**Lake oxygen isotopes as recorders of North American Rocky Mountain
hydroclimate: Holocene patterns and variability at multi-decadal to
millennial time scales**

Lesleigh Anderson^{1*}, Max Berkelhammer², John A. Barron³, Byron A. Steinman⁴,
Bruce P. Finney⁵, Mark B. Abbott⁶

¹U.S. Geological Survey Geosciences and Environmental Change Science Center,
Denver CO, USA

²University of Illinois-Chicago, Department of Earth and Environmental Science,
Chicago IL, USA

³U.S. Geological Survey Volcano Science Center, Menlo Park CA, USA

⁴University of Minnesota-Duluth, Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences
and Large Lakes Observatory, Duluth MN, USA

⁵Idaho State University, Departments of Biological Sciences and Geosciences,
Pocatello ID, USA

⁶University of Pittsburgh, Department of Geology and Environmental Science,
Pittsburgh PA, USA

*Corresponding Author: land@usgs.gov, 303-236-1296

Abstract

Lake sediment oxygen isotope records (carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) in the western North American Cordillera developed during the past decade provides substantial evidence of Pacific ocean-atmosphere forcing of hydroclimatic variability during the Holocene. Here we present an overview of 18 lake sediment $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records along with a new compilation of lake water $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ that are used to characterize lake sediment sensitivity to precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in contrast to fractionation by evaporation. Of the 18 records, 14 have substantial sensitivity to evaporation. Two records reflect precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ since the middle Holocene, Jellybean and Bison Lakes, and are geographically positioned in the northern and southern regions of the study area. Their comparative analysis indicates a sequence of time-varying north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns that is evidence for a highly non-stationary influence by Pacific ocean-atmosphere processes on the hydroclimate of western North America. These observations are discussed within the context of previous research on North Pacific precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ based on empirical and modeling methods. The Jellybean and Bison records indicate that a prominent precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole (enriched-north and depleted-south) was sustained between ~ 3.5 and 1.5 ka, which contrasts with earlier Holocene patterns, and appears to indicate the onset of a dominant tropical control on North Pacific ocean-atmosphere dynamics. This remains the state of the system today. Higher frequency reversals of the north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole between ~ 2.5 and 1.5 ka, and during the Medieval

Climate Anomaly and the Little Ice Age, also suggest more varieties of Pacific ocean-atmosphere modes than a single Pacific Decadal Oscillation (PDO) type analogue. Results indicate that further investigation of precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns on short (observational) and long (Holocene) time scales is needed to improve our understanding of the processes that drive regional precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ responses to Pacific Ocean-atmosphere variability, which in turn, will lead to a better understanding of internal Pacific ocean-atmosphere variability and its response to external climate forcing mechanisms.

Contents

1. Introduction
2. Lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
 - 2.1 Lakes as “isometers”
3. North Pacific climate controls on precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ through the Holocene
 - 3.1 Gulf of Alaska circulation and precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
 - 3.1.1 Empirical evidence
 - 3.1.2 Model simulations
 - 3.2 Updated summary of North Pacific precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
4. New perspectives on north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns through the Holocene
5. Conclusions
- Acknowledgements
- References

1. Introduction

North American Rocky Mountain winter precipitation, principally stored as snowpack, is the primary water resource for the surrounding semiarid regions (Wise, 2012). North American precipitation patterns and corresponding snowpack distributions reflect synoptic scale winter storm tracks and the upper level atmospheric flow (Changnon et al., 1993; L'Heureux et al., 2004; Shinker and Bartlein, 2009; Miyasaka et al., 2014). Significant snowpack variance is explained by ocean-atmosphere climate modes, which are internal to the climate system and operate on interannual to multi-decadal times-scales, such as the El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO) and the Pacific Decadal Oscillation (PDO) (Dettinger et al., 1998; Cayan et al., 1998; Brown and Comrie, 2004; Mote, 2006; Brown, 2011; Pederson et al., 2011). Changing atmospheric flow provides a potential mechanistic explanation for correlations between precipitation distributions (both spatial and temporal) and internal climate modes such as ENSO and PDO.

The role and significance of internal ocean-atmosphere climate variability, and its responses to external forcing mechanisms, such as changes in Earth's orbital configuration, volcanism and anthropogenic activity, are prominently featured in questions about the future of water resources in western North America (Pederson et al., 2013; McCabe and Wolock, 2009; Wise, 2010; Byrne et al., 1999; Clark et al., 2001; Salathe, 2006; Hoerling et al., 2010; Abatzoglou, 2011). However, application of multi-decadal climate mode concepts is complex because such atmospheric behavior emerges in the climate system even in the absence of external forcing and

thereby comprises background climate variability, or noise, which is inherently stochastic (Alexander, 2010; Schneider and Cornuelle, 2005; Overland et al., 2008).

Estimates of future responses of western North American water resources to anthropogenic warming are provided by Global Climate Models (GCMs) (Barnett and Pierce, 2009; Seager et al., 2007). GCMs accurately capture many aspects of the climate system, including the global response to external forcing, which provide important insight into the dynamics associated with past and future climate change. However, many GCMs consistently appear to either suppress or inaccurately represent internal ocean-atmosphere variability and should not be exclusively relied upon to investigate future climate change scenarios for regions that are strongly influenced by internal climate modes such as western North America (Alder and Hostetler, 2014; Bartlein et al., 2014; Collins, 2005; Deser et al., 2012; Harrison et al., 2014, 2015; Schmidt et al., 2005; Sun, 2010).

Holocene climate proxy records provide abundant evidence for changes in internal ocean-atmosphere climate variability related to external forcing (*e.g.*, Cobb et al., 2013; Koutavas and Joanides, 2012; Li et al., 2011; Moy et al., 2002). Here we review evidence that internal ocean-atmosphere climate variability affects hydroclimate in western North America in response to external forcing from spatially distributed lake isotope records (carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) with an emphasis on the records that reflect the oxygen isotope composition of precipitation (precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$). Such records provide insight on past changes in atmospheric flow, moisture source areas, rainout efficiency, and the temperature of condensation (Ingraham,

1998; Darling et al., 2006). We propose that with a process-based understanding of regional climate controls on precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, inferred precipitation patterns and corresponding atmospheric flow from spatially distributed precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ paleorecords will elucidate the changing influence of North Pacific ocean-atmosphere variability on Rocky Mountain snowpack on multi-decadal to millennial time scales.

To achieve our objectives, we evaluate 18 lake carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records within the greater western North American Cordillera from Alaska to Colorado (Figure 1). Our evaluation is based on a compilation of lake water isotope values ($\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$) that provide a framework for understanding the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ relationships between lake-sediment carbonate (endogenic calcite and aragonite), lake water, and precipitation. This allows us to characterize each of the lake carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records as an “isometer” of the climate processes that control precipitation, precipitation minus evaporation (P-E), or a mixture of both. We then use the Holocene precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records to examine north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns on multi-decadal to millennial timescales. From this comparative analysis we consider how internal Pacific ocean-atmosphere modes varied throughout the Holocene and influenced hydroclimate in the western North American Cordillera in relation to external forcing by solar insolation. This comparison necessitates a review of previous research on precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in the North Pacific and Gulf of Alaska region.

2. Lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$

140

141 We focus this analysis on the interior Rocky Mountain region where there
142 are strong continental rainout fractionation effects on precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (Winnick
143 et al., 2014). The lake carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records are distributed from northern Alaska
144 ($\sim 68^\circ\text{N}$) to southern Colorado ($\sim 37^\circ\text{N}$), and we also include a discussion of the
145 Mount Logan ice- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record in the Yukon Territory (Fisher et al., 2004 and 2008),
146 the Oregon Caves National Monument (NM) speleothem- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record (Ersek et al.,
147 2012), and the Gulf of Alaska (GoA) foraminiferal- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record EW0408-85JC
148 (Praetorius and Mix, 2014) (Figure 1a, Table 1). Additional lake and speleothem
149 carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records from the desert environments of the Great Basin (Benson et
150 al., 2002, 2003; Lachniet et al., 2014; Yuan et al., 2004, 2013), and the Sierra Nevada
151 in California (McCabe-Glyn et al., 2013) are not included in the present analysis,
152 which we have limited to intermountain regions with higher precipitation amounts.

153 The intermountain lake records span a range of climates indicated by the
154 ratio of precipitation (P) to potential evaporation (PE) derived from the National
155 Centers for Environmental Prediction North American Regional Reanalysis (NCEP-
156 NARR). The NARR is a three-dimensional atmospheric model forced with observed
157 climate from surface measurements and atmospheric soundings (Mesinger et al.,
158 2006). The model is fundamentally similar to global reanalysis products but is
159 projected onto a $0.3^\circ \times 0.3^\circ$ resolution that makes it particularly useful for studies of
160 topographically complex environments. The large-scale P/PE patterns (Figure 1a)
161 reflect topographic effects on the amount of precipitation where regions with the

highest ratios, indicative of a wetter climate, occur in low elevation coastal areas and particularly along the coastal mountain ranges, largely due to higher P. Lower P/PE ratios, which indicate a drier climate, occur in leeward rain shadows of mountain ranges: these are found in eastern Washington, the southwest Yukon Territory, and low elevation regions of Colorado and Utah, due to low P and high PE. Intermediate ratios typically reflect areas with highly uneven seasonal precipitation distributions where the amount of P is high but dominated by winter snowfall and PE is also high during relatively long dry summers, such as in the northern and central Rocky Mountains in Montana and Colorado.

Based on the compilation of ~600 lake water $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ measurements (Figure 1b), similar climate controls are also evident from regional evaporation lines (REL) derived from lake water isotope compositions and their intercept with the Global Meteoric Water Line (GMWL) (Figure 2a). The compilation includes previously published data as well as newly presented results (Supplemental files). We identified eight regional groups from the water isotope data and determined linear $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ correlations, REL, for each (Table 2): Colorado and Utah, Montana, Wyoming and Idaho, eastern Washington, British Columbia and Alberta, Yukon Territory, and within Alaska, the central interior, southern Brooks Range, and northeast interior. The intercept of each REL with the GMWL indicates the starting isotopic composition of the regional source waters on an evaporation-driven vector, and therefore, closely approximates the annual weighted $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ value of precipitation (Darling et al., 2006).

The decline in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ value for the REL-GMWL intercept for higher latitudes reflects large-scale climatic controls on regional precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, including latitude and continental effects (Bowen and Revenaugh, 2003; Kendall and Coplen 2001; Rozanski, 1993). The $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ intercept values of -25.5‰ in northeast interior Alaska at $\sim 65^\circ\text{N}$ represent a -9.5‰ difference in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ value for the REL-GMWL intercept from Colorado and Utah at $\sim 40^\circ\text{N}$. The more positively enriched intercept values in Colorado and Utah (-16‰ and -118‰ for $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$, respectively) are due to the region's low latitude, warmer temperatures, and frequent incursions of subtropical Pacific and Gulf of Mexico air masses, which bring relatively enriched $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ vapor to the region. At higher latitudes, more negatively depleted intercepts are due to colder temperatures and the dominance of North Pacific and Arctic vapor relatively depleted in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$. The seasonal balance of precipitation is also influential such that snow-dominated climates are characterized by depleted intercepts.

