The Effect of Cycle Frequency, H₂O and CO₂ on TBC Lifetime with NiCoCrAlYHfSi
Bond Coatings

M. J. Lance, K. A. Unocic, J. A. Haynes and B. A. Pint

Materials Science and Technology Division

Oak Ridge National Laboratory, 1 Bethel Valley Rd., Oak Ridge, TN 37831, USA

Furnace cycle testing of superalloy 1483 and X4 substrates with high velocity oxygen fuel (HVOF) NiCoCrAlYHfSi bond coatings and air plasma sprayed (APS) yttria-stabilized zirconia (YSZ) top coatings were conducted at 1100 °C in various environments. Average thermal barrier coating (TBC) lifetimes were 5-6 times longer when 100 h cycles were used to simulate base-load power generation operation, compared to the 1 h aero-engine standard cycle. Longer exposure times for 100 h cycles increased the interdiffusion resulting in no clear effects of H₂O and CO₂ additions on average TBC lifetime for the 1483 substrates, contrary to the results with 1 h cycles where the addition of H₂O reduced TBC lifetime. The lower Al content and perhaps the higher Ti content in 1483 compared to X4 resulted in lower TBC lifetimes for 1483. Photo-stimulated luminescence piezospectroscopy (PLPS) and 3D microscopy were used to measure residual stress in the alumina scale and surface roughness, respectively, on specimens with and without a YSZ top coating.

Keywords: photo-stimulated luminescence piezospectroscopy (PLPS); water vapor; bond coating; alumina scale; TBC

1. Introduction

Along with low natural gas prices, increased emissions regulation in the U.S. have resulted in the closure of many smaller, older coal-fired power plants and less utilization of the entire fleet in the past 7 years [1]. When new U.S. coal-fired generation is built, new technology will be required to reduce Hg, SO_x, NO_x and CO₂ emissions. As part of this trend, two commercial scale (~600 MW) integrated gasification combined cycle (IGCC) plants have recently been built in the U.S., one with >60% CO₂ capture and the other capture ready. These plants burn coal-derived synthesis gas (syngas) in turbines that are very similar to the turbines in natural gas combined cycle (NGCC) plants with turbine exhaust used to generate steam in a bottoming cycle to increase the total plant efficiency. One drawback of IGCC is that syngas-fired turbines are de-rated (i.e. fired at a lower maximum temperature than similar NGCC turbines), which reduces the turbine efficiency resulting in lower plant electricity output for the same amount of fuel [2].

Improved materials/coatings may enable a reduction in the de-rating; however, it is critical to understand the syngas turbine environment as well as other innovative concepts that may contain high levels of CO₂ and/or H₂O. While sulfur or ash contamination from gasifying coal could be mitigated, especially by carbon capture processes applied to the syngas prior to combustion, the higher water vapor content (compared to NGCC) is determined by the fuel (ranging from syngas to pure H₂) and combustion conditions [2, 3]. Increasing the CO₂ in the turbine exhaust could facilitate CO₂ capture [4].

A trend for land-based gas turbines is the use of less expensive superalloys. Eliminating Re from single crystal superalloys reduces alloy costs by ~30% and the highest performance superalloys may not be needed as temperatures are lower in these turbines in order to achieve the 3-5 year overhaul time before stripping and reapplying the thermal barrier coating (TBC).

Furthermore, 1st generation single crystal superalloys like Re-free 1483 [5] have higher Cr contents yielding better hot corrosion resistance than 2nd generation alloys like X4 (3% Re) [6, 7].

These IGCC-relevant factors have been combined in this study in order to evaluate coating performance for this application. The effects of water vapor on high temperature oxidation have been widely studied in the past 15 years [8-16], including alumina-forming alloys and TBC bond coatings but a complete understanding has yet to be achieved. Advanced characterization techniques, such as photo-stimulated luminescence piezospectroscopy (PLPS) to measure stress in alumina scales [17-20], also are being employed. This technique is based upon the correlation of stress to the frequency shift of the R-lines produced by Cr^{3+} in Al_2O_3 [21]. The signal intensity is large enough to allow for non-destructive stress measurement from the scale grown under a YSZ (yttria stabilized zirconia) top coat [22]. In this work, PLPS was used to characterize specimens with and without an APS-YSZ top coating to build upon previous work [23-25].

