Are climate warming and enhanced atmospheric deposition of sulfur and nitrogen threatening tufa landscapes in Jiuzhaigou National Nature Reserve, Sichuan, China?

Xue Qiao^a, Jie Du^{b,c}, Stefano Lugli^d, Jinhai Ren^b, Weiyang Xiao^b, Pan Chen^c, Ya Tang^{c,1}

^a Institute of New Energy and Low-Carbon Technology, Sichuan University, Chengdu 610065, Sichuan Province, China

^b Jiuzhaigou Administrative Bureau, Zhangzha Town, Jiuzhaigou County 623402, Sichuan Province, China

^c Department of Environment, College of Architecture and Environment, Sichuan University, Chengdu 610065, Sichuan Province, China

^d Dipartimento di Scienze Chimiche e Geologiche, Università degli Studi di Modena e Reggio Emilia, Via Campi 103, Modena 41125, Italy

Abstract: Massive deposition of calcium carbonate in ambient temperature waters (tufa) can form magnificent tufa landscapes, many of which are designated as protected areas. However, tufa landscapes in many areas are threatened by both local anthropogenic activities and climate change. This study, for the first time, posed the question whether the tufa landscape degradation (characterized by tufa degradation and increased biomass of

Abbreviations: a.s.l., above sea level; CaCO₃, Calcium carbonate; Ca(HCO₃)₂, Calcium bicarbonate; CO₂, Carbon dioxide; DOC, Dissolved organic carbon; IC, Ion chromatograph; IPCC, Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change; LLMS, Long Lake Meteorological Station; MEPC, Ministry of Environmental Protection of China; NH₄⁺, Ammonia ion; NO₃⁻, Nitrate ion; SIc, Saturation index of calcite; SNMS, Songpan National Meteorological Station; SO₄²⁻, Sulfate ion; TIN, Total inorganic nitrogen; USGS, United States Geology Survey; VWM, Volume weighted mean.

¹ Corresponding author, tangya@scu.edu.cn

green algae) in Jiuzhaigou National Nature Reserve of China is partially caused by regional air pollution and climate warming. The results indicate that wet deposition (including rain and snow) polluted by anthropogenic SO_2 , NO_x , and NH_3 emissions dissolves exposed tufa and may considerably reduce tufa deposition rate and even cause tufa dissolution within shallow waters. These effects of wet deposition on tufa enhanced as pH of wet deposition decreased from 8.01 to 5.06. Annual Volume Weighted Mean concentration of reactive nitrogen (including NH_4^+ and NO_3^-) in wet deposition ($26.1 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$) was 1.8 times of the corresponding value of runoff ($14.8 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$) and exceeded China's national standard of total nitrogen in runoff for nature reserves ($14.3 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$), indicating a direct nitrogen fertilization effect of wet deposition on green algae. As water temperature is the major limiting factor of algal growth in Jiuzhaigou and temperature in the top layer (0-5 cm) of runoff (depth<1 m, no canopy coverage of trees and shrubs) was significantly higher at the sites with increased biomass of green algae ($p<0.05$), climate warming in this region would favor algal growth. In sum, this study suggests that climate warming and enhanced sulfur and nitrogen deposition have contributed to the current degradation of tufa landscape in Jiuzhaigou, but in order to quantify the contributions, further studies are needed, as many other anthropogenic and natural processes also influence tufa landscape evolution.

Keywords: travertine, climate change, nutrient enrichment, acid rain, national park

1. Introduction

Tufa is the product of calcium carbonate (CaCO_3) deposition in ambient temperature waters, mainly presenting as calcite and typically containing the remains of micro- and macrophytes, invertebrates, and bacteria (Ford and Pedley, 1996). Travertine is usually used as an alternative term for tufa (Pentecost, 2005). As for the formation of tufa, it is believed that groundwater, which first gains high carbon dioxide (CO_2) concentrations from soil profiles (Yan et al., 2013) and/or possibly from deep sources like the upper mantle (Yoshimura et al., 2004), dissolves carbonate bedrocks to form a solution rich in calcium bicarbonate ($\text{Ca}(\text{HCO}_3)_2$). After traveling for some distance and then emerging at springs, dissolved CO_2 is lost from the solution on contact with the atmosphere which has a CO_2 concentration lower than that in equilibrium with the $\text{Ca}(\text{HCO}_3)_2$ -rich solution (Pentecost, 2005). Due to CO_2 loss, the solution becomes supersaturated with respect to calcite and begins to produce calcite (Eq. 1). Tufa may spread across the earth's surface for meters to kilometers, building three dimensional landforms that can be generally categorized into two fundamental depositional morphotypes (Ford and Pedley, 1996). The first is called "fluvial barrage model" (Pedley, 1990) or "barrage travertine/tufa system" (Violance et al., 1994), which involves damming of a river, by means of one or more transverse oriented tufa barrages (Ford and Pedley, 1996; Figure S1). The second is "perched springline model" (Pedley, 1990) or "slope travertine/tufa system" (Violance et al., 1994), which involves the formation of a valley-side-sited, wedge-shaped sedimentary body (Ford and Pedley, 1996; Figure S2). A detailed review of tufa and travertine deposits of the world can be found in Ford and Pedley (1996).

