1 Title: **RAD Sequencing Enables Unprecedented Phylogenetic Resolution and Objective**
2 **Species Delimitation in Recalcitrant Divergent Taxa**

3
4 Authors: Santiago Herrera^{1,2*}, Timothy M. Shank¹

5
6 ¹*Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA, USA*

7 ²*Biology Department, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, Woods Hole, MA, USA*

8 **Present affiliation: University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada*

9
10 Email addresses: S. Herrera sherrera@alum.mit.edu; T.M. Shank tshank@whoi.edu

11
12 Corresponding authors: Santiago Herrera and Timothy M. Shank; 266 Woods Hole Road, MS33,
13 Woods Hole, MA 02543, USA. Tel: +1 508 289 3761, Fax: +1 508-457-2134.

Abstract

Species delimitations is problematic in many cases due to the difficulty of evaluating predictions from species hypotheses. In many cases delimitations rely on subjective interpretations of morphological and/or DNA data. Species with inadequate genetic resources needed to answer questions regarding evolutionary relatedness and genetic uniqueness are particularly problematic. In this study, we demonstrate the utility of restriction site associated DNA sequencing (RAD-seq) to objectively resolve unambiguous phylogenetic relationships in a recalcitrant group of deep-sea corals with divergences >80 million years. We infer robust species boundaries in the genus *Paragorgia* by testing alternative delimitation hypotheses using a Bayes Factors delimitation method. We present substantial evidence rejecting the current morphological species delimitation model for the genus and infer the presence of cryptic species associated with environmental variables. We argue that the suitability limits of RAD-seq for phylogenetic inferences cannot be assessed in terms of absolute time, but are contingent on taxon-specific factors. We show that classical taxonomy can greatly benefit from integrative approaches that provide objective tests to species delimitation hypotheses. Our results lead the way for addressing further questions in marine biogeography, community ecology, population dynamics, conservation, and evolution.

Keywords

Cryptic species; Species delimitation; BFD*; Phylogenomics; SNPs; RAD-seq.

1. Introduction

Species delimitation is problematic in many taxa due to the difficulty of evaluating predictions from species hypotheses derived using different species concepts. Species concepts set particular expectations of the properties used to support species delimitations (De Queiroz, 2007). For example, the classic biological species concept requires intrinsic reproductive isolation between heterospecific organisms and interbreeding among homospecific organisms resulting in viable and fertile descendants (Mayr, 1942). In many, if not the majority of cases, it is difficult to evaluate behavioural, reproductive, and ecological properties due to technical limitations of field or laboratory work, which largely determine the kind of observations and data that can be obtained. In these cases researchers conventionally rely on morphological observations and/or DNA sequence data to generate species delimitation hypotheses.

Although there have been significant attempts to develop statistical methods that objectively identify species-diagnostic morphological discontinuities (e.g., Zapata and Jimenez 2012), many species delimitations are performed subjectively based on assessments made by specialized taxonomists. Molecular phylogenetic analyses of DNA sequences provide independent means to test these species delimitation hypotheses utilizing a variety of methods, ranging from variability thresholds of barcode sequences (Hebert et al., 2003) to probabilistic coalescent-based model methods (Fujisawa and Barraclough, 2013; Yang and Rannala, 2010). These molecular methods rely on informative DNA sequence markers, and in many cases on resolved phylogenies.

The sub-class Octocorallia (Phylum Cnidaria), which includes animals known as

61 gorgonians, sea pens, and soft corals, is an example of a recalcitrant group wherein species
62 delimitations are problematic. Octocorals are predominantly a deep-sea group (Cairns, 2007;
63 Watling et al., 2011) and therefore are extremely difficult to observe and collect. Classic
64 morphology-based species delimitation and identification in this group is arduous for non-
65 specialists, and challenging to replicate among taxonomists (Catherine S. McFadden et al.,
66 2010b). Variations in octocoral colony architecture and micro-skeletal structures – sclerites – are
67 used as species diagnostic characters (e.g. Bayer, 1956). However, studies over the last 15 years
68 have shown that in many cases species delimitations and systematics based on these
69 morphological traits keep little to no correspondence with the patterns of genetic diversity and
70 relatedness inferred using mitochondrial and ribosomal DNA sequence markers (Dueñas and
71 Sánchez, 2009; France, 2007; McFadden et al., 2006). A confounding factor when analysing
72 mitochondrial DNA markers is the fact that anthozoans, including octocorals, have slow rates of
73 sequence evolution relative to other metazoans (Hellberg, 2006; Shearer et al., 2002).
74 Furthermore, octocoral mitochondrion is unique among eukaryotes by having a functional DNA
75 mismatch repair gene — *mtMutS* — which presumably is responsible for the extremely low
76 sequence variability observed in this group (Bilewitch and Degnan, 2011). Traditional molecular
77 markers have thus been remarkably insufficient to resolve relationships at all taxonomic levels
78 within the octocorals (Catherine S. McFadden et al., 2010b). Alternative nuclear markers, such
79 as the ITS2 and *SRP54* have been used to examine interspecific and intraspecific relationships
80 (Aguilar and Sánchez, 2007; Concepcion et al., 2007; Herrera et al., 2010); however, their
81 application and impact has been limited due to issues regarding intragenomic variability
82 (Sánchez and Dorado, 2008) and low sequencing reliability (Catherine S. McFadden et al.,
83 2010a). These long-standing technical problems have caused fundamental questions in

octocorals regarding species differentiation, systematics, diversity, biogeography, community ecology, population dynamics, and evolution to remain unanswered.

Technological developments in next-generation sequencing platforms and library preparation methodologies have made genomic resources increasingly accessible and available for the study of non-model organisms, thus offering a great opportunity to overcome the difficulties inherent to the use of traditional sequencing approaches. One of these methodologies is restriction-site-associated DNA sequencing (RAD-seq), which combines enzymatic fragmentation of genomic DNA with high-throughput sequencing for the generation of large numbers of markers (Baird et al., 2008). RAD-seq has shown great promise to resolve difficult phylogenetic, phylogeographic, and species delimitation questions in diverse groups of eukaryotes (Cruaud et al., 2014; Emerson et al., 2010; Herrera et al., 2015b; Leaché et al., 2014; Wagner et al., 2012) , including cnidarians (Reitzel et al., 2013) and most recently deep-sea octocorals (Pante et al., 2014). The number of orthologous restriction sites that can be retained across taxa, which decreases as divergence increases, limits the usefulness of RAD-seq for these kinds of studies. *In silico* studies in model organisms indicate that RAD-seq can be used to infer phylogenetic relationships in young groups of species (up to 60 million years old), such as *Drosophila* (Cariou et al., 2013; Rubin et al., 2012); however, the boundary limits of this technique have only been empirically explored in a handful of mostly younger groups (Cruaud et al., 2014; Gonen et al., 2015; Hipp et al., 2014; Leaché et al., 2015).