A broadly similar spatial precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ pattern for this region is also evident from the Global Network of Isotopes in Precipitation (GNIP; Bowen and Wilkinson, 2002; Rozanski et al., 1993). However, it is crucial to recognize the isotopic differences between lake water and precipitation estimates because it is the isotope ratio of lake water, rather than precipitation, that is incorporated by the lake sediment carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ proxy, which is our focus here. The substantial differences amongst the RELs also make it evident that assessments of individual lake water isotope data should be based on each lake's comparison with its respective regional

evaporation trends.

The REL slopes range from 4.0 (Yukon Territory) to 5.6 (southern Brooks Range in Alaska), and reflect the influence of relative humidity on kinetic fractionation (Gibson et al., in press; Henderson and Shuman, 2009). Lower slopes indicate relatively high evaporation and low relative humidity (low P/PE) and they are observed for all the sampled regions from Colorado to the Yukon Territory and central Alaska (slopes of 3.9 to 4.4). Higher slopes in northern Alaska (5.0 and 5.5) reflect a combination of higher precipitation and humidity and a limitation on total evaporation imposed by the short ice-free warm season.

REL length, represented here as the range of lake isotope values observed in each region, is strongly associated with the distribution of the sampling and individual basin hydrology (Steinman and Abbott, 2013; Supplemental files) but is also likely influenced by P/PE. For instance, higher maximum isotope compositions and longer REL length are observed for regions with lower relative humidity and longer warm seasons during which evaporation strongly influences lake water isotopic composition. Thus, isotope values from Colorado and Utah have the longest REL and the shortest REL in the southern Brooks Range in Alaska reflects that region's high P/PE and the combined effects of higher relative humidity and short ice-free warm season.

The position of an individual lake's isotopic composition relative to its REL indicates the extent to which fractionation resulting from evaporation enriches the

remaining water in heavy isotopes relative to the original isotopic composition of meteoric source water, which is the inflow and direct precipitation on the lake's surface. Thus, the distance between an individual lake's isotopic composition and the value of the REL-GMWL intercept is a function of the extent to which evaporation has influenced a lake's water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$. From this observation of modern lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ we take the approach that past lake sensitivity to evaporation can also be generally evaluated by the position of sediment carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values on their respective modern REL (Figure 2b). The greater the distance between the range of carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values and REL-GMWL intercept likely indicates an increasing control by evaporation on lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ throughout a lake's history.

For a visual comparison of the 18 carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records along each REL we use a generalized horizontal $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ scale (Figure 2b). This representation again highlights the decline in REL-GMWL intercepts from $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values of -17 to -18‰ in southern latitudes (upper) to -20 to -25.5‰ in higher latitudes (lower). Several carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records, such as Scanlon, Castor, Foy, Cleland and Marcella Lakes, are nearer the maximum lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ value within a region. Others span the middle of their RELs, such as San Luis, Jones, Crevice, 7-Mile and Track Lakes. Several carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records are nearer to their REL-GMWL intercept value, such as Yellow, Renner, Paradise, and Takahula Lakes, whereas Bison, Lime, Jellybean, and Tangled Up Lakes overlap their REL-GMWL intercept.

Since $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ measurements are reported as per mil deviations (‰) in relation

to two different standards, the international Vienna-Pee-Dee Belemnite standard (VPDB) for carbonate and Standard Mean Ocean Water (VSMOW) for water, and there is a lake water-temperature fractionation effect between carbonate minerals and water ($-0.25\text{‰}/^{\circ}\text{C}$; Friedman and O'Neil, 1977), adjustments are needed in order to compare water and carbonate $\delta^{18}\text{O}$. However, these differences are relatively small in comparison to the range of the carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values for each record and do not significantly alter these general comparisons.

As previous reviews of oxygen isotopes from lake sediments have summarized (Ito, 2001; Leng et al., 2006; Leng and Marshall, 2004), understanding the sensitivity of lake water to evaporation-driven fractionation effects is critical for correctly assessing the paleoclimate information provided by lake carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variations. Along these lines, our evaluation further elucidates the reasons why comparison of lake carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variations must account for differences in the climate sensitivity of each lake system resulting from regional climate and extent of hydrological closure. If these considerations are ignored, the resulting interpretations can be misleading and lead to spurious reconstructions of past climate conditions. Our evaluation here is based on identifying the relationship of a particular lake's water isotope values to the appropriate REL-GMWL intercept, thus providing a framework for carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ paleoclimate studies in northwestern North America.

2.1 Lakes as “isometers”

As a reservoir of meteoric water, a lake’s isotopic composition is a metric of the controlling climate and hydrologic processes and can be considered an “isometer.” The hydrologic fluxes of water into and out of a lake control the degree to which lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ reflects changes in precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, P-E, or both (Figure 3). On one end of the hydrologic spectrum are hydrologically open lakes with water residence times that are too short for evaporation effects to significantly influence the water body. In this case, high rates of surface and subsurface inflow and outflow lead to water residence times of days to weeks for small lake systems. Although evaporation does influence the lake, its effects on the isotope mass balance of the overall water body are minimal due to continual replacement by runoff and groundwater inflow. This hydrologic configuration often leads to lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values that reflect precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, and we term these systems “precipitation isometers.” They are identified by water isotope values that plot on the intersection of the REL and the GMWL, or with the regional meteoric water line if it has been established. As discussed above, there are four lakes in western North America that appear to fit this criteria; Bison Lake in Colorado, Lime Lake in eastern Washington, Jellybean Lake in the southwest Yukon Territory, and Tangled Up Lake in the Brooks Range of northern Alaska (Figure 2b).

On the other end of the hydrologic spectrum are lakes in which outflow is restricted and significant water loss occurs through evaporation from the lake

surface. In such terminal lake systems, climate changes may drive both lake level and lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variations; if inflow exceeds evaporation for a long period of time, then lake levels rise and lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ decreases, and *vice-versa*, leading to transient isotopic shifts to hydrologic forcing rather than long-term isotope equilibrium responses to hydroclimate (Gat, 1995; Ricketts and Anderson, 1998; Steinman and Abbott, 2013; Shapley et al., 2008). A large number of lakes fall between the fully open and fully closed end members and have some surface and subsurface outflow, typically as subsurface seepage through the littoral zones, but restriction may also occur if surface outflow is regulated by a fixed outflow elevation and is therefore intermittent. These systems, that we term here as “P-E isometers,” also lose substantial amounts of water through evaporation from the lake surface.

For P-E isometer hydrologic configurations, which characterize the majority of the 18 lake systems discussed here, site-specific hydrologic controls on lake water residence time and evaporation are best evaluated on a case-by-case basis with isotope mass balance modeling tools (Gibson et al., in press; Shapley et al., 2008). Because these systems indicate transient and equilibrium lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ responses to hydroclimate change, the carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records reflect both short-term (sub-decadal to decadal) and long-term (centennial to millennial) forcing (Steinman and Abbott, 2013; Steinman et al., 2010 and 2012). Five P-E lake records approach the maximum lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ on their RELs, which indicates severe fractionation by evaporation: Castor and Scanlon Lakes in eastern Washington, Foy Lake in Montana, Cleland Lake in British Columbia, and Marcella Lake in Yukon

Territory. The remaining nine lake records, at intermediate positions between GMWL intercepts and water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ maxima, indicate more balanced controls by both precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and evaporation (Figure 2b, Table 2).

Many of these records were evaluated as part of a prior study that focused on western North American lake carbonate P-E isometers with an emphasis on identifying climate shifts during the past 2000 years (Steinman et al., 2014). Most of these records (Marcella, Paradise, Cleland, Renner, Castor, Foy, Jones, and Crevice) have sufficient temporal resolution to identify recent multi-decadal to century scale variability and their geographic distribution is sufficient to characterize regional patterns.

The general relationships between lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, hydrology, and climate are also indicated by the ~600 lake water deuterium excess values (dxs) shown with the NARR P/PE ratios (Figure 4). The dxs is calculated from $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ ($dxs = \delta^2\text{H} - 8*\delta^{18}\text{O}$) and becomes lower in evaporating water (Dansgaard, 1964). Thus, P-E isometers (low dxs , high $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) are located on the lower left corner of the distribution that corresponds with dry climates (low P/PE) and strong evaporation effects. The triangular shape of the distribution illustrates that precipitation isometers such as Bison and Jellybean Lakes (high dxs , low $\delta^{18}\text{O}$), located on the upper area of the distribution, occur in both wet and dry climates (high and low P/PE). In wetter climates, both surface and subsurface through-flow are likely to occur, whereas in drier climates subsurface through-flow may be more common. Between these end-members, represented by the corners of the triangular

distribution, are mixed hydrology lakes (intermediate $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) for which lake water isotopic composition reflects the combined effects of changes in precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and evaporation.

3. North Pacific climate controls on precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ through the Holocene

This review focuses on the two currently available northern and southern precipitation isometers with multi-decadal to century scale resolution that continuously extend from the middle Holocene to the present: Jellybean Lake (hereafter 'JB') located on the east, or leeward, side of the St. Elias Mountains in the southwest Yukon Territory (Anderson et al., 2005, 2007); and Bison Lake, located on a high plateau (~3255 m) in northwest Colorado (Anderson, 2011, 2012; Anderson et al., 2015, in press). However, first we reassess evidence from proxy and modeling studies regarding climate controls on North Pacific precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and the implications for the JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ interpretation. We then compare the JB and Bison precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns to draw new conclusions about the role of internal climate modes on western North American hydroclimate.

3.1 Gulf of Alaska atmospheric circulation and precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$

Prior analysis of the JB and the Mount Logan (hereafter 'ML') $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records led to the hypothesis that regional precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in the North Pacific Gulf of

Alaska region is primarily controlled by atmospheric circulation processes rather than temperature (Anderson et al., 2005; Fisher et al., 2004). The following review will show that subsequent data and modeling studies support this hypothesis, while underscoring considerable uncertainty about specific circulation mechanisms that cause different precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ shifts and trends through time.

A significant challenge for testing $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ -climate hypotheses in the North Pacific region is the dearth of historical observational climate and isotopic data. This issue is compounded by the topographic complexity of the area, which leads to significant climatic heterogeneity within small geographic domains. For instance, the extreme topography (*e.g.*, ~ 3000 to 5000 m a.s.l.) within a few kilometers of the coastline generates substantial climate gradients 50 km farther inland. This physiography also contributes to the shape of the large-scale geostrophic flow across northwestern North America and the existence of the semi-permanent Aleutian Low (AL) pressure center located over the eastern North Pacific (Figure 5). Due to its mid-latitude position, the AL is influenced by Arctic and subtropical ocean-atmosphere processes, which contribute significant complexity to its temporal and spatial variance. This convergence of diverse and geographically distant controlling factors also highlights why a clearer understanding of the historical and paleoclimate changes of the North Pacific region has broader implications, for both North America and Northern Hemisphere climates.