Many magnificent tufa landscapes are designated as protected areas and are also popular tourist destinations (Ford and Pedley, 1996; Pentecost, 2010). Jiuzhaigou National Nature Reserve (Jiuzhaigou, hereafter) in China, Plitvice National Park in Croatia, Havasupai Canyon in the U.S., and Dunns River Falls in Jamaica are examples that are famous for tufa landscapes. Unfortunately, tufa landscape degradation (e.g., increased biomass of green

algae associated with nutrient enrichment, tufa erosion and dissolution, a reduced deposition rate of tufa, and tufa waterfall collapse) has been reported for many protected areas and its relationship with local anthropogenic activities has been investigated (Goudie et al., 1993; Zhou, 1998; Zhang et al., 2012). Trampling by humans and livestock causes physical damage to tufa so now they are protected by boardwalks and fences (Pentecost, 2010). Discharge change caused by climate change and anthropogenic activities led to reduced tufa deposition and/or tufa loss (Goudie et al., 1993). Water chemistry change caused by deforestation, fertilizers, and wastewater would also affect tufa deposition and even cause tufa loss (Thorpe, 1981; Goudie et al., 1993; Zhou et al., 1998). Although a number of protective measures have been implemented, degradation of tufa landscape continues in some protected areas (Zhang et al., 2012; Gu et al., 2013). As tufa landscapes are usually formed in shallow waters and some of which would be seasonally dry, they might prove sensitive to atmospheric environmental changes. It is evident that anthropogenic activities have led to climate warming (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), 2013) and enhanced atmospheric deposition of reactive sulfur and nitrogen (including sulfate ion (SO_4^{2-}), nitrate ion (NO_3^-), and ammonia ion (NH_4^+)) throughout the world (Vet et al., 2014). Climate warming influences water temperature, which is regarded as the major limiting factor of algal growth in many alpine, subalpine, and boreal regions (Williamson et al., 2008; Schindler, 2009). Reactive nitrogen is an important nutrient for the growth of hydrophytes like green algae, particularly in pristine waters, which are usually low in nitrogen concentrations (Baron et al., 2000; Williamson et al., 2008; Hessen et al., 2009). SO_4^{2-} and NO_3^- are the main acids that cause acid rain and it is well known that acid rain can accelerate chemical weathering of carbonate rocks. However, to the best of the authors' knowledge, the contributions of climate warming and enhanced deposition of reactive sulfur and nitrogen to tufa landscape degradation have not been explored.

This paper reports a case study in Jiuzhaigou (32.88°-33.33° N, 103.77°-104.08° E, 2000-4880 m above sea level (a.s.l.)), a headwater watershed located in a subalpine to alpine region of Sichuan Province, China (Figure 1a). Jiuzhaigou has a reserve area of 643 km² and additionally has a buffer zone of 598 km². Over 80% of Jiuzhaigou's land is covered by

vegetation, including 65% covered by pine forests and mixed broadleaf and coniferous forests and 15% covered by shrubs and meadows (Lin et al., 2006; Liu et al., 2007; Bossard et al., 2015). Tufa landscapes are distributed in the bottom of Rize and Shuzheng valleys (Figure 1b), having a total area of 2.4 km² and consisting of 17 groups of waterfalls, 16 cascades/shoals, 110 lakes/pools, and numerous springs. Due to logging in 1966-1978 and poor management of tourism development in the 1980s and early 1990s, human activities caused remarkable adverse effects on tufa landscapes then, such as increased lake sedimentation, water pollution, and physical damage to tufa (Zhou, 1998; Gu et al., 2013; Li et al., 2014; Liang et al., 2014). In order to protect the tufa landscapes, logging was banned in 1978 and a number of regulations/infrastructure were implemented/built in the late 1990s and early 2000s. Farming and grazing have been completely barred since 2001. Wastewater and solid wastes are collected through a sanitary system and transported out of the reserve. Nuorilang Center is the sole restaurant and tourists are strict to visit the reserve approximately between 7:00 am and 6:00 pm. Tourist vehicles are not allowed in the reserve starting from 2002; instead, a system of tour buses and boardwalks are now used by tourists to visit the main tourist region located in the bottom of Rize, Shuzheng, and Zezhawa valleys (Figure 1b).