In this study, we aim to empirically explore the limits of RAD-seq to solve questions in phylogenetics and species delimitation. We focus on the recalcitrant *Anthomastus-Corallium*

clade of octocorals (*sensu* McFadden et al. 2006) to test the utility of RAD-seq to resolve phylogenetic relationships among divergent taxa, and to infer objective species boundaries. Corals in the *Anthomastus-Corallium* clade (hereafter referred as the AC clade) are among the most conspicuous, widely distributed, and ecologically important benthic invertebrates in deep-water ecosystems (Roberts et al., 2009). This clade is constituted by more than 100 species defined morphologically, divided in 10 genera, and three families (World Register of Marine Species at <http://www.marinespecies.org> accessed on 2014-10-10), spanning a divergence time of over 100 million years (Ardila et al., 2012; Herrera et al., 2012). However, species delimitations and phylogenetic relationships in this clade, as in other octocorals, are controversial and conflictive (Ardila et al., 2012; Herrera et al., 2012, 2010). Many of the species in this group are considered species indicators of Vulnerable Marine Ecosystems (ICES, 2013), with some of them considered endangered (CITES, 2014). Accurate species identifications, as well as complete inventories and knowledge of species ranges, are therefore critical to ensure the effectiveness and appropriateness of conservation and management policies.

2. Materials & methods

2.1. Morphological species identifications and DNA sequencing

To carry out identifications using current morphological coral species descriptions, we performed scanning electron microscopy of sclerites on 44 octocoral specimens from the AC clade (Table S1) identifying 12 putative morphospecies. To obtain a dense genome-wide set of markers we performed RAD sequencing with the 6-cutter restriction enzyme PstI (using PredRAD (Herrera et al., 2015a) we predicted between 32,000-110,000 cleavage sites in their

genomes [Table S2]). DNA was purified following (Herrera et al., 2015b). Concentration-normalized DNA was submitted to Floragenex Inc (Eugene, OR) for library preparation and RAD sequencing. Libraries were sequenced by 48-multiplex, using 10-base pair barcodes, on a lane of Illumina Hi-Seq 2000 (100bp). This yielded 3.9 ± 1.4 million raw reads (average $\pm$ standard deviation) per individual. To compare the inferences obtained from RAD-seq data with the inferences drawn from traditional genetic barcoding data, we performed Sanger sequencing of the mitochondrial *mtMutS* gene on the same specimens. PCRs were carried out following (Herrera et al., 2015b), with primers described by (Herrera et al., 2010), and sequencing was performed by Eurofins Genomics (Eurofins MWG Operon, Inc.)

2.2. RAD-seq data filtering clustering and phylogenetic inference

Sequence reads were de-multiplexed and quality filtered with the *process_radtags* program from the package Stacks v1.20 (Catchen et al., 2013) using the following parameters: *-t* 91, *-c*, *-s* 10, *-r*, and *-w* 0.15. Additional filtering, and the clustering within and between individuals to identify homologous loci (full sequences, including invariable sites and single nucleotide polymorphisms) was performed using the program pyRAD v2.01 (Eaton, 2014). Approximately $74.3 \pm 8.1\%$ of the raw reads were retained after these steps (Table S3). To examine the sensitivity of the phylogenetic inference to the clustering parameters used to identify orthologous loci and create nucleotide matrices in pyRAD, we investigated different combinations of clustering thresholds (*c* 0.80, 0.85 and 0.90) and minimum number of taxa per locus (*m* 4, 6, and 9) in a set of ‘backbone’ supermatrices containing one individual from each of the 12 identified morphospecies. The minimum depth of coverage required to build a cluster and the maximum number of shared polymorphic sites in a locus were kept constant at 4 (*d*) and

3 (p) respectively. The 9 resulting **backbone** supermatrices ranged in the total number of loci per matrix from ~9 to 60 thousand loci, increasing dramatically as the minimum number of taxa per locus was reduced (Table S4). In contrast, the different clustering thresholds did not have a significant effect on the total number of loci, but rather on the number of variable sites and, most importantly, on the number of phylogenetically-informative sites (Table S4). Each of the resulting **backbone** supermatrices was analysed in RAxML-HPC2 v8.0 (Stamatakis, 2014) for maximum likelihood (ML) phylogenetic inference. For this, and all the other phylogenetic analyses in RAxML, we assumed the GTR GAMMA substitution model as suggested by the Akaike Information Criterion (AIC) implemented in JModelTest 2.0 (Darriba et al., 2012). Branch support was assessed by 500 bootstrap replicates.

We selected an optimal combination of loci clustering parameters as the set of parameters that minimized the number of missing data and maximized the number of phylogenetically-informative sites while producing a highly supported phylogenetic tree. These optimal parameters were: clustering threshold of 80% similarity among sequences (c 0.80) and a minimum coverage of taxa per locus of 75% (m 9) (Table S4). The resulting supermatrix had 20% missing data, and 24% of the variable sites were phylogenetically-informative. A supermatrix containing the sequence data of all the 44 octocoral specimens, denominated ‘**PHYLO**’, was built using this parameter combination (c 0.80, m 33) in pyRAD (see Table S5 for individual statistics) and analyzed in RAxML. This supermatrix has 5,997 loci with 85,293 variable sites; 53,150 of which were phylogenetically informative.

2.3. Phylogenetic inference with traditional genetic barcoding data

To compare the tree topology obtained from the phylogenetic inferences of the **PHYLO** supermatrix with traditional genetic barcoding data we analyzed the *mtMutS* sequences from the same individuals (hereafter referred to as ‘**mitochondrial**’ matrix) using RAxML. To place the specimens from this study in a broader phylogenetic context we added data from 233 additional specimens belonging to the AC clade, as well as outgroups, to the **mitochondrial** matrix (see Table S6, Figs. S2 and S3), and analyzed it with RAxML.

2.4. Testing species delimitation models for *Paragorgia*

To evaluate the utility of RAD-seq to perform objective species delimitations in octocorals we focused on specimens of the genus *Paragorgia* – the best-sampled taxon in our dataset, both in terms of geographic representation and number of putative morphospecies. We used the Bayes Factor Delimitation method with genomic data (BFD*) (Leaché et al., 2014), which allows for the comparison of alternative species delimitation models in an explicit multispecies coalescent framework using genome-wide SNP data. We calculated marginal likelihood estimates (MLE) of alternative taxonomy-informed and taxonomy-independent species delimitation models on a supermatrix of unlinked SNPs from the 31 specimens of *Paragorgia* (**‘PARAGORGIA’**: c 0.80, and m 31 for 0% missing data; only one SNP per locus, for a total of 1,203 SNPs), and compared them to the MLE of the null model ‘**morphid**’, which is based on current morphological species descriptions (Sánchez, 2005). MLE were obtained using the implementation of BFD* in the SNAPP (Bryant et al., 2012) plug-in for BEAST v2.1.3 (Bouckaert et al., 2014). We performed a path-sampling of 48 steps (MCMC length 100,000, pre-burnin 10,000), following (Leaché et al., 2014). Bayes Factors (BF) were calculated from the MLE for each model and compared (Kass and Raftery, 1995).

Four alternative taxonomy-informed species delimitation models were defined for *Paragorgia*: i) ‘**PAB**’: **morphid** plus a split of *P. arborea* based on previous evidence of genetic differentiation of north Pacific populations (Herrera et al., 2012); ii) ‘**STE**’: **morphid** plus a split of *P. stephencairnsi* based on depth differences (specimens collected <350m vs. >1000m), as depth is known to be an important structuring variable in marine taxa (Jennings et al., 2013; Prada and Hellberg, 2013; Quattrini et al., 2015); iii) ‘**PABSTE**’: **morphid** plus the splits of **PAB** and **STE**; and iv) ‘**splitPAB**’: **morphid** plus the split of **STE** and an additional split in **PAB** where *P. arborea* is split in 3 corresponding to the ocean basin where the specimens were collected (north Pacific, south Pacific and north Atlantic).