3.1.1 Empirical evidence

379

380 Three central characteristics of the JB and ML records support the original
381 circulation hypothesis, as presented in Fisher et al. (2004), wherein stronger AL and
382 meridional flow results in more depleted precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in the southwest Yukon
383 Territory, which we term as the “strong-depleted” hypothesis. These characteristics
384 are: (1) the independently dated lake and ice records exhibit similar multi-decadal
385 trends and shifts over the past 2000 years, with relatively high $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values during
386 most of the Little Ice Age (LIA; Figure 6), (2) the large negative $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ shifts at ~1850
387 AD at both the ice core elevation (~5000 m) and JB headwater elevation (~1300 m)
388 are consistent with a modeled shift in the vertical $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ profile on ML (Holdsworth
389 and Fogarsi, 1991), and (3) the magnitude of JB and ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variability and
390 relatively enriched $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values during the LIA are not explained by existing
391 temperature- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ relations, which imply higher temperatures that are inconsistent
392 with colder temperatures inferred from LIA glacier advances. Collectively, these
393 observations indicate that in addition to temperature, North Pacific precipitation-
394 $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ is also controlled by the location of the water vapor source, vapor transport
395 distance and rainout effects, and vertical orographic mixing (*e.g.*, Berkelhammer et
396 al., 2011).

397 Anderson et al. (2005) also proposed that different storm track orientations
398 relative to the coastal mountain barrier would lead to unique changes in
399 precipitation fractionation. Based on modern rain shadow precipitation processes,
400 they asserted that AL intensification and more southerly storm tracks, which

produce higher precipitation along the coasts, and higher snow accumulation at higher elevations, subsequently results in greater fractionation and more depleted $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ at ML and JB. Anderson et al. (2007) further proposed that the varying storm tracks would affect aridity in the leeward rain-shadow regions and tested this hypothesis with nearby Marcella Lake, a P-E isometer. Rapid Marcella $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ increases at ~1850 AD and ~800 BP (1200 AD) indicated shifts to more arid conditions that were coincident with the prominent negative shift to depleted JB and ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ hypothesized to reflect a stronger AL. Additional support for this hypothesis is provided by two-phase LIA glacier growth (Barclay et al., 2009), pollen assemblages that indicate greater coastal precipitation (Heusser et al., 1985), and similar $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variations at Seven Mile Lake, another P-E isometer, in the central Yukon (Anderson, 2011).

Anderson et al. (2005) compared JB- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and the 100-yr North Pacific Index (NPI) (Trenberth and Hurrell, 1994), a metric of northeastern Pacific sea level pressure (SLP) anomalies that is closely associated with AL strength, and incorrectly reported a positive correlation between depleted JB- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and negative NPI (strong AL) that was, in fact, an inverse correlation (Figure 7). Though the inverse correlation was significant ($r^2 = 0.23$, $p < 0.05$), the ^{210}Pb -determined ages have substantial uncertainty (± 5 to 20 years) and there are minimal degrees of freedom in the correlation statistic. It is possible to obtain significant positive or negative correlations by tuning the JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ anomalies within conservative age error estimates and using various NPI smoothing intervals. We now conclude that

comparisons between JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ anomalies and the NPI are ambiguous. In the annually dated ML record, however, there is a suggestion of a negative correlation between $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and NPI (Figure 7). The JB and ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records are not well correlated since 1900 AD, though again the JB dating uncertainty complicates the comparison.

Osterberg et al. (2014) have since provided an independent proxy correlation with the NPI from annual measurements of ML sodium (Na^+) concentrations for the past 1500 years, and their results lend support to the original “strong-depleted” precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ hypothesis (Figure 6 and 7). Relying on physical arguments that higher sea salt concentrations are associated with higher near-surface central Pacific wind speeds during strong AL circulation (negative NPI), they find an inverse correlation between higher sodium amounts and negative NPI anomalies ($r = -0.45$, $p < 0.001$). The inverse correlation has the strongest significance with no lead or lag, is relatively insensitive to different winter month NPI sampling, and both variables have similar power spectra. Importantly, rapid increases in both sodium concentrations and variance between ~ 1820 and 1850 AD coincide with the larger negative shifts to depleted JB and ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (Figure 6). Similarly, the large negative shift to depleted JB and ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ between ~ 700 and 800 BP (1200 to 1100 AD) coincides with greater ML sodium variance.

The comparison between ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and sodium from the instrumental period reveals further uncertainty for the ice $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ interpretations during the 100-yr time period (Figure 7). Although higher sodium and depleted $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values during the

1980s positive PDO are consistent with the “strong-depleted” hypothesis, the overall correlation between 3-yr averages of ML sodium and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ since 1900 AD is only weakly negative and not significant ($r^2 = 0.02$). For instance, during the two decades prior to the late 1970s shift from a negative to a positive PDO (positive to negative NPI) phase, lower ML sodium concentrations occurred with depleted $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, which contrasts with the aforementioned “strong-depleted” association. The previous positive PDO (negative NPI) phase during the 1920s and 1930s is also not registered strongly by either proxy.

This comparison may also be an illustration of the difficulty in correlating annual ice- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variations, which exhibit strong seasonal sensitivity to climate metrics. Rupper et al. (2004) show that only in years of high snow accumulation does ML have a robust connection with atmospheric circulation (Moore et al., 2002). Thus, seasonal biases and the low signal-to-noise ratio over the historical period, which are also similar features of JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, provide a likely explanation for the weak relationships since 1900 AD between the NPI, and the PDO, and JB and ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records. It is important to recognize that pre-20th century ML and JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ shifts are much larger (~ 2 to 6‰ ; Figure 6), which also strongly suggests that 20th century comparisons and modern analogues are probably insufficient to characterize the full range of Holocene variability.

3.1.2 Model simulations

The first principles of atmospheric circulation dynamics suggest that the “strong-depleted” hypothesis is counterintuitive. This conundrum arises because strong AL circulation is typically observed to entrain greater amounts of sub-tropical moisture composed of vapor derived from relatively warm ocean water (Figure 5; Papineau, 2001). This is because if all other factors are assumed to be equal, then warmer ocean waters would be expected to produce vapor more enriched in ^{18}O than colder ocean water. Therefore, southerly sourced vapor would be expected to generate more enriched precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ than that derived from cold, northerly sourced vapor. This effect is robustly reproduced by numerous isotope enabled General Circulation Models (Berkelhammer et al., 2011; Field et al., 2010; Liu et al., 2014; Porter et al., 2013).

Field et al. (2010) and Porter et al. (2013) use the NASA-GISS Model E (Schmidt et al., 2005) configured with a $4^\circ \times 5^\circ$ and $2^\circ \times 2.5^\circ$ horizontal grid resolution, with 45 and 40 vertical levels, respectively. Field et al. (2010) simulated the 45 years since 1954 as an analogue study whereas Porter et al. (2013) simulated the 1970-2009 period nudged by NCEP/NCAR reanalysis data. Both models were forced with interannually varying sea surface temperatures (SSTs) and sea ice fields from the HADISST 1.1 dataset (Rayner et al., 2003). Both GCM simulations provide evidence for strong circulation controls on precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, with a clear “strong-enriched” AL to precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ association as well as strong AL circulation controls on precipitation amount and temperature.

488 Indicating further GCM uniformity, Liu et al. (2014) evaluated precipitation-
489 $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ controls by the Pacific North America pattern (PNA) with the Isotopes-
490 incorporated Global Spectral Model (IsoGSM) for 1950-2005 and obtained a similar
491 result. Characterized by a ridge-trough pressure gradient over western North
492 America, a positive PNA is also associated with a strong AL, positive PDO and
493 negative NPI phases. Further insight into the IsoGSM model is provided by
494 Berkelhammer et al. (2011) who examined isotopic anomalies in precipitation for
495 individual years (1989, 1998, and 2003) with contrasting annual circulation and
496 precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns (Figure 8). Consistent with Liu et al. (2014), the IsoGSM
497 simulations indicate that strong AL circulation in 1998 and 2003 enhanced
498 southwesterly wind anomalies producing regions of enriched precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
499 extending from the subtropics to Alaska that contrast with depleted precipitation-
500 $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ throughout western North America during weak AL circulation in 1989.

501 Fisher et al. (2004) took a different approach, using a numerical regional
502 stable isotope model coupled to a zonally averaged global model to compare a
503 simulated and observed vertical $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ profile on ML for vapor sourced from different
504 regions (Figure 9). Their reasoning was guided by the previously documented
505 vertical $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and dxs discontinuity on ML (Holdsworth and Fogarsi, 1991;
506 Holdsworth and Krouse, 2002). The vertical $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ discontinuity suggested three
507 atmospheric layers during precipitation on the St. Elias Mountain barrier: (1) a
508 lower monotonic fractionation sequence below ~ 3 km, (2) a middle mixed layer,
509 typically 1-2 km thick in which $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ is nearly constant regardless of altitude, and (3)

an upper “quasi geostrophic flow” layer above ~5.3 km with a fractionation sequence isolated from the lowermost layer below 3 km. The implications of this vertical stratification are that upper and lower vapor sources may differ and that changes in the height of the boundary layer could give rise to complex signals of precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ at different elevations.

The same numerical model had successfully simulated the vertical $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ profiles of the Devon ice cap in Arctic Canada, and the Greenland and Antarctic ice sheets (Fisher, 1992). The model also appears to successfully simulate the vertical ML- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ profile, although there are a limited number of calibration points (Figure 8b). Two different simulations were conducted for (1) subtropical (~20°N) and North Pacific vapor sources (modern, meridional) and (2) only North Pacific vapor sources (zonal). The simulations indicated that the addition of subtropical moisture caused changes to the vertical $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ profile, which led to more depleted precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ at ML and JB elevations that are consistent with the shifts to more depleted $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ at ~1850 AD (Figure 7 and 9b).

3.2 Updated summary of North Pacific precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$

This updated assessment of multiple data types provides a clear consensus for hypothesis regarding atmospheric circulation controls on precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in the North Pacific region. Firstly, both the proxy data and models indicate no evidence for dominance by temperature, precipitation amount, or seasonality.

However, significant differences between the models and proxy data indicate that the precise circulation mechanism that gives rise to precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ signals remain ambiguous. We assert that uncertainties regarding boundary layer height are the most likely explanation for these differences because no existing model simulations explicitly address variations in the height of vertical mixing between the marine boundary layer and upper level geostrophic flow in response to circulation changes. In Hawaii the same mechanisms have been observed to create temporally complex vertical precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ profiles (Bailey et al., 2013), an observation that raises questions about the rates and heights of mixing and associated fractionations. Further investigation of vertical processes by isotope-enabled model simulations to address the ambiguities identified here, and to examine water resource implications for similar orographic processes in the Pacific Northwest (*e.g.*, Luce et al., 2013), will be crucial to advancing our understanding of regional precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ controls.

Also clearly missing from the empirical evidence is continuous, observational monitoring of precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ designed to capture both synoptic-scale events and their response to lower frequency circulation patterns within this topographically complex region. Recent monitoring of U.S. Rocky Mountain snowpack- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ has confirmed that observations over long time periods with high spatial density are necessary to capture complex spatial heterogeneity in mountainous regions (Anderson et al., in press). The sparse temporal and spatial coverage of the observational precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data available from the Global Network of Isotopes in Precipitation (GNIP) may capture broad scale fractionation effects (*e.g.*, Bailey et

al., 2015) but is too coarse to capture the isotopic processes required to evaluate local to regional controls. A monitoring network on an elevation gradient across coastal mountain barriers would make a strong contribution to better resolve this uncertainty.