Although great efforts have been made to protect Jiuzhaigou's tufa landscapes, the degradation of tufa landscape, characterized by increased biomass of green algae and tufa erosion and dissolution (Figure S3), continues and is occurring in parallel with climate warming (Figure 2) and elevated atmospheric deposition of reactive sulfur and nitrogen, which includes acid rain (pH<5.60) (Qiao et al., 2015a). Specifically, annual mean air temperature increased by 0.3°C in Jiuzhaigou from 2003 to 2014 and by 1.2°C from 1951 to 2014 at the Songpan National Meteorological Station (SNMS), which is about 140 km from Jiuzhaigou (Figure 2). Acid rain was observed having SO₄²⁻ as the major source of acidity and over 90% of the annual wet deposition fluxes of reactive sulfur and nitrogen were from anthropogenic sources (Qiao et al., 2015a). From June to August 2010 (accounting for 30% and 40% of annual deposition fluxes of reactive sulfur and nitrogen, respectively), 93%, 98%, and 69% of the deposition fluxes of SO₄²⁻, NO₃⁻, and NH₄⁺ were from inter-regional

transport of air pollutants, respectively, rather than from local emissions (Qiao et al., 2015b). Therefore, the main objective of this study is to understand whether these observed climate warming and enhanced deposition of reactive sulfur and nitrogen actually have contributed to the current degradation of tufa landscape in Jiuzhaigou.

2. Methods and materials

2.1. Study area

Human history in the reserve dates back to at least 2,000 yr BP (Henck et al., 2010) and can be approximately divided into four periods (Urgenson et al., 2014): (1) swidden agriculture (before early 1950s), (2) collective agriculture (1950s-1970s) combined with intensive logging (1966-1978), (3) modified family-based agriculture (1970s-1999) and protected area establishment (1978), and (4) tourism development (1984-present) and implementation of reforestation programs (1999-present). In 2015, over 5 million tourists visited the reserve and about 1,300 residents inhabit in four villages, three of which are located in the main tourist region (Figure 1b). Natural gas and electricity are now widely used for household cooking and heating.

Climately, Jiuzhaigou lies in a transitional region from the humid Sichuan Basin to the semiarid Tibetan Plateau (Urgenson et al., 2014). At the Nuorilang Center, monthly air temperature was highest in July ($\sim 18^{\circ}\text{C}$) and lowest in January ($\sim -4^{\circ}\text{C}$). Annual precipitation was 539-771 mm, with over 80% falls during the wet season (approximately from April to October). Precipitation is the sole water source of the watershed. A one-year monitoring campaign from April 2010 to May 2011 collected 36 weekly to biweekly wet deposition samples (including rain and snow) at the Long Lake Meteorological Station (LLMS) and found that pH of wet deposition was 5.06-8.01, with about 10% of samples having a pH less than 5.60 (Qiao et al., 2015a). Annual Volume Weighted Mean (VWM) concentrations of Mg^{2+} , Ca^{2+} , SO_4^{2-} , K^{+} , Na^{+} , F^{-} , Cl^{-} , NH_4^{+} , NO_3^{-} , and TIN (i.e., total inorganic nitrogen, including NH_4^{+} and NO_3^{-} here) were 41.1, 149.8, 70.5, 21.2, 38.0, 21.0, 37.2, 13.4, 12.7, and

26.1 $\mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$, respectively (Table 1; Qiao et al., 2015a).

In response to the seasonal changes of precipitation, runoff level was highest in October and lowest in April. The runoff in the bottom of Rize and Shuzheng valleys generally flows from south to north and interspersed with tufa dams and lakes (Florsheim et al., 2013). Zezhawa Valley lacks surface flow and tufa but contains three lakes and a small pool, water of which four leaks to Rize and Shuzheng valleys (Gan, 2007). Alkalinity, ionic concentrations, pH, and temperature of runoff were monitored at 11 sites in the dry and wet seasons (Qiao, 2012; Figure 1b) during the one-year wet deposition monitoring campaign of Qiao et al. (2015a). The results show that runoff at the 11 sites was alkaline (pH: 7.77-8.60; alkalinity: 2413-4143 $\mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$) and had mean Mg^{2+} , Ca^{2+} , SO_4^{2-} , K^+ , Na^+ , F^- , Cl^- , NH_4^+ , NO_3^- , and TIN concentrations of 537.6, 1545, 201.7, 16.1, 59.1, 35.8, 24.7, 0.9, 13.9, and 14.8 $\mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$, respectively (Table 1).

2.2. Impacts of enhanced acid deposition on tufa

Acid rain mainly caused by anthropogenic SO_4^{2-} was observed in Jiuzhaigou and NO_3^- has also been identified as an acidity source (Qiao et al., 2015a). In order to understand whether enhanced deposition of these two acids is harming tufa landscapes in Jiuzhaigou, we first compared the Saturation Index of Calcite (SIc) between wet deposition and runoff. Water with an SIc less/larger than zero is prone to dissolve/precipitate calcite. SIc of each sample was calculated using the PHREEQC model (version 3) developed by the United States Geology Survey (USGS) (Parkhurst and Appelo, 1999) and using the WATEQ4F thermodynamic database (Ball and Nordstrom, 2001) distributed with the PHREEQC model. This model has been widely used to calculate SIc of water samples in tufa-related studies (Leybourne et al., 2009; Vázquez-Urbez et al., 2010; Arenas et al., 2015). To run the PHREEQC model, we used the data of each sample of runoff and wet deposition (including temperature, pH, conductivity, alkalinity, and Mg^{2+} , Ca^{2+} , SO_4^{2-} , K^+ , Na^+ , F^- , Cl^- , NH_4^+ , and NO_3^- concentrations) measured in Qiao et al. (2012) and Qiao et al. (2015a), respectively. Alkalinity of wet deposition was not directly measured but it was believed mostly

contributed by HCO_3^- in Jiuzhaigou (Qiao et al., 2015a), thus Eq. (2) was used to estimate alkalinity of the wet deposition samples that had a pH higher than 7.00 in this study. Alkalinity was considered to be zero in the wet deposition samples that had a pH less than 7.00.

