2005a], these models have largely focused on understanding the present-day Earth's mantle structure (i.e., the degree-2). However, increasingly more observations have been made about the temporal and spatial patterns in tectonics and volcanism, and have started to shed light on the possible scenarios of time-evolution of mantle dynamics and structure. Despite significant challenges in integrating relevant observations and dynamics together, two contrasting proposals for temporal evolution of mantle structure in the last 500 Ma have been proposed in recent years [Torsvik et al., 2006, 2010, 2014; Zhong et al., 2007; Zhang et al., 2010].

4.1 Observational Constraints and Previous Studies

The most robust and significant observational constraint on the Earth's dynamic history is probably the formation and breakup of supercontinents Pangea and Rodinia in the last billion years [e.g., Evans, 2003; Li and Zhong, 2009]. Given the established relation between the present-day mantle structure and plate tectonic motions in the last

120 Ma [e.g., Bunge et al., 1998; McNamara and Zhong, 2005a], it is expected that supercontinent assembly and breakup processes would be associated with mantle dynamics and structure. Other observations that may also have implications for temporal evolution of mantle structure and dynamics include true polar wander (TPW), continental flooding, global sea-level changes, and magnetic polarity reversal frequencies, as to be reviewed.

According to Hoffman [1991] and Scotese [1997], the assembly of Pangea was completed by ~330 Ma in the Carboniferous as Gondwana and Laurussia collided near the equator (Fig. 9a), while the breakup of Pangea started at ~175 Ma in the Middle Jurassic, first with North America breaking away from Africa, South America and Eurasia, followed with a sequence of breakups from ~140 Ma to 100 Ma in the Cretaceous between Antarctic, Australia, Africa and South America. The formation of Pangea and the collisions among continental blocks generated mountain belts including Appalachians and Urals, and the Pangea's breakup led to formation of major oceans including Atlantic Ocean. It has also been well accepted in geological community that supercontinent Rodinia may have formed at ~900 Ma and broken up at ~750 Ma (Fig. 9b) [e.g., Li et al., 2008; Torsvik, 2003], suggesting possibly a cyclic process for supercontinents. There are a number of general characteristics of Pangea and Rodinia supercontinent processes. Magmatism and volcanism recorded on continents appeared to have peaked during the breakup of Pangea and Rodinia, while at a minimal level during their formation periods (Fig. 9c-d) [e.g., Ernst and Bleeker, 2010; Torsvik et al., 2010]. Both Pangea and Rodinia appeared to have been largely surrounded by subduction zones during and after their formation (Fig. 9a-b). Major subduction zones may have also

existed between major continental blocks before they collided to form supercontinents. Both Pangea and Rodinia seemed to have existed only for ~150 Ma before their breakups, while the whole assembly and breakup process may have taken ~500-600 Ma [e.g., Evans, 2003].

True polar wander (TPW) represents the migration of the Earth's spin axis as a result of the change of the Earth's dynamic moment of inertia [e.g., Goldreich and Toomri, 1969]. As the Earth's dynamic moment of inertia is controlled by degree-2 non-hydrostatic geoid anomalies, TPW may provide constraints on the Earth's mantle structure. However, it is challenging to infer TPW in the Earth's history, because one must seek for coherent motion of all tectonic and continental blocks over a geological time period from often scarce paleomagnetic observations that do not constrain longitudes of continental blocks [e.g., Besse and Courtillot, 2002; Evans, 2003; Maloof et al., 2006]. TPW for the last 200 Ma appeared to be episodic and amounted to ~30 degrees in total [Besse and Courtillot, 2002]. However, some significant TPW events have been inferred for earlier time periods [van der Voo, 1994; Maloof et al., 2006]. In a recent model for the last 520 Ma plate motion history, 10 TPW events were included with constraints on their polar wander paths [Torsvik et al., 2014].

Large-scale continental flooding and global sea-level changes occurred repeatedly in Phanerozoic, for example, from the early to middle Paleozoic, and from the late Mesozoic to early Cenozoic [Hallam, 1984]. The continental flooding has been attributed to the effects of averaged seafloor age [Flemming and Roberts, 1973; Pitman et al., 1978] and dynamic topography caused by subducted slabs [Mitrovica et al., 1989; Gurnis, 1993]. Subducted slabs with their negative buoyancy may cause surface depression [e.g.,

Hager and Richards, 1989]. Subduction history from paleogeographic reconstruction models has been used to construct dynamic models of mantle flow driven by the slabs' negative buoyancy to predict dynamic topography, the sea-level change and continental flooding [Gurnis, 1993]. Averaged seafloor age affects global sea-level because of its effect on seafloor topography. The younger the averaged seafloor is, the shallower the ocean basins are and the higher the global sea level is. Averaged seafloor age is determined by seafloor spreading rate and size distribution of tectonic plates [Kominz, 1984; Loyd et al., 2007]. Therefore, global sea level change and continental flooding may help constrain mantle dynamic history.

The Earth's magnetic polarity reversals occurred at highly variable frequencies from several reversals per million years in the most recent history to once every tens of millions of years (e.g., the Cretaceous and Permian superchrons) [Ogg, 2012]. While the dynamics of magnetic polarity reversals is still not well understood, the CMB heat flux pattern is believed to play a major role [e.g., Glatzmaier et al., 1999; Olson et al., 2010]. Therefore, the observed vastly different polarity reversal frequencies may imply significant temporal variations in the patterns of CMB heat flux and hence mantle structures [Olson et al., 2010].

4.2. A Scenario with a Spatially Stable Degree-2 Mantle Structure

Torsvik et al. [2010, 2014] proposed that the Earth's mantle may have had a predominantly degree-2 structure that is similar to the present-day's mantle with African and Pacific LLSVPs for the last 500 Ma. This proposal was mainly based on correlation of eruption sites of LIPs with the edges of LLSVPs (Fig. 3b) [Torsvik et al., 2006]. As discussed in section 2.4, the hotspots, if projected vertically down to the CMB, were

found to preferentially locate in the African and Pacific LLSVPs [e.g., Hager et al., 1985] or in the regions with large horizontal gradients in S-wave models (i.e., mostly near the boundaries of LLSVPs) [Thorne et al., 2004]. Torsvik et al. [2006] showed that the original eruption sites of LIPs in the last 200 Ma, after they were restored using the plate motion history model, would be approximately also above the edges of LLSVPs which the authors defined as the 1% contour of S-wave velocity anomalies near the CMB in the Smean model (Fig. 3b) [Becker and Boschi, 2002]. This spatial correlation led Torsvik et al. [2006] to propose that the two LLSVPs have remained in the mantle fixed for the last 200 Ma. Subsequently, Torsvik and his colleagues, by considering older LIPs [Torsvik et al., 2008a-b] and kimberlites, suggested that the LLSVPs have been spatially stationary for the last 320 Ma [Torsvik et al., 2010]. By analyzing the quadrupole component (i.e., degree-2 poloidal field) of plate motions of the last 250 Ma, Conrad et al. [2013] concluded that the two major upwelling systems associated with the LLSVPs have been stationary for the last 250 Ma, although Rudolph and Zhong [2013] showed that the degree-2 poloidal field of plate motions alone would not be representative of the overall plate divergence.

More significantly, on the basis of the proposed stationary LLSVPs and eruption of LIPs at the edges of LLSVPs, Torsvik et al [2014] and Domeier and Torsvik [2014] reconstructed paleogeography, continental motions and global plate motions for the Paleozoic (i.e., from 540 to 250 Ma), using an iterative scheme that would determine the locations of continental blocks and TPW events and minimize the impact of the longitude ambiguity in paleomagnetic studies. Different from previous studies on reconstructions of paleogeography [e.g., Scotese, 1997] and of global plate motion history [e.g., Gordon and

Jurdy, 1986], the reconstruction scheme by Torsvik et al. [2014] and Domeier and Torsvik [2014] placed an important role on the African and Pacific LLSVPs. First, in modeling the TPW events (10 events in total), the Earth's spin axis was constrained to follow a great circle path such that the African and Pacific LLSVPs were always in the equatorial regions and antipodal to each other. This great circle path for the spin axis would follow the negative degree-2 geoid anomalies for the present-day Earth and would have an axis at 0°N and 11°E going through the centers of two LLSVPs (Fig. 3a). In practice, a coherent rotational motion for all the continental blocks was determined first, but only its projected component onto the (0°N, 11°E) axis was considered as possible TPW motion. Second, while the latitudes of a continental block was constrained by paleomagnetic data, its longitudes, whenever possible, was constrained by placing relevant LIPs and kimberlites from the continent at the edges of either African or Pacific LLSVPs. The scheme invoked an iterative approach to make use of the above-mentioned rules and geological data to finally come up with the paleogeography and continental motions for the Paleozoic as summarized in Torsvik et al. [2014].

The spatial correlation of LIP eruptions with the edges of the African and Pacific LLSVPs for the last 200 Ma [Torsvik et al., 2006] provided appealing observational constraints on when the present-day degree-2 mantle structure including the LLSVPs may have been formed. However, given the significance and potential impact of the proposals that the African and Pacific LLSVPs have been stationary for the last 540 Ma and that the LIPs and kimberlites over this time period have erupted at the edges of stationary LLSVPs, it is important to scrutinize the relevant arguments and evidence.

First, the role of the LIPs older than 200 Ma as evidence in supporting the

stationary LLSVPs beyond 200 Ma deserves some discussion. Although there were ~20 LIPs since the breakup of Pangea for the last 200 Ma, only five LIPs were identified between 200 Ma and 520 Ma: Siberian Traps at ~250 Ma, Emeishan at ~258 Ma, Skagerrak at ~297 Ma, Yakutsk at ~360 Ma, and Kalkarindji at ~510 Ma [Torsvik et al., 2008a] (Fig. 3b and 9d). This is consistent with active magmatism and volcanism during supercontinent breakup (Fig. 9c) [Ernst and Bleeker, 2010]. It was recognized in Torsvik et al [2006] that Siberian Traps fit to neither the African nor Pacific LLSVPs. The eruption locations of other four Paleozoic LIPs and their host continental blocks were generally poorly constrained by paleomagnetic and geological data. Torsvik et al. [2008a-b] decided to place the eruption locations of these four LIPs at the edges of either African or Pacific LLSVPs, assuming that the empirical spatial relation between the LLSVPs and LIPs for the last 200 Ma holds as well for earlier time periods. For example, in placing Emeishan LIP at the western edge of the Pacific LLSVP, Torsvik et al. [2008a] stated in their Figure 5's caption that "... *Because South China was not part of Pangea, its longitudinal relation to South Africa is unknown and, on palaeomagnetic evidence, it can be placed anywhere in palaeolongitude but not adjacent to Pangea and the African LLSVP. However, if the 258 Ma Emeishan LIP was erupted from a plume derived from the 1% slow shear wave velocity contour in the lowermost mantle of one of the Earth's two major LLSVP's, the only likely position would be along the western edge of the Pacific LLSVP*". Therefore, it seems that these >250 Ma LIPs at the edges of the LLSVPs in Torsvik et al. [2010; 2014] were consequence of the assumption of rather than evidence for stationary African and Pacific LLSVPs during those times. It is unclear whether such determined locations of LIPs and continental blocks in Paleozoic relative to

the LLSVPs may have affected the correlation of kimberlites with the LLSVPs in Torsvik et al. [2010, 2014]. Also notice that significant number of kimberlites (e.g., in Canada and China) were excluded in the correlation studies of Torsvik et al. [2010].

Second, while proposed LIP eruptions at the edges of thermochemical piles in Torsvik et al [2006] are supported by mantle dynamic models [Tan et al., 2011], the 20 LIPs in the last 200 Ma do not necessarily support the proposed fixity of the LLSVPs for the last 200 Ma. This is because these LIPs erupted at different times, and for the last 200 Ma there was on average only one LIP event per 10 Myrs (Fig. 9d), which is not sufficient to define as complicated boundaries as the two LLSVPs (Fig. 3b). Clearly, the LIPs in the Paleozoic do not provide the necessary support for the proposed fixity of the LLSVPs, as discussed in the last paragraph. A couple of recent studies have also debated the statistical significance of the LIPs erupting at the edges of the LLSVPs [Davies et al, 2014; Austermann et al., 2014]. Furthermore, while dynamic models predicted that many plumes would generate and rise along the edges of chemical piles, a significant fraction of mantle plumes would also not be associated with the chemical piles [Tan et al., 2011]. Mantle plumes may tilt significantly during their ascent due to global mantle flow [Steinberger and O'Connell, 2000; Zhong et al., 2000a; Boschi et al., 2007].