Five alternative taxonomy-independent models for *Paragorgia* were defined through Bayesian and ML implementations of the Poisson tree processes model (PTP) (available at <http://species.h-its.org/ptp/>). PTP estimates the number of speciation events in a rooted phylogenetic tree in terms of nucleotide substitutions (Zhang et al., 2013). We used PTP to analyse the trees obtained from ML phylogenetic inferences of reduced **mitochondrial** and **PHYLO** matrices that included the 33 specimens from the family Paragorgiidae (genera *Paragorgia* and *Sibogorgia*) exclusively. The ‘**PARAGORGIIDAE**’ RAD-seq supermatrix was generated in pyRAD (*c* 0.80 and *m* 33; this supermatrix has 446 loci with 3,595 variable sites; 2,361 of which were phylogenetically informative). The resulting trees were rooted with *Sibogorgia* and analyzed by the PTP method (MCMC length 500,000, 100 thinning, 25% burnin). We assessed convergence by examining the likelihood trace. The combinations of ML and Bayesian PTP implementations (mlPTP and bPTP) with the **PARAGORGIIDAE** *mtMutS*

and RAD-seq trees resulted in four species delimitation models: ‘**mlPTPmt**’, ‘**bPTPmt**’, ‘**mlPTPrad**’, and ‘**bPTPrad**’. Lastly, because deep-sea corals are known to show genetic differentiation at ocean basin/regional scales (Herrera et al., 2012; Miller et al., 2011; Morrison et al., 2011), we constructed an additional taxonomy-uninformed naïve species delimitation model, ‘**geo**’, based on the geographic location where the specimens were collected (north Pacific, south Pacific or north Atlantic ocean basins). A extreme model were all *Paragorgia* specimens were part of a single species was tested, however the probability of this model given the data was extremely small, approaching 0, which caused a computational logic error in all attempts (data not shown).

2.5. Species tree inference

To test the tree topology in the genus *Paragorgia* obtained by the phylogenetic analysis of the **PHYLO** and **PARAGORGIIDAE** concatenated supermatrices we performed a species tree inference from the SNP data in the **PARAGORGIA** matrix using SNAPP. This program allows the inference of species trees from unlinked SNP data while bypassing the inference of individual gene trees. We performed 3 independent runs (MCMC length 10,000,000; sampling every 1,000; pre-burnin 1,000) with default priors for coalescence rate, mutation rate and ancestral population size parameters. We assessed convergence to stationary distributions and effective sample sizes >200 after 10% burnin in TRACER (Rambaut and Drummond, 2007). Species trees in the posterior distribution were summarized with DENSITREE v2.01 (Bouckaert, 2010).

3. Results & discussion

3.1. RAD sequencing enables unprecedented phylogenetic resolution

Our analyses of RAD-seq data provide a robust and fully resolved phylogenetic hypothesis for the recalcitrant octocorals in the *Anthomastus-Corallium* clade, a result never achieved before. This study together with the work by Pante et al. (2014) in the octocoral genus *Chrysogorgia*, constitute the first applications of RAD-sequencing for phylogenetics and species delimitation in cnidarians, and one of the first ones in invertebrates. All of our analyses based on RAD-seq supermatrices – varying in taxon coverage, degree of divergence among taxa, proportion of missing data, number of loci, and analysis type (ML concatenated loci or Bayesian SNPs species tree) – produced completely congruent and strongly supported trees, which together provide extremely high confidence on the phylogenetic hypothesis inferred for the octocoral AC clade (Figs. 1, 2, 3, 4 and Fig. S1). Each one of the morphologically identified families, genera, and species in this dataset were monophyletic. The branching pattern of the tree is consistent with an expected transition between coalescent processes among species and genera (long deep branches), and population processes within species (short shallow branches).

3.2. Single markers alone can produce biased phylogenetic inferences

Only a handful of studies, using traditional mitochondrial data and the ITS2 and 28S nuclear markers, have attempted to evaluate phylogenetic relationships in the octocoral AC clade (Ardila et al., 2012; Figueroa and Baco, 2015; Herrera et al., 2012, 2010; McFadden and van Ofwegen, 2013; Uda et al., 2013). These studies find support for the monophyly of the genus *Paragorgia*, the family Coralliidae, and the sister relationship between the Paragorgiidae and Coralliidae. However, those data do not provide enough phylogenetic resolution to infer the evolutionary relationships among many of the putative morphological species. Furthermore,

significant incongruences between mitochondrial and nuclear ITS2 gene trees from AC taxa have been documented by (Herrera et al., 2010). Here we reproduce similar incongruences in tree topology when comparing the trees inferred from mitochondrial and nuclear RAD-seq datasets (Fig. 2). Likewise, Pante et al. (2014) documented marked incongruence between trees inferred from mitochondrial and RAD-seq data in *Chrysogorgia*. These observations suggest that processes that can cause gene tree heterogeneity, such as incomplete lineage sorting and horizontal gene transfer (Edwards, 2009; Maddison, 1997), may be more prevalent in octocorals than previously recognized. Consequently, we suggest that single marker gene trees in octocorals and other taxa, particularly from the mitochondria (including whole mitochondrial genomes), should not be considered as robust hypotheses of true species phylogenies on their own, without further validation by multiple informative and independent nuclear loci. While we recognize the important utility of using single barcoding gene regions for the rapid assessment of species assignments, we urge systematists to be conservative when making taxonomic rearrangements based on inferences from single-marker data alone.

3.3. RAD-seq data is suitable for phylogenetic inference in divergent taxa

Contrary to the currently accepted idea that RAD-seq data are only suitable for taxa with divergence times younger than 60 million years (MY) (Rubin et al., 2012), we demonstrate their suitability well beyond this age threshold. Remarkably, we were able to confidently resolve phylogenetic relationships among genera from different families diverging by at least 80 MY in the AC clade. The split between the lineages leading to the families Paragorgiidae and Coralliidae has been dated, using coralliid fossils, to be between 80-150 MY old (Ardila et al., 2012; Herrera et al., 2012). We found that the proportion of shared loci among individuals from

these to families in our optimal **backbone** supermatrix was 70-80% (Fig. 1). Park et al. (2012) estimated the age of the most recent common ancestor of the Coralliidae at approximately 50 MY (25-100 MY 95% confidence region), using independent cnidarian fossils for molecular clock calibration. The split with the genera *Anthomastus* and *Heteropolypus* is likely older than 100 MY. It is without question that, due to mutation at restriction sites, the number of RAD loci among taxa for which orthology can be established decreases rapidly as divergence increases. However, we suggest that the suitability limits of RAD-seq for phylogenetics in divergent taxa cannot be assessed in terms of absolute time, but depend on taxon-specific factors such as mutation rate, generation time and effective population size.