Along these lines, sampling of snowpack $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ at Wolverine glacier, located on the Alaskan Kenai Peninsula with an elevation range between ~ 450 and 1680 m, began in spring of 2014. The sampling followed several rain-on-snow events in late January when persistent southerly atmospheric flow advected unseasonably warm temperatures and subtropical vapor into south-central Alaska. Ice layers associated with this rain event were identified in a snow pit at ~ 1000 m and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ profiles indicate higher $d\text{x}$ s and depleted $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (by -4‰) compared with surrounding snow (Shad O'Neel, Eric Klein and Jeff Welker, written communication). If the ice layers do in fact represent the rain event, and not sublimation or some other post-depositional process, then the low $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values support the "strong-depleted" hypothesis. Alternatively, the low values could also reflect boundary layer dynamics for this individual synoptic event that is related to a highly localized orographic rainout process. Additional observations are required to pinpoint more precise causes of spatial and temporal variability in vertical precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ gradients in mountainous regions.

In summary, although more evidence has been collected, there remains significant uncertainty about atmospheric circulation controls on precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in the North Pacific region. This review has described (1) contrasting results

between the GCMs and the numerical modeling experiments, and (2) inconsistent results between proxy records during the instrumental period since ~1900 AD. Regarding the first point, the different results obtained by the GCM and numerical models can likely be explained by differences in topographic resolution and vertical mixing and boundary layer dynamics. The GCMs appear to broadly capture first principle physical controls but are not as suitable a tool for testing orographic effects, a task for which the numerical model may be better suited. Therefore, the most probable conclusion that can be drawn is that neither model invalidates the other because their designs evaluate different processes on different spatial scales.

Regarding the second point, the relationship between JB and ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and metrics of AL strength during the instrumental period are inconsistent with the coherent negative JB and ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ shifts at ~1850 AD and ~800 BP (1200 AD) (Figure 6 and 7) that we acknowledge could be related to uncertainties in dating of JB lake sediment and varying seasonal sensitivity of the ML ice core. We also recognize inconsistencies between the JB and ML records and the tree-ring derived NPI record of D'Arrigo et al. (2005); yet differences between tree-rings, lake sediments and ice cores can potentially be understood in the context of unique proxy sensitivity and seasonal biases (Anderson et al., 2011; Osterberg et al., 2014; Steinman et al., 2012). Another approach to better understand patterns of Pacific ocean-atmosphere change is to examine spatially distributed lake sediment- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ through the Holocene from precipitation isometers to develop hypotheses that explain similarities and differences, which is the concluding part of this review.

4. New Perspectives on north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns through the Holocene

As described in section 2.1, precipitation isometers such as in the case of Bison, Lime, JB, and Tangled Up Lakes, exhibit negligible overprinting by variations in humidity or hydrology. Of these records, JB and Bison extend back to the middle Holocene with multi-decadal to centennial resolution and are geographically positioned to evaluate north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variations (Figure 10). The records have independently established chronologies based on ^{210}Pb (and ^{137}Cs for JB), calibrated ^{14}C ages of terrestrial macrofossils, and late Holocene tephra layers (Anderson et al., 2005, Anderson, 2011, 2012). Their comparison reveals previously unobserved sequences of in-phase and anti-phase precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole patterns over a range of timescales.

During the middle Holocene (8 - 4 ka) JB and Bison records share few similarities; JB displays low-frequency cycles of ~ 1000 -yr length with a tendency towards decreasing and depleted $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ anomalies, whereas Bison displays a steady multi-millennial decline from highly enriched anomalies. We suggest that these differences resulted from weak mid-Holocene expression of large-scale forcing by Pacific ocean-atmosphere dynamics as we know them today, and that the records instead predominantly indicate stronger regional responses to external forcing. The most prominent external forcing mechanism during the middle Holocene is solar

insolation, which influenced each region differently, ranging from summer values 8 to 15% higher-than-present and winter values 8 to 15% lower within the latitude band between $\sim 40^\circ$ and $\sim 70^\circ$ of the study sites (Berger and Loutre, 1991). In the southern regions, higher summer solar insolation is thought to have led to an enhanced North American Monsoon (NAM), as suggested by modeling and additional proxy records (Metcalf et al., 2015; Jones et al., 2015). This relationship is consistent with positive Bison anomalies that reflect warmer than average temperature of precipitation and rain dominance of the seasonal precipitation balance (Anderson, 2012; Anderson et al., in press).

In contrast, millennial-scale JB variations bear a closer similarity to those in carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records from the Oregon Cave NM speleothem (Ersek et al., 2012) as well as with a record of near-surface GoA planktonic foraminifera- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (Praetorius and Mix, 2014). These records are interpreted to reflect winter atmospheric temperature and precipitation, and sea surface temperature (SST) controls, respectively (Figure 11). Ersek et al. (2012) identified similarities between the Oregon Cave NM speleothem and solar irradiance reconstructions from records of ^{14}C production and ^{10}Be fluxes that are also evident between JB and a combined solar irradiance index (Figure 10; Steinhilber et al., 2012). Praetorius and Mix (2014) highlight the relative decoupling, or seesaw behavior between Greenland (NGRIP) and GoA during the Holocene in contrast to deglacial times. However, both of these records also indicate a gradual increase to more enriched $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, which is not

evident at either JB or ML, which have low-frequency trends towards more depleted $\delta^{18}\text{O}$.

Barron and Anderson (2011) suggest that terrestrial and marine proxy data along the northeast Pacific margin indicate the possibility of a more negative PDO/La Niña-like mean-state of the Pacific during the mid-Holocene. However, such an analogy and the implied large-scale teleconnection between weak AL strength and precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ as the “weak-enriched” corollary of the “strong-depleted” hypothesis, is inconsistent with the out-of-phase anomalies between JB, Bison, Oregon, and GoA records. We now suggest that these comparisons imply that the North Pacific and AL did not interact with the subtropical Pacific in a coupled PDO/ENSO-like manner during the middle Holocene. In the absence of strong AL coupling with subtropical ocean-atmosphere dynamics during the middle Holocene, it is possible that the AL was more strongly influenced by northern modes of variability (e.g., Northern Annual Mode or Arctic Oscillation) and a North Atlantic forcing component. For instance, if relatively depleted JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ might predominantly reflect colder, northerly sourced vapor associated with high latitude forcing, then this could reflect an influence by Bering Sea and/or Arctic sea ice extent in addition to millennial scale Arctic circulation processes (Darby et al., 2012; Harada et al., 2014; McKay et al., 2008).

At ~4 ka both JB and Bison begin a millennial scale trend towards an enriched-north/depleted-south dipole precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ pattern that terminates at ~2 ka, which, for example, is a pattern consistent with a modeled strong-west AL

modern analogue (Figure 8, middle panels). In addition, there are two multi-century anti-phase, depleted-north/enriched-south, dipole patterns between 2.2 and 1.8 ka (Figure 9), which, for example, are consistent with a modeled strong-east AL modern analogue (Figure 8, right panels). We suggest that this coupled north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole behavior, in contrast to the divergent patterns during the middle Holocene, represents the onset of a tropical controls on Pacific ocean-atmosphere dynamics, as we know them today. Support for this interpretation is also provided by: (1) warmer alkenone-inferred North Pacific SSTs between ~ 4 and 3 ka, which suggests northward transport of subtropical waters offshore of northern California and the Gulf of Alaska associated with the North Pacific gyre (Barron et al., 2003; Praetorius et al., 2015), and (2) higher than normal background tropical storm activity near Japan attributed to an increase in El Niño frequency (Woodruff et al., 2009). The onset of coupled behavior also coincides with an inferred increase in positive Arctic Oscillation (low pressure) circulation (Darby et al., 2012) between ~ 3 and 1.2 ka, which in the present day also results in more southerly sourced GoA precipitation.

The depleted Bison $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ anomalies between ~ 3 and 1.2 ka are attributed to predominantly colder than average temperatures and snowfall-dominated precipitation balance (Anderson et al., in press). However, as discussed above, the processes that could explain the enriched JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ anomalies are uncertain. If enriched JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ reflect the predominance of warmer southerly derived vapor (for example 2003 in Figure 8a), which is counter to the “strong-depleted” hypothesis,

then the corresponding enriched-north/depleted-south pattern could possibly be consistent with a strong AL, positive PDO/PNA pattern. Comparative analysis of North American carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records distributed on eastern and western sides of the continent, including a “weak-enriched” interpretation of the JB record, suggests that a transition occurred at ~ 4 ka from more negative to positive PNA conditions (Liu et al., 2014). However, we note that additional evidence from highly depleted Rocky Mountain snowpack- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ associated with strong zonal flow also suggests that an enriched-north/depleted-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole pattern could possibly be the result of zonal patterns (Anderson et al., in press).

Notably, between ~ 4 and 3 ka, the JB and ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ anomalies also diverge: as JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ became relatively enriched during this period, ML $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ remained relatively depleted (Figure 11). Barron and Anderson (2011) noted that this locally divergent behavior could reflect weak regional climate forcing. We now suggest this behavior is more likely a result of boundary layer fractionation effects caused by changing atmospheric flow, although this assumption remains to be conclusively supported. In this instance either reduced vertical mixing or lower boundary layer height, in response to a change in circulation patterns, could account for relatively depleted $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ at ML that are not observed at JB, although this proposition remains to be conclusively supported. Thus, the precise mechanisms for how the enriched-north/depleted-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole pattern between ~ 3 and 1.2 ka relates to specific Pacific, or Arctic, circulation patterns is uncertain. Nevertheless,

its appearance is consistent with increasing influence by subtropical Pacific ocean-atmosphere processes on the hydroclimate of the western North America Cordillera.

Between ~ 1.5 and 1.2 ka, the enriched-north/depleted-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole reversed (depleted-north/enriched-south). Subsequently, during the early Medieval Climate Anomaly (MCA), by ~ 1000 AD, north and south regions became roughly neutral and in-phase. Between ~ 1.2 and 0.8 ka (800 to 1200 AD), a strong enriched-north/depleted-south dipole reestablished within decades before rapidly returning to an in-phase neutral pattern by ~ 0.5 ka (~ 1500 AD). Similar decadal-scale reversals and dipole responses are not apparent within any previous time period during the Holocene. Thus, although previous studies have identified the MCA interval as a generally negative-PDO-like period (Mann et al., 2009), the precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole variations shown here reinforce the likelihood that strong forcing by the Pacific ocean-atmosphere dynamics also included a greater variety of Pacific ocean-atmosphere modes and regional responses than a single modern PDO analogue (e.g., Overland et al., 1999; Bond et al., 2003; Overland and Wang, 2005).

During the LIA (~ 1500 to 1900 AD) a strong multi-century enriched-north/depleted-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole pattern became reestablished. However, at ~ 1850 AD prominent shifts to the most depleted values of the Holocene at both JB and Bison likely reflect colder temperatures that are well documented during the late 19th and early 20th centuries. We also note that other strongly depleted anomalies between ~ 3 and 1.2 ka are also consistent with colder temperatures throughout western North America related to neoglaciation. The

~1850 AD shifts could reflect influence by external factors such as solar minima and resultant teleconnections as suggested by others for Arctic and Atlantic sectors (Gray et al., 2004; Ineson et al., 2011; Ortega et al., 2015). Within a Holocene context, though, these prominent high-frequency precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ shifts serve to reinforce the notion that complex precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ behavior exists for a wide range of frequencies, an observation that further informs the aforementioned proxy and modeling discussion.