Third, TPW was a distinct feature in the reconstructions of paleogeography and plate motions in Torsvik et al. [2014] and Domeier and Torsvik [2014], but the robustness of the inferred TPW could be questionable because of the assumption of stationary present-day degree-2 geoid associated with the African and Pacific LLSVPs. The proposed fixity of the African and Pacific LLSVPs near the CMB is not strongly supported by the observations beyond 200 Ma as discussed earlier, therefore there is no

strong basis to use the present-day geoid associated with the LLSVPs to constrain the TPW path in the Paleozoic. Even if the LLSVPs had been relatively stationary near the CMB as possibly for the last 200 Ma, caution would also be needed in using the present-day geoid to constrain the TPW path. TWP is controlled by degree-2 geoid anomalies that are sensitive to the buoyancy and viscosity throughout the mantle, particularly in the mantle transition zones and the middle mantle [e.g., Hager and Richards, 1989]. Also, downwellings are likely to play a significant role in controlling the TPW [Richards et al., 1998; Steinberger and Torsvik, 2008]. If the two LLSVPs represent thermochemical anomalies as having been hypothesized [e.g., McNamara and Zhong, 2005], the long-wavelength geoid anomalies would be controlled by mantle structure in the top 1700 km of the mantle, and the bottom 1000 km of the mantle including the LLSVPs would not have any net contribution to the geoid [Liu and Zhong, 2014; 2015]. It should also be pointed out that the TPW, if determined incorrectly, would introduce spurious lithospheric net rotation in plate motion models, causing dynamic inconsistency as discussed recently [Rudolph and Zhong, 2014].

In short, the proposal that the African and Pacific LLSVPs and degree-2 mantle structure may have been relatively stable and stationary for the last 540 Ma by Torsvik et al. [2010, 2014] has potentially important implications for mantle dynamics and paleogeography reconstruction. There is little observational evidence for this proposal beyond 200 Ma. The discussions presented above purposely provided a critical assessment of this proposal with a hope to motivate more vigorous tests of the proposal.

4.3. A Scenario with Alternating Degree-1 and Degree-2 Mantle Structure

Zhong et al. [2007] proposed that the mantle structure was predominantly at degree-1 in the early and middle Paleozoic during and shortly after the Pangea assembly and that the present-day degree-2 mantle structure was formed significantly after Pangea assembly. This model was mainly based on consideration on how a supercontinent may come to form dynamically and what the supercontinent may affect its underlying mantle convection. A degree-1 mantle convection with hot upwellings in one hemisphere and cold downwellings in the other hemisphere would lead continental blocks to collide and merge to a supercontinent in the downwelling hemisphere [e.g., Monin, 1991; Evans, 2003]. As discussed in section 3.2, Zhong et al. [2007] found that degree-1 mantle convection occurs with observationally constrained lithospheric and mantle viscosity structure (Fig. 6e). Such predominantly degree-1 convection would lead to formation of supercontinent on a ~300 Myrs time-scale that is consistent with the inferred for Pangea and Rodinia [Zhang et al., 2009]. Once a supercontinent is formed, the circum-supercontinent subduction, as inferred for Pangea and Rodinia (Fig. 9a-b), would lead to upwellings and increased temperature beneath the supercontinent, thus changing the degree-1 mantle structure to degree-2 with two major antipodal upwellings, similar to the present-day Earth's mantle (Fig. 6f) [Zhong et al., 2007]. The hot, upwellings beneath the supercontinent would cause magmatism and eventual breakup of the supercontinent.

This model may provide a simple explanation to a number of important observations. The first is the present-day dominantly degree-2 mantle structure with antipodal African and Pacific LLSVPs. The model suggests that the African LLSVP would have been formed after Pangea formation (i.e., after 330 Ma) as a result of upwelling return flow in response to circum-Pangea subduction. This causes the mantle

structure to switch from degree-1 to degree-2. The present-day degree-2 mantle structure with two LLSVPs reflects the temporal evolution of mantle convection modulated by Pangea assembly and breakup process [Zhong et al., 2007; Li and Zhong, 2009]. The second is on the temporal variations in magmatism, i.e., reduced level of magmatism between 500 Ma and 200 Ma and enhanced after 180 Ma (Fig. 9c-d) [e.g., Ernst and Bleeker, 2010]. During and shortly after Pangea assembly, the mantle in the African hemisphere where the continents were colliding and merging to give rise to mantle downwellings would be relatively cold as predicted from this model (Fig. 6e) [Zhong et al., 2007; Zhang et al., 2009], thus having a reduced magmatism. Once the African upwelling system or LLSVP was formed significantly after the Pangea assembly (Fig. 6f), the magmatism started to increase, followed with the Pangea's breakup [Zhong et al., 2007].

The proposed scenario of mantle structure evolution was confirmed in semi-dynamic models of thermochemical mantle convection with a simple plate motion history model for the last 450 Ma that includes the assembly and breakup processes of Pangea [Zhang et al., 2010]. The semi-dynamic model is similar to McNamara and Zhong [2005a] except for using plate motions over longer geological history. The plate motions for the last 120 Ma were taken from Lithgow-Bertelloni and Richards [1998] (Fig. 4a-b) (referred to as LBR1998) that was also used in McNamara and Zhong [2005a]. Between 120 Ma and 450 Ma, continental plate motions were determined from paleogeography by Scotese [1997], while the plate motions in the Pacific were assumed to be similar to that at 120 Ma. Given the significant convergence between Laurussia and Gondwana from 450 Ma to 330 Ma in Scotese's paleogeography model (Fig. 4c), subducted slabs were

accumulated in the mantle beneath Pangea at 330 Ma in the semi-dynamic model, pushing the thermochemical materials above the CMB away from the African/Pangea hemisphere and leading to a largely degree-1 mantle structure (Fig. 10a) [Zhang et al., 2010]. With the circum-Pangea subduction, the African upwelling system and thermochemical pile started to develop, and were largely developed by ~200 Ma (Fig. 10b). The present-day mantle structure from this model (Fig. 10c) is quite similar to the present-day seismic structure (Fig. 1 and 5) [Zhang et al., 2010; McNamara and Zhong, 2005a].

The semi-dynamic model with the plate motion history for the last 450 Ma also makes predictions for temporal evolution of surface dynamic topography and CMB heat flux that have implications for vertical motion history of continental cratons and for core dynamo action [Zhang et al., 2012; Flowers et al., 2012; Zhang and Zhong, 2011; Olson et al., 2013]. For example, the model predicts that the Slave craton in North America subsides before Pangea assembly at 330 Ma but uplifts significantly from 330 Ma to 240 Ma in response to pre-Pangea subduction and post-assembly mantle warming (Fig. 11a). The Kaapvaal craton of Africa is predicted to undergo uplift from ~180 Ma to 90Ma after Pangea breakup, but its dynamic topography remains stable for the last 90 Ma (Fig. 11b). These model predictions for the Slave and Kaapvaal cratons compare well with the burial-unroofing histories inferred from thermochronology studies (Fig. 11a-b), thus supporting our dynamic models including the development of the African LLSVP mantle structure [Zhang et al., 2012; Flowers et al., 2012]. The predicted CMB heat flux was used in dynamo models to investigate its effects on the polarity reversal frequency and inner core growth history [Olson et al., 2013, 2015]. Although the model failed to

account for the Cretaceous superchron, it reproduced well other characteristics of polarity reversal frequency [Olson et al., 2013].

4.4. Are the stationary LLSVPs insensitive to surface plate motions?

The general results from the semi-dynamic model of Zhang et al [2010] are consistent with previous studies [e.g., McNamara and Zhong, 2005a; Bunge et al., 1998; Hager and O'Connell, 1981] in that surface plate motions dictate mantle convection and structure. Particularly, the thermo-chemical piles are passive features that respond to downwellings from above [McNamara and Zhong, 2005a; Tackley, 1998; Tan et al., 2011]. The evolution of large-scale mantle structure in these models mostly reflects the plate motion history, that is, the plate motion history of the last ~120-150 Ma for the present-day degree-2 mantle structure (Fig. 10c) and the pre-Pangea plate motions for the degree-1 mantle structure at the Pangea time (Fig. 10a).

Recently, Bull et al. [2014] performed similar semi-dynamic modeling calculations but using different plate motion models: for the Paleozoic (410-250 Ma) [Domeier and Torsvik, 2014] (referred to as DT2014) and the last 200 Ma [Seton et al., 2012] (referred to as S2012). The Paleozoic plate motion model DT2014 was derived by assuming stationary African and Pacific LLSVPs, as discussed in section 4.2, while the plate motion S2012 was an updated model from Mueller et al. [2008]. Bull et al. [2014] made three conclusions: 1) The African and Pacific LLSVPs, if used as initial conditions, would have remained close to their present-day positions for at least the last 410 Myr, supporting Torsvik et al. [2010, 2014]. 2) The mantle could not have been at dominantly degree-1 structure during the Pangea assembly, because such initial conditions would not have led to the present-day mantle structure. 3) The present-day degree-2 mantle

structure with two LLSVPs could not be reproduced using S2012 plate motion for the last 120 Myr, contradicting with McNamara and Zhong [2005a] that used plate motion model LBR1998 [Lithgow-Bertelloni and Richards, 1998].

Zhong and Rudolph [2015] have recently computed a number of models with different plate motion histories including the ones used in Bull et al. [2014], and they obtain the results that are inconsistent with Bull et al. [2014] but confirm the results by McNamara and Zhong [2005a] and Zhang et al. [2010]. For example, Zhong and Rudolph [2015] found that using the last 120 Ma plate motion history from either LBR1998 or S2012, the semi-dynamic models would reproduce seismically imaged degree-2 mantle structure including the African and Pacific LLSVPs for the present-day. The models by Zhong and Rudolph [2015], which are similar to those by Zhang et al. [2010], use realistic mantle viscosity inferred from post-glacial rebound studies [e.g., Simons and Hager, 1997; Mitrovica and Forte, 2004] with the lower mantle viscosity of approximately 10^{22} Pas and ~ 100 times smaller viscosity for the upper mantle. Zhong and Rudolph [2015] found that more viscous lower mantle (i.e., a smaller Rayleigh number) would slow down the development of the lower mantle degree-2 structure. However, using different plate motion history models for the last 250 Ma (e.g., Zhang et al. [2010] or Z2010; DT2014; S2012; LBR1998) and different mantle viscosity, Zhong and Rudolph [2015] conclude that for a reasonable range of mantle viscosity, the present-day lower mantle degree-2 structure is largely caused by plate motion history for the last 150 Ma and may not contain or “remember” significant amount of information before 150 Ma. This result is similar to Bunge et al. [1998] that focused on comparing slab structure using LBR1998 plate motion.

Would the degree-2 structure with the two LLSVPs remain stationary or unchanged for the last 410 Ma using DT2014 plate motion, as suggested in Bull et al. [2014]? Zhong and Rudolph [2015] computed the semi-dynamic convection models using plate motion history for the last 410 Ma (i.e., using DT2014 and S2012) and degree-2 structure with two LLSVPs as initial conditions at 410 Ma, as in Bull et al. [2014]. However, Zhong and Rudolph [2015] found that the initially degree-2 lower mantle structure including the shape of the LLSVPs (Fig. 12a) would vary significantly with time before and shortly after Pangea assembly in response to the imposed plate motion history and that the degree-1 structure has grown to be more significant than degree-2 between 350 Ma and 250 Ma (Fig. 12b). After Pangea is formed at ~330 Ma, the circum-Pangea subduction promotes degree-2 structure formation [Zhong et al., 2007; Zhang et al., 2010; Bower et al., 2013]. By ~200 Ma, the lower mantle structure is again dominantly degree-2 with the African and Pacific LLSVPs (Fig. 12c) that remain unchanged since. The present-day structure is again dominantly degree-2 with two major LLSVPs and is similar to the initial condition (Fig. 12a and 12d). Zhong and Rudolph [2015] also conclude that for models with different initial conditions, plate motion history and mantle viscosity, the dominantly degree-2 lower mantle structure with the African and Pacific LLSVPs as observed today may have largely formed the latest by 200 Ma.