2. Material and methods

Superalloy coupons of X4 and 1483, 2 mm thick and ~16 mm diameter with a 1mm hole were coated using a commercial-type HVOF process with commercial NiCoCrAlYHfSi [26] (Table I) powders at Stony Brook University's Center for Thermal Spray Research. The HVOF-coated specimens were annealed in a vacuum of 10^{-4} Pa for 4 h at 1080 °C and had a bond coating thickness of ~100 μm . A ~200 μm -thick APS YSZ layer was then applied on one side using typical spray conditions.

For each testing condition, 4-6 specimens were evaluated: 3-5 with YSZ and one without YSZ to study the surface morphology evolution. For 1 h cycles at 1100 °C, specimens were hung by a Pt-Rh wire in an automated cyclic rig with a controlled environment and then cooled in

laboratory air for 10 min for each cycle. For 100 h cycles, specimens were placed in an alumina boat, heated to temperature over ~4 h in flowing argon and furnace cooled after the cycle. Environments included (1) dry air, (2) air with $10\pm1\%$ or $50\pm2\%$ vol.% H_2O and (3) buffered 90% (CO_2 -0.15% O_2)+10% H_2O [16, 27]. The injected water was measured to calibrate its concentration. For the CO_2 - H_2O environment, the partial pressure of O_2 was intentionally fixed by the 0.15% O_2 in the CO_2 and the C activity was calculated to be 10^{-32} . Specimen mass change was measured using a Mettler-Toledo model XP205 balance but is not reported.

Periodically during exposure, specimens were examined using a scanning electron microscope (SEM) equipped with an energy dispersive x-ray spectrometer (EDS), a Keyence VHX digital microscope and optical profiler [24], and a Dilor XY800 Raman microprobe (Horiba Scientific, Edison, NJ) with an Innova 308c Ar^+ laser (Coherent, Inc., Santa Clara, CA) operating at 5145 Å with a power at the scale surface of 2.5 mW. PLPS stress maps were collected from the same 500 x 670 μm region as the digital images where average roughness (R_a) was calculated from the height maps [24, 25]. The laser spot size and the mapping step size were both 10 μm and the acquisition time for one spectrum was 0.1 s. A total of 3468 spectra were collected for each map. Since the bond coat surface was not flat and the scale was often cracked, the stress state was not assumed to be biaxial and so hydrostatic stress (the average of the trace of the stress tensor) was determined by dividing the frequency shift of the R2 line from a zero stress reference (NIST standard reference material 676A) by $7.61\text{ cm}^{-1}/\text{GPa}$ [21]. Owing to the large number of spectra collected no attempt was made to deconvolute multiple stress states and only a single stress (one set of R-lines) was fitted to each spectrum. One YSZ-coated specimen was also mapped using the same procedure described above with a fiducial marker cut into the YSZ top coating to locate the area. In order to improve the signal intensity, the laser power and the acquisition time were increased to 10 mW and 1 s, respectively. Fig. 1 shows typical spectra

acquired from the YSZ-coated specimen and the bare bond coat specimen after 100 h in air with 50% H₂O at 1100 °C. The spectrum from the zero-stress reference powder is also included. The intensity of the spectrum measured underneath the YSZ was ~10,000 times weaker than that measured on the scale on the bare bond coating. As noted by others [28, 29] this decline in intensity is due to attenuation of both the incident and luminescent light by the YSZ layer. After 5 x 100 h cycles, spalled Al₂O₃-containing scale debris on the YSZ surface obscured the spectra from the interface but debris after 10 x 100h cycles was removed using compressed air. After YSZ-coating failure (near 100% spall in all cases), the specimens were metallographically sectioned and examined by light microscopy and electron probe microanalysis (EPMA) using a JEOL model 8200 microprobe.