Additionally, as tufa landscapes in Jiuzhaigou are mostly formed in shallow waters and some tufa landscapes would be completely/partially dry during the dry season and at the beginning of wet season, we also used the PHREEQC model and the WATEQ4F thermodynamic database to calculate SIc values in the water mixed by runoff and wet deposition at a variety of volume ratios. The volume mixing ratios of runoff (V_{runoff}) to wet deposition ($V_{\text{wet deposition}}$) are 1:0, 1:0.01, 1:0.05, 1:0.1, 1:1, 1:2, 1:5, and 0:1. As runoff at the 11 sites was monitored in August 2010 and April 2011 (Qiao et al., 2012; Figure 1b), the monthly pH (calculated by using monthly VWM H^+ concentrations), temperature, and VWM alkalinity and ionic concentrations of wet deposition in these two months were used in calculating SIc for the water mixed by runoff and wet deposition.

$$\text{Alkalinity or } [\text{HCO}_3^-] = ([\text{K}^+] + 2 \times [\text{Ca}^{2+}] + [\text{Na}^+] + 2 \times [\text{Mg}^{2+}] + [\text{NH}_4^+]) - (2 \times [\text{SO}_4^{2-}] + [\text{NO}_3^-] + [\text{Cl}^-] + [\text{F}^-])$$

$$\text{pH} > 7.00 \quad (2)$$

Where $[\text{X}]$ is the concentration of a given ion of wet deposition in $\mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$.

2.3. Impacts of elevated nitrogen deposition and climate warming on green algae

In order to understand if enhanced deposition of reactive nitrogen has contributed to the current increased biomass of green algae, NO_3^- , NH_4^+ , and TIN concentrations were compared between wet deposition and runoff. The data of the weekly to biweekly wet deposition samples collected during April 2010 to May 2011 were derived from Qiao et al. (2015a). The data of runoff measured in August 2010 and April 2011 at 11 sites was derived from Qiao (2012). The results of Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test show that all the datasets

follow a normal distribution, except for the NH_4^+ dataset of runoff. Thus, T-Test was used to compare NO_3^- and TIN concentrations between wet deposition and runoff, while Mann-Whitney U Test was used to compare the two datasets of NH_4^+ . All the statistical tests mentioned above were carried out by using IBM SPSS 19.0. The average TIN concentration of runoff and the annual VWM TIN of wet deposition were also compared to China's national standard of total nitrogen in runoff for nature reserves (Ministry of Environmental Protection of China (MEPC), 2002).

Increased biomass of green algae was observed only in the shallow waters with a low canopy coverage of trees and shrubs. Water temperature at these sites was more easily affected by air temperature and solar radiation, while green algae at these sites have a good access to light, which is also an important factor for their growth. Zhu (2007) found that water temperature is the major limiting factor to the growth of green algae in the Pearl Shoal and Five-flower Lake of Jiuzhaigou and green algae biomass increased as water temperature increased from 8 to 17°C. In this study, we compared temperature in the top layer (0-5 cm) of waters, which had a water depth approximately less than 1 m and no canopy coverage of trees and shrubs. Water temperature was measured at 80 sites, including 48, 12, 9, and 11 sites located in tufa dams/cascades/shoals, lakes/pools, swamps, and rivers, respectively. At the sites of lakes, pools, and rivers, temperature was measured at the rims, where water was shallow. Water temperature was measured by using a pH meter equipped with a temperature sensor (Milwaukee SM102) between 10:00 am and 15:00 pm on two summer days (25-26th June, 2011). At each site, water temperature was measured at five to eight points with 0.5-1.0 m between each two points and the average temperature was used as the temperature of the site. After measurements, water temperature was then compared between the sites with increased biomass of green algae (54 sites) and that with low biomass of green algae (26 sites) by using T-Test, as the two datasets both follow a normal distribution according to the results of Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test.

3. Results

All the runoff samples were calcite saturated, having an SIc of 0.2-0.9; in contrast, all the wet deposition samples were calcite unsaturated, having an SIc of -6.4 to -1.2 (Figure 3). In general, the wet deposition and runoff samples having lower pH had lower SIc values (Figure 3). When the volume mixing ratio of $V_{\text{wet deposition}}$ to V_{runoff} is approximately larger than 1:1, the mixed water would have an SIc value less than 0 and a pH and a Ca^{2+} concentration in the ranges of 6.5-8.0 and 70-900 $\mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$, respectively (Figure 4).