It should be pointed out that although the semi-dynamic convection models with DT2014 plate motion also predict significant degree-1 structure in the lower mantle in the early stage of Pangea (e.g., Fig. 12c) [Zhong and Rudolph, 2015], the degree-1 structure is not as strong as that in Zhang et al. [2010] (Fig. 10a). This is expected because the pre-Pangea plate motions in DT2014 included significantly less convergence between

Laurussia and Gondwana in forming Pangea than that implied in Scotese's paleogeography reconstruction (see also Torsvik et al. [2014]). However, since the assumptions of the stationary African and Pacific LLSVPs for the last 500 Myrs that were used to build DT2014 are debatable as discussed before, the predicted lower mantle structure at the Pangea time would be subjected to the same debate and may represent one of the possible scenarios, like that from Zhang et al. [2010]. The results from Zhong and Rudolph [2015] are in conflict with what have been reported in Bull et al. [2014]. It is unclear what have caused the difference. It is possible that Bull et al. [2014] used significantly larger mantle viscosity than that inferred from the observations. It should be pointed out that the plate motion models for Domeier and Torsvik [2014] from 410 Ma to 250 Ma and for Seton et al. [2012] from 200 Ma to the present-day were downloaded from the published websites. However, the plate motions between 250 Ma and 200 Ma are not publically available. Therefore, the plate motions for this 50 Myrs period in Zhong and Rudolph [2015] are likely different in detail from that used in Bull et al. [2014]. However, this difference should not affect the conclusion, because the significant time evolution of the lower mantle structure including chemical piles occurs before 250 Ma for which only DT2014 plate motion was relevant (Fig. 12c).

5. Conclusion and future directions

The lower mantle structure of the present-day Earth is characterized by two major seismically slow anomalies beneath Africa and Pacific (i.e., LLSVPs) separated by seismically fast anomalies associated with the past subduction [e.g., Dziewonski, 1984; Ritsema et al., 2011]. This structure is often referred as to degree-2 structure. The degree-2 mantle structure has important implications for the Earth's long-wavelength

topography, gravity and geoid anomalies, distribution of volcanism, style of mantle convection, and true polar wander. Seismic and geodynamic studies suggest that the LLSVPs are likely chemically distinct from the ambient mantle [Masters et al., 2000; Wen et al., 2001; Ni et al., 2002; McNamara and Zhong, 2005a], although some other studies propose no need for chemical heterogeneity in the LLSVPs [e.g., Schuberth et al., 2009, 2012; Davies et al., 2012]. The degree-2 structure in the lower mantle may result from the history of plate tectonic motions and subduction of the last 150 Ma [e.g., Bunge et al., 2002; McNamara and Zhong, 2005a; Zhong and Rudolph, 2015] for mantle viscosity inferred from post-glacial rebound studies. Fully dynamic models of mantle convection without any imposed surface motions may produce convective structure at wavelengths comparable with the present-day Earth's mantle (i.e., degree-2) at realistic Rayleigh number, using moderately strong lithosphere and lower mantle [Zhong et al., 2007]. Even degree-1 mantle convection could be generated with this type of lithospheric and mantle viscosity. The long-wavelength mantle convection may provide a dynamically self-consistent explanation for the present-day mantle structure and large-scale surface tectonics (e.g., Pangea assembly and breakup) and volcanism [Zhong et al., 2007].

The African and Pacific LLSVPs may be the primary source regions for mantle plumes and volcanism including large igneous provinces (LIP) [e.g., Hager et al., 1985; Torsvik et al., 2010], to explain the isotopic heterogeneities in hotspot volcanism [Hoffman, 1997]. Hotspot volcanism and LIPs for the last 200 Ma may occur preferentially at the boundaries of the LLSVPs [e.g., Torsvik et al., 2006]. While this empirical relation is supported by dynamic models of thermochemical convection [Tan et

al., 2011], its statistical significance has also been called into question [Davies et al., 2014; Austermann et al., 2014]. However, there is only a very small number of LIPs older than 200 Ma and their eruption sites are poorly constrained by geological and paleomagnetic data [Torsvik et al., 2008a-b]. There is no strong evidence for these relatively old LIPs to be associated with the present-day African and Pacific LLSVPs.

While the present-day Earth's mantle structure is dominantly at degree-2, how mantle structure may have evolved in the geological past (e.g., since the early Paleozoic) is an intriguing question that has important implications for time-evolution of volcanism and surface tectonics. The degree-1 mantle convection provides an appealing mechanism for supercontinent formation in the downwelling hemisphere [Zhong et al., 2007]. If Pangea was formed in this way, then the mantle in the early Pangea time would have a degree-1 structure, suggesting a transition of degree-1 to degree-2 mantle structure from Pangea to the present-day [Zhong et al., 2007; Zhang et al. 2010]. This suggests that the mantle beneath Pangea would experience significant increase in temperature from the early Pangea time to later time, which may be responsible for the Pangea breakup [Gurnis, 1988; Zhong and Gurnis, 1993; Lowman and Jarvis, 1996; Lenardic et al., 2011]. These temporal variations in mantle structure and temperature may explain the volcanism history recorded on continents (i.e., a low level of volcanism in the early Pangea time but high before and during Pangea breakup) [Ernst and Bleeker, 2010]. The close association of the LIPs of the last 200 Ma with the African and Pacific LLSVPs may suggest that the present-day degree-2 structure may have formed at ~200 Ma [Torsvik et al., 2006], and this appears consistent with the prediction of semi-dynamic

models using different plate motion history models and initial conditions [Zhong and Rudolph, 2015].

However, the proposed fixity of the African and Pacific LLSVPs for the last 520 Ma [Torsvik et al., 2010; 2014] lacks robust observational evidence beyond 200 Ma and is not supported by mantle dynamics. Therefore, caution may be exercised in using the fixity for reconstructing paleogeography and constraining locations of continental blocks and true polar wander in the Paleozoic or early Mesozoic (i.e., >200 Ma). The semi-dynamic models using Domeier and Torsvik's [2014] plate motion history for the last 410 Ma derived from the fixity of the African and Pacific LLSVPs predict that the LLSVPs must have moved around significantly in response to the surface plate motions [Zhong and Rudolph, 2015], thus leading to dynamic inconsistency. Generally speaking, it is always possible to construct a global plate motion history model with Pangea assembly and breakup that does not cause significant migration of the African and Pacific LLSVPs since the Paleozoic. For example, one can always envision that Pangea was formed above the downwelling regions between the two LLSVPs, and has subsequently moved out of the downwelling region to above the African LLSVP or upwelling. However, even if such a plate motion history model can be built, one must also answer the dynamics question as to why Pangea would move against mantle flow from the downwelling to upwelling regions.

Future studies are needed to further test different hypotheses on the degree-2 mantle structure and the African and Pacific LLSVPs and their time evolution since the early Paleozoic. First, more seismic, mineral physics and geodynamics studies are needed to examine the thermochemical structures in the lower mantle, particularly whether or not

and how the LLSVPs are chemically distinct from the bulk of the mantle [Masters et al., 2000; Davies et al., 2012; McNamara and Zhong, 2005a; He and Wen, 2012]. Can the anti-correlation between the shear and bulk sound speed anomalies in the lower mantle and LLSVP regions, which is often cited as evidence for chemically distinct LLSVPs, be explained in terms of post-perovskite phase change [Davies et al., 2012]? What are responsible for the significantly different seismic anisotropy in and outside the LLSVPs [Lynner and Long, 2014; Cottaar and Romanowicz, 2013]? If the LLSVPs are chemically distinct, what are the origins of the chemical heterogeneities, primitive or recycled crust or both [e.g., Li et al., 2014; Nakagawa and Tackley, 2014] and how do the chemically distinct and heavy LLSVPs reconcile with the surface geoid anomalies [Liu and Zhong, 2014; 2015]? For the latter question, more seismic studies are needed to better resolve mantle structure around ~1800 km depths, as the bottom 1000 km of the mantle including the LLSVPs would be compensated and not produce any net surface geoid [Liu and Zhong, 2014; 2015].

Time-evolution of long-wavelength mantle structure is an important topic that requires more observational studies and modeling work to interpret the observations. Improving plate motion history models is important [e.g., Seton et al., 2012], and it is also challenging beyond 200 Ma due to lack of the observations and data in oceanic regions. Observational studies should focus on establishing spatial and temporal patterns of volcanism [e.g., Torsvik et al., 2006; Ernst and Bleeker, 2010] and inferring true polar wandering events, sea-level change and vertical motions of cratons [e.g., Maloof et al., 2006; Ault et al., 2009; Flowers and Schoene, 2010; Flowers et al., 2012]. Geochemical observations may also provide important constraints on mantle compositional structure,

and hence mantle dynamics [Iwamori and Nakamura, 2015]. Through geodynamic modeling, these observations may help constrain time-evolutions of plate motions and of long-wavelength mantle structure [e.g., Zhang et al., 2012; Conrad, 2013; van Keken and Ballentine, 1999; Li and McNamara, 2014].

Finally, there is a need for better understanding the physics behind the long-wavelength convection. While more numerical modeling studies are needed to further examine the role of stratified mantle viscosity, particularly the lithospheric viscosity, in promoting long-wavelength convection [e.g., Zhong et al., 2007], it is equally important to develop an improved understanding both qualitatively and quantitatively about the governing physics of long-wavelength convection [e.g., Lenardic et al., 2006]. Given the important role of lithosphere in the dynamics of the mantle and also in relating to observations, incorporating lithosphere in mantle dynamic models is essential. Future geodynamic studies should continue exploring relevant rheological properties of lithosphere [e.g., Zhong and Watts, 2013; Bercovici and Ricard, 2012; Arredondo and Billen, 2012; Watts et al., 2013]. At the same time, different forms and approximations of modeling lithosphere including semi-dynamic models with imposed plate motions [e.g., Zhang et al., 2010] and pseudo-plastic rheology in fully dynamic models [e.g., Coltice et al., 2012; Yoshida and Hamano, 2015] should be employed to incorporate lithosphere, continental collision and rifting in global mantle convection models and to integrate and understand geological observations.

Acknowledgement. This work was supported by the National Science Foundation through grant 1135382. CitcomS is available through the Computational Infrastructure

1216 for Geodynamics (geodynamics.org). Mr. Chuan Qin helped make Figure 8 for this
1217 paper. The authors would also like to thank W. Leng, Z.X. Li, M.L. Rudolph, and N.
1218 Zhang for their contributions to the work presented here, and M. Yoshida and an
1219 anonymous reviewer for their constructive reviews.

Reference

- Allegre, C.J., Hofmann, A., O’Nions, K., 1996. The Argon constraints on mantle structure. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 23, 3555–3557. doi:10.1029/96GL03373
- Allegre, C., Staudacher, T., Sarda, P., Kurz, M., 1983. Constraints on Evolution of Earths Mantle from Rare-Gas Systematics. *Nature* 303, 762–766. doi:10.1038/303762a0
- Anderson, D., 1982. Hotspots, Polar Wander, Mesozoic Convection and the Geoid. *Nature* 297, 391–393. doi:10.1038/297391a0
- Arredondo, K.M., Billen, M.I., 2012. Rapid weakening of subducting plates from trench-parallel estimates of flexural rigidity. *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.* 196, 1–13. doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2012.02.007
- Ault, A.K., Flowers, R.M., Bowring, S.A., 2009. Phanerozoic burial and unroofing history of the western Slave craton and Wopmay orogen from apatite (U-Th)/He thermochronometry. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 284, 1–11. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2009.02.035
- Austermann, J., Kaye, B.T., Mitrovica, J.X., Huybers, P., 2014. A statistical analysis of the correlation between large igneous provinces and lower mantle seismic structure. *Geophys. J. Int.* 197, 1–9. doi:10.1093/gji/ggt500
- Becker, T.W., 2008. Azimuthal seismic anisotropy constrains net rotation of the lithosphere, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 35, L08308. doi:10.1029/2008GL033946
- Becker, T.W., 2006. On the effect of temperature and strain-rate dependent viscosity on global mantle flow, net rotation, and plate-driving forces. *Geophys. J. Int.* 167, 943–957. doi:10.1111/j.1365-246X.2006.03172.x
- Becker, T.W., Boschi, L., 2002. A comparison of tomographic and geodynamic mantle models. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems* 3, 1003. doi:10.1029/2001GC000168
- Bercovici, D., 2003. The generation of plate tectonics from mantle convection. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 205, 107–121. doi:10.1016/S0012-821X(02)01009-9
- Bercovici, D., Ricard, Y., 2014. Plate tectonics, damage and inheritance. *Nature* 508, 513–516. doi:10.1038/nature13072
- Bercovici, D., Ricard, Y., 2012. Mechanisms for the generation of plate tectonics by two-phase grain-damage and pinning. *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.* 202, 27–55. doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2012.05.003

1251 Bercovici, D., G. Schubert, G. A. Glatzmaier, and A. Zebib, 1989a. Three-dimensional
1252 thermal convection in a spherical shell, *J. Fluid Mech.* 206, 75-104,
1253 Bercovici, D., G. Schubert and G. A. Glatzmaier, 1989b. Three-dimensional, spherical
1254 models of convection in the Earth's mantle, *Science* 244, 950-955.
1255 Besse, J., Courtillot, V., 2002. Apparent and true polar wander and the geometry of the
1256 geomagnetic field over the last 200 Myr. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 107, 2300.
1257 doi:10.1029/2000JB000050
1258 Boschi, L., Becker, T. W., and Steinberger, B., 2007. Mantle plumes: Dynamic models
1259 and seismic images, *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.*, 8, Q10006,
1260 doi:10.1029/2007GC001733.
1261 Bower, D.J., Gurnis, M., Seton, M., 2013. Lower mantle structure from
1262 paleogeographically constrained dynamic Earth models. *Geochem. Geophys.*
1263 *Geosystems* 14, 44–63. doi:10.1029/2012GC004267
1264 Boyet, M., Carlson, R.W., 2005. Nd-142 evidence for early (> 4.53 Ga) global
1265 differentiation of the silicate Earth. *Science* 309, 576–581.
1266 doi:10.1126/science.1113634
1267 Brune, J.N., Dorman, J., 1963. Seismic waves and earth structure in the Canadian Shield,
1268 *Bull. Seism. Soc. Am.*, 53, 167-210.
1269 Buffett, B., Gable, C., Oconnell, R., 1994. Linear-Stability of a Layered Fluid with
1270 Mobile Surface Plates. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 99, 19885–19900.
1271 doi:10.1029/94JB01556
1272 Bull, A. L., Domeier, M., Torsvik, T.H., 2014. The effect of plate motion history on the
1273 longevity of deep mantle heterogeneities, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 401, 172-182.
1274 Bull, A.L., McNamara, A.K., Ritsema, J., 2009. Synthetic tomography of plume clusters
1275 and thermochemical piles, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 278, 152-162.
1276 Bunge, H.P., 2005. Low plume excess temperature and high core heat flux inferred from
1277 non-adiabatic geotherms in internally heated mantle circulation models. *Phys. Earth*
1278 *Planet. Inter.* 153, 3–10. doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2005.03.017
1279 Bunge, H.P., Ricard, Y., and Matas, J., 2001. Non-adiabaticity in mantle convection,
1280 *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 28, 879– 882.