Bioinformatic studies addressing the issue of extent of the suitability of RAD-seq for phylogenetic inference have focused mainly on *Drosophila* as a study model (Cariou et al., 2013; Rubin et al., 2012). Longer generation times and lower metabolic rates in taxa like deep-sea corals, relative to those in organisms like *Drosophila*, could cause a reduction in mutation rates (see review by Baer et al. (2007)), which may in turn decrease the evolutionary rates at restriction sites and allow for phylogenetic inferences using RAD-seq in situations of deeper divergence. Consistent with this hypothesis, we observe a nucleotide diversity (π) calculated across all octocoral specimens from the **PHYLO** matrix of 0.012 ± 0.002 (considered a minimum since RAD-seq data can lead to diversity underestimates (Arnold et al., 2013) (see Table S7 and Table S8 for individual values), which is significantly lower than the nucleotide diversity in many of the *Drosophila* species (Cariou et al., 2013; Rubin et al., 2012). In addition to mutation rates and nucleotide diversity, there are many factors and processes known to influence genetic diversity across species – and likely the evolutionary rate as well. These factors

include the effective population size, selection, habitat, geographic range, and mating system (Leffler et al., 2012). We suggest that the cumulative expression of these processes are captured by RAD-seq approaches and can be successfully used to infer phylogenetic relationships in certain taxa with deeper divergences than previously suggested. This is particularly true when the number of RAD loci is maximized through the choice of restriction enzymes with higher cutting frequencies in the target taxon (Herrera et al., 2015a).

3.4. RAD-seq reveals cryptic diversity and allows robust species delineations

Our study, a statistically-rigorous genomic test of species hypotheses in octocorals, provides substantial evidence rejecting the current morphological species delimitation model for the genus *Paragorgia*. Branch-length differences among individuals, as well as well-supported sub-clades, revealed intraspecific genetic diversity that was undetected by the **mitochondrial** matrix. Furthermore, we find very strong support from Bayes Factors ($2\log(\text{BF}) > 10$; *sensu* Kass and Raftery, 1995) for a nested model (**PABSTE**) that combines species boundaries from morphological taxonomy with cryptic diversity linked to environmental variables of geographic location and depth (Figs. 3 and 4). The **PABSTE** model proposes 9 species among the examined specimens. Five of these species correspond to the morphological species *P. coralloides*, *P. kaupeka*, *P. alisonae*, *P. johnsoni*, and *P. maunga*. Two splits, corresponding to sub-clades in the morphological species *P. arborea* and in *P. stephencairnsi*, indicate cases of cryptic species.

Herrera et al. (2012) found significant genetic differentiation of the north Pacific populations of *P. arborea* relative to the south Pacific, Atlantic and Indian Ocean populations, and suggested that these populations likely represent sub-species. The north Pacific populations

of *P. arborea* were previously defined as a separate species, *P. pacifica*, by Verrill (1922) based on gross colony morphology, but later combined into a single species by Grasshoff (1979). Sánchez (2005) suggested potential small differences in medullar sclerite sizes and ornamentation between north Pacific specimens and specimens from elsewhere. However, we were unable to recognize these morphological differences in the few examined specimens in this study, which may reflect on the plasticity of these characters. Nonetheless, based on the very strong support for the split of *P. arborea* from analysis of genome-wide SNP makers, corresponding to a pattern of segregation by geographic location, we resurrect the species *Paragorgia pacifica* Verrill 1922 for the north Pacific populations of formerly *P. arborea*. We find no evidence of cryptic speciation between the north Atlantic and south Pacific *P. arborea* and therefore conclude it should be considered a single species as previously suggested by Herrera et al. (2012).

Depth is an important factor contributing to genetic differentiation and the formation of marine species living in shallow waters (Carlson and Budd, 2002; Prada and Hellberg, 2013) and at depth (Glazier and Etter, 2014; Jennings et al., 2013; Quattrini et al., 2013). The observed cryptic differentiation between specimens of *P. stephencairnsi* collected shallower than 350m and deeper than 1000m indicates that depth is also a diversifying force in octocorals from the AC clade, which had previously gone undetected (Herrera et al., 2012). The holotype of *P. stephencairnsi* was collected from approximately 350m in the Georgia Strait of British Columbia, overlapping in depth range and geographic region with that of most of the specimens from the shallow sub-clade examined in this study. Therefore, we propose to conserve that name

360 *P. stephencairnsi* for that shallow sub-clade, and consider the deep sub-clade as a new species
 361 *Paragorgia jamesi* sp. nov.
 362
 363 Family **Paragorgiidae** Kükenthal, 1916
 364 Genus **Paragorgia** Stiasny, 1937
 365
 366 ***Paragorgia stephencairnsi*** species-complex
 367 Revised morphological diagnosis [emended from Sánchez (2005)]: Robust branches.
 368 White, pink or red cortex; white or pink medulla; white, pink, red or purple autozoid apertures.
 369 Numerous conical, semi-closed, autozoid polyp apertures uniformly/randomly distributed
 370 throughout the branches. Siphonozoid apertures tightly closed, not observable to the naked eye.
 371 Medulla in the terminal branches with 6–7 major canals. Surface sclerites mostly 7- and 8-
 372 radiates, with long (> 0.01 mm) lobulated, smooth rays. Medulla with elongated, forked or
 373 irregular spindles, highly ornated, usually less than 0.3 mm in length.
 374
 375 ***Paragorgia jamesi* sp. nov.**
 376 Material examined: **Holotype** Royal British Columbia Museum (RBCM) 010-00234-004
 377 (2344), TC2004-039 (Fig. 5 A-F); Latitude: 53.3709, Longitude: -133.3123; Depth: 1192-1195
 378 m; Locality: Haida Gwaii, off Rennell Sound, west of Graham Island, British Columbia (BC),
 379 Canada; Collection date: 3 September 2001; Collector: Jim Boutillier. **Paratype** U.S. National
 380 Museum of Natural History (USNM) 1007316 (Fig. 5 G-K); Latitude: 48.4375, Longitude: -
 381 126.384; Depth: 1168 m; Locality: continental slope southwest of Vancouver Island, BC,
 382 Canada; Collection date: 9 September 2004; Collector: Jim Boutillier.

Diagnosis: Morphology as described for the species complex. *P. jamesi* (deep sub-clade) is differentiated from *P. stephencairnsi* (shallow sub-clade) by 125 fixed SNPs identified from the **PARAGORGIA** supermatrix (see **Supplementary File 1** for details). *A posteriori* comparisons of morphological characters revealed that the lobulated rays of 7- and 8-radiate surface sclerites in *P. jamesi* have mostly rounded edges, whereas the ones from *P. stephencairnsi* have mostly sharp edges (**Figs. 5 & 6**).

Distribution: Northeaster Pacific Ocean. Continental slope off British Columbia, Canada. Depth range: 1168-1195 m.

Etymology: Named in honour of James David Rodríguez Rubio, arguably the best Colombian professional football (soccer) player in history. His many achievements were a source of inspiration for this work.

Remarks: The lobulated rays of 7- and 8-radiate surface sclerites of the paratype of *P. stephencairnsi* are mostly rounded [see Sánchez (2005) Fig. 41], resembling those of *P. jamesi* (**Figs. 5 & 6**). This specimen was also collected deeper than the range of all other *P. stephencairnsi* specimens (490 m). Thus it is likely that the paratype of *P. stephencairnsi* is a specimen of *P. jamesi*. However, the DNA from both the museum holotype and paratype of *P. stephencairnsi* was unsuitable for RAD-sequencing (degraded DNA or formalin fixation) and the proposed species designation could not be tested. Targeted SNP genotyping could help resolve this issue.

Paragorgia stephencairnsi sensu stricto Sánchez, 2005

Paragorgia stephencairnsi Sánchez 2005: 57.