3. Results and discussion

Fig. 2 summarizes the average TBC lifetime data using both 1 h [25, 30] and 100 h cycles at 1100 °C. The lifetimes are the average values from three coated specimens except for the 1483 specimens exposed in 100 h cycles where five specimens were exposed. For reference, data from an earlier study with a lower roughness bond coating ($R_a \sim 5 \mu\text{m}$) are also included [27]. The substrate marked X4+ was similar to X4 but also contained 1–2 ppma Y and 2–3 ppma La. The same commercial bond coating powder was used in each case. As reported previously [25, 30], the lifetimes in 1 h cycles indicated (1) the increased bond coating roughness did not increase the average lifetime, (2) the TBC lifetime on 1483 substrates was lower than with the X4 substrates with bond coatings made in the same batch, (3) the addition of 10% H₂O decreased the TBC lifetime compared to dry air and (4) increasing to 50% H₂O further reduced the lifetime. The result with 10% H₂O was consistent with a previous study but in that study with $R_a \sim 5 \mu\text{m}$ bond coatings, cycling with 50% H₂O caused no further decrease in lifetime [27].

As expected [31, 32], the average TBC lifetimes were much longer when the cycle frequency was increased to 100 h to better simulate a base-load (i.e. more continuous operation) power generation duty cycle compared to the 1 h cycle test derived from an aero-engine duty cycle. Some of the coatings on the X4+ substrate lasted 10 times longer than those subjected to 1 h cycles and were not reported previously [27]. As noted before [25], the rougher ($R_a \sim 8 \mu\text{m}$) bond coatings were inadvertently thinner than the $R_a \sim 5 \mu\text{m}$ bond coatings and this is the likely reason for the reduction in average TBC lifetime from 3733 h to 2200 h with the X4-type substrates (see Fig. 2). The longer-lasting smoother bond coatings also failed gradually by edge delamination that was detected by thermography, while the rougher bond coatings spalled completely at failure. Previously, the Y and La additions in X4+ did not appear to produce any beneficial effects on TBC lifetime in 1 h cycles [27]. Consistent with the 1 h cycles, the average TBC lifetime with 10% H_2O was substantially shorter for the coatings on 1483 substrates compared to the X4 substrates. These specimens were all coated in the same batch and were tested at the same time. Not consistent with the 1 h cycles was the inconsistent effect of environment on the average TBC lifetimes with the 1483 substrates. The specimens tested in laboratory air had the shortest average lifetime of 860 h, while those tested with 10% H_2O had the longest average TBC lifetime of 1360 h. A 1040 h average lifetime was observed with 50% H_2O . For this study, a new environment containing 90% buffered CO_2 with 10% H_2O was added and resulted in an average lifetime of 1120 h. This level of CO_2 is much higher than anticipated in a syngas-fired turbine but was used to identify if any CO_2 effect might be expected at lower CO_2 levels. Buffered CO_2 was used as a low O_2 partial pressure is not expected in a combustion turbine.

Characterization of the specimens exposed with 1 h cycles was reported previously (except for those exposed in 50% H_2O) [25] therefore the discussion of the characterization

results will focus on the specimens cycled with 100 h cycles. Fig. 3 shows the surface roughness as a function of exposure time for the specimens without a YSZ top coating. The higher bond coating roughness in this batch of specimens was achieved by over spraying with coarser powder of the same composition, which resulted in a surface morphology like that shown in Fig. 4 with large intermittently-dispersed spherical particles. These particles were not present in the $R_a \sim 5$ μm coatings [27]. With exposure, all of the specimens initially increased in roughness due to oxidation followed by a decrease due to the spallation of some spherical metal particles as they were undercut by oxidation [25]. The exception to this trend was the coating exposed for 10 x 100 h cycles in 50% H_2O , which continued to increase in roughness. Further inspection of the region examined on this specimen showed spallation from a valley that effectively increased the roughness measurement despite a similar behavior.

For comparison, the specimen exposed to 1 h cycles and 50% H_2O exhibited a more rapid increase and subsequent decrease in roughness because of the much larger number of thermal cycles experienced (500) compared to 10 cycles for the other specimens. The roughness of the YSZ-coated specimen exposed to 100 h cycles and 50% H_2O is also shown in Fig. 3. The YSZ surface roughness did not change during exposure in contrast to prior results for EB-PVD YSZ top coatings with a Pt-modified aluminide bond coating exposed to 1 h cycles [33]. After YSZ spallation, the roughness of the bond coating on this sample was significantly lower as many of the spherical particles remained embedded in the adjacent YSZ coating, which spalled at failure.