The results of comparison of reactive nitrogen concentrations between runoff and wet deposition are shown in Table 1. NO_3^- concentrations were similar between wet deposition and runoff ($p>0.05$); in contrast, NH_4^+ and TIN concentrations were significantly higher in wet deposition ($p<0.05$). Annual VWM TIN concentrations of wet deposition also exceeded 14.3 $\mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$ (Table 1), which is China's national standard of total nitrogen in runoff for nature reserves (MEPC, 2002).

Temperature in the top layer (0-5 cm) of runoff (depth<1 m and no canopy coverage of trees and shrubs) is shown in Figure 5. The temperature was significantly higher at the sites with increased biomass of green algae (8.1-17.7°C) than at the sites with low biomass of green algae (6.3-11.8 °C) ($p<0.05$). The temperature generally decreased as elevation increased and increased biomass of green algae was found in the elevations approximately less than 2600 m a.s.l.

4. Discussion

4.1. Tufa deposition and dissolution

Basically, tufa deposition occurs given the following conditions (Goudie et al., 1993): (1) availability of enough dissolved particulate CaCO_3 , (2) occurrence of turbulent degassing of CO_2 from water, and (3) presence of suitable substrates (e.g., mosses and tree roots and branches) which provide framework for tufa deposition. Some ions (e.g., PO_4^{3-}) and organic ligands inhibit tufa deposition through blocking active crystal-growth sites on calcite surface (Lebrón and Suárez, 1996; Lin and Singer, 2006). At a temperature of 25°C and an SIc of

0.95, calcite deposition is completely inhibited when dissolved organic carbon (DOC) concentration is greater than $300 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$, and the particle size of calcite crystals would decrease from $100 \mu\text{m}$ to less than $2 \mu\text{m}$ as DOC concentration increases from 20 to $150 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$ (Lebrón and Suárez, 1996). Due to lack of free energy to create new surface areas, unavailability of reactive calcite to act as nucleation sites, and inhibition effect from some substances, tufa deposition mostly occurs in the waters that have a Ca^{2+} concentration larger than $2000 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$ (Pentecost, 2005) and is at least 5-10 times supersaturated with respect to calcite ($\text{SIc} > 0.7-1.0$) (Chen et al., 2004).

In this study, we found that wet deposition was calcite unsaturated ($\text{SIc} = -6.4$ to -1.2) and the wet deposition samples with lower pH had lower values of SIc in general (Figure 3). This indicates that direct deposition of rain and snow onto exposed tufa would cause tufa dissolution and enhanced acid deposition would accelerate tufa dissolution. As shown in Figure 4, wet deposition can also considerably reduce SIc and tufa dissolution starts in the water mixed by wet deposition and runoff at an approximately mixing ratio of $V_{\text{wet deposition}}$ to V_{runoff} when larger than 1:1. These effects of wet deposition on tufa could be important in Jiuzhaigou, as a large areal portion of tufa landscapes are with shallow water (depth $< 10 \text{ cm}$) and would be seasonally dry. Furthermore, the Ca^{2+} concentrations and SIc of most runoff samples collected in Jiuzhaigou were lower than $2000 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$ and/or 0.7, respectively (Table 1; Qiao, 2012) and DOC concentrations in the runoff samples were 65-809 $\mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$, with an average concentration of $190 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$ (Chen, 2012). These DOC, Ca^{2+} , and SIc data of runoff also help to explain the current low deposition rate of tufa in Jiuzhaigou.

In addition to wet deposition, other processes may also contribute to the tufa degradation in Jiuzhaigou. Anthropogenic activities (such as deforestation, quarrying, fertilizer use, cattle manuring, and industry) and climate change could influence tufa deposition and loss through altering discharge, water chemistry, and watershed conditions (Goudie et al., 1993). Among the anthropogenic activities, deforestation is widespread and is believed to be the mechanism that most easily explains the widespread nature of the tufa decline in Europe (Goudie et al., 1993), while Jiuzhaigou is a forested watershed that has experienced deforestation by logging and tourism development. Deforestation may influence

tufa landscape through a variety of ways (Goudie et al., 1993), such as: (1) increased discharge, enhancing channel erosion, (2) elevated runoff turbidity, reducing algal productivity and increasing the asphyxiation and erosion of plants, (3) increased podzolization and peat growth in watersheds, releasing more acids to runoff, (4) CO₂ reduction in soil caused by accelerated soil erosion and/or by reduced root respiration, leading to lower CaCO₃ inputs into runoff, (5) nutrient release affecting plant productivity, (6) less organic debris for tufa barrage development, and (7) flood plains become more erodible, reducing tufa accumulation. Lake core evidence and runoff monitoring have already proved that deforestation increased soil erosion, lake sedimentation, and nutrient inputs to runoff in Jiuzhaigou (Li et al., 2014; Liang et al., 2014). All the above suggest that deforestation and its associated land use change might be another important cause of tufa degradation in Jiuzhaigou and a relevant systematic analysis is needed in future.