406 **Holotype** USNM 57982; Latitude: 49.2307, Longitude: -123.74; Depth: 350 m; Locality:
407 4 miles northeast of Entrance Island, Strait of Georgia, BC, Canada; Collection date: 14 August
408 1973; Collector: Neil McDaniel. **Paratype** USNM 94437; R/V *Atlantis* AII-125, DSR/V *Alvin*
409 AD2296; Latitude: 32.4333, Longitude: -127.793; Depth: 490 m; Locality: Fieberling Guyot,
410 West Of Channel Islands, California (CA), USA; Collection date: 16 October 1990. Collector:
411 Lauren Mullineaux.

412 New material examined (see **Table S1 for details**); USNM 11224300 (OC 06); R/V
413 *McArthur II*; 188 m; off Ohiat Island, BC, Canada USNM 1157074 (101010, DW-026-02-6); R/V
414 *Velero IV*; 283 m; Piggy Bank, CA, USA. Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution (WHOI)
415 Agam, C02, C03, C04 & C05; Scuba; 32-41 m; Agamemnon Channel, BC, Canada. WHOI
416 C100-102 & C104; Scuba; 40 m; Tahsis Inlet, BC, Canada. Fisheries and Oceans Canada
417 (FOC)/WHOI FOC5 (5, 2009-47/ 71167), FOC25 (25, 2012-65/ 72750), FOC26 (26, 2012-65/
418 72750) & FOC30 (30, 2012-65/ 72750); 201-318 m; off Graham Island, BC, Canada.

419 Emended diagnosis: Morphology as described for the species complex. *P. stephencairnsi*
420 (shallow sub-clade) is differentiated from *P. jamesi* (deep sub-clade) by 125 fixed SNPs
421 identified from the PARAGORGIA matrix (see **Supplementary File 1** for details). *A posteriori*
422 comparisons of morphological characters revealed that the lobulated rays of 7- and 8-radiate
423 surface sclerites in *P. stephencairnsi* have mostly sharp edges, whereas the ones from *P. jamesi*
424 have mostly rounded edges (**Figs. 5 & 6**).

425 Emended distribution: Northeast Pacific Ocean. Continental shelf, shelf slope and
426 seamounts off California, USA to British Columbia, Canada. Depth range: 32-350 m.

Remarks: Holotype was collected from a submerged power cable that traversed the Strait of Georgia, British Columbia, from Point Grey to Nanaimo. The cable was being recovered because it was no longer being used but was valuable due to its core of solid copper.

***Paragorgia pacifica* Verrill 1922**

Paragorgia pacifica Verrill 1922: G16.

Paragorgia arborea: Sánchez 2005: 15.

New material examined (see [Table S1 for details](#)): RBCM 011-00067-002; off BC, Canada. RBCM 011-00160-001; off BC, Canada. USNM 1007340; 1168 m; off Vancouver Island, BC, Canada.

Emended diagnosis: Morphology as described by Sánchez (2005). This shallow sub-clade is differentiated from the deep sub-clade by 175 fixed SNPs identified from the PARAGORGIA matrix (see [Supplementary File 2](#) for details).

Emended distribution: Northern Pacific Ocean. Continental shelf, shelf slope and seamounts off US and Canada west coast, from California to Alaska, Gulf of Alaska, Aleutian Islands, Bering Sea, Sea of Okhotsk and the Sea of Japan. Depth range: 15-1600 m.

Remarks: Herrera *et al.* (2012) found a conspicuous break in the genetic composition (mitochondrial haplotypes and nuclear ITS2) of *P. pacifica* between western and eastern North Pacific sub-regions, separated by the Alaska Peninsula. Whether these constitute isolated populations of *P. pacifica* or different cryptic species remains an open question.

4. Conclusions

In this case study we demonstrate the empirical utility of RAD-seq to resolve phylogenetic relationships among divergent and recalcitrant taxa and to objectively infer species boundaries by testing alternative delimitation hypotheses. We were able to make use of RAD-seq to overcome long-standing technical difficulties in octocoral genetics, and resolve fundamental questions in species definitions and systematics. We show that classic morphological taxonomy can greatly benefit from integrative approaches that provide objective tests to species delimitation hypotheses. Our results can serve as a guide for addressing rapidly-evolving hypotheses and fundamental questions in biogeography, species ranges, community ecology, population dynamics and evolution of recalcitrant taxa. The results from this study also represent a valuable reference resource for the development of tools, such as SNP arrays, that can be used to perform accurate species identifications, and generate species inventories that will aid the design and implementation of conservation and management policies.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by the National Geographic Society/Waite Foundation (W285-13 to SH); the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA NA09OAR4320129 to TS); the National Science Foundation (NSF OCE-1131620 to TS); the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA NNX09AB76G to TS); and the Academic Programs Office (Ocean Ventures Fund to SH), the Ocean Exploration Institute (Fellowship support to TMS) and the Ocean Life Institute of the Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution (WHOI).

For enabling access to key specimens we thank K. Schnabel, S. Mills, D. Tracey, M. Clark, A. Rowden, S. Cairns, E. Cordes, A. Quattrini, G. Workman, M. Wyeth, K. Anderson, M. Frey, H. Gartner, J. Boutillier, L. Watling, J. Adkins. We thank P. Aldersdale, N. Ardila and J. Sánchez for assistance with morphological identifications. We also thank V. Tunnicliffe, E. O’Brien, D. Forsman, J. Fellows, N. McDaniel, S. Schooner, J. Schooner and K. Helyar for assistance during scuba diving fieldwork in BC (DFO license FIN130270). We thank the chief scientists, masters, crew, scientific personnel, and funding agencies of expeditions AT07-35, KOK0506, Lophelia II 2009, RB-0503, TAN1007, TAN1104, TAN1206, and TAN1213. Specimens provided by the National Institute of Water and Atmospheric Research (NIWA) were collected under research programs: Kermadec Arc Minerals, funded by the New Zealand (NZ) Ministry of Business, Innovation & Employment (MBIE), Auckland University, Institute of Geological and Nuclear Science (GNS), and WHOI; Ocean Survey 20/20 funded by Land Information NZ; Impact of resource use on vulnerable deep-sea communities (CO1X0906), funded by MBIE; Nascent Inter-Ridge Volcanic And Neotectonic Activity, funded by the Ministry for Primary Industries (MPI), GNS, MBIE, and UNH; Scientific Observer Program funded by MPI; and the Joint NZ-USA 2005 NOAA Ring of Fire Expedition, part of NIWA’s Seamount Program (FRST CO1X0508). We thank A.M. Tarrant, A.M. Reitzel, S. Edwards (editor) and two anonymous reviewers for providing helpful comments that improved this manuscript.