The stress measurements are shown in histograms in Fig. 5 after 100 and 1000 h. Surprisingly, the specimen exposed in 10% H_2O and 100 h cycles without a top coating consistently had the lowest stress at both 100 and 1000 h, even lower than the specimen exposed in 1 h cycles which had already experienced 100 cycles after 100 h of exposure (Fig. 5a). The other three specimens without top coatings exposed in 100 h cycles all exhibited a broad stress

distribution after 1 cycle. At longer times, the compressive stress distribution narrowed with the peak distribution of 0.1 GPa after 5 cycles caused by extensive cracking, which relieved stress in the scale. The final stress measurement after 10 cycles is shown in Fig. 5b where the distribution skewed towards higher stresses due to new scale formation. New scale growth on the specimen cycled for 500, 1-h cycles in 50% H₂O resulted in a small peak at 4 GPa (not shown).

Different from the bare bond coating specimens in Fig. 5 was the stress distribution measured from the specimen with a YSZ top coating exposed in 100 h cycles and 50% H₂O. The 0.8 GPa peak stress was significantly narrower than many of the other specimens whose peak was at only 0.1 GPa (Fig. 5a). The higher stress in the scale is likely caused by the increased constraint imposed on the scale by the YSZ layer [34, 35]. Furthermore, the stress did not change significantly between 1 cycle (100 h) and 10 cycles (1000 h) (Fig. 5b), surprisingly, because the YSZ coating spalled after the next cycle. After spallation, the stress histogram of the exposed bond coating surface was similar to those measured for the bare bond coatings samples in Fig. 5b. These results suggest that measuring the residual stress beneath the YSZ top coating may be more useful than studying HVOF-coated specimens without a top coating where the alumina scale spalls readily.

Fig. 6 shows examples of the stress maps collected on specimens exposed in 100 h cycles in 50% H₂O with and without a YSZ top coating. As observed with 1 h cycles [25], the scale formed on the spherical particles (as shown in Fig. 4) cracks more readily than the scale in the flatter regions due to out-of-plane tensile stresses generated during cooling. These particles correspond to the round, low-stress regions on the bare bond coating after 1 cycle, Fig. 6a. Stress relief associated with these particles can also be observed at the interface through the YSZ coating after the same exposure time (Fig. 6c). Compared to the bare bond coating, fewer low stress regions were observed, suggesting that the YSZ layer inhibited scale cracking after 1 cycle,

consistent with stress distributions in Fig. 5a. After 10 cycles, the bare bond coating had more near-zero stress regions suggesting that more of the remaining scale was cracked. However, some areas had stresses exceeding 2 GPa, which is attributed to new, adherent scale growth on the spalled regions, Fig. 6b. In contrast, the stress in the scale under the YSZ layer in Fig. 6d was mostly intact (~0.8 GPa) but the zero-stress regions increased after 10 cycles leading up to coating failure. Again, this is consistent with the histogram for this data in Fig. 5b.

It is well-known that the YSZ layer will increase the laser spot size at the thermally-grown scale due to light dispersion within the YSZ with estimates ranging from 20 μm [36-38] to 160 μm [29]. One factor that may improve the spatial resolution is the increased R-line signal from cracked scale [25, 39]. The low stress regions under the YSZ in Fig. 6c emitted >10 times more luminescence than the surrounding high stress regions. Cracked scale will thus contribute more of the luminescence to the measured spectrum thereby allowing features that may be much smaller than the illuminated spot to appear in the stress maps.

Fig. 7 shows cross-sectional images of representative failed YSZ-coated specimens. As expected, the rougher bond coating caused the interfacial crack to travel mainly through the YSZ layer and tangential to peaks of the spherical particles where thicker Ni-rich oxide formed. The failure was not significantly different between 1 and 100 h cycles in 50% H_2O (Figs. 7a and 7b). One difference between the 1 and 100 h cycle specimens was the oxides formed at the interface between the bond coating and the 1483 substrate. With the longer exposure time (240 x 1 h cycles vs. 11 x 100 h cycles) at 1100°C, the oxides (identified by EPMA) appear to have grown significantly, they are clearly evident in the image in Fig. 7d, which was collected by illuminating the sample from the side, as indicated by the blue-tinted regions. Often discrete oxide particles at this interface are attributed to embedded alumina/silica grit from roughening of the substrate prior to coating. However, in these specimens, the interfacial particles are clearly growing with

exposure time and their growth is attributed to the relatively poor oxidation resistance of uncoated 1483 compared to X4 [40]. The spray coating process does not perfectly coat the coupon edge and this can lead to some ingress of O^{2-} or OH^- along this interface from the specimen edge. Fig. 8 shows an extreme case where the bond coating began to lift off at the coating-substrate interface after 10 x 100 h cycles in 10% H_2O .