5. Conclusions

This review has characterized lake $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records from western North America, established their classification as isometers, and shown their utility as tracers of past hydroclimate variability. Lakes that act as precipitation isometers are differentiated from those that act as P-E isometers, and it is shown that comparative analysis of lake $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records are most effective for similar isometers. The review of past research indicates a clear consensus that internal ocean-atmosphere modes exert strong control on western North American precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$. Prominent north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ pattern variations indicated by JB and Bison Lakes from the middle Holocene to the present provide evidence for a highly non-stationary influence of Pacific ocean-atmosphere processes on the hydroclimate of western North America.

The north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns indicate that the internal climate mechanisms such as ENSO, PDO and PNA, that reflect an intrinsically coupled tropical and North Pacific ocean-atmosphere system, became a dominant forcing of hydroclimate in western North America after ~ 4 ka. Prior to that time, it seems more likely that each region was responding independently to external forcing by solar insolation; northern regions were more strongly influenced by Arctic and Atlantic forcing, including the influence of sea ice extent; whereas the southernmost regions were more strongly influenced by North American Monsoon dynamics. The onset of north-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns suggests that only after ~ 4 ka did the tropical and North Pacific regions begin to act in a coupled manner to produce climate variability that was unprecedented since the time of deglaciation. These results, combined with previous data and modeling experiments, indicate that we have much to learn about the specific Pacific ocean-atmosphere mechanisms that give rise to different precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variations and why their influences vary through time.

This review of western North American lake $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ also highlights the importance of obtaining both spatial and temporal information to address questions regarding the timing of regional climate change in response to internal variability and external forcing. The compilation underscores the unlikelihood that a single climate proxy record can provide information for a single climate mode or that is specifically relevant to all areas, especially within a large region of complex topography. Rather, it illustrates the necessity of applying multiple records to

identify the numerous processes that cause climate change in western North America. Thus, future efforts should focus on providing additional spatially distributed precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and P-E lake records from locations that broaden regional representation.

Furthermore, by selectively comparing proxy records that reflect the same climate component, in this case precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, we show the utility of a common-data synthesis approach, wherein records that reflect one component of the climate system are compared with one another to provide a foundation for comparison against other proxy types that reflect different climate variables. For instance, a P-E isometer approach utilizing Holocene length records that include Paradise and Cleland Lakes, as well as the inclusion of the previously mentioned proxy records from the Great Basin, Sierra Nevada, and southern California (Kirby et al., 2013) will broaden the perspectives identified here.

Lastly, the impact of new lake carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records will only be as great as new insights gained from parallel research on the processes that connect climate variations to precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variations on local to regional scales. Western North American hydroclimate is characterized by the interaction between ocean-atmosphere circulation controls and complex topography, and it is essential that future and existing paleorecords be informed by observational process studies that address the varying effects of vapor source, transport distances, and orographic boundary layer dynamics on precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in three dimensions on fine spatial and temporal scales.

793

794 **Acknowledgements**

795 The U.S. Geological Survey (USGS) Climate and Land Use Change Research and
796 Development supported this research. The National Science Foundation provided
797 support for Berkelhammer (AGS 1502776), Steinman and Abbott (EAR 090220) and
798 Finney (ARC 0909310, AGS 040206). We appreciate assistance by Paco VanSistine
799 and Jeremy Havens with GIS and figures, Dan Engstrom for radiometric dating
800 interpretations, Shad O'Neel, Eric Klein and Jeff Welker for sharing the 2014
801 Wolverine snow pit data, and Alisa Mast for lake water isotope data from the Flat
802 Tops Wilderness of Colorado. We thank Matthew Jones, Natalie Kehrwald and an
803 anonymous reviewer for constructive and helpful comments that greatly improved
804 the manuscript. Any use of trade, product, or firm names is for descriptive purposes
805 only and does not imply endorsement by the U.S. Government.

806

807 **References**

808

809 Abatzoglou, J.T., 2011. Influence of the PNA on declining mountain snowpack in the
810 western United States. *International Journal of Climatology* 31, 1135-1142.
811 Alder, J.R., Hostetler, S.W., 2014. Global climate simulations at 3000 year intervals
812 for the last 21,000 years with the GENMOM coupled atmosphere-ocean model.
813 *Climate of the Past Discussion* 10, 2925-2978, doi:10.5194/cpd-2925-2014.

814 Alexander, M., 2010. Extra tropical air-sea interaction, sea surface temperature
 815 variability, and the Pacific Decadal Oscillation, in: Sun, D., Bryan, F. (Eds.),
 816 Climate Dynamics: Why Does Climate Vary? American Geophysical Union,
 817 Washington D.C., pp. 123-148.

818 Anderson, L., 2011. Holocene record of precipitation seasonality from lake calcite
 819 $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in the central Rocky Mountains, United States. *Geology* 39, 211-214
 820 doi:210.1130/G31575.31571.

821 Anderson, L., 2012. Rocky Mountain Hydroclimate: Holocene variability and the
 822 role of insolation, ENSO, and the North American Monsoon. *Global and Planetary*
 823 *Change* 92-93, 198-208.

824 Anderson, L., Abbott, M.B., Finney, B.P., Burns, S.J., 2005. Regional atmospheric
 825 circulation change in the north Pacific during the Holocene inferred from
 826 lacustrine carbonate oxygen isotopes, Yukon Territory, Canada. *Quaternary*
 827 *Research* 64, 21-35; Errata 65(2006), 350-351.

828 Anderson, L., Abbott, M.B., Finney, B.P., Burns, S.J., 2007. Late Holocene moisture
 829 balance variability in the southwest Yukon Territory, Canada. *Quaternary*
 830 *Science Reviews* 26, 130-141.

831 Anderson, L., Berkelhammer, M.B., Mast, M.A., in press. Isotopes in North American
 832 Rocky Mountain Snowpack 1993-2014. *Quaternary Science Reviews*

833 Anderson, L., Finney, B.P., Shapley, M.D., 2011. Lake carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records from
 834 the Yukon Territory, Canada: Little Ice Age moisture variability and patterns.
 835 *Quaternary Science Reviews* 30, 887-898.

836 Anderson, L., Brunelle, A., Thompson, R.S., 2015. A multi-proxy record of
 837 hydroclimate, vegetation, fire, and post-settlement impacts for a subalpine
 838 plateau, central Rocky Mountains, U.S.A. *The Holocene* 25, 932-943.
 839 Bailey, A., Toohey, D., Noone, D., 2013. Characterizing moisture exchange between
 840 the Hawaiian convective boundary layer and free troposphere using stable
 841 isotopes in water. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres* 118, 8208-
 842 8221, doi:10.1002/jgrd.50639.
 843 Bailey, H.L., Kaufman, D., Henderson, A.K., Leng, M.J., 2015. Synoptic scale controls
 844 on the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in precipitation across Beringia. *Geophysical Research Letters* 42,
 845 doi:10.1002/2015GL063983.
 846 Barclay, D.J., Wiles, G.C., Calkin, P.E., 2009. Holocene glacier fluctuations in Alaska.
 847 *Quaternary Science Reviews* 28, 2034-2048.
 848 Barnett, T.P., Pierce, D.W., 2009. Sustainable water deliveries from the Colorado
 849 River in a changing climate. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science* 106,
 850 7334-7338.
 851 Barron, J., Anderson, L., 2011. Enhanced Late Holocene ENSO/PDO Expression along
 852 the margins of the Eastern North Pacific. *Quaternary International* 235, 3-12.
 853 Barron, J.A., Heusser, L., Herbert, T., Lyle, M., 2003. High-resolution climatic
 854 evolution of coastal northern California during the past 16,000 years.
 855 *Paleoceanography* 18, 1020, doi:10.1029/2002PA000768.
 856 Bartlein, P.J., Hostetler, S.W., Alder, J.R., 2014. Paleoclimate, in: Ohring, G. (Ed.),
 857 *Climate Change in North America, Regional Climate Studies*. Springer

858 International Publishing, Cham Heidelberg New York Dordrecht London, pp. 1-
859 55, doi:10.1007/1978-1003-1319-03768-03764.

860 Benson, L., Kashgarian, M., Rye, R., Lund, S., Paillet, F., Smoot, J., Kester, C., Mensing,
861 S., Meko, D., Lindström, S., 2002. Holocene multidecadal and multicentennial
862 droughts affecting Northern California and Nevada. *Quaternary Science Reviews*
863 21, 659-682.

864 Benson, L., Linsley, B., Smoot, J., Mensing, S., Lund, S., Stine, S., Sarna-Wojcicki, A.,
865 2003. Influence of the Pacific Decadal Oscillation on the climate of the Sierra
866 Nevada, California and Nevada. *Quaternary Research* 59, 151-159.

867 Berger, A., Loutre, M.F., 1991. Insolation values for the climate of the last 10 million
868 years. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 10, 297-317.

869 Berkelhammer, M.B., Stott, L.D., Yoshimura, K., Johnson, K., Sinha, A., 2011. Synoptic
870 and mesoscale controls on the isotopic composition of precipitation in the
871 western United States. *Climate Dynamics*, doi:10.1007/s00382-00011-01262-
872 00383.

873 Bond, N.A., Overland, J.E., Spillane, M., Stabeno, P., 2003. Recent shifts in the state of
874 the North Pacific. *Geophysical Research Letters* 30, 2183,
875 doi:10.1029/2003GL018597, 012003.

876 Bowen, G.J., Wilkinson, B., 2002. Spatial distribution of $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in meteoric
877 precipitation. *Geology* 30, 315-318.

878 Brown, D.P., 2011. Winter circulation anomalies in the western United States
879 associated with antecedent and decadal ENSO variability. *Earth Interactions* 15,
880 1-12.

881 Brown, D.P., Comrie, A.C., 2004. A winter precipitation 'dipole' in the western United
882 States associated with multi-decadal ENSO variability. *Geophysical Research*
883 *Letters* 31, doi:10.1029/2003GL018726.

884 Byrne, J.M., Berg, A., Townshend, I., 1999. Linking observed and general circulation
885 model upper air circulation patterns to current and future snow runoff for the
886 Rocky Mountains. *Water Resources Research* 35, 3793-3802.

887 Cayan, D.R., Dettinger, M.D., Diaz, H.F., Graham, N.E., 1998. Decadal variability of
888 precipitation over western North America. *Journal of Climate* 11, 3148-3166.

889 Changnon, D., McKee, T.B., Doesken, N.J., 1993. Annual snowpack patterns across
890 the Rockies: long-term trends and associated 500-mb synoptic patterns.
891 *Monthly Weather Review* 121, 633-647.

892 Clark, M.P., Serreze, M.C., McCabe, G.J., 2001. Historical effects of El Nino and La Nina
893 events on the seasonal evolution of the montane snowpack in the Columbia and
894 Colorado River Basins. *Water Resources Research* 37, 741-757.

895 Clegg, B.F., Hu, F.S., 2010. An oxygen-isotope record of Holocene climate change in
896 the south-central Brooks Range, Alaska. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 29, 928-
897 939.