References

- Aguilar, C., Sánchez, J.A., 2007. Phylogenetic hypotheses of gorgoniid octocorals according to ITS2 and their predicted RNA secondary structures. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 43, 774–786. doi:10.1016/j.ympev.2006.11.005
- Ardila, N.E., Giribet, G., Sánchez, J.A., 2012. A time-calibrated molecular phylogeny of the

precious corals: reconciling discrepancies in the taxonomic classification and insights into their evolutionary history. *BMC Evol. Biol.* 12. doi:Artn 246Doi 10.1186/1471-2148-12-246

Arnold, B., Corbett-Detig, R.B., Hartl, D., Bomblies, K., 2013. RADseq underestimates diversity and introduces genealogical biases due to nonrandom haplotype sampling. *Mol. Ecol.* 22, 3179–3190. doi:Doi 10.1111/Mec.12276

Baer, C.F., Miyamoto, M.M., Denver, D.R., 2007. Mutation rate variation in multicellular eukaryotes: causes and consequences. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 8, 619–631. doi:Doi 10.1038/Nrg2158

Baird, N.A., Etter, P.D., Atwood, T.S., Currey, M.C., Shiver, A.L., Lewis, Z.A., Selker, E.U., Cresko, W.A., Johnson, E.A., 2008. Rapid SNP discovery and genetic mapping using sequenced RAD markers. *PLoS One* 3, e3376.

Bayer, F.M., 1956. Octocorallia, in: Moore, R.C. (Ed.), *Treatise on Invertebrate Paleontology Part F. Coelenterata*. Geological Society of America and University of Kansas Press, Lawrence, Kansas, pp. 163–231.

Bilewitch, J.P., Degnan, S.M., 2011. A unique horizontal gene transfer event has provided the octocoral mitochondrial genome with an active mismatch repair gene that has potential for an unusual self-contained function. *BMC Evol. Biol.* 11, 228. doi:papers2://publication/doi/10.1186/1471-2148-11-228

Bouckaert, R., Heled, J., Kuhnert, D., Vaughan, T., Wu, C.H., Xie, D., Suchard, M.A., Rambaut, A., Drummond, A.J., 2014. BEAST 2: a software platform for Bayesian evolutionary analysis. *PLoS Comput. Biol.* 10, e1003537. doi:10.1371/journal.pcbi.1003537

Bouckaert, R.R., 2010. DensiTree: making sense of sets of phylogenetic trees. *Bioinformatics* 26, 1372–1373. doi:Doi 10.1093/Bioinformatics/Btq110

Bryant, D., Bouckaert, R., Felsenstein, J., Rosenberg, N.A., RoyChoudhury, A., 2012. Inferring species trees directly from biallelic genetic markers: Bypassing gene trees in a full coalescent analysis. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 29, 1917–1932. doi:Doi 10.1093/Molbev/Mss086

Cairns, S.D., 2007. Deep-water corals: An overview with special reference to diversity and distribution of deep-water scleractinian corals. *Bull. Mar. Sci.* 81, 311–322.

Cariou, M., Duret, L., Charlat, S., 2013. Is RAD-seq suitable for phylogenetic inference? An in silico assessment and optimization. *Ecol. Evol.* 3, 846–852. doi:10.1002/ece3.512

Carlson, D.B., Budd, A.F., 2002. Incipient speciation across a depth gradient in a scleractinian coral? *Evolution* (N. Y). 56, 2227–2242.

Catchen, J., Hohenlohe, P.A., Bassham, S., Amores, A., Cresko, W.A., 2013. Stacks: an analysis tool set for population genomics. *Mol. Ecol.* 22, 3124–3140. doi:10.1111/Mec.12354

CITES, 2014. Appendices I, II and III. Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of wild fauna and flora, , <http://www.cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/app/2014/E-Appendices-2014-09-14.pdf>.

Concepcion, G.T., Crepeau, M.W., Wagner, D., Kahng, S.E., Toonen, R.J., 2007. An alternative to ITS, a hypervariable, single-copy nuclear intron in corals, and its use in detecting cryptic species within the octocoral genus *Carijoa*. *Coral reefs* 27, 323–336. doi:10.1007/s00338-

- Cruaud, A., Gautier, M., Galan, M., Foucaud, J., Saune, L., Dubois, E., Nidelet, S., Deuve, T., Rasplus, J.-Y.J., Genson, G., Dubois, E., Nidelet, S., Deuve, T., Rasplus, J.-Y.J., 2014. Empirical Assessment of RAD Sequencing for Interspecific Phylogeny. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 31, 1272–1274. doi:10.1093/molbev/msu063
- Darriba, D., Taboada, G.L., Doallo, R., Posada, D., 2012. jModelTest 2: more models, new heuristics and parallel computing. *Nat. Methods* 9, 772.
- De Queiroz, K., 2007. Species concepts and species delimitation. *Syst. Biol.* 56, 879–886.
- Dueñas, L.F., Sánchez, J.A., 2009. Character lability in deep-sea bamboo corals (Octocorallia, Isididae, Keratoisidinae). *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 397, 11–23. doi:10.3354/Meps08307
- Eaton, D.A., 2014. PyRAD: Assembly of de novo RADseq loci for phylogenetic analyses. *Bioinformatics* 30, 1844–1849. doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/btu121
- Edwards, S. V., 2009. Is a new and general theory of molecular systematics emerging? *Evolution* (N. Y.) 63, 1–19. doi:10.1111/J.1558-5646.2008.00549.X
- Emerson, K.J., Merz, C.R., Catchen, J.M., Hohenlohe, P.A., Cresko, W.A., Bradshaw, W.E., Holzapfel, C.M., 2010. Resolving postglacial phylogeography using high-throughput sequencing. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 107, 16196–16200. doi:10.1073/pnas.1006538107
- Figueroa, D.F., Baco, A.R., 2015. Octocoral mitochondrial genomes provide insights into the phylogenetic history of gene order rearrangements, order reversals, and cnidarian phylogenetics. *Genome Biol. Evol.* 7, 391–409. doi:10.1093/gbe/evu286
- France, S.C., 2007. Genetic analysis of bamboo corals (Cnidaria : Octocorallia : Isididae): Does lack of colony branching distinguish Lepidisis from Keratoisis? *Bull. Mar. Sci.* 81, 323–333.
- Fujisawa, T., Barraclough, T.G., 2013. Delimiting species using single-locus data and the generalized mixed Yule coalescent approach: A revised method and evaluation on simulated data sets. *Syst. Biol.* 62, 707–724. doi:10.1093/Sysbio/Syt033
- Glazier, A.E., Etter, R.J., 2014. Cryptic speciation along a bathymetric gradient. *Biol. J. Linn. Soc.* 113, 897–913. doi:10.1111/bij.12389
- Gonen, S., Bishop, S.C., Houston, R.D., 2015. Exploring the utility of cross-laboratory RAD-sequencing datasets for phylogenetic analysis. *BMC Res. Notes* 8, 299. doi:10.1186/s13104-015-1261-2
- Grasshoff, M., 1979. Zur bipolaren verbreitung der oktokoralle *Paragorgia arborea* (Cnidaria: Anthozoa: Scleraxonia). *Senckenbergiana Maritima* 11, 115–137.
- Hebert, P.D.N., Cywinska, A., Ball, S.L., DeWaard, J.R., 2003. Biological identifications through DNA barcodes. *Proc. R. Soc. B-Biological Sci.* 270, 313–321. doi:10.1098/Rspb.2002.2218
- Hellberg, M.E., 2006. No variation and low synonymous substitution rates in coral mtDNA despite high nuclear variation. *BMC Evol. Biol.* 6. doi:10.1186/1471-2148-6-24
- Herrera, S., Baco, A., Sánchez, J.A., 2010. Molecular systematics of the bubblegum coral genera (Paragorgiidae, Octocorallia) and description of a new deep-sea species. *Mol. Phylogenet.*