A cross-section from the specimen heated in the CO_2 - H_2O environment is shown in Figs. 7c and 7d, which showed no indication of any internal oxidation/carburization due to this environment. No internal attack was observed on the specimen without the YSZ top coating either. It appears that replacing air with buffered CO_2 in this experiment did not have a significant detrimental effect. A companion study with aluminide bond coatings and EB-PVD top coatings using 1 h cycles at 1150 °C in the same environments found a longer lifetime in CO_2 +10% H_2O than in air+10% H_2O [30]. Relatively little prior work has been performed on alumina-forming coatings or alloys in CO_2 -containing environments at high temperature. A 1965 study of type 304 stainless steel found internal carburization in 1 bar CO_2 but more protective behavior for FeCrAl alloys [41].

The prior study of coated 1483 in 1h cycles found significantly greater interdiffusion on these coatings compared to X4 substrates [25], which was attributed to the lower Al content in 1483. With the longer exposure times in 100 h cycles, this issue is likely to be even more severe. Fig. 9 shows an EPMA line profile from one of the YSZ-coated 1483 specimens exposed for 1400 h in air with 10% H_2O . The Al content has dropped to ~4 wt%, near the same level as the substrate (3.4%) and significantly below the 12.3% in the starting coating powder. The other significant change is that there is now more than 1.5% Ti that has diffused in from the 1483 substrate. Previously, model NiCrAlYHf alloys were studied with and without 0.3%Ti and this level of Ti did not cause a change in alumina growth or adhesion [42]. However, the 1.5%Ti

combined with the large drop in Al content in the coating, may be very detrimental to the coating oxidation performance. Thus, one reason that TBC lifetime appeared to be relatively unaffected by environment for the 100 h cycle samples on 1483 may be that the bond coating became so severely depleted in Al at these long exposure times that this Al/Ti interdiffusion effect leads to failure independent of environment.

While 1100 °C was selected to accelerate TBC failures to reasonable times, this temperature is particularly high for 1483 without a coating. The low level of Al and high Ti content in 1483 result in very poor uncoated oxidation resistance, especially compared to X4 [40]. The disk specimen geometry resulted in edges that were not fully coated. While this was not an issue for X4, it appeared to be an issue for 1483. The liftoff shown in Fig. 8 could cause the YSZ coating to fail as well. The susceptibility of uncoated 1483 to rapid oxidation is also a concern as the bond coating was not as thick as in the previous study [27]. Thus, when evaluating less oxidation resistant substrates, more care may be needed to coat the entire specimen or the coating temperature may need to be reduced. However, reducing the temperature to 1050 °C would likely greatly increase the coating lifetime [43] but 1050°C is still not a low enough temperature for uncoated 1483 to form a protective oxide, especially in the presence of water vapor [40].

4. Conclusion

Furnace cycling testing of HVOF NiCoCrAlYHfSi bond coatings and APS YSZ top coatings was conducted at 1100 °C with variables relevant to current land-based, syngas-fired gas turbines: (1) different environments, (2) different superalloys and (3) longer thermal cycles. Average TBC lifetime with 100 h cycles was 5-6 times longer compared to previous testing with 1 h cycles of coatings performed on test specimens obtained from the same batch. Based on the

observation that additions of H₂O and CO₂ had no clear effects on the average TBC lifetime of coated 1483 substrates, these longer exposure times appear to have changed the failure mechanism to interdiffusion and increased formation of oxide at the coating-1483 interface thereby raising the concern that a specimen geometry effect may also be contributing to the failure with the less oxidation-resistant 1483 substrate. Compared to X4 substrates with the same coating, the lifetime on 1483 was 30-40% lower in both 1 and 100 h cyclic testing at 1100 °C. The lower Al content and perhaps the higher Ti content in 1483 may have contributed to this difference. Stress measurements through the YSZ top coating appeared to be a more useful characterization method than studying bare HVOF bond coatings and future work will employ this methodology.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank D. Leonard, G. Garner, T. Lowe, T. Geer and T. Jordan for assistance with the experimental work at ORNL and E. Lara-Curzio and P. F. Tortorelli for comments on the manuscript. This research was sponsored by the U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Coal and Power R&D in the Office of Fossil Energy, (R. Dennis program manager).