898 Cobb, K.M., Westphal, N., Sayani, H.R., Watson, J.T., Di Lorenzo, E., Cheng, H.,
 899 Edwards, L.R., Charles, C.D., 2013. Highly variable El Niño-Southern Oscillation
 900 throughout the Holocene. *Science* 339, 67-70, doi:10.1126/science.1228246.
 901 Collins, M., 2005. El Niño- or La Niña-like climate change? *Climate Dynamics* 24, 89-
 902 104, doi:10.1007/s00382-00004-00478-x.
 903 D'Arrigo, R., Wilson, R., Deser, C., Wiles, G., Cook, E., Villalba, R., Tudhope, A., Cole, J.,
 904 Linsley, B., 2005. Tropical–North Pacific Climate Linkages over the Past Four
 905 Centuries. *Journal of Climate* 18, 5253-5265.
 906 Dansgaard, W., 1964. Stable isotopes in precipitation. *Tellus* 16, 436-468.
 907 Darby, D., Ortiz, J.D., Grosch, C.E., Lund, S.P., 2012. 1,500-yr cycle in the Arctic
 908 Oscillation identified in Holocene Arctic sea-ice drift. *Nature Geoscience* 5,
 909 doi:10.1038/ngeo1629.
 910 Darling, G.W., Bath, A.H., Gibson, J.J., Rozanski, K. (2006). *Isotopes in Water*, in: M.J.
 911 Leng (ed.), *Isotopes in Palaeoenvironmental Research*. Springer, The
 912 Netherlands, pp. 1-66.
 913 Deser, C., Knutti, R., Solomon, S., Phillips, A.S., 2012. Communication of the role of
 914 natural variability in future North American climate. *Nature Climate Change* 2,
 915 doi:10.1038/nclimate1562.
 916 Dettinger, M., Cayan, D.R., Diaz, H.F., Meko, D.M., 1998. North-south precipitation
 917 patterns in western North America on interannual to decadal timescales. *Journal*
 918 *of Climate* 11, 3095-3111.

919 Ersek, V., Clark, P.U., Mix, A.C., Cheng, H., Edwards, L.R., 2012. Holocene winter
 920 climate variability in mid-latitude western North America. *Nature*
 921 *Communications* 3, 1219, doi:10.1038/ncomms2222.

922 Field, R.D., Moore, G.W.K., Holdsworth, G., Schmidt, G.A., 2010. A GCM-based analysis
 923 of circulation controls on $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in the southwest Yukon, Canada: implications for
 924 climate reconstructions in the region. *Geophysical Research Letters* 37, L05706,
 925 doi:05710.01029/02009GL041408.

926 Fisher, D.A., 1992. Stable isotope simulations using a regional stable isotope model
 927 coupled to a zonally averaged global model. *Cold Regions Science and*
 928 *Technology* 21, 61-77.

929 Fisher, D.A., Wake, C., Kreutz, K., Yalcin, K., Steig, E., Mayewski, P., Anderson, L.,
 930 Zheng, J., Rupper, S., Zdanowicz, C., Demuth, M., Waszkiewicz, M., Dahl-Jensen, D.,
 931 Goto-Azuma, K., Bourgeois, J.B., Koerner, R.M., Sekerka, J., Osterberg, E., Abbott,
 932 M.B., Finney, B.P., Burns, S.J., 2004. Stable Isotope Records from Mount Logan,
 933 Eclipse Ice Cores and Nearby Jellybean Lake. *Water Cycle of the North Pacific*
 934 *over 2000 years and over five vertical kilometers: Sudden shifts and tropical*
 935 *connections. Géographie Physique et Quaternaire* 58, 337-352.

936 Fisher, D., Osterberg, E., Dyke, A. Dahl-Jensen, D., Demuth, M., Zdanowicz, C.
 937 Bourgeois, J., Koerner, R.M., Mayewski, P., Wake, C., Kreutz, K., Steig, E., Zheng, J.,
 938 Yalcin, K., Goto-Azuma, K., Luckman, B., Rupper, S., 2008. The Mt Logan
 939 Holocene-late Wisconsinan isotope record: tropical Pacific-Yukon connections.
 940 *The Holocene* 18, 667-677.

941 Friedman, I., O'Neil, J.R., 1977. Compilation of stable isotope fractionation factors of
 942 geochemical interest. U.S. Geological Survey Professional Paper 440-KK, pp. 1-
 943 40.
 944 Gat, J.R., 1995. Stable Isotopes of fresh and saline lakes, in: Lerman, A. (Ed.), Physics
 945 and Chemistry of Lakes. Elsevier, Amsterdam, pp. 139-165.
 946 Gibson, J.J., Birks, S.J., Yi, Y., in press. Stable isotope mass balance in lakes: a
 947 contemporary perspective. Quaternary Science Reviews.
 948 Gray, S.T., Graumlich, L.J., Betancourt, J.L., Pederson, G.T., 2004. A tree-ring based
 949 reconstruction of the Atlantic Multidecadal Oscillation since 1567 A.D.
 950 Geophysical Research Letters 31, doi:10.1029/2004GL019932.
 951 Harada, N., Katsuki, K., Nakagawa, M., Matsumoto, A., Seki, O., Addison, J.A., Finney,
 952 B.P., Sato, M., 2014. Holocene sea surface temperature and sea ice extent in the
 953 Okhotsk and Bering Seas. Progress in Oceanography 126, 242-253.
 954 Harrison, S.P., Bartlein, P.J., Brewer, S., Prentice, I.C., Boyd, M., Hessler, I., Holmgren,
 955 K., Izumi, K., Willis, K., 2014. Climate model benchmarking with glacial and mid-
 956 Holocene climates. Climate Dynamics 43, 671-688, doi:610.1007/s00382-
 957 00013-01922-00386.
 958 Harrison, S.P., Bartlein, P.J., Izumi, K., Annan, J., Hargreaves, J., Braconnot, P.,
 959 Kageyama, M., 2015. Evaluation of CMIP5 palaeo-simulation to improve climate
 960 projections. Nature Climate Change, doi:10.1038/nclimate2649.

961 Henderson, A.K., Shuman, B.N., 2009. Hydrogen and oxygen isotopic compositions of
 962 lake water in the western United States. *Geological Society of America Bulletin*
 963 121, 1179-1189, doi:1110.1130/B26441.26441.
 964 Heusser, C.J., Heusser, L.E., Peteet, D.M., 1985. Late-Quaternary climatic change on
 965 the American North Pacific Coast. *Nature* 315, 485-487.
 966 Hoerling, M., Eischeid, J.K., Perlwitz, J., 2010. Regional precipitation trends:
 967 distinguishing natural variability from anthropogenic forcing. *Journal of Climate*
 968 23, 2131-2145.
 969 Holdsworth, G., Fogarsi, S., 1991. Variation of the stable isotopes of water with
 970 altitude in the Saint Elias Mountains of Canada. *Journal of Geophysical Research*
 971 96, 7483-7494.
 972 Holdsworth, G., Krouse, R., 2002. Altitudinal variations of the stable isotopes of snow
 973 in regions of high relief. *Journal of Glaciology* 48, 31-41.
 974 Ineson, S., Scaife, A.A., Knight, J.R., Manners, J.C., Dunstone, N.J., Gray, L.L., Haigh, J.D.,
 975 2011. Solar forcing of winter climate variability in the Northern Hemisphere.
 976 *Nature Geoscience* 4, doi:10.1038/ngeo1282.
 977 Ingraham, N.L., 1998. Isotopic variations in precipitation, in: McDonnell, J.J., Kendall
 978 C.K. (Eds.), *Isotope Tracers in Catchment Hydrology*. Elsevier, Amsterdam, pp.
 979 87-118.
 980 Ito, E., 2001. Application of stable isotope techniques to inorganic and biogenic
 981 carbonates, in: Last, W.M., Smol, J.P. (Eds.), *Tracking Environmental Change*
 982 *Using Lake Sediments*, pp. pp. 351-371.

983 Jones, M.D., Metcalf, S.E., Davies, S.J., Noren, A., 2015. Late Holocene reorganization
 984 and the North American Monsoon. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 124, 290-295.
 985 Kendall, C., Coplen, T.B., 2001. Distribution of oxygen-18 and deuterium in river
 986 waters across the United States. *Hydrological Processes* 15, 1363-1393.
 987 Kirby, M.E., Feakins, S.J., Bonuso, N., Fantozzi, J.M., Hiner, C.A., 2013. Latest
 988 Pleistocene to Holocene hydroclimate from Lake Elsinore. *Quaternary Science*
 989 *Reviews* 76, 1-15.
 990 Koutavas, A., Joanides, S., 2012. El Niño-Southern Oscillation extrema in the
 991 Holocene and Last Glacial Maximum. *Paleoceanography* 27,
 992 doi:10.1029/2012PA002378.
 993 Lachniet, M.S., Dennison, R.F., Asmerom, Y., Polyak, V., 2014. Orbital control of
 994 western North America atmospheric circulation and climate over two glacial
 995 cycles. *Nature Communications* 5:3805, doi:10.1038/ncomms4805.
 996 Leng, M.J., Lamb, A.L., Heaton, T.H.E., Marshall, J.D., Wolfe, B.B., Jones, M.D., Holmes,
 997 J.A., Arrowsmith, C., 2006. Isotopes in lake sediments, in: Leng, M.J. (Ed) *Isotopes*
 998 *in Palaeoenvironmental Research*, Springer, The Netherlands.
 999 Leng, M.J., Marshall, J.D., 2004. Palaeoclimate interpretation of stable isotope data
 1000 from lake sediment archives. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 23, 811-831.
 1001 Li, J., Xie, S., Cook, E.R., Huang, G., D'Arrigo, R., Liu, F., Ma, J., Zheng, X., 2011.
 1002 Interdecadal modulation of El Niño amplitude during the past millennium.
 1003 *Nature Climate Change* 1, doi:10.1038/nclimate1086.

1004 Liu, Z., Yoshimura, K., Bowen, G.J., Buening, N.H., Risi, C., Welker, J.M., Yuan, F.,
 1005 2014. Paired oxygen isotope records reveal modern North American
 1006 atmospheric dynamics during the Holocene. *Nature Communications* 5,
 1007 doi:10.1038/ncomms4701.

1008 L'Heureux, M.L., Mann, M.E., Cook, B.I., Gleason, B.E., Vose, R.S., 2004. Atmospheric
 1009 circulation influences on seasonal precipitation patterns in Alaska during the
 1010 latter 20th century. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 109, D06106,
 1011 doi:10.1029/2003JD003845

1012 Luce, C.H., Abatzoglou, J.T., Holden, Z.A., 2013. The missing mountain water: slower
 1013 westerlies decrease orographic enhancement in the Pacific Northwest. *Science*
 1014 342, 1360-1364, doi:10.1126/science.1242335.

1015 Mann, M.E., Zhang, Z., Rutherford, S., Bradley, R.S., Hughes, M.K., Shindell, D., Amman,
 1016 C., Faluvegi, G., Ni, F., 2009. Global signatures and dynamical origins of the Little
 1017 Ice Age and Medieval Climate Anomaly. *Science* 326, 1256-1260.

1018 McCabe, G.J., Wolock, D.M., 2009. Recent declines in western U.S. snowpack in the
 1019 context of twentieth-century climate variability. *Earth Interactions* 13,
 1020 doi:10.1175/2009EI283.1.