579 Evol. 55, 123–135. doi:10.1016/j.ympev.2009.12.007

580 Herrera, S., Reyes-Herrera, P.H., Shank, T.M., 2015a. Predicting RAD-seq marker numbers
581 across the eukaryotic tree of life. *Genome Biol. Evol.* 7, 3207–3225.
582 doi:10.1093/gbe/evv210

583 Herrera, S., Shank, T.M., Sánchez, J.A., 2012. Spatial and temporal patterns of genetic variation
584 in the widespread antitropical deep-sea coral *Paragorgia arborea*. *Mol. Ecol.* 21, 6053–
585 6067. doi:10.1111/mec.12074

586 Herrera, S., Watanabe, H., Shank, T.M., 2015b. Evolutionary and biogeographical patterns of
587 barnacles from deep-sea hydrothermal vents. *Mol. Ecol.* 24, 673–689.
588 doi:10.1111/mec.13054

589 Hipp, A.L., Eaton, D.A.R., Cavender-Bares, J., Fitzek, E., Nipper, R., Manos, P.S., 2014. A
590 framework phylogeny of the american oak clade based on sequenced RAD data. *PLoS One*
591 9, e93975. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0093975

592 ICES, 2013. Assessment of the list of VME indicator species and elements. International
593 Council for the Exploration of the Sea,
594 <http://www.ices.dk/sites/pub/Publication%20Reports/Advice/2013/Special%20requests/NE>
595 [AFC_VME_%20indicator_%20species_%20and_elements.pdf](http://www.ices.dk/sites/pub/Publication%20Reports/Advice/2013/Special%20requests/NE).

596 Jennings, R.M., Etter, R.J., Ficarra, L., 2013. Population differentiation and species formation in
597 the deep sea: the potential role of environmental gradients and depth. *PLoS One* 8, e77594.
598 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0077594

599 Kass, R.E., Raftery, A.E., 1995. Bayes Factors. *J. Am. Stat. Assoc.* 90, 773–795.

600 Kükenthal, W., 1916. System und Stammesgeschichte der Scleraxonier und der Ursprung der
601 Holaxonier. *Zool. Anz.* 47, 170–183.

602 Leaché, A.D., Banbury, B.L., Felsenstein, J., de Oca, A., Nieto-M., Stamatakis, A., 2015. Short
603 Tree, Long Tree, Right Tree, Wrong Tree: New Acquisition Bias Corrections for Inferring
604 SNP Phylogenies. *Syst. Biol.* 64, syv053. doi:10.1093/sysbio/syv053

605 Leaché, A.D., Fujita, M.K., Minin, V.N., Bouckaert, R.R., 2014. Species delimitation using
606 genome-wide SNP Data. *Syst. Biol.* 63, 534–542. doi:10.1093/sysbio/syu018

607 Leffler, E.M., Bullaughey, K., Matute, D.R., Meyer, W.K., Segurel, L., Venkat, A., Andolfatto,
608 P., Przeworski, M., 2012. Revisiting an old riddle: What determines genetic diversity levels
609 within species? *Plos Biol.* 10, e1001388. doi:10.1371/journal.pbio.1001388
610 10.1371/Journal.Pbio.1001388

611 Maddison, W.P., 1997. Gene trees in species trees. *Syst. Biol.* 46, 523–536. doi:10.2307/2413694
612 10.2307/2413694

613 Mayr, E., 1942. Systematics and the Origin of Species from the Viewpoint of a Zoologist,
614 Columbia biological series. Columbia University Press, New York,.

615 McFadden, C.S., Adden, C.S., Benayahu, Y., Pante, E., Thoma, J.N., Nevarez, P.A., France,
616 S.C., 2010a. Limitations of mitochondrial gene barcoding in Octocorallia. *Mol. Ecol.*
617 *Resour.* 11, 19–31. doi:10.1111/j.1755-0998.2010.02875.x

618 McFadden, C.S., France, S.C., Sánchez, J.A., Alderslade, P., 2006. A molecular phylogenetic
619 analysis of the Octocorallia (Cnidaria: Anthozoa) based on mitochondrial protein-coding

620 sequences. Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 41, 513–527.

621 McFadden, C.S., Sánchez, J.A., France, S.C., 2010b. Molecular Phylogenetic Insights into the
622 Evolution of Octocorallia: A Review. Integr. Comp. Biol. 50, 389–410.
623 doi:10.1093/icb/icq056

624 McFadden, C.S., van Ofwegen, L.P., 2013. Molecular phylogenetic evidence supports a new
625 family of octocorals and a new genus of Alcyoniidae (Octocorallia, Alcyonacea). Zookeys
626 346, 59–83. doi:10.3897/Zookeys.346.6270

627 Miller, K.J., Rowden, A.A., Williams, A., Haussermann, V., 2011. Out of their depth? Isolated
628 deep populations of the cosmopolitan coral *Desmophyllum dianthus* may be highly
629 vulnerable to environmental change. PLoS One 6, e19004.
630 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0019004

631 Morrison, C.L., Ross, S.W., Nizinski, M.S., Brooke, S., Jarnegren, J., Waller, R.G., Johnson,
632 R.L., King, T.L., 2011. Genetic discontinuity among regional populations of *Lophelia*
633 *pertusa* in the North Atlantic Ocean. Conserv. Genet. 12, 713–729. doi:10.1007/s10592-010-0178-5

635 Pante, E., Abdelkrim, J., Viricel, A., Gey, D., France, S.C., Boisselier, M.C., Samadi, S., 2014.
636 Use of RAD sequencing for delimiting species. Heredity (Edinb). 114, 450–459.
637 doi:10.1038/hdy.2014.105

638 Park, E., Hwang, D.S., Lee, J.S., Song, J.I., Seo, T.K., Won, Y.J., 2012. Estimation of
639 divergence times in cnidarian evolution based on mitochondrial protein-coding genes and
640 the fossil record. Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 62, 329–345. doi:10.1016/J.Ympev.2011.10.008

642 Prada, C., Hellberg, M.E., 2013. Long prereproductive selection and divergence by depth in a
643 Caribbean candelabrum coral. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 110, 3961–3966.
644 doi:10.1073/pnas.1208931110

645 Quattrini, A.M., Baums, I.B., Shank, T.M., Morrison, C.L., Cordes, E.E., 2015. Testing the
646 depth-differentiation hypothesis in a deepwater octocoral. Proc. Biol. Sci. 282, 20150008.
647 doi:10.1098/rspb.2015.0008

648 Quattrini, A.M., Georgian, S.E., Byrnes, L., Stevens, A., Falco, R., Cordes, E.E., 2013. Niche
649 divergence by deep-sea octocorals in the genus *Callogorgia* across the continental slope of
650 the Gulf of Mexico. Mol. Ecol. 22, 4123–4140. doi:10.1111/mec.12370

651 Rambaut, A., Drummond, A.J., 2007. Tracer v1.4, Available from
652 <http://beast.bio.ed.ac.uk/Tracer>.

653 Reitzel, A.M., Herrera, S., Layden, M.J., Martindale, M.Q., Shank, T.M., 2013. Going where
654 traditional markers have not gone before: Utility of and promise for RAD sequencing in
655 marine invertebrate phylogeography and population genomics. Mol. Ecol. 22, 2953–2960.
656 doi:10.1111/mec.12228

657 Roberts, J.M., Wheeler, A., Freiwald, A.R., Cairns, S.D., 2009. Cold-Water Corals : The Biology
658 and Geology of Deep-Sea Coral Habitats. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK ;
659 New York.