References

- [1] B.A. Pint, High-Temperature Corrosion in Fossil Fuel Power Generation: Present and Future, *J. Mater.*, 65 (2013) 1024-1032.
- [2] I. Wright, T. Gibbons, Recent developments in gas turbine materials and technology and their implications for syngas firing, *Int. J. Hydrogen Energ.*, 32 (2007) 3610-3621.
- [3] B.M. White, R.W. Ames, P. Burke, Conditions in Advanced Turbines for IGCC Power Plants with Carbon Capture, ASME Paper #GT2013-94609, Proc. Turbo Expo 2013, 2013.
- [4] L. Ruth, Advanced clean coal technology in the USA, *Mater. High Temp.*, 20 (2003) 7-14.
- [5] D.M. Shah, A. Cetel, Evaluation of PWA1483 for large single crystal IGT blade applications, in: *Superalloys 2000*, Warrendale, PA, 2000, pp. 295-304.
- [6] A. Bennett, Properties of Thermal Barrier Coatings, *Mater. Sci. Tech.*, 2 (1986) 257-261.
- [7] R. Rapp, Chemistry and electrochemistry of hot corrosion of metals, *Mater. Sci. Eng.*, 87 (1987) 319-327.
- [8] C. Leyens, K. Fritscher, R. Gehrling, M. Peters, W.A. Kaysser, Oxide scale formation on an MCrAlY coating in various H₂-H₂O atmospheres, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 82 (1996) 133-144.
- [9] K. Onal, M.C. Maris Sida, G.H. Meier, F.S. Pettit, Water vapor effects on the cyclic oxidation resistance of alumina forming alloys, *Mater. High Temp.*, 20 (2003) 327-337.
- [10] E.J. Opila, Volatility of common protective oxides in high-temperature water vapor: Current understanding and unanswered questions, *Mater. Sci. Forum*, 461-464 (2004) 765-773.

- [11] B.A. Pint, J.A. Haynes, Y. Zhang, K.L. More, I.G. Wright, The effect of water vapor on the oxidation behavior of Ni–Pt–Al coatings and alloys, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 201 (2006) 3852-3856.
- [12] J.L. Smialek, Enigmatic Moisture Effects on Al₂O₃ Scale and TBC Adhesion, *Mater. Sci. Forum*, 595-598 (2008) 191-198.
- [13] R. Kartono, D.J. Young, Effectiveness of platinum and iridium in improving the resistance of Ni-Al to thermal cycling in air–steam mixtures, *Mater. Corros.*, 59 (2008) 455-462.
- [14] W.J. Quadakkers, J. Žurek, M. Hänsel, Effect of water vapor on high-temperature oxidation of FeCr alloys, *J. Mater.*, 61 (2009) 44-50.
- [15] V. Déneux, Y. Cadoret, S. Hervier, D. Monceau, Effect of Water Vapor on the Spallation of Thermal Barrier Coating Systems During Laboratory Cyclic Oxidation Testing, *Oxid. Met.*, 73 (2010) 83-93.
- [16] B.A. Pint, G.W. Garner, T.M. Lowe, J.A. Haynes, Y. Zhang, Effect of increased water vapor levels on TBC lifetime with Pt-containing bond coatings, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 206 (2011) 1566-1570.
- [17] D.M. Lipkin, D.R. Clarke, M. Hollatz, M. Bobeth, W. Pompe, Stress Development in Alumina Scales Formed upon Oxidation of (111)NiAl Single Crystals, *Corros. Sci.*, 39 (1997) 231-242.
- [18] C. Mercer, D. Hovis, A.H. Heuer, T. Tomimatsu, Y. Kagawa, A.G. Evans, Influence of thermal cycle on surface evolution and oxide formation in a superalloy system with a NiCoCrAlY bond coat, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 202 (2008) 4915-4921.