4.2. Increased biomass of green algae

Algal growth is affected by light (Hill et al., 1988), temperature (Raven and Geider, 1988), and nutrients, particularly nitrogen and phosphorus (Hill et al., 1998; Lv et al., 2011). In many alpine, subalpine, and boreal lakes, the growth of hydrophytes is temperature limited and/or nitrogen limited, thus these lakes are believed to be sentinels to both climate warming and elevated nitrogen deposition (Baron et al., 2000; Williamson et al., 2008; Hessen et al., 2009; Schindler, 2009). In these water environments, algae are the hydrophytes that most sensitive to climate warming and atmospheric nitrogen deposition (Dixit et al., 1992; Wolfe et al., 2001; Rühland et al., 2003; Saros et al., 2003; Solovieva et al., 2008; Elser et al., 2009; Winder et al., 2009).

Located in a subalpine to alpine region, Jiuzhaigou is experiencing climate warming (Figure 2). Field observation found that the growth of green algae at the Pearl Shoal and Five-Flower Lake of Jiuzhaigou was controlled by the factors in the following order: temperature > dissolved oxygen > total nitrogen > total phosphorous > chemical oxygen demand (Zhu, 2007). Using lab experiments, Zhu (2007) also found that biomass of green

algae increased as water temperature increased from 8 to 17°C. In this study, we found that increased biomass of green algae was more prone to occur in warmer, shallow waters with a good access to light and with an elevation less than 2600 m a.s.l. (Figure 5). These may suggest that climate warming would favor the growth of green algae and it might increase green algae biomass in higher elevations (>2600 m a.s.l.) in Jiuzhaigou.

The processes controlling nutrient loadings in runoff include (Feller, 2009): (1) atmospheric deposition and climate, (2) geological weathering, (3) terrestrial biological process, (4) physical-chemical reactions in the soil, and (5) physical, chemical, and biological process within aquatic ecosystems. Inter-regional transport of air pollutants from human emissions has elevated deposition of reactive nitrogen (Qiao et al., 2015a; Qiao et al., 2015b) and has a fertilization effect on green algae in Jiuzhaigou, as total nitrogen is the third most important factor controlling the growth of green algae in Jiuzhaigou (Zhu, 2007) and NH_4^+ and TIN concentrations were statistically higher in wet deposition than in runoff (Table 1). In addition to wet deposition, deforestation and its associated land use change may also be the causes of increased nitrogen in runoff. The runoff was low in nitrogen and phosphorus when tourism started in early 1980s (Zhou et al., 1986; Luo, 2000), but nitrogen and phosphorus in runoff started to increase as early as 1990s (Zhou, 1998; Cao, 1999), most likely due to wastewater from tourist activities (Zhou, 1998; Gaulke et al., 2010). Although a sanitary system is now used to collect wastewater and transport it out of the reserve, Wang (2006) still observed that tourist activities increased nitrogen inputs from land to runoff through the boardwalks and soils along the runoff. Furthermore, deforestation caused by previous logging and tourism development may still affect nutrient loadings in runoff through the (2-4) processes suggested by Feller (2009). In order to control nutrient loadings in runoff, future studies are needed to better quantify the contributions of different sources to nutrients in runoff, particularly for nitrogen and phosphorus.

5. Conclusion

In the last three decades, a remarkable degradation of the tufa landscapes, characterized

by increased biomass of green algae and tufa degradation, has been observed in Jiuzhaigou. This study examined whether these tufa landscape changes are partially associated with climate warming and the enhanced deposition of reactive sulfur and nitrogen caused by inter-regional transport of air pollutants. The results show that wet deposition (not necessarily being acid rain) in Jiuzhaigou was calcite unsaturated, suggesting that wet deposition would dissolve exposed tufa. Additionally, wet deposition may reduce tufa deposition or even cause tufa dissolution in shallow waters. These effects of wet deposition on tufa increased as pH of wet deposition decreased from 8.01 to 5.06. TIN concentrations were much higher in wet deposition (annual VWM = $26.1 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$) than in runoff (mean = $14.8 \mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$), suggesting a nitrogen fertilization of wet deposition on green algae. As water temperature was the major limiting factor of algal growth and temperature in the top layer (0-5 cm) of waters (depth < 1 m, no canopy coverage of trees and shrubs) was significantly higher at the sites with increased algal biomass, climate warming in the region ($+1.2^{\circ}\text{C}$ from 1951 to 2014) may favor the growth of green algae and increase green algae biomass in higher elevations (>2600 m a.s.l.). In summary, climate warming and enhanced deposition of reactive sulfur and nitrogen may have contributed to the current tufa landscape degradation in Jiuzhaigou, but future studies are needed to better quantify the contributions, as many other anthropogenic and natural processes also affect tufa landscape evolution, particularly the deforestation caused by previous logging and by tourism development.

Acknowledgments

This study was funded by the National Science Foundation of China (21407110), the Program of Introducing Talents of Discipline to Universities (B08037), and the International Program of the Ministry of Science and Technology of China (2010DFA91280). We thank anonymous reviewers and the editors for their useful comments on the earlier version of the manuscript. We thank the China Meteorological Data Sharing Service System for providing meteorological data of Songpan County, Sichuan Province. We also thank Jiuzhaigou Administrative Bureau for providing meteorological data and local logistics and

accommodation for this study.