660 Rubin, B.E., Ree, R.H., Moreau, C.S., 2012. Inferring phylogenies from RAD sequence data.
661 PLoS One 7, e33394. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0033394

- Sánchez, J.A., 2005. Systematics of the bubblegum corals (Cnidaria: Octocorallia: Paragorgiidae) with description of new species from New Zealand and the Eastern Pacific. *Zootaxa* 1014, 1–72. doi:papers2://publication/uuid/C9A26ACD-0C36-46DC-834A-68449F6B83B8
- Sánchez, J.A., Dorado, D., 2008. Intragenomic ITS2 variation in Caribbean seafans. *Proc. 11th Int. Coral Reef Symp.*
- Shearer, T.L., Van Oppen, M.J.H., Romano, S.L., Worheide, G., 2002. Slow mitochondrial DNA sequence evolution in the Anthozoa (Cnidaria). *Mol. Ecol.* 11, 2475–2487. doi:10.1046/J.1365-294X.2002.01652.X
- Stamatakis, A., 2014. RAxML version 8: A tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of large phylogenies. *Bioinformatics* 30, 1312–1313. doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/btu033
- Stiasny, G., 1937. Die Gorgonacea der Siboga-Expedition. Supplement II, Revision der Scleraxonia mit ausschluss der Melitodidae und Coralliidae. *Siboga-Expedition Monogr.* 13b, 1–138.
- Uda, K., Komeda, Y., Fujita, T., Iwasaki, N., Bavestrello, G., Giovine, M., Cattaneo-Vietti, R., Suzuki, T., 2013. Complete mitochondrial genomes of the Japanese pink coral (*Corallium elatius*) and the Mediterranean red coral (*Corallium rubrum*): a reevaluation of the phylogeny of the family Coralliidae based on molecular data. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol. D-Genomics Proteomics* 8, 209–219. doi:10.1016/J.Cbd.2013.05.003
- Verrill, A.E., 1922. Part G: Alcyonaria and Actiniaria. *Rep. Can. Arct. Exped. 1913-18* 8, 1–164.
- Wagner, C.E., Keller, I., Wittwer, S., Selz, O.M., Mwaiko, S., Greuter, L., Sivasundar, A., Seehausen, O., 2012. Genome-wide RAD sequence data provide unprecedented resolution of species boundaries and relationships in the Lake Victoria cichlid adaptive radiation. *Mol. Ecol.* 22, 787–798. doi:10.1111/mec.12023
- Watling, L., France, S.C., Pante, E., Simpson, A., 2011. Biology of Deep-Water Octocorals, *Advances in Marine Biology*. doi:10.1016/B978-0-12-385529-9.00002-0
- Yang, Z.H., Rannala, B., 2010. Bayesian species delimitation using multilocus sequence data. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 107, 9264–9269. doi:10.1073/Pnas.0913022107
- Zapata, F., Jimenez, I., 2012. Species delimitation: Inferring gaps in morphology across geography. *Syst. Biol.* 61, 179–194. doi:10.1093/Sysbio/Syr084
- Zhang, J., Kapli, P., Pavlidis, P., Stamatakis, A., 2013. A general species delimitation method with applications to phylogenetic placements. *Bioinformatics* 29, 2869–2876. doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/btt499

Figure captions

Figure 1. Proportion of loci shared among individuals of the AC clade in the optimal backbone matrix (c 0.80, m 9). Each family is indicated with a different colour: red for Paragorgiidae; blue for Coralliidae; and yellow for Alcyoniidae. Black-filled circles represent the proportion of the total number of loci shared among individuals. Red-filled circles represent the proportion of the total number of loci present in each individual. Circle scale shows the number of loci represented

by 100% and 50% circle sizes. Grey vertical bars represent the average proportion of loci shared by each individual. Phylogenetic tree was inferred with RAxML. All branches have bootstrap support of 100 except for those shown. This figure was generated with the package RADami (Hipp et al., 2014).

Figure 2. Phylogenetic trees of the AC clade based on RAD-seq and mitochondrial data. Left tree based on the RAD-seq concatenated **PHYLO** supermatrix (5,997 loci that contained data for at least 75% of the specimens; 85,293 variable sites; 53,150 of which were phylogenetically-informative). Right tree based on the *mtMutS* **mitochondrial** matrix (711 bp, 130 variable sites, 101 informative). Each family is indicated with a different branch colour: blue red for Paragorgiidae; blue for Coralliidae; and yellow for Alcyoniidae. Phylogenetic trees were inferred with RAxML. Branch labels indicate bootstrap support values greater than 50; * indicates support of 100. Scale bar indicates substitutions per site.

Figure 3. Species delineation hypotheses for *Paragorgia*. Schematic shows the different species delimitation models for *Paragorgia* evaluated with the BFD* method and their results. *Sibogagorgia* was included as outgroup to root the inferences for *Paragorgia*. The first model (**morphid**) indicates the species identifications based on morphology. For all models, numbered groupings indicate the species assignments. Bottom rows show the total number of species proposed, the marginal likelihood estimate (calculated on the supermatrix **PARAGORGIA**, which contains 1,203 SNPs present in all individuals), rank for each model, and Bayes Factor comparisons [$2\log_{10}(\text{BF})$, calculated with respect to the null **morphid** model]. Phylogenetic tree on the left, shown only for visual reference, was inferred with the RAD-seq concatenated PARAGORGIIID matrix in RAxML. Branch labels indicate bootstrap support values greater than 50; * indicates support of 100. Scale bar indicates substitutions per site.

Figure 4. Species tree of *Paragorgia*. This claudogram illustrates the posterior distribution of species trees inferred with SNAPP based on the best species delimitation model PABSTE. High colour density is indicative of areas in the species trees with high topology agreement. Different colours represent different topologies. The maximum clade credibility species tree is shown with thicker branches. Trees with the same topology as the maximum clade credibility species tree are coloured in red. Trees with different topologies are coloured green or blue. With the exception of the branch leading to the clade of *P. johnsoni*, *P. maunga*, and *P. alisonae*, which has a posterior probability of 0.87, all interior branches have posterior probabilities of 1.0.

Figure 5. *Paragorgia jamesi* sp. nov. type specimens. A-F, Holotype RBCM 010-00234-004; A, cross section of a terminal branch; B, whole specimen (photos courtesy of Heidi Gartner); C, typical polyp sclerite; D-E, 7- and 8-radiate surface sclerites; F, medulla sclerites. G-K, Paratype USNM 1007316; G, whole specimen (photo courtesy of Robert Ford and Stephen Cairns); H, typical polyp sclerites; I-J, 7- and 8-radiate surface sclerites; K, medulla sclerites. Scale bars for C-F and H-K are 20 μm .

Figure 6. *Paragorgia stephencairnsi* representative examined material. A-C, USNM 1157074; A, typical polyp sclerites; B, 7- and 8-radiate surface sclerites; C, medulla sclerites. D-F, WHOI C03; D, typical polyp sclerites; E, 7- and 8-radiate surface sclerites; F, medulla sclerites. All scale bars are 20 μm .

Figure 1

Figure 2

Figure 3

Figure 4

Figure 5

Figure 6

Graphical Abstract