1021 McCabe-Glyn, S., Johnson, K.R., Strong, C., Berkelhammer, M.B., Sinha, A., Cheng, H.,
 1022 Edwards, L.R., 2013. Variable North Pacific influence on drought in southwestern
 1023 North America since AD 854. *Nature Geoscience* 6, 617-621,
 1024 doi:10.1038/ngeo1862.

1025 McKay, J.L., de Vernal, A., Hillaire-Marcel, C., Not, C., Polyak, L., Darby, D., 2008.
 1026 Holocene fluctuations in Arctic sea-ice cover: dinocyst-based reconstructions for
 1027 the eastern Chukchi Sea. *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences* 45, 1377-1397.
 1028 Mesinger, F., Dimego, G., Kalney, E., Mitchell, K., Shafran, P.C., Ebisuzaki, W., Jovic, W.,
 1029 Woollen, D., Roger, E., Berbery, E.H., Ek, M.B., Fan, Y., Grumbine, R., Higgins, W.,
 1030 Li, H., Lin, Y., Manikin, G., Parrish, D., Shi, W., 2006. North American Regional
 1031 Reanalysis. *Bulletin of the American Meterological Society* 87, 343-360.
 1032 Metcalf, S.E., Barron, J.A., Davies, S.J., 2015. The Holocene history of the North
 1033 American Monsoon: 'known knowns' and 'known unknowns' in understanding
 1034 its spatial and temporal complexity. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 120, 1-27.
 1035 Miyasaka, T., Nakamura, H., Taguchi, B., Nonaka, M., 2014. Multidecadal
 1036 modulations of the low-frequency climate variability in the wintertime North
 1037 Pacific since 1950. *Geophysical Research Letters* 41, 2948-2955,
 1038 doi:10.1002/2014GL059696.
 1039 Moore, G.W.K., Holdsworth, G., Alverson, K., 2002. Climate change in the North
 1040 Pacific region over the past three centuries. *Nature* 420, 401-403.
 1041 Moy, C.M., Seltzer, G.O., Rodbell, D.T., Anderson, D.M., 2002. Variability of El
 1042 Niño/Southern Oscillation activity at millennial timescales during the Holocene
 1043 epoch. *Nature* 420, 162-165.
 1044 Nelson, D.B., Abbott, M.B., Steinman, B., Polissar, P.J., Stansell, N.D., Ortiz, J.D.,
 1045 Rosenmeier, M.F., Finney, B.P., Riedel, J., 2011. Drought variability in the Pacific

1046 Northwest from a 6,000-yr lake sediment record. Proceedings of the National
 1047 Academy of Science 108, doi:10.1073/pnas.1009194108.
 1048 Ortega, P., Lehner, F., Swingedourw, D., Masson-Delmotte, V., Raible, C.C., Casado, M.,
 1049 Yiou, P., 2015. A model-tested North Atlantic Oscillation reconstruction for the
 1050 past millennium. Nature 523, doi:10.1038/nature14518.
 1051 Osterberg, E., Mayewski, P., Fisher, D., Kreutz, K., Maasch, K.A., Sneed, S.B., Kelsey, E.,
 1052 2014. Mount Logan ice core record of tropical and solar influences on Aleutian
 1053 Low variability. Journal of Geophysical Research Atmospheres 119,
 1054 doi:10.1002/2014JD021847.
 1055 Overland, J.E., Wang, M., 2005. The third Arctic climate pattern, 1930's and early
 1056 2000's. Geophysical Research Letters 32, L23808, doi:10.1029/2005GL024254.
 1057 Overland, J., Rodionov, S., Minobe, S., Bond, N., 2008. North Pacific regime shifts:
 1058 definitions, issues and recent transitions. Progress in Oceanography 77, 92-102.
 1059 Papineau, J.M., 2001. Wintertime temperature anomalies in Alaska correlated with
 1060 ENSO and PDO. International Journal of Climatology 21, 1577-1592.
 1061 Pederson, G.T., Betancourt, J.L., McCabe, G.J., 2013. Regional patterns and proximal
 1062 causes of the recent snowpack decline in the Rocky Mountains, U.S. Geophysical
 1063 Research Letters 40, 1811-1816, doi:10.1002/grl.50424.
 1064 Pederson, G.T., Gray, S.T., Ault, T., Marsh, W., Fagre, D.B., Bunn, A.G., Woodhouse,
 1065 C.A., Graumlich, L.J., 2011. Climatic controls on snowmelt hydrology of the
 1066 Northern Rocky Mountains. Journal of Climate 24,
 1067 doi:10.1175/2010JCL13729.13721.

1068 Porter, T.J., Pisaric, M.F.J., Field, R.D., Kokelj, S.V., Edwards, T.W.D., deMontigny, P.,
 1069 Healy, R., LeGrande, A.N., 2013. Spring-summer temperatures since AD 1780
 1070 reconstructed from stable oxygen isotope ratios in white spruce tree-rings from
 1071 the Mackenzie Delta, northwestern Canada. *Climate Dynamics* 42, 771-785.
 1072 Papineau, J.M., 2001. Wintertime temperature anomalies in Alaska correlated with
 1073 ENSO and PDO. *International Journal of Climatology* 21, 1577-1592.
 1074 Praetorius, S.K., Mix, A.C., 2014. Synchronization of North Pacific and Greenland
 1075 climates preceded abrupt deglacial warming. *Science* 345, 444-448.
 1076 Praetorius, S.K., Mix, A.C., Davies, M.H., Wolhowe, M.D., Prahl, F.G., 2015. North
 1077 Pacific deglacial hypoxic events linked to abrupt ocean warming. *Nature* 527,
 1078 362-366, doi:10.1038/nature15753.
 1079 Rayner, N.A., Parker, D.E., Horton, E.B., 2003. Global analyses of sea surface
 1080 temperature, sea ice, and night marine air temperature since the late nineteenth
 1081 century. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 108, doi:10.1029/2002DJ002670.
 1082 Ricketts, R.D., Anderson, R.F., 1998. A direct comparison between the historical
 1083 record of lake level and the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ signal in carbonate sediments from Lake
 1084 Turkana, Kenya. *Limnology and Oceanography* 43, 811-822.
 1085 Rodionov, S.N., Bond, N.A., Overland, J.A., 2007. The Aleutian Low, storm tracks, and
 1086 winter climate variability in the Bering Sea. *Deep-Sea Research Part II* 54, 2560-
 1087 2577.

1088 Rozanski, K., Araguas-Araguas, L., Gonfiantini, R., 1993. Isotopic patterns in modern
 1089 global precipitation, in: Swart, P.K., Lohman, K.C., McKenzie, J., Savin, S. (Eds.),
 1090 Climate Change in Continental Isotopic Records. AGU, pp. 1-36.
 1091 Rupper, S., Steig, E.J., Roe, G., 2004. The Relationship between snow accumulation at
 1092 Mt. Logan, Yukon, Canada, and Climate Variability in the North Pacific. *Journal of*
 1093 *Climate* 17, 4724-4739.
 1094 Schmidt, G.A., Hoffman, G., Shindell, D.T., Hu, Y., 2005. Modeling atmospheric stable
 1095 isotopes and the potential for constraining cloud processes and stratosphere-
 1096 troposphere water exchange. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 110,
 1097 doi:10.1029/2005JD005790.
 1098 Schneider, N., Cornuelle, B.D., 2005. The forcing of the Pacific Decadal Oscillation.
 1099 *Journal of Climate* 18, 4355-4373.
 1100 Seager, R., Ting, M., Held, I., Kushnir, Y., Lu, J., Vecchi, G., Huang, H., Harnik, N.,
 1101 Leetmaa, A., Lau, N., Li, C., Velez, J., Niak, N., 2007. Model projections of an
 1102 imminent transition to a more arid climate in southwestern North America.
 1103 *Science* 316, 1181-1184.
 1104 Shapley, M.D., Ito, E., Donovan, J.J., 2008. Isotopic evolution and climate
 1105 paleorecords: modeling boundary effects in groundwater-dominated lakes.
 1106 *Journal of Paleolimnology* 39, 17-33.
 1107 Shapley, M.D., Ito, E., Donovan, J.J., 2009. Lateglacial and Holocene hydroclimate
 1108 inferred from a groundwater flow-through lake, Northern Rocky Mountains,
 1109 U.S.A. *The Holocene* 19, 523-535.

1110 Shinker, J.J., Bartlein, P.J., 2009. Visualizing the large-scale patterns of ENSO-related
 1111 climate anomalies in North America. *Earth Interactions* 13, 3,
 1112 doi:10.1175/2008EI2114.1
 1113 Steinhilber, F., Abreu, J.A., Beer, J., Brunner, I., Christi, M., Fischer, H., Heikkilä, U.,
 1114 Kubik, P.W., Mann, M., McCracken, K.G., Miller, H., Miyahara, H., Oerter, H.,
 1115 Wilhems, F., 2012. 9,400 years of cosmic radiation and solar activity from ice
 1116 cores and tree rings. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science* 109, 5967-
 1117 5971.
 1118 Steinman, B., Abbott, M.B., 2013. Isotopic and hydrologic responses of small closed
 1119 lakes to climate variability: Hydroclimate reconstructions from lake sediment
 1120 oxygen isotope records and mass balance models. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica*
 1121 *Acta* 105, 342-359.
 1122 Steinman, B., Abbott, M.B., Mann, M.E., Ortiz, J.D., Feng, S., Pompeani, D.P., Stansell,
 1123 N.D., Anderson, L., Finney, B.P., Bird, B.W., 2014. Ocean-atmosphere forcing of
 1124 centennial hydroclimate variability in the Pacific Northwest. *Geophysical*
 1125 *Research Letters* 41, doi:10.1002/2014GL059499.
 1126 Steinman, B., Abbott, M.B., Mann, M.E., Stansell, N.D., Finney, B.P., 2012. 1,500 year
 1127 quantitative reconstruction of winter precipitation in the Pacific Northwest.
 1128 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science* 109,
 1129 doi:10.1073/pnas.1201083109.
 1130 Steinman, B., Rosenmeier, M.F., Abbott, M.B., 2010. The isotopic and hydrologic
 1131 response of small, closed-basin lakes to climate forcing from predictive models:

1132 simulations of stochastic and mean-state precipitation responses. *Limnology and*
 1133 *Oceanography* 55, 2246-2261, doi:2210.4319/lo2010.2255.2246.2246.
 1134 Sun, D., 2010. The diabatic and non-linear aspects of the El Niño-Southern
 1135 Oscillation: implications for its past and future behavior, in: Sun, D. (Ed) *Climate*
 1136 *Dynamics: Why Does Climate Vary*. American Geophysical Union, Washington
 1137 DC.
 1138 Trenberth, K.E., Hurrell, J.W., 1994. Decadal atmosphere-ocean variations in the
 1139 Pacific. *Climate Dynamics* 9, 303-319.
 1140 Whitlock, C., Dean, W.E., Fritz, S.C., Stevens, L.R., Stone, J.R., Power, M.J., Rosenbaum,
 1141 J., Pierce, K.L., Bracht-Flyr, B., 2013. Holocene seasonal variability inferred from
 1142 multiple proxy records from Crevice Lake, Yellowstone National Park, U.S.A.
 1143 *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 331-332, 90-103.
 1144 Winnick, M.J., Chamberlain, C.P., Caves, J.K., Welker, J.M., 2014. Quantifying the
 1145 isotopic 'continental effect'. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 406, 123-133.
 1146 Wise, E.K., 2010. Spatiotemporal variability of the precipitation dipole transition
 1147 zone in the western United States. *Geophysical Research Letters* 37, L07706,
 1148 doi:10.1029/2009GL042193.
 1149 Wise, E., 2012. Hydroclimatology of the U.S. Mountain West. *Progress in Physical*
 1150 *Geography* 36, 458-479.
 1151 Woodruff, J.D., Donnelly, J.P., Okusu, A., 2009. Exploring typhoon variability over the
 1152 mid-to-late Holocene: evidence of extreme coastal flooding from Kamikoshiki,
 1153 Japan. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 28, 1774-1785.