1281 Bunge, H.P., Richards, M.A., Baumgardner, J.R., 2002. Mantle-circulation models with
 1282 sequential data assimilation: inferring present-day mantle structure from plate-motion
 1283 histories. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. -Math. Phys. Eng. Sci.* 360, 2545–2567.
 1284 doi:10.1098/rsta.2002.1080
 1285 Bunge, H.P., Richards, M.A., Baumgardner, J.R., 1996. Effect of depth-dependent
 1286 viscosity on the planform of mantle convection. *Nature* 379, 436–438.
 1287 doi:10.1038/379436a0
 1288 Bunge, H.P., Richards, M.A., Lithgow-Bertelloni, C., Baumgardner, J.R., Grand, S.P.,
 1289 Romanowicz, B.A., 1998. Time scales and heterogeneous structure in geodynamic
 1290 earth models. *Science* 280, 91–95. doi:10.1126/science.280.5360.91
 1291 Campbell, I., Griffiths, R., 1990. Implications of Mantle Plume Structure for the
 1292 Evolution of Flood Basalts. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 99, 79–93. doi:10.1016/0012-
 1293 821X(90)90072-6
 1294 Castle, J.C., Van der Hilst, R.D., 2003. Searching for seismic scattering off mantle
 1295 interfaces between 800 and 2000 km depth, *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 108,
 1296 2095, doi: 10.1029/2001JB000286, 2003
 1297 Chase, C., 1979. Subduction, the Geoid, and Lower Mantle Convection. *Nature* 282,
 1298 464–468. doi:10.1038/282464a0
 1299 Christensen, U., Hofmann, A., 1994. Segregation of Subducted Oceanic-Crust in the
 1300 Convecting Mantle. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 99, 19867–19884.
 1301 doi:10.1029/93JB03403
 1302 Christensen, U., Yuen, D., 1985. Layered convection induced by phase-transitions. *J.*
 1303 *Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth*, 90, 291–300. doi:10.1029/JB090iB12p10291
 1304 Coltice, N., Rolf, T., Tackley, P.J., Labrosse, S., 2012. Dynamic causes of the relation
 1305 between area and age of the ocean floor, *Science*, 336, 335-338.
 1306 Conrad, C.P., 2013. The solid earth's influence on sea level, *Geol. Soc. of Amer.*
 1307 *Bull.*, 125, 1027-1052, doi:10.1130/B30764.1.
 1308 Conrad, C.P., Behn, M.D., 2010. Constraints on lithosphere net rotation and
 1309 asthenospheric viscosity from global mantle flow models and seismic anisotropy.
 1310 *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems* 11, Q05W05. doi:10.1029/2009GC002970

1311 Conrad, C.P., Molnar, P., 1997. The growth of Rayleigh-Taylor-type instabilities in the
 1312 lithosphere for various rheological and density structures. *Geophys. J. Int.* 129, 95–
 1313 112. doi:10.1111/j.1365-246X.1997.tb00939.x
 1314 Conrad, C.P., Steinberger, B., Torsvik, T.H., 2013. Stability of active mantle upwelling
 1315 revealed by net characteristics of plate tectonics. *Nature* 498, 479–482.
 1316 doi:10.1038/nature12203
 1317 Cottaar, S., Romanowicz, B., 2013. Observations of changing anisotropy across the
 1318 southern margin of the African LLSVP. *Geophys. J. Int.* 195, 1184–1195.
 1319 doi:10.1093/gji/ggt285
 1320 Courtillot, V., Davaille, A., Besse, J., Stock, J., 2003. Three distinct types of hotspots in
 1321 the Earth's mantle. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 205, 295–308. doi:10.1016/S0012-
 1322 821X(02)01048-8
 1323 Davaille, A., 1999. Simultaneous generation of hotspots and superswells by convection in
 1324 a heterogenous planetary mantle. *Nature* 402, 756–760. doi:10.1038/45461
 1325 Davies, D.R., Goes, S., Sambridge, M., 2015. On the relationship between volcanic
 1326 hotspot locations, the reconstructed eruption sites of large igneous provinces and deep
 1327 mantle seismic structure, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 411, 121-130.
 1328 Davies, D.R., Goes, S., Davies, J.H., Schuberth, B.S.A., Bunge, H.-P., Ritsema, J., 2012.
 1329 Reconciling dynamic and seismic models of Earth's lower mantle: The dominant role
 1330 of thermal heterogeneity. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 353, 253–269.
 1331 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2012.08.016
 1332 Davies, G.F., 1999. *Dynamic Earth: Plates, Plumes and Mantle Convection*, 458 pp.,
 1333 Cambridge Univ. Press, New York.
 1334 Davies, G.F., 1993. Cooling the core and mantle by plume and plate flow, *Geophys. J.*
 1335 *Int.* 115, 132-146.
 1336 Davies, G.F., 1989. Mantle convection model with a dynamic plate: topography, heat
 1337 flow and gravity anomalies, *Geophys. J. Int.*, 98, 461-464.
 1338 Davies, G.F., 1988a, Ocean bathymetry and mantle convection: 1. Large- scale flow and
 1339 hotspots, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 93, 10,467–10,489
 1340 Davies, G.F., 1988b, Role of the lithosphere in mantle convection, *J. Geophys. Res.*,
 1341 93(B9), 10451–10466, doi:10.1029/JB093iB09p10451.

1342 Davies, G.F., 1984. Geophysical and isotopic constraints on mantle convection: An
 1343 interim synthesis, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 89, 6017–6040.

1344 Davies, G.F., Pribac, F., 1993. Mesozoic Seafloor Subsidence and the Darwin Rise, Past
 1345 and Present, in *The Mesozoic Pacific: Geology, Tectonics, and Volcanism*. American
 1346 Geophysical Union, pp. 39–52.

1347 Davies, G., Richards, M., 1992. Mantle Convection. *J. Geol.* 100, 151–206.

1348 De Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., Vlcek, V., 2012. Electrical resistivity and thermal
 1349 conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. *Proc.*
 1350 *Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 109, 4070–4073. doi:10.1073/pnas.1111841109

1351 Domeier, M., Torsvik, T.H., 2014. Plate tectonics in the late Paleozoic. *Geosci. Front.* 5,
 1352 303–350. doi:10.1016/j.gsf.2014.01.002

1353 Dziewonski, A., 1984. Mapping the Lower Mantle - Determination of Lateral
 1354 Heterogeneity in P-Velocity up to Degree and Order-6. *J. Geophys. Res.* 89, 5929–
 1355 5952.

1356 Dziewonski, A., Hager, B., Oconnell, R., 1977. Large-Scale Heterogeneities in Lower
 1357 Mantle. *J. Geophys. Res.* 82, 239–255. doi:10.1029/JB082i002p00239

1358 England, P., Molnar, P., 1997. Active deformation of Asia: from kinematics to dynamics.
 1359 *Science* 278, 647–650.

1360 Ernst, R., Bleeker, W., 2010. Large igneous provinces (LIPs), giant dyke swarms, and
 1361 mantle plumes: significance for breakup events within Canada and adjacent regions
 1362 from 2.5 Ga to the Present. *Can. J. Earth Sci.* 47, 695–739. doi:10.1139/E10-025

1363 Evans, D.A.D., 2003. True polar wander and supercontinents. *Tectonophysics* 362, 303–
 1364 320.

1365 Fei, Y., Van Orman, J., Li, J., van Westrenen, W., Sanloup, C., et al., 2004.
 1366 Experimentally determined postspinel transformation boundary in Mg₂SiO₄ using
 1367 MgO as an internal pressure standard and its geophysical implications. *J. Geophys.*
 1368 *Res.*, 109, B02305.

1369 Flemming, N., Roberts, D., 1973. Tectono-Eustatic Changes in Sea-Level and Seafloor
 1370 Spreading. *Nature* 243, 19–22. doi:10.1038/243019a0

1371 Flesch, L.M., Holt, W.E., Haines, A.J., Shen-Tu, B., 2000. Dynamics of the Pacific-North
 1372 American Plate Boundary in the Western United States, *Science*, 287, 834-836.

1373 Flowers, R.M., Ault, A.K., Kelley, S.A., Zhang, N., Zhong, S., 2012. Epeirogeny or
 1374 eustasy? Paleozoic-Mesozoic vertical motion of the North American continental
 1375 interior from thermochronometry and implications for mantle dynamics. *Earth Planet.*
 1376 *Sci. Lett.* 317, 436–445. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2011.11.015
 1377 Flowers, R.M., Schoene, B., 2010. (U-Th)/He thermochronometry constraints on
 1378 unroofing of the eastern Kaapvaal craton and significance for uplift of the southern
 1379 African Plateau. *Geology* 38, 827–830. doi:10.1130/G30980.1
 1380 Foley, B., Becker, T. W., 2009. Generation of plate-like behavior and mantle
 1381 heterogeneity from a spherical, visco-plastic convection model. *Geochem., Geophys.,*
 1382 *Geosys.*, 10, Q08001, doi:10.1029/2009GC002378,
 1383 Fukao, Y., Obayashi, M., 2013. Subducted slabs stagnant above, penetrating through, and
 1384 trapped below the 660 km discontinuity. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 118, 5920–
 1385 5938. doi:10.1002/2013JB010466
 1386 Fukao, Y., Obayashi, M., Nakakuki, T., 2009. Stagnant Slab: A Review. *Annu. Rev.*
 1387 *Earth Planet. Sci.* 37, 19–46. doi:10.1146/annurev.earth.36.031207.124224
 1388 Fukao, Y., Widiyantoro, S., Obayashi, M., 2001. Stagnant slabs in the upper and lower
 1389 mantle transition region. *Rev. Geophys.* 39, 291–323. doi:10.1029/1999RG000068
 1390 Garnero, E.J., 2000. Heterogeneity of the lowermost mantle. *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet.*
 1391 *Sci.* 28, 509–537. doi:10.1146/annurev.earth.28.1.509
 1392 Garnero, E.J., McNamara, A.K., 2008. Structure and dynamics of Earth’s lower mantle.
 1393 *Science* 320, 626–628. doi:10.1126/science.1148028
 1394 Gerault, M., Becker, T.W., Kaus, B.J.P., Faccenna, C., Moresi, L., Husson, L., 2012. The
 1395 role of slabs and oceanic plate geometry in the net rotation of the lithosphere, trench
 1396 motions, and slab return flow. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems* 13, Q04001.
 1397 doi:10.1029/2011GC003934
 1398 Glatzmaier, G.A., Coe, R.S., Hongre, L., Roberts, P.H., 1999. The role of the Earth’s
 1399 mantle in controlling the frequency of geomagnetic reversals. *Nature* 401, 885–890.
 1400 doi:10.1038/44776
 1401 Goes, S., Eakin, C.M., Ritsema, J., 2013. Lithospheric cooling trends and deviations in
 1402 oceanic PP-P and SS-S differential traveltimes. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 118,
 1403 996–1007. doi:10.1002/jgrb.50092

1404 Goldreich, P., Toomre, A., 1969. Some remarks on polar wandering. *J. Geophys. Res.* 74,
1405 2555–2567.

1406 Gomi, H., Ohta, K., Hirose, K., Labrosse, S., Caracas, R., Verstraete, M.J., Hernlund,
1407 J.W., 2013. The high conductivity of iron and thermal evolution of the Earth's core.
1408 *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.* 224, 88–103. doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2013.07.010

1409 Gonnermann, H.M., Mukhopadhyay, S., 2009. Preserving noble gases in a convecting
1410 mantle. *Nature* 459, 560–U88. doi:10.1038/nature08018

1411 Gordon, R., Jurdy, D., 1986. Cenozoic Global Plate Motions. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid*
1412 *Earth Planets* 91, 2389–2406. doi:10.1029/JB091iB12p12389

1413 Grand, S.P., 1994. Mantle Shear Structure Beneath the America and Surrounding Oceans.
1414 *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 99, 11591–11621. doi:10.1029/94JB00042

1415 Grand, S.P., 2002. Mantle shear-wave tomography and the fate of subducted slabs.
1416 *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. Ser. -Math. Phys. Eng. Sci.* 360, 2475–2491.
1417 doi:10.1098/rsta.2002.1077

1418 Grand, S.P., R. D van der Hilst, S. Widiyantoro, 1997. Global seismic tomography: A
1419 snapshot of convection in the Earth. *GSA Today* 7, 1–7.