- [19] V.K. Tolpygo, D.R. Clarke, Competition Between Stress Generation and Relaxation During Oxidation of an Fe-Cr-Al-Y Alloy, *Oxid. Met.*, 49 (1998) 187-212.
- [20] J.A. Haynes, M.J. Lance, B.A. Pint, I.G. Wright, Characterization of commercial EB-PVD TBC systems with CVD (Ni,Pt)Al bond coatings, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 146 (2001) 140-146.
- [21] Q. Ma, D.R. Clarke, Piezospectroscopic Determination of Residual Stress in Polycrystalline Alumina, *J. Am. Ceram. Soc.*, 77 (1994) 298-302.
- [22] R.J. Christensen, D.M. Lipkin, D.R. Clarke, K. Murphy, Nondestructive Evaluation of the Oxidation Stresses through Thermal Barrier Coatings Using Cr^{3+} Piezospectroscopy, *Appl. Phys. Lett.*, 69 (1996) 3754-3756.
- [23] J.A. Nychka, D.R. Clarke, S. Sridharan, E. Jordan, M. Gell, M.J. Lance, C.J. Chunnillall, I.M. Smith, S.R.J. Saunders, R. Pillan, V. Sergo, A. Selcuk, A. Atkinson, K.S. Murphy, NDE assessment of TBCs: an interim report of a photo-stimulated luminescence 'round-robin' test, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 163 (2003) 87-94.
- [24] M.J. Lance, K.A. Unocic, J.A. Haynes, B.A. Pint, Effect of water vapor on thermally-grown alumina scales on Pt-modified and simple aluminide bond coatings, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 237 (2013) 2-7.
- [25] J.A. Haynes, K.A. Unocic, M.J. Lance, B.A. Pint, Impact of superalloy composition, bond coat roughness and water vapor on TBC lifetime with HVOF NiCoCrAlYHfSi bond coatings, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 237 (2013) 65-70.
- [26] J.T. Demasi-Marcin, D.K. Gupta, Protective coatings in the gas turbine engine, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 68 (1994) 1-9.

- [27] J.A. Haynes, K.A. Unocic, B.A. Pint, Effect of water vapor on the 1100°C oxidation behavior of plasma-sprayed TBCs with HVOF NiCoCrAlX bond coatings, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 215 (2013) 39-45.
- [28] K.W. Schlichting, K. Vaidyanathan, Y.H. Sohn, E.H. Jordan, M. Gell, N.P. Padture, Application of Cr^{3+} photoluminescence piezo-spectroscopy to plasma-sprayed thermal barrier coatings for residual stress measurement, *Mater. Sci. Eng. A*, 291 (2000) 68-77.
- [29] D. Liu, O. Lord, O. Stevens, P.E.J. Flewitt, The role of beam dispersion in Raman and photo-stimulated luminescence piezo-spectroscopy of yttria-stabilized zirconia in multi-layered coatings, *Acta Mater.*, 61 (2013) 12-21.
- [30] B.A. Pint, K.A. Unocic, J.A. Haynes, *Proc. 7th Inter. Conf. on Advances in Materials Technology for Fossil Power Plants*, ASM International, Materials Park, OH, in press, 2014.
- [31] N. Vialas, D. Monceau, B. Pieraggi, Effect of cycle frequency on high temperature oxidation Behavior of alumina-forming coatings used for industrial gas turbine blades, *Mater. Sci. Forum*, 461-464 (2004) 747-754.
- [32] B.A. Pint, P.F. Tortorelli, I.G. Wright, Effect of cycle frequency on high-temperature oxidation behavior of alumina-forming alloys, *Oxid. Met.*, 58 (2002) 73-101.
- [33] V.K. Tolpygo, D.R. Clarke, K.S. Murphy, Evaluation of interface degradation during cyclic oxidation of EB-PVD thermal barrier coatings and correlation with TGO luminescence, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 188-189 (2004) 62-70.
- [34] A. Atkinson, A. Selcuk, A. Selçuk, S.J. Webb, Variability of stress in alumina corrosion layers formed in thermal-barrier coatings, *Oxid. Met.*, 54 (2000) 371-384.