1154 Yuan, F., Linsley, B.K., Lund, S.P., McGeehin, J.P., 2004. A 1200 year record of
1155 hydrologic variability in the Sierra Nevada from sediments in Walker Lake,
1156 Nevada. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems* 5, Q03007,
1157 doi:03010.01029/02003GC000652.

1158 Yuan, F., M.R., K., Valdez, A., 2013. Late glacial and Holocene records of climatic
1159 change in the southern Rocky Mountains from sediments in San Luis Lakes,
1160 Colorado USA. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 392, 146-160.

Figure Captions

Figure 1.

Western North American (A) gridded NCEP-NARR precipitation/potential evaporation ratios (P/PE) from and locations of lake sediment- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records (yellow; Table 1), and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records from Gulf of Alaska (GoA) planktonic foraminifera EW040885JC (purple), Mount Logan ice core (green), and Oregon Cave NM speleothem (green). (B) Locations of compiled lake water $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ compositions (Table 2, Supplementary files).

Figure 2

(A) Regional Evaporation Lines for eight western North American regions (REL; colored vectors) derived from lake water $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ compositions ($n \sim 600$; Table 2 and supplementary files) and the Global Meteoric Water Line (GMWL; black vector). Solid circles indicate the maximum isotopic compositions observed for each region. (B) Lake carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ records (solid) on their respective REL (dashed) and generalized $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ scale (same color and order as in A).

Figure 3

Schematic of the lake hydrology showing the influence on lake- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ by the relative strength of evaporative loss to input; (A) in open, through-flowing systems, lake-

$\delta^{18}\text{O}$ is minimally fractionated by evaporation and reflects precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, (B) in P-E systems lake- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ reflects the precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and fractionation by evaporation, and (C) in fully closed, terminal systems, all water loss is by evaporation and lake $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ is strongly enriched. Schematic plots of $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ (as in Figure 2a) for each example indicates the relative positions of lake- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (black circles) on three hypothetical regional evaporation lines (REL_1 , REL_2 , REL_3) extending from the Global Meteoric Water Line (GMWL). ($\delta^{18}\text{O}_\text{P}$ = precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{P-E}}$ = evaporated lake water- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, gw = groundwater, evap = evaporation flux).

Figure 4

Lake water deuterium excess ($d\text{x}\text{s}$) versus NCEP-NARR P/PE color-coded by $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ value (Table 1, Supplemental files). Note the trend of increasing potential for lakes to have lower $d\text{x}\text{s}$ in regions of lower P/PE.

Figure 5

Schematic of general Aleutian Low (L) and jet stream circulation patterns in the northeast Pacific associated with PDO and NPI phases; (A) strong +PDO/-NPI patterns correspond with deep AL centers and cyclonic flow drawing subtropical vapor northward along the west coast of North America and cold arctic vapor southward. Although strong AL centers are often positioned over the eastern sector of the Gulf of Alaska as shown here, its position varies. Note the strong S-N

meridional character of flow; and (B) neutral-to-strong –PDO/+NPI pattern that corresponds with a weak AL center that less vigorously entrains North Pacific vapor eastward within zonal jet stream flow. Historically, the mean east or west position of the AL during such states is highly variable (Rodionov et al., 2007)

Figure 6

Jellybean (JB) $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and 3-yr running average of Mount Logan (ML) sodium and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ on an AD scale for the past 1500 years. Gray shaded areas identify prominent negative shifts in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ that correspond to higher sodium concentrations.

Figure 7

Time-series: annual (blue) and 5-yr running average (red) of the PDO, NPI (note the reversed scale), ML sodium and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (Osterberg et al., 2014; Fisher et al., 2004) since 1900 A.D. The JB $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data are shown with a shaded area to outline the ± 2 to 5-yr age error estimates. The NPI index (blue) is shown for NCEP/NCAR re-analyses (green) to illustrate their differences prior to 1928. Gray shaded areas identify prominent +PDO/-NPI phases between 1920 to 1942 and 1976 to 1990.

Figure 8

Modeled precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ patterns for the North Pacific climate during the winters (NDJFM) of 1989, 2003 and 1998 (from Berkelhammer et al., 2011); the top row (A) shows wind vector anomalies and 850 mb geopotential heights, and the lower row

(B) shows the IsoGSM precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ anomalies (green = depleted, blue = enriched). A -PDO/+NPI circulation in 1989 illustrates a weak AL, west-northwesterly flow, and depleted precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ throughout western North America. Two varieties of +PDO/-NPI are illustrated by 2003 and 1998; in 2003 a strong-west AL results in enriched-north/depleted-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole, whereas a strong-east AL in 1998 results in depleted-north/enriched-south precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ dipole at JB and Bison. Note the opposite sign of the precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ anomalies at JB and Bison Lakes during such circulation patterns.

Figure 9

Vertical precipitation- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ trends from the St. Elias Mountains of southern Yukon Territory and Alaska (from Fisher et al., 2004); the left panel (A) shows the modeled vertical profile (range of model simulations and best fit) and measured data (sources listed in Fisher et al., 2004) interpreted to represent a modern meridional circulation pattern. The right panel (B) shows the modeled effects on the vertical profile shown in (A) for only North Pacific sources estimated for zonal flow. The red squares in (B) are the $\Delta\delta^{18}\text{O}$ observed before and after the ~1850 AD shift at ML, Eclipse Icefield (Wake et al., 2003), and JB shown in Figure 7. The lower JB square is the elevation of the lake and the upper square is the highest elevation of the lake's watershed.

Figure 10

Holocene JB and Bison Lake $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ z-score records over (A) the last 8,000 cal years (blue = raw, red = 21-interval smoothing), and (B) expands the past 3500 years on AD and cal yr BP age scales. The shaded intervals reflect key periods of transition discussed in the text.

Figure 11

Holocene z-scores for JB and Bison lake- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, Mount Logan ice- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (Fisher et al., 2008), and Oregon Cave NM speleothem- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (Ersek et al., 2012) with Gulf of Alaska foraminifera- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (‰VPDB; Praetorius and Mix, 2014), and total solar irradiance (TSI) anomalies based on combined ^{10}Be from ice core records and ^{14}C from tree-rings (Steinhilber et al., 2012) (blue=raw, red=21-interval smoothing with exception of TSI where red = 41-interval smoothing).

Figures

Figure 1

A.

B.

Figure 2

A. Regional evaporation lines and global meteoric water line (GMWL)

B. Lake sediment record and regional evaporation lines

Figure 3

Figure 4

Figure 5

A.

B.

Figure 6

Figure 7

20th Century

Figure 8

Figure 9**A. Modern (Meridional)** **B. Zonal -v- Modern**

Figure 10**A** **B**

Figure 11

Table 1

Lake carbonate- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ Records

Name	Lat (°N)	Long (°W)	Elev (m)	ka ^a	P/PE ^b	P (Kg/m ²)	PE (Kg/m ²)	<i>dxs</i>	Isometer	Reference
Takahula	67.35	153.66	257	11	8.03	1.17	0.15	-4.7	Mixed	Clegg and Hu, 2010
Tangled Up	67.67	149.07	450	7	7.14	1.20	0.17	-30.2	Precipitation	Anderson et al, 2001
Track	66.85	145.17	145	5	1.69	0.50	0.29	-41.4	Mixed	Anderson, this study
Seven Mile	62.18	136.38	697	1	2.67	0.71	0.27	-1.6	Mixed	Anderson et al., 2011
Jellybean	60.35	134.81	727	8	4.82	1.13	0.24	7.0	Precipitation	Anderson et al., 2005
Marcella	60.07	133.81	454	5	4.79	1.16	0.24	-42.0	P/E	Anderson et al., 2007
Paradise	54.68	122.62	733	10	10.04	2.76	0.28	-5.7	Mixed	Steinman et al., 2014,
Cleland	50.82	116.38	1158	10	6.07	1.66	0.28	-42	P/E	Steinman, this study
Castor	48.54	119.58	594	6	1.99	0.91	0.46	-45.5	P/E	Nelson et al., 2011
Scanlon	48.54	119.56	698	0.1	1.99	0.91	0.46	-43.8	P/E	Steinman et al., 2013
Lime	48.87	117.33	757	10	1.99	0.91	0.46	7.6	Precipitation	Steinman et al., 2012
Renner	48.78	118.89	753	1.5	2.99	1.48	0.50	-1.2	Mixed	Steinman, this study
Foy	48.16	114.35	1010	2.2	1.64	0.43	3.82	-32.7	P/E	Stevens et al., 2006
Jones	47.04	113.14	1250	12.5	1.48	0.45	3.28	-20	Mixed	Shapley et al., 2009
Crevice	45.00	110.58	1709	10	2.38	0.46	5.14	*	Mixed	Whitlock et al., 2013
Bison	39.76	107.35	3290	10	1.67	0.48	3.47	10.5	Precipitation	Anderson, 2011
Yellow	39.65	107.34	3160	7	1.67	0.48	3.47	-4.4	Mixed	Anderson, 2012
San Luis	37.67	105.72	2290	11	1.07	0.56	1.91	*	Mixed	Yuan et al., 2013

^a Time length of record, thousands of years
^b North American Regional Reanalysis (NARR), precipitation=P and potential evaporation=PE
* Modern water data not available

Table 2

Western North America Regional Evaporation Line (REL) statistics

Region	n	R ²	REL-GMWL Intercept $\delta^{18}\text{O}$	Slope	Reference ^b
Brooks Range Alaska	68	0.8959	-23.27	5.595	Clegg and Hu, 2010; Finney, this study
Northeast Interior Alaska	99	0.9513	-25.61	5.077	Anderson et al., 2013
Central Interior Alaska	33	0.9475	-21.19	4.438	Finney and Anderson, this study
Yukon Territory	69	0.9659	-21.55	3.976	Anderson et al., 2005 and 2007
British Columbia & Alberta	114	0.9756	-19.51	4.384	Steinman and Abbott, this study
Eastern Washington	115 ^a	0.9846	-16.62	4.328	Steinman et al., 2012 & this study
Montana, Idaho, & Wyoming	82	0.9844	-17.33	4.397	Henderson and Shuman, 2009
Colorado & Utah	100	0.9804	-16.43	5.014	Steinman and Abbott, this study Anderson, 2011, 2012 & this study

^a Includes 75 measurements of Castor and Scanlon Lakes

^b Regional plots and all data are available in Supplemental files