1420 Grigne, C., Labrosse, S., Tackley, P.J., 2005. Convective heat transfer as a function of
1421 wavelength: Implications for the cooling of the Earth, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 110, B03409,
1422 doi:10.1029/2004JB003376.

1423 Gurnis, M., 1993. Phanerozoic marine inundation of continents driven by dynamic to-
1424 pography above subducting slabs. *Nature* 364, 589–593.

1425 Gurnis, M., 1988. Large-scale mantle convection and the aggregation and dispersal of
1426 supercontinents. *Nature* 332, 695–699.

1427 Hager, B.H. and Richards, M.A., 1989. Long-wavelength variations in Earth's geoid -
1428 physical models and dynamical implications, *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. Lond., Ser. A*, 328,
1429 309–327.

1430 Hager, B.H., Clayton, R.W., Richards, M.A., Comer, R.P., Dziewonski, A.M., 1985.
1431 Mantle heterogeneity, dynamic topography and the geoid, *Nature*, 313, 541-545.

1432 Hager, B. H., O'Connell, R.J., 1979. Kinematic models of large-scale flow in the Earth's
1433 mantle, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 84, 1031–1048.

1434 Hallam, A., 1984. Pre-Quaternary Sea-Level Changes, *Annu. Rev. of Earth Planet. Sci.*,
 1435 12, 205-243.
 1436 Han, L., and Gurnis, M., 1996. How valid are dynamic models of subduction and
 1437 convection when plate motions are prescribed? *Phys. Earth Planet. Int.*, 110, 235-246.
 1438 Hansen, U., Yuen, D.A., Kroening, S.E., Larsen, T.B., 1993. Dynamic consequences of
 1439 depth-dependent thermal expansivity and viscosity on mantle circulations and thermal
 1440 structure, *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.*, 77, 205-223, 1993.
 1441 Harder, H. (2000), Mantle convection and the dynamic geoid of Mars, *Geophys. Res.*
 1442 *Lett.*, 27, 301–304.
 1443 Hernlund, J. W., A. K. McNamara (2015) The core-mantle boundary region, in *Treatise*
 1444 *on Geophysics*, vol. 8: Mantle Dynamics, editors: D. Bercovici and G. Schubert, 461-
 1445 519, Elsevier Ltd., Oxford.
 1446 Hernlund, J. W. (2010) On the interaction of the geotherm with a post-perovskite phase
 1447 transition in the deep mantle. *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.* 180(3-4), 222-234
 1448 Hernlund, J.W., Thomas, C., Tackley, P.J., 2005. A doubling of the post-perovskite phase
 1449 boundary and structure of the Earth's lowermost mantle, *Nature*, 434: 882-886.
 1450 Hernlund J.W., Houser, C., 2008. On the distribution of seismic velocities in Earth's deep
 1451 mantle, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 265: 423-437.
 1452 He, Y., and Wen, L. (2012) Geographic boundary of the “Pacific Anomaly” and its
 1453 geometry and transitional structure in the north, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 117, B09308,
 1454 doi:10.1029/2012JB009436.
 1455 He, Y., and Wen, L. (2009) Structural features and shear-velocity structure of the
 1456 “Pacific Anomaly”, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 114, B02309, doi:10.1029/2008JB005814.
 1457 Hill, R. I., Campbell, I. H., Davies, G. F., Griffiths, R. W., 1992. Mantle plumes and
 1458 continental tectonics, *Science*, 256, 186–193.
 1459 Hoeink, T., Lenardic, A., (2008) Three-dimensional mantle convection simulations with a
 1460 low-viscosity asthenosphere and the relationship between heat flow and the horizontal
 1461 length scale of convection, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 35, L10304
 1462 Hoffman, P.F., 1991. Did the breakout of Laurentia turn Gondwanaland inside-out?
 1463 *Science* 252, 1409–1412

1464 Hofmann, A. W., 1997, Mantle geochemistry: The message from oceanic volcanism,
 1465 Nature, 385, 219– 229.

1466 Houser, C., Masters, G., Shearer, P., Laske, G., 2008. Shear and compressional velocity
 1467 models of the mantle from cluster analysis of long-period waveforms, Geophys. J.
 1468 Int., 174, 195-212.

1469 Huang, J.S., Zhong, S.J., 2005. Sublithospheric small-scale convection and its
 1470 implications for residual topography at old ocean basins and the plate model, J.
 1471 Geophys. Res., 110, B05404, 10.1029/2004JB003153.

1472 Ishii, M., Tromp, J., 1999. Normal-mode and free-air gravity constraints on lateral
 1473 variations in velocity and density of Earth's mantle. Science, 285, 1231-1236.

1474 Iwamori, H., Nakamura, H., 2015. Isotopic heterogeneity of oceanic, arc and continental
 1475 basalts and its implications for mantle dynamics, Gondwana Res., 27, 1131-1152,
 1476 doi:10.1016/j.gr.2014.09.003.

1477 Jadamec, M., Billen, M.I., 2010. Reconciling Rapid 3-D Mantle Flow and Surface Plate
 1478 Motions Near the Eastern Alaska Slab Edge, Nature, 465, 338-341.

1479 Jellinek, A.M., Manga, M., 2004. Links between long-lived hotspots, mantle plumes, D"
 1480 and plate tectonics, Rev. Geophys., 42, RG3002, 10.1029/2003RG000144.

1481 Jaupart, C., Parsons, B., 1985. Convective instabilities in a variable viscosity fluid cooled
 1482 from above. Phys. Earth Planet. Inter. 39, 14–32.

1483 Karason, H., van der Hilst, R.D., 1999. Compositional heterogeneity in the bottom
 1484 kilometers of Earth's mantle: toward a hybrid convection model, Science, 283, 1885-
 1485 1888.

1486 Karato, S., 1993. Importance of anelasticity in the interpretation of seismic tomography,
 1487 Geophys. Res. Lett., 20, 1623-1626.

1488 Ke, Y., Solomatov, V.S., 2006. Early transient superplumes and the origin of the Martian
 1489 crustal dichotomy, J. Geophys. Res., 111, E10001, doi:10.1029/2005JE002631.

1490 Kellogg, L.H., Hager, B.H., van der Hilst, R.D., 1999. Compositional stratification in the
 1491 deep mantle, Science, 283, 1881-1884.

1492 Kennett, B.L.N., Widiyantoro, S., van der Hilst, R.D., 1998. Joint seismic tomography
 1493 for bulk sound and shear wave speed in the Earth's mantle, J. Geophys. Res., 12469-
 1494 12493.

1495 Kominz, M.A., 1984, Oceanic ridge volume and sea-level change - An error analysis, *in*
 1496 Schlee, J.S., ed., Inter- regional unconformities and hydrocarbon accumulation: Tulsa,
 1497 Oklahoma, American Association of Petroleum Geologists Memoir 36, 109–127.
 1498 Korenaga, J., 2008. Urey ratio and the structure and evolution of Earth’s mantle, *Rev.*
 1499 *Geophys.*, 46, RG2007, doi:10.1029/2007RG000241.
 1500 King, S.D., Gable, C.W., Weinstein, S.A., 1992. Models of convection-driven tectonic
 1501 plates: a comparison of methods and results, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 109, 481-487.
 1502 Koschmieder, E.L., 1993. Benard cells and Taylor vortices, Cambridge University Press,
 1503 pp337.
 1504 Labrosse, S., Hernlund, J.W., Coltice, N., 2007. A crystallizing dense magma ocean at
 1505 the base of the Earth’s mantle, *Nature*, 450, 866-869.
 1506 Labrosse, S., 2002. Hotspots, mantle plumes and core heat loss, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*,
 1507 199, 147-156
 1508 Lay, T., and E. J. Garnero (2007). Reconciling the post-perovskite phase with
 1509 seismological observations of lowermost mantle structure, in *Post-Perovskite: The*
 1510 *Last Mantle Phase Transition*, edited by K. Hirose, J. Brodholt, T. Lay, and D. Yuen,
 1511 American Geophysical Union, Monograph, 129-153
 1512 Lay, T., Helmberger, D.V., 1983. A shear velocity discontinuity in the lower mantle,
 1513 *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 10, 63-66.
 1514 Lay, T., Hernlund, J., Buffett, B. A., 2008. Core-mantle boundary heat flow. *Nature*
 1515 *Geosci.* 1, 25-32.
 1516 Lay, T., Hernlund, J., Garnero, E.J., Thorne, M.S., 2006. A post-perovskite lens and D”
 1517 heat flux beneath the central Pacific. *Science* 314, 1272–1276.
 1518 doi:10.1126/science.1133280
 1519 Lay, T., Williams, Q., Garnero, E.J., 1998. The core-mantle boundary layer and deep
 1520 earth dynamics, *Nature*, 392, 461-468
 1521 Lenardic, A., Richards, M.A., Busse, F.H., 2006. Depth-dependent rheology and the
 1522 horizontal length scale of mantle convection. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 111,
 1523 B07404. doi:10.1029/2005JB003639
 1524 Lenardic, A., Moresi, L.-N., Jellinek, A.M., O'Neill, C., Cooper, C.M., Lee, C.T., 2011.
 1525 Continents, super-continents, mantle thermal mixing, and mantle thermal isolation:

theory, numerical simulations, and laboratory experiments, *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.*, 12, Q10016, doi:10.1029/2011GC003663.

Leng, W., and S. J. Zhong, 2008. Controls on plume heat flux and plume excess temperature, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 113, B04408, doi:10.1029/2007JB005155

Lerch, F.J., Klosko, S.M., Patel, G.B., 1983. A Refined Gravity Model from Lageos (GEM2), NASA Technical Memorandum 84986, Goddard Space Flight Center, Greenbelt/Maryland.

Li, M.M., McNamara, A.K., Garnero, E.J., 2014. Chemical complexity of hotspots caused by cycling oceanic crust through mantle reservoirs, *Nature Geoscience*, 7, 336-370.

Li, X.D., Romanowicz, B., 1996. Global mantle shear velocity model developed using nonlinear asymptotic coupling theory. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 101, 22245–22272. doi:10.1029/96JB01306

Li, Z.X., Zhong, S.J., 2009. Supercontinent-superplume coupling, true polar wander and plume mobility: Plate dominance in whole-mantle tectonics. *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.* 176, 143–156. doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2009.05.004

Li, Z.X., et al., 2008. Assembly, configuration, and break-up history of Rodinia: A synthesis. *Precambrian Research* 160 (1–2), 179–210.

Litasov K.D., Ohtani E, Sano A, Suzuki A, Funakoshi K. 2005. In situ X-ray diffraction study of postspinel transformation in a peridotite mantle: implication for the 660-km discontinuity. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 238, 311–328.

Lithgow-Bertelloni, C., Richards, M.A., Conrad, C.P., Griffiths, R.W., 2001. Plume generation in natural thermal convection at high Rayleigh and Prandtl numbers. *J. Fluid Mech.* 434, 1-21.