References

Arenas, C., Auqué, L., Osácar, C., Sancho, C., Lozano, M.V., Vázquez-Urbez, M., Pardo, G., 2015. Current tufa sedimentation in a high discharge river: A comparison with other synchronous tufa records in the Iberian Range (Spain). *Sediment. Geol.* 325, 132-157.

Ball, J.W., Nordstrom, D.K., 2001. User's manual for WATEQ4F, with revised thermodynamic data base and test cases for calculating speciation of major, trace, and redox elements in natural waters (Available at: <http://pubs.usgs.gov/of/1991/0183/report.pdf>).

Baron, J.S., Rueth, H.M., Wolfe, A.M., Nydick K.R., Allstott, E.J., Minear, J.T., Moraska, B., 2000. Ecosystem responses to nitrogen deposition in the Colorado Front Range. *Ecosystems* 3, 352-368.

Bossard, C.C., Cao, Y.T., Wang, J.Y., Rose, A., Tang, Y., 2015. New patterns of establishment and growth of *Picea*, *Abies* and *Betula* tree species in subalpine forest gaps of Jiuzhaigou National Nature Reserve, Sichuan, southwestern China in a changing environment. *Forest Ecol. Manag.* 356, 84-92.

Cao, H.L., 1999. How long will the spectacular Jiuzhaigou will go? *Rural Econ. Tech.* 10, 42-43. In Chinese.

Chen, J., Zhang, D.D., Wang, S.J., Xiao, T.F., Huang, R.G., 2004. Factors controlling tufa deposition in natural waters at waterfall sites. *Sediment. Geol.* 166, 353-366.

Chen, P., 2012. The water chemistry and source of nitrate and sulfate in the World Natural Heritage Site, Jiuzhaigou National Nature Reserve, southwestern China. Master thesis. Chengdu: Sichuan University. In Chinese.

Dixit, S.S., Smol, J.P., Kingston, J.C., Charles, D.F., 1992. Diatoms: powerful indicators of environmental change. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 26, 22-33.

398 Elser, J.J., Kyle, M., Steger, L., Nydick, K.R., Baeron, J.S., 2009. Nutrient availability and
 399 phytoplankton nutrient limitation across a gradient of atmospheric nitrogen deposition.
 400 Ecology 90, 3062-3073.

401 Feller, M.C., 2015. Deforestation and nutrient loading to fresh water. Encyclopedia of Inland
 402 Water, doi:10.1016/B978-012370626-3.00227-1.

403 Florsheim, J.L., Ustin, S.L., Tang, Y., Di, B., Huang, C., Qiao, X., Peng, H., Zhang, M., Cai,
 404 Y., 2013. Basin-scale and travertine dam-scale controls on fluvial travertine, Jiuzhaigou,
 405 southwestern China. Geomorphology 180-181, 267-280.

406 Ford, T.D., Pedley, H.M., 1996. A review of tufa and travertine deposits of the world.
 407 Earth-Sci. Rev. 41, 117-175.

408 Gaulke, L.S., Weiyang, X., Scanlon, A., Henck, A., Hinckley, T., 2010. Evaluation criteria
 409 for implementation of a sustainable sanitation and wastewater treatment system at
 410 Jiuzhaigou National Park, Sichuan Province, China. Environ. Manage. 45, 93-104.

411 Gan, J.J., 2007. A system study on the geological environment and water cycle at the
 412 Jiuzhaigou Valley. Master thesis. Chengdu: Southwest Jiaotong University. In Chinese.

413 Goudie, A.S., Viles, H.A., Pentecost, A., 1993. The late-Holocene tufa decline in Europe.
 414 Holocene 3, 181-186.

415 Gu, Y., Du, J. Tang, Y., Qiao, X., Bossard, C., Deng, G.P., 2013. Challenges for sustainable
 416 tourism at the Jiuzhaigou World Natural Heritage site in western China. Nat. Resour. Forum.
 417 37, 103-112.

418 Henck, A., Taylor, J., Lu, H.L., Li, Y.X., Yang, Q.X., Grub, B., Breslow, S.J., Robbins, A.,
 419 Elliott, A., Hinckley, T., Combs, T., Urgenson, L., Widder, S., Hu, X.X., Ma, Z.Y., Yuan,
 420 Y.W., Jian, D.J., Liao, X., Tang, Y., 2010. Anthropogenic hillslope terraces and swidden
 421 agriculture in Jiuzhaigou National Park, northern Sichuan, China. Quaternary Res. 73,
 422 201-207.

423 Hessen, D.O., Andersen, T., Larsen, S., Skjelkvåle, B.L., de Wit, H.A., 2009. Nitrogen

424 deposition, catchment productivity, and climate as determinants of lake stoichiometry.
 425 *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 54, 2520-2528.

426 Hill, W.R., Knight, A.W., 2008. Nutrient and light limitation of algae in two northern
 427 California streams. *J. Phycol.* 24, 125-132.