- [35] H.E. Evans, Oxidation failure of TBC systems: An assessment of mechanisms, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 206 (2011) 1512-1521.
- [36] K.W. Schlichting, N.P. Padture, E.H. Jordan, M. Gell, Failure modes in plasma-sprayed thermal barrier coatings, *Materials Science and Engineering a-Structural Materials Properties Microstructure and Processing*, 342 (2003) 120-130.
- [37] A. Selcuk, A. Atkinson, Analysis of the Cr^{3+} luminescence spectra from thermally grown oxide in thermal barrier coatings, *Mater. Sci. Eng. A*, 335 (2002) 147-156.
- [38] C. Rinaldi, L. De Maria, M. Mandelli, Assessment of the Spent Life Fraction of Gas Turbine Blades by Coating Life Modeling and Photostimulated Luminescence Piezospectroscopy, *J. Eng. Gas Turb. Power*, 132 (2010) 114501-114501-114504.
- [39] X. Wang, A. Atkinson, L. Chirivì, J.R. Nicholls, Evolution of stress and morphology in thermal barrier coatings, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 204 (2010) 3851-3857.
- [40] B.A. Pint, unpublished work, 2014.
- [41] H.E. McCoy, Type 304 Stainless Steel vs Flowing CO_2 at Atmospheric Pressure and 1100-1800F, *Corrosion*, 21 (1965) 84-94.
- [42] K.A. Unocic, B.A. Pint, Oxidation behavior of co-doped NiCrAl alloys in dry and wet air, *Surf. Coat. Tech.*, 237 (2013) 8-15.
- [43] D. Renusch, M. Schorr, M. Schutze, The role that bond coat depletion of aluminum has on the lifetime of APS-TBC under oxidizing conditions, *Mater. Corros.*, 59 (2008) 547-555.

Table I. Chemical compositions (atomic% or ppma) determined by inductively coupled plasma analysis and combustion analysis.

Material	Ni	Cr	Al	Re	Co	W	Ta	Mo	Ti	C	Other (ppma)
X4	62.8	7.5	13.0	0.9	9.7	2.1	2.2	0.4	1.2	0.02	<3Y,270Hf,17S
1483	60.8	13.6	7.3	<	8.8	1.3	1.7	1.2	4.9	0.36	<3Y,7Hf,80Si,<1S
MCrAlYHf	41.2	16.2	22.9	<	18.4	0.01	<	<	<	0.05	3860Y,710Hf, 6500Si,3S

< Indicates below the detectability limit of <0.01%

List of figure captions

Fig. 1. Luminescence spectra acquired from samples with and without a YSZ top coating after 100 h in air with 50 vol% H₂O at 1100 °C. Also included is a spectrum from the zero-stress reference powder.

Fig. 2. Average TBC lifetime data using both 100 h (first bar for each condition) and 1 h (second bar) cycles at 1100 °C measured on three coated specimens except for the 1483 specimens exposed in 100 h cycles where five specimens were exposed in each condition. The substrate marked X4+ was the same as X4 but with 1–2 ppma Y and 2–3 ppma La. Some 1h cycle data from Refs. 25 and 30.

Fig. 3. The average surface roughness, R_a , as a function of time at 1100 °C (100 h cycles). Data for one sample following 1-h cycles in 50% H₂O is also included.

Fig. 4. Surface profile of a bare bond coating after 100 h in 50% H₂O with $R_a \sim 8$.

Fig. 5. Stress histograms measured on 1483 specimens with and without a YSZ coating after 100 h (a) and 1000 h (b) at 1100 °C.

Fig. 6. Stress maps collected from the 1483 specimens without a YSZ top coating after 1-100 h cycle (a) and 10-100 h cycles (b) and with a YSZ top coating after 1-100 h cycles (c) and 10-100 h cycles (d). Arrows indicate the same two low-stress regions after 1 and 10-100 h cycles.

Fig. 7. Cross-sectional images of failed TBC-coated specimens after 240 1-h cycles in 50% H₂O (a), 10 100-h cycles in 50% H₂O (b), and 11 100-h cycles in 90% CO₂-10% H₂O imaged with top-down (c) and side (d) illumination modes.

Fig. 8. SEM secondary electron image of the 1483 bond coating only specimen after 10 100-h cycles in air with 10% H₂O.

Figure 9. (a) Secondary electron image of polished cross-section of failed 1483 HVOF ($R_a=8$)/YSZ-coated specimen at 1100 °C after 14 100-h cycles in air with 10% H₂O (b) EPMA line profile shown in (a) with the gas interface on the left and the substrate on the right.

Fig. 1.

Fig. 2.

Fig. 3.

Fig. 4.

Fig. 5.

Fig. 6.

Fig. 7.

Fig. 8.

Fig. 9.