Lithgow-Bertelloni, C., Richards, M.A., 1998. The dynamics of Cenozoic and Mesozoic plate motions. *Rev. Geophys.* 36, 27–78. doi:10.1029/97RG02282

Lithgow-Bertelloni, C., Silver, P.G., 1998. Dynamic topography, plate driving forces and the African superswell. *Nature* 395, 269–272. doi:10.1038/26212

Liu, L.J., Spasojevic, S., Gurnis, M., 2008. Reconstructing Farallon Plate Subduction Beneath North America Back to the Late Cretaceous. *Science* 322, 934–938. doi:10.1126/science.1162921

1557 Liu, L.J., Stegman, D.R., 2012. Origin of Columbia River flood basalt controlled by
 1558 propagating rupture of the Farallon slab. *Nature* 482, 386–U1508.
 1559 doi:10.1038/nature10749
 1560 Liu, X., Zhong, S.J., 2015. The long-wavelength geoid from 3-dimensional spherical
 1561 models of thermal and thermo-chemical mantle convection, *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid*
 1562 *Earth*, 120, doi:10.1002/2015JB012016.
 1563 Liu, X., Zhong, S.J., 2014. Controls on Long-wavelength Convective Structure and the
 1564 Geoid from 3D Spherical Mantle Convection Models, Abstract, Workshop for mantle
 1565 and lithospheric dynamics, Banff, Canada.
 1566 Lowman, J.P., Jarvis, G.T., 1996. Continental collisions in wide aspect ratio and high
 1567 Rayleigh number two-dimensional mantle convection models. *J. Geophys. Res.* 101,
 1568 25,485–25,497.
 1569 Loyd, S. J., Becker, T. W., Conrad, C. P., Lithgow-Bertelloni, C., and Corsetti, F. A.,
 1570 2007. Time-variability in Cenozoic reconstructions of mantle heat flow: plate tectonic
 1571 cycles and implications for Earth's thermal evolution. *Proceed. Nat. Acad. Sci.*, 104,
 1572 14266-14271.
 1573 Lynner, C., Long, M.D., 2014. Lowermost mantle anisotropy and deformation along the
 1574 boundary of the African LLSVP, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 41, 3447–3454,
 1575 doi:10.1002/2014GL059875.
 1576 Maloof, A.C., Halverson, G.P., Kirschvink, J.L., Schrag, D.P., Weiss, B.P., Hoffman,
 1577 P.F., 2006. Combined paleomagnetic, isotopic, and stratigraphic evidence for true
 1578 polar wander from the Neoproterozoic Akademikerbreen Group, Svalbard, Norway.
 1579 *Geol. Soc. Am. Bull.* 118, 1099–1124. doi:10.1130/B25892.1
 1580 Masters, G., Jordan, T., Silver, P., Gilbert, F., 1982. Aspherical Earth Structure from
 1581 Fundamental Spheroidal-Mode Data. *Nature* 298, 609–613. doi:10.1038/298609a0
 1582 Masters, G., Laske, G., Bolton, H., Dziewonski, A., 2000. The Relative Behavior of
 1583 Shear Velocity, Bulk Sound Speed, and Compressional Velocity in the Mantle:
 1584 Implications for Chemical and Thermal Structure, in: Karato, S.-I., Forte, A.,
 1585 Liebermann, R., Guysters, Stixrude, L. (Eds.), *Earth's Deep Interior: Mineral Physics*
 1586 *and Tomography From the Atomic to the Global Scale. American Geophysical*
 1587 *Union*, pp. 63–87.

1588 McNamara, A.K., Zhong, S.J., 2005a. Thermochemical structures beneath Africa and the
1589 Pacific Ocean. *Nature* 437, 1136–1139. doi:10.1038/nature04066

1590 McNamara, A.K., Zhong, S.J., 2005b, Degree-1 mantle convection: Dependence on
1591 internal heating and temperature-dependent rheology, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 32,
1592 L01301, 10.1029/2004GL021082.

1593 McNamara, A.K., Zhong, S.J., 2004. The influence of thermochemical convection on the
1594 fixity of mantle plumes. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 222, 485–500.
1595 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2004.03.008

1596 Mei, S., Suzuki, A.M., Kohlstedt, D.L., Dixon, N.A., Durham, W.B., 2010. Experimental
1597 constraints on the strength of the lithospheric mantle. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth*
1598 115, B08204. doi:10.1029/2009JB006873

1599 Mitrovica, J.X., Forte, A.M., 2004. A new inference of mantle viscosity based upon joint
1600 inversion of convection and glacial isostatic adjustment data. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*
1601 225, 177–189. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2004.06.005

1602 Mitrovica, J., Beaumont, C., Jarvis, G., 1989. Tilting of Continental Interiors by the
1603 Dynamical Effects of Subduction. *Tectonics* 8, 1079–1094.
1604 doi:10.1029/TC008i005p01079

1605 Monin, A., 1991. Planetary Evolution and Global Tectonics. *Tectonophysics* 199, 149–
1606 164. doi:10.1016/0040-1951(91)90170-W

1607 Montelli, R., Nolet, G., Dahlen, F.A., Masters, G., Engdahl, E.R., Hung, S.H., 2004.
1608 Finite frequency tomography reveals a variety of plumes in the mantle, *Science*, 303,
1609 338–343.

1610 Moresi, L., Solomatov, V., 1998. Mantle convection with a brittle lithosphere: thoughts
1611 on the global tectonic styles of the Earth and Venus. *Geophys. J. Int.* 133, 669–682.
1612 doi:10.1046/j.1365-246X.1998.00521.x

1613 Moresi, L., Solomatov, V., 1995. Numerical Investigation of 2D Convection with
1614 Extremely Large Viscosity Variations. *Phys. Fluids* 7, 2154–2162.
1615 doi:10.1063/1.868465

1616 Morgan, W.J., 1971. Convection plumes in the lower mantle, *Nature*, 230, 42–43.

1617 Nakagawa, T., Tackley, P.J., 2014. Influence of combined primordial layering and
 1618 recycled MORB on the coupled thermal evolution of Earth's mantle and core.
 1619 *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems* 15, 619–633. doi:10.1002/2013GC005128
 1620 Ni, S.D., Tan, E., Gurnis, M., Helmberger, D., 2002. Sharp sides to the African
 1621 superplume. *Science* 296, 1850–1852. doi:10.1126/science.1070698
 1622 Nyblade, A., Robinson, S., 1994. The African Superswell. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 21, 765–
 1623 768. doi:10.1029/94GL00631
 1624 Ogg, J., 2012. The geomagnetic polarity time scale. in: Gradstein, F., Ogg, J., Schmitz,
 1625 M., and Ogg, G., (Eds.), *The Geologic Time Scale 2012*, Eds. Elsevier, Amsterdam,
 1626 pp. 85–128
 1627 Olson, P.L., Coe, R.S., Driscoll, P.E., Glatzmaier, G.A., Roberts, P.H., 2010. Geodynamo
 1628 reversal frequency and heterogeneous core-mantle boundary heat flow. *Phys. Earth*
 1629 *Planet. Inter.* 180, 66–79. doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2010.02.010.
 1630 Olson, P., Deguen, R., Hinnov, L.A., Zhong, S.J., 2013. Controls on geomagnetic
 1631 reversals and core evolution by mantle convection in the Phanerozoic. *Phys. Earth*
 1632 *Planet. Inter.* 214, 87–103. doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2012.10.003
 1633 Olson, P., Hinnov, L.A., Driscoll, P.E., 2014. Nonrandom geomagnetic reversal times
 1634 and geodynamo evolution. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 388, 9–17.
 1635 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2013.11.038
 1636 Olson, P., Deguen, R., Rudolph, M.L., Zhong, S.J., 2015. Core evolution driven by
 1637 mantle global circulation. *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.*,
 1638 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pepi.2015.03.002>.
 1639 O'Neill, C., Muller, D., Steinberger, B., 2005. On the uncertainties in hot spot
 1640 reconstructions and the significance of moving hot spot reference frames. *Geochem.*
 1641 *Geophys. Geosystems* 6, Q04003. doi:10.1029/2004GC000784
 1642 Panning, M., Romanowicz, B., 2006. A three-dimensional radially anisotropic model of
 1643 shear velocity in the whole mantle. *Geophys. J. Int.* 167, 361–379.
 1644 doi:10.1111/j.1365-246X.2006.03100.x
 1645 Parmentier, E.M., Zhong, S., Zuber, M.T., 2002. Gravitational differentiation due to
 1646 initial chemical stratification: origin of lunar asymmetry by the creep of dense
 1647 KREEP? *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 201, 473–480. doi:10.1016/S0012-821X(02)00726-4

1648 Paulson, A., Zhong, S.J., and Wahr, J., 2007, Limitations on the inversion for mantle
 1649 viscosity from post-glacial rebound, *Geophys. J. Int.*, 168, 1195-1209.
 1650 Pitman W.C. III, 1978. Relationship between eustasy and stratigraphic sequences of
 1651 passive margins, *Geol. Soc. of Am. Bull.* 89, 1389-1403.
 1652 Pozzo, M., Davies, C., Gubbins, D., Alfe, D., 2012. Thermal and electrical conductivity
 1653 of iron at Earth's core conditions. *Nature* 485, 355–U99. doi:10.1038/nature11031
 1654 Ratcliff, J.T., Tackley, P.J., Schubert, G., Zebib, A., 1997. Transitions in thermal
 1655 convection with strongly variable viscosity. *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.* 102, 201–212.
 1656 doi:10.1016/S0031-9201(97)00013-7
 1657 Resovsky, J.S., Ritzwoller, M.H., 1999. Regularization uncertainty in density models
 1658 estimated from normal mode data. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 26, 2319–2322.
 1659 doi:10.1029/1999GL900540
 1660 Ribe, N.M., de Valpine, D.P., 1994. The Global Hotspot Distribution and Instability of
 1661 D''. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 21, 1507–1510. doi:10.1029/94GL01168
 1662 Ricard, Y., Fleitout, L., Froidevaux, C., 1984. Geoid Heights and Lithospheric Stresses
 1663 for a Dynamic Earth. *Ann. Geophys.* 2, 267–286.
 1664 Ricard, Y., Doglioni, C. Sabadini, R., 1991. Differential rotation between lithosphere and
 1665 mantle: A consequence of lateral mantle viscosity variations, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 96,
 1666 8407–8415.
 1667 Ricard, Y., Richards, M., Lithgowbertelloni, C., Lestunff, Y., 1993. A Geodynamic
 1668 Model of Mantle Density Heterogeneity. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 98, 21895–
 1669 21909. doi:10.1029/93JB02216
 1670 Richards, M.A., Hager, B., 1984. Geoid Anomalies in a Dynamic Earth. *J. Geophys. Res.*
 1671 89, 5987–6002. doi:10.1029/JB089iB07p05987
 1672 Richards, M.A., Jones, D., Duncan, R., Depaolo, D., 1991. A Mantle Plume Initiation
 1673 Model for the Wrangellia Flood-Basalt and Other Oceanic Plateaus. *Science* 254,
 1674 263–267. doi:10.1126/science.254.5029.263
 1675 Richards, M.A., Yang, W.S., Baumgardner, J.R., Bunge, H.P., 2001. Role of a low-
 1676 viscosity zone in stabilizing plate tectonics: Implications for comparative terrestrial
 1677 planetology, *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems*, 2, 2000GC000115.

1678 Ritsema, J., Deuss, A., van Heijst, H.J., Woodhouse, J.H., 2011. S40RTS: a degree-40
 1679 shear-velocity model for the mantle from new Rayleigh wave dispersion, teleseismic
 1680 traveltimes and normal-mode splitting function measurements. *Geophys. J. Int.* 184,
 1681 1223–1236. doi:10.1111/j.1365-246X.2010.04884.x
 1682 Ritsema, J., van Heijst, H. J. & Woodhouse, J. H. (2004) Global transition zone
 1683 tomography. *J. Geophys. Res.* 109, doi:10.1029/2003JB002610.
 1684 Ritsema, J., van Heijst, H.J., Woodhouse, J.H., 1999. Complex shear wave velocity
 1685 structure imaged beneath Africa and Iceland. *Science* 286, 1925–1928.
 1686 doi:10.1126/science.286.5446.1925
 1687 Ritzwoller, M.H., Shapiro, N.M., Zhong, S.J., 2004. Cooling history of the Pacific
 1688 lithosphere. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 226, 69–84. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2004.07.032
 1689 Roberts, J.H., Zhong, S.J., 2006. Degree-1 convection in the Martian mantle and the
 1690 origin of the hemispheric dichotomy. *J. Geophys. Res.-Planets* 111, E06013.
 1691 doi:10.1029/2005JE002668
 1692 Romanowicz, B., 2003. Global mantle tomography: Progress status in the past 10 years,
 1693 *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.* 31, 303–28.
 1694 Rudolph, M.L., Zhong, S., 2013. Does quadrupole stability imply LLSVP fixity? *Nature*
 1695 503, E3–E4. doi:10.1038/nature12792
 1696 Rudolph, M.L., Zhong, S.J., 2014. History and dynamics of net rotation of the mantle and
 1697 lithosphere. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems* 15, 3645–3657.
 1698 doi:10.1002/2014GC005457
 1699 Schuberth, B. S. A., Zanolli, C., Nolet, G., 2012. Synthetic seismograms for a synthetic
 1700 Earth: long-period P- and S-wave traveltimes variations can be explained by
 1701 temperature alone. *Geophys. J. Int.* 200, 1393–1412.
 1702 Schuberth, B.S.A., Bunge, H.-P., Ritsema, J., 2009. Tomographic filtering of high-
 1703 resolution mantle circulation models: Can seismic heterogeneity be explained by
 1704 temperature alone? *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems* 10, Q05W03.
 1705 doi:10.1029/2009GC002401
 1706 Shephard, G.E., Bunge, H.P., Schuberth, B.S.A.; et al. 2012, Testing absolute plate
 1707 reference frames and the implications for the generation of geodynamic mantle
 1708 heterogeneity structure, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 317, 204–217.

1709 Scotese, C.R., 1997. Continental Drift, 7th ed. PALEOMAP Project, Arlington, Texas. 79
 1710 pp.
 1711 Sidorin, I., Gurnis, M., Helmberger, D.V., 1999. Evidence for a ubiquitous seismic
 1712 discontinuity at the base of the mantle. *Science* 286, 1326–1331.
 1713 doi:10.1126/science.286.5443.1326
 1714 Simons, M., Hager, B.H., 1997. Localization of the gravity field and the signature of
 1715 glacial rebound. *Nature* 390, 500–504. doi:10.1038/37339
 1716 Sleep, N., 1990. Hotspots and Mantle Plumes - Some Phenomenology. *J. Geophys. Res.-*
 1717 *Solid Earth Planets* 95, 6715–6736. doi:10.1029/JB095iB05p06715
 1718 Smith, A.G., Hurley, A.M., Briden, J.C., 1981. Phanerozoic Paleocontinental World
 1719 Maps. Cambridge Univ. Press.
 1720 Spencer, J.R., Nimmo, F., 2013. Enceladus: An Active Ice World in the Saturn System.
 1721 *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.*, 41, 693–717. doi:10.1146/annurev-earth-050212-
 1722 124025
 1723 Sramek, O., Zhong, S.J., 2010. Long-wavelength stagnant lid convection with
 1724 hemispheric variation in lithospheric thickness: Link between Martian crustal
 1725 dichotomy and Tharsis? *J. Geophys. Res.-Planets* 115, E09010.
 1726 doi:10.1029/2010JE003597
 1727 Steinberger, B., O'Connell, R.J., 2000. Effects of mantle flow on hotspot motion, in *The*
 1728 *History and Dynamics of Global Plate Motions*, edited by M. A. Richards, R. G.
 1729 Gordon, and R. D. van der Hilst, pp. 377–398, AGU, Washington, D. C.
 1730 Steinberger, B., Torsvik, T.H., 2008. Absolute plate motions and true polar wander in the
 1731 absence of hotspot tracks. *Nature* 452, 620–U6. doi:10.1038/nature06824
 1732 Su, W.J., Dziewonski, A.M., 1997. Simultaneous inversion for 3-D variations in shear
 1733 and bulk velocity in the mantle. *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.* 100, 135–156.
 1734 doi:10.1016/S0031-9201(96)03236-0
 1735 Su, W., Woodward, R., Dziewonski, A., 1994. Degree-12 Model of Shear Velocity
 1736 Heterogeneity in the Mantle. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 99, 6945–6980.
 1737 doi:10.1029/93JB03408

1738 Tackley, P., 1993. Effects of Strongly Temperature-Dependent Viscosity on Time-
 1739 Dependent, 3-Dimensional Models of Mantle Convection. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 20,
 1740 2187–2190. doi:10.1029/93GL02317
 1741 Tackley, P.J., 2002. Strong heterogeneity caused by deep mantle layering. *Geochem.*
 1742 *Geophys. Geosystems* 3, 1024. doi:10.1029/2001GC000167
 1743 Tackley, P.J., 1998. Three-dimensional simulations of mantle convection with a thermo-
 1744 chemical basal boundary layer, in: Gurnis, M., Wyssession, M.E., Knittle, E., Buffett,
 1745 B.A. (Eds.), *Core-Mantle Boundary Region*. Amer. Geophys. Union, Washington, pp.
 1746 231–253.
 1747 Tackley, P.J., 1996a. On the ability of phase transitions and viscosity layering to induce
 1748 long wavelength heterogeneity in the mantle. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 23, 1985–1988.
 1749 doi:10.1029/96GL01980
 1750 Tackley, P.J., 1996b. Effects of strongly variable viscosity on three-dimensional
 1751 compressible convection in planetary mantles. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 101,
 1752 3311–3332. doi:10.1029/95JB03211
 1753 Tackley, P., Stevenson, D., Glatzmaier, G., Schubert, G., 1993. Effects of an
 1754 Endothermic Phase-Transition at 670 Km Depth in a Spherical Model of Convection
 1755 in the Earth's Mantle. *Nature* 361, 699–704. doi:10.1038/361699a0
 1756 Tan, E., Leng, W., Zhong, S., Gurnis, M., 2011. On the location of plumes and lateral
 1757 movement of thermochemical structures with high bulk modulus in the 3-D
 1758 compressible mantle. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosystems* 12, Q07005.
 1759 doi:10.1029/2011GC003665
 1760 Tanimoto, T., 1990. Long-Wavelength S-Wave Velocity Structure Throughout the
 1761 Mantle. *Geophys. J. Int.* 100, 327–336. doi:10.1111/j.1365-246X.1990.tb00688.x
 1762 Thorne, M.S., Garnero, E.J., Grand, S.P., 2004. Geographic correlation between hot spots
 1763 and deep mantle lateral shear-wave velocity gradients. *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.* 146,
 1764 47–63. doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2003.09.026
 1765 Thurber, C., Ritsema, J. (2007) Theory and observations - Seismic tomography and
 1766 inverse methods, in G. Schubert (ed.), *Treatise on Geophysics, Vol. 1*, pp. 323-360,
 1767 Elsevier Ltd., Oxford.

1768 Torsvik, T.H., 2003. The Rodinia jigsaw puzzle. *Science* 300, 1379–1381.
1769 doi:10.1126/science.1083469

1770 Torsvik, T.H., Smethurst, M.A., Burke, K., Steinberger, B., 2006. Large igneous
1771 provinces generated from the margins of the large low-velocity provinces in the deep
1772 mantle. *Geophys. J. Int.* 167, 1447–1460. doi:10.1111/j.1365-246X.2006.03158.x

1773 Torsvik, T.H., Steinberger, B., Cocks, L.R.M., Burke, K., 2008a. Longitude: Linking
1774 Earth’s ancient surface to its deep interior. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 276, 273–283.

1775 Torsvik, T.H., Smethurst, M.A., Burke, K., Steinberger, B., 2008b. Long term stability in
1776 deep mantle structure: evidence from the ca. 300 Ma Skagerrak-Centered Large
1777 Igneous Province (the SCLIP). *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 267, 444–452.

1778 Torsvik, T.H., Burke, K., Steinberger, B., Webb, S.J., Ashwal, L.D., 2010. Diamonds
1779 sampled by plumes from the core-mantle boundary. *Nature* 466, 352–355.

1780 Torsvik, T.H., van der Voo, R., Doubrovine, P.V., Burke, K., Steinberger, B., Ashwal,
1781 L.D., Tronnes, R.G., Webb, S.J., Bull, A.L., 2014. Deep mantle structure as a
1782 reference frame for movements in and on the Earth. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.*
1783 111, 8735–8740. doi:10.1073/pnas.1318135111

1784 Tucker, J.M., Mukhopadhyay, S., Schilling, J.-G., 2012. The heavy noble gas
1785 composition of the depleted MORB mantle (DMM) and its implications for the
1786 preservation of heterogeneities in the mantle. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 355, 244–254.
1787 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2012.08.025

1788 Turcotte, D. L. and Schubert, G., *Geodynamics*, 2nd ed. Cambridge University Press,
1789 2002

1790 Van der Hilst, R.D., de Hoop, M.V., Wang, P., Shim, S.-H., Ma, P., Tenorio, L., 2007.
1791 Seismostratigraphy and thermal structure of Earth’s core-mantle boundary region.
1792 *Science* 315, 1813–1817. doi:10.1126/science.1137867

1793 Van der Hilst, R.D., Widiyantoro, S., Engdahl, E.R., 1997. Evidence for deep mantle
1794 circulation from global tomography. *Nature* 386, 578–584. doi:10.1038/386578a0

1795 Van der Hilst, R., Engdahl, R., Spakman, W., Nolet, G., 1991. Tomographic Imaging of
1796 Subducted Lithosphere Below Northwest Pacific Island Arcs. *Nature* 353, 37–43.
1797 doi:10.1038/353037a0

1798 Van der Voo, R., 1994. True Polar Wander During the Middle Paleozoic. *Earth Planet.*
 1799 *Sci. Lett.* 122, 239–243. doi:10.1016/0012-821X(94)90063-9
 1800 van Keken, P.E., Ballentine, C.J., 1999. Dynamical models of mantle volatile evolution
 1801 and the role of phase transitions and temperature-dependent rheology, *J. Geophys.*
 1802 *Res.* 104, 7137–7168.
 1803 Wang, Y., Wen, L.X., 2004. Mapping the geometry and geographic distribution of a very
 1804 low velocity province at the base of the Earth's mantle. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth*
 1805 109, B10305. doi:10.1029/2003JB002674
 1806 Warren, J.M., Hirth, G., 2006. Grain size sensitive deformation mechanisms in naturally
 1807 deformed peridotites. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 248, 438–450.
 1808 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2006.06.006
 1809 Watts, A.B., Zhong, S.J., Hunter, J., 2013. The Behavior of the Lithosphere on Seismic to
 1810 Geologic Timescales. *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.* 41, 443–468.
 1811 doi:10.1146/annurev-earth-042711-105457
 1812 Wen, L.X., Silver, P., James, D., Kuehnel, R., 2001. Seismic evidence for a thermo-
 1813 chemical boundary at the base of the Earth's mantle. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 189,
 1814 141–153. doi:10.1016/S0012-821X(01)00365-X
 1815 Wieczorek, M.A., Jolliff, B.L., Khan, A., Pritchard, M.E., Weiss, B.P., Williams, J.G.,
 1816 Hood, L.L., Richter, K., Neal, C.R., Shearer, C.K., McCallum, I.S., Tompkins, S.,
 1817 Hawke, B.R., Peterson, C., Gillis, J.J., Bussey, B., 2006. The constitution and
 1818 structure of the lunar interior, in: Jolliff, B.L., Wieczorek, M.A. (Eds.), *New Views of*
 1819 *the Moon*. Mineralogical Soc Amer, Chantilly, 221–364.
 1820 Wolfe, C.J., Solomon, S.C., Laske, G., Collins, J.A., Detrick, R.S., Orcutt, J.A.,
 1821 Bercovici, D., Hauri, E.H., 2009. Mantle Shear-Wave Velocity Structure Beneath the
 1822 Hawaiian Hot Spot, *Science*, 326, 1388–1390.
 1823 Woodhouse, J., Dziewonski, A., 1984. Mapping the Upper Mantle - 3-Dimensional
 1824 Modeling of Earth Structure by Inversion of Seismic Waveforms. *J. Geophys. Res.*
 1825 89, 5953–5986. doi:10.1029/JB089iB07p05953.
 1826 Yoshida, M., Ogawa, M., 2005. Plume heat flow in a numerical model of mantle
 1827 convection with moving plates, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 239, 276–285,
 1828 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2005.09.006.

1829 Yoshida, M., Kageyama, A., 2006. Low-degree mantle convection with strongly
 1830 temperature- and depth-dependent viscosity in a three-dimensional spherical shell, *J.*
 1831 *Geophys. Res.*, 111, B03412, doi:10.1029/2005JB003905.
 1832 Yoshida, M., Santosh, M., 2011. Supercontinents, mantle dynamics and plate tectonics: A
 1833 perspective based on conceptual vs. numerical models, *Earth-Science Reviews*,
 1834 105(1-2), 1-24, doi:10.1016/j.earscirev.2010.12.002.
 1835 Yoshida, M., Hamano, Y., 2015. Pangea breakup and northward drift of the Indian
 1836 subcontinent reproduced by a numerical model of mantle convection, *Scientific*
 1837 *Reports*, 5, 8407, doi:10.1038/srep08407.
 1838 Zhang, P., Cohen, R.E., Haule, K., 2015, Effects of electron correlations on transport
 1839 properties of iron at Earth's core conditions, *Nature*, 517, 605-607.
 1840 Zhang, N., Zhong, S., Flowers, R.M., 2012. Predicting and testing continental vertical
 1841 motion histories since the Paleozoic. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 317, 426–435.
 1842 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2011.10.041
 1843 Zhang, N., Zhong, S., 2011. Heat fluxes at the Earth's surface and core-mantle boundary
 1844 since Pangea formation and their implications for the geomagnetic superchrons. *Earth*
 1845 *Planet. Sci. Lett.* 306, 205–216. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2011.04.001
 1846 Zhang, N., Zhong, S., Leng, W., Li, Z.-X., 2010. A model for the evolution of the Earth's
 1847 mantle structure since the Early Paleozoic. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 115,
 1848 B06401. doi:10.1029/2009JB006896
 1849 Zhang, S., Yuen, D.A., 1995. The Influences of Lower Mantle Viscosity Stratification on
 1850 3d Spherical-Shell Mantle Convection. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 132, 157–166.
 1851 doi:10.1016/0012-821X(95)00038-E
 1852 Zhao, D.P., 2004. Global tomographic images of mantle plumes and subducting slabs:
 1853 insight into deep Earth dynamics, *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.*, 146, 3-34.
 1854 Zhong, S.J., and M. L. Rudolph, 2015. On the temporal evolution of long-wavelength
 1855 mantle structure of the Earth mantle since the Early Paleozoic, *Geochem. Geophys.*
 1856 *Geosyst.*, 16, 1599-1615, doi:10.1002/2015GC005782.
 1857 Zhong, S.J., Watts, A.B., 2013. Lithospheric deformation induced by loading of the
 1858 Hawaiian Islands and its implications for mantle rheology. *J. Geophys. Res.-Solid*
 1859 *Earth* 118, 6025–6048. doi:10.1002/2013JB010408

1860 Zhong, S.J., McNamara, A., Tan, E., Moresi, L., Gurnis, M., 2008. A benchmark study
 1861 on mantle convection in a 3-D spherical shell using CitcomS. *Geochem. Geophys.*
 1862 *Geosystems* 9, Q10017. doi:10.1029/2008GC002048
 1863 Zhong, S.J., 2009. Migration of Tharsis volcanism on Mars caused by differential
 1864 rotation of the lithosphere. *Nat. Geosci.* 2, 19–23. doi:10.1038/NGEO392
 1865 Zhong, S.J., Zhang, N., Li, Z.-X., Roberts, J.H., 2007. Supercontinent cycles, true polar
 1866 wander, and very long-wavelength mantle convection. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 261,
 1867 551–564. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2007.07.049
 1868 Zhong, S.J., 2006. Constraints on thermochemical convection of the mantle from plume
 1869 heat flux, plume excess temperature and upper mantle temperature, *J. Geophys. Res.*,
 1870 111, B04409, doi:10.1029/2005JB003972.
 1871 Zhong, S.J., Zuber, M.T., 2001. Degree-1 mantle convection and the crustal dichotomy
 1872 on Mars. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 189, 75–84.
 1873 Zhong, S.J., Zuber, M.T., Moresi, L., Gurnis, M., 2000a. Role of temperature-dependent
 1874 viscosity and surface plates in spherical shell models of mantle convection. *J.*
 1875 *Geophys. Res.-Solid Earth* 105, 11063–11082. doi:10.1029/2000JB900003
 1876 Zhong, S.J., Parmentier, E.M., Zuber, M.T., 2000b. A dynamic origin for the global
 1877 asymmetry of lunar mare basalts. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 177, 131–140.
 1878 doi:10.1016/S0012-821X(00)00041-8
 1879 Zhong, S. J., Gurnis, M., Moresi, L., 1998. The role of faults, nonlinear rheology, and
 1880 viscosity structure in generating plates from instantaneous mantle flow models, *J.*
 1881 *Geophys. Res.*, 103, 15255-15268.
 1882 Zhong, S. J., Gurnis, M., 1994. The role of plates and temperature-dependent viscosity in
 1883 phase change dynamics, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 99, 15903-15917.
 1884 Zhong, S. J., Gurnis, M., 1993. Dynamic feedback between an non-subducting raft and
 1885 thermal convection, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 98, 12219-12232.
 1886 Zhou, H., 1996. A high-resolution P wave model for the top 1200 km of the mantle. *J.*
 1887 *Geophys. Res.* 101, 27791–27810.
 1888 Zuber, M.T., 2001. The crust and mantle of Mars. *Nature* 412, 220–227.
 1889 doi:10.1038/35084163
 1890

Figure Captions

Figure 1. Seismic structure at 2800 km (a) and 1800 km (b) depths and the normalized power spectra at different depths (c) from Ritsema et al [2011]. In Figure 1c, the right panel shows the depth-dependence of maximum power that is used to normalize the power spectra for each depth. The major seismically slow anomalies beneath Africa and Pacific above the core-mantle boundary in Figure 1a are often called the large low shear velocity provinces or LLSVPs. This figure shows clearly that the mantle structure is predominantly at degree-2.

Figure 2. Schematic diagrams showing different styles of mantle convection: an isochemical, whole mantle convection (a), a layered mantle convection with 670 km as the compositional boundary (b), a layered mantle convection by Kellogg et al. [2000] with an highly undulated compositional boundary at ~1700 km depth (c), and a mantle convection model with thermochemical piles (i.e., the LLSVPs), ULVZs, and pPv (d). Figure 2c is taken from [Kellogg et al., 2000].

Figure 3. A map of earth's non-hydrostatic geoid anomalies from degrees 2 to 12 (a), and spatial distribution of hotspot volcanism with deep mantle plumes and restored LIP eruption sites plotted on a map of seismic anomalies at 2800 km depth from Smean model [Becker and Boschi, 2002] (b). In Figure 3a, the star at (0°N, 11°E) marks the axis going through the centers of the positive degree-2 geoid anomalies associated with the African and Pacific LLSVPs. This axis defines the great circle path along which the Earth's spin axis migrates for TPW events inferred in Torsvik et al. [2010; 2014]. Figure

3b is taken from Torsvik et al. [2010]. In addition to hotspot volcanism and LIPs, Figure 3b also shows the distribution of kimberlites (black and white dots) and -1% contours of S-wave velocity anomalies (red contours) that were often used to define the LLSVPs.

Figure 4. Plate motion at the present-day (a) and ~100 Ma (b) from Lithgow-Bertelloni and Richards [1998].

Figure 5. Seismic model of Ritsema et al. [2004] viewed from above the Pacific (a) and Africa (b), and the chemical structure from 3-D semi-dynamic models of thermochemical convection by McNamara and Zhong [2005] viewed from above the Pacific (c) and Africa (d). In Figure 5a-b, only the seismic models below 1100 km depth are shown, and the red and blue iso-surfaces represent seismically slow and fast anomalies. Figures 5c-d show iso-surfaces for compositional field that represent the chemically distinct and dense mantle or LLSVPs. The figure was modified from McNamara and Zhong [2005].

Figure 6. Convective structures from 3-D fully dynamic models of mantle convection with different model parameters. (a) isoviscous, basal heating convection at $Ra=7 \times 10^3$ with stable tetrahedral convective structure, b) isoviscous, mixed heating (60% internal heating) convection at $Ra=2.43 \times 10^5$, c) mixed heating convection (50% internal heating) with temperature-dependent viscosity (10^3 viscosity variations for non-dimensional temperature changing from 0 to 1) at $Ra=4.56 \times 10^6$, d) the same convection model as in Fig. 6c but with a factor of 30 viscosity reduction for the top 670 km, e) the same convection model as in Fig. 6d but with increased lithospheric viscosity, showing degree-

l convection, and f) the same convection model as in Fig. 6e but with an imposed supercontinent at the surface, showing degree-2 convection with two-antipodal upwellings, one of which is beneath the supercontinent. Figures 6a, 6b, and 6c-6e were modified from Zhong et al. [2008], Zhong et al. [2000], and Zhong et al. [2007], respectively. The yellow and blue isosurfaces of residual temperature represent hot upwellings and cold downwellings, respectively.

Figure 7. Dominant spherical harmonic degree l (i.e., convective wavelength) of convective structure versus the ratio of lithospheric to upper mantle viscosities $\eta_{\text{lith}}/\eta_{\text{um}}$ from 3-D fully dynamic models of thermal convection with temperature- and depth-dependent viscosity [Liu and Zhong, 2014]. The models are similar to those in Zhong et al. [2007] (e.g., Figures 6c-e) but with a larger range of model parameters of Rayleigh number Ra and $\eta_{\text{lith}}/\eta_{\text{um}}$. For all the calculations, the upper mantle is 30 times weaker than the lower mantle (i.e., $\eta_{\text{um}}/\eta_{\text{lm}}=1/30$), and temperature-dependent viscosity gives rise to 10^3 viscosity variations for dimensionless temperature varying from 0 to 1. The spectral analyses are done for quasi-steady state temperature field at 100 km above the CMB, and the dominant harmonic degree l is the averaged over some time period.

Figure 8. The setup of a Rayleigh-Taylor instability analysis in spherical geometry using an analytical model by Zhong and Zuber [2001] (a), and preferred wavelengths (i.e., spherical harmonic degree, l) predicted from the Rayleigh-Taylor instability analysis for different viscosity contrasts between the top and bottom layers, η_t/η_b , and different radial

location of the density interface (b). The results show that radially stratified viscosity leads to long-wavelength structure.

Figure 9. Supercontinents Pangea at 195 Ma [Scotese, 1997] (a) and Rodinia at 750 Ma [Li et al., 2008] (b), time-dependent magmatism for the last 2.7 Ga [Ernst and Bleeker, 2010] (c), and time-dependent LIP events for the last 500 Ma [Torsvik et al., 2008a]. Figures 9a-b, 9c, and 9d were modified from Zhong et al. [2007], Ernst and Bleeker [2010], and Torsvik et al. [2008a], respectively. In Figure 9c, the magmatic events represent secular pulses of short-lived mafic magmatic events binned per 100 Myrs. In Figure 9d, each symbol with abbreviation represents a LIP event (see Torsvik et al. [2008a] for details of abbreviation), and the latitudes of LIP eruptions were also given.

Figure 10. Mantle thermochemical structure at 2750 km depth from a semi-dynamic convection model by Zhang et al., [2010] at 330 Ma (a), 195 Ma (b), and present-day (c). In these temperature plots, the large regions with high temperature are also where the chemical piles are. The plate motion history model uses plate motions of LBR1998 for the last 120 Ma and continental motions from paleogeography reconstruction of Scotese [1997] for earlier times. The figure was modified from Zhang et al. [2010].

Figure 11. Predicted time-dependent dynamic topography at the Slave craton (a) and Kaapvaal craton (b) from semi-dynamic convection models of Zhang et al. (2010) (i.e., from Figure 10) and their comparison with the inferred burial and unroofing history for

these two cratons from thermochronology studies (shaded) [Flowers et al., 2012; Flowers and Schoene, 2010]. The figure was modified from Zhang et al. [2012].

Figure 12. Time-evolution of thermochemical structures at 2750 km depth from a semi-dynamic mantle convection model of Zhong and Rudolph [2015] using the plate motion history for the last 410 Ma from Domeier and Torsvik [2014] and Seton et al. [2012]. Snapshots at 410 Ma or initial condition (a), ~300 Ma (b), ~181 Ma (c), and the present-day (d). The black contour is for composition field $C=0.5$. Note that the initial temperature and composition structure in Figure 12a is taken from the present-day structure from another calculation using Seton et al [2012] for the last 200 Ma plate motion and that the present-day structure for the current case in Figure 12d after 410 Myrs time integration becomes nearly identical to the initial condition in Figure 12a. The calculation shows significant time variations of mantle structure from the initially degree-2 structure at 410 Ma to that with significant degree-1 structure at ~300 Ma using Domeier and Torsvik [2014] plate motion. The figure was taken from Zhong and Rudolph [2015].

1999
2000
2001
2002
2003
2004

Shijie Zhong is a Professor of Physics and Geophysics at the Department of Physics, University of Colorado at Boulder. He received his Ph. D. in Geophysics and Scientific Computing from University of Michigan in 1994.

2005
2006
2007
2008

Xi Liu is a Ph.D. graduate student at the Department of Physics, University of Colorado at Boulder. She received her B.S. in Geophysics from University of Science and Technology of China in 2010.

Figure 1

Figure 2

Figure 3

Figure 4

Figure 5

Figure 6

Figure 7

Figure 8

Figure 9

Figure 10

Figure 11

410 Ma

a)

181.1 Ma

c)

299.1 Ma

b)

0 Ma

d)

Temperature

Figure 12