428 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), 2013. Fifth assessment report- climate
 429 change 2013 (Available at: <http://www.ipcc.ch/report/ar5/wg1/>).

430 Lebrón, I.A., Suárez, D.L., 1996. Calcite nucleation and precipitation kinetics as affected by
 431 dissolved organic matter at 25°C and pH at 7.5. *Geochim. et Cosmochim. Ac.* 60,
 432 2765-2776.

433 Leybourne, M.I., Betcher, R.N., McRitchie, W.D., Kaszycki, C.A., Boyle, D.R., 2009.
 434 Geochemistry and stable isotopic composition of tufa water and precipitates from the
 435 Interlake Region, Manitoba, Canada: constraints on groundwater origin, calcitization, and
 436 tufa formation. *Chem. Geol.* 260, 221-233.

437 Li, S.G., Hu, X.X., Tang, Y., Huang, C.M., Xiao, W.Y., 2014. Response of lacustrine
 438 sediment to anthropogenic activities over 240 years in Jiuzhaigou National Nature Reserve,
 439 Southwest China. *Quatern. Int.* 349, 367-375.

440 Liang, K.K., Hu, X.X., Li, S.G., Huang, C.M., Tang, Y., 2014. Anthropogenic effect on
 441 deposition dynamics of lake sediments based on ¹³⁷Cs and ²¹⁰Pbex Techniques in Jiuzhaigou
 442 National Nature Reserve, China. *Chinese Geogr. Sci.* 24, 180-190.

443 Lin, Y., Singer, P.C., 2006. Inhibition of calcite precipitation by orthophosphate: Speciation
 444 and thermodynamic considerations. *Geochim. et Cosmochim. Ac.* 70, 2530-2539.

445 Liu, S., Zhang, X., Zeng, Z., 2007. Biodiversity of the Jiuzhaigou National Nature Reserve.
 446 Chengdu: Sichuan Science and Technology Press. In Chinese.

447 Luo, S.C., 2000. Protection and development: Tourism development in Jiuzhaigou. *Financ.*
 448 *Econ. (Supplement)*, 290-292. In Chinese.

449 Lv, J., Wu, H.J., Chen, M.Q., 2011. Effects of nitrogen and phosphorus on phytoplankton

composition and biomass in 15 subtropical, urban shallow lakes in Wuhan, China.
 Limnologia- Ecol. Manage. Inland Waters 41, 48-56.

Ministry of Environmental Protection of China (MEPC), 2002. Environmental quality
 standards for runoff (Available at:
<http://kjs.mep.gov.cn/hjbhzb/bzwb/shjbh/shjzlbz/200206/W020061027509896672057.pdf>).
 In Chinese.

Parkhurst, D.L. Appelo, C.A.J., 1999. User's guide to PHREEQC (version 2) a computer
 program for speciation, batch-reaction, one-dimensional transport, and inverse geochemical
 calculations (Available at: http://wwwbrr.cr.usgs.gov/projects/GWC_coupled/phreeqc/).

Pedley, H.M., 1990. Classification and environmental models of cool freshwater tufas.
 Sediment. Geol. 68, 143-154.

Pentecost, A., 2005. Travertine. Berlin: Springer.

Pentecost, A., 2010. Chapter 7 continental carbonates - preservation of natural and historic
 heritage sites. Development in Sedimentology 62, 297-311.
 Doi:10.1016/S0070-4571(09)06207-4.

Qiao, X. 2012. Impacts of regional air pollution on the World Natural Heritage Site,
 Jiuzhaigou, southwestern China. PhD dissertation. Chengdu: Sichuan University. In
 Chinese.

Qiao, X., Xiao, W., Jaffe, D., Kota, S.H., Ying, Q., Tang, Y., 2015a. Atmospheric wet
 deposition of sulfur and nitrogen in Jiuzhaigou National Nature Reserve, Sichuan Province,
 China. Sci. Total Environ. 511, 28-36.

Qiao, X., Tang, Y., Kota, S.H., Li, J.Y., Wu, L., Hu, J.L., Zhang, H.L., Ying, Q., 2015b.
 Modeling dry and wet deposition of sulfate, nitrate, and ammonium ions in Jiuzhaigou
 National Nature Reserve, China using a source-oriented CMAQ model: Part II. Emission
 sector and source region contributions. Sci. Total Environ. 532, 840-848.

Raven, J.A., Geider, R.J., 1988. Temperature and algal growth. New Phytol. 110, 441-461.

476 Rühland, K., Priesnitz, A., Smol, J.P., 2003. Paleolimnological Evidence from Diatoms for
 477 Recent Environmental Changes in 50 lakes across Canadian Arctic Treeline. *Arct. Antarct.*
 478 *Alp. Res.* 35, 110-123.

479 Saros, J.E., Interlandi, S.J., Wolfe, A., Engstrom, D.R., 2003. Recent changes in the diatom
 480 community structure of lakes in the Beartooth Mountain Range, U.S.A. *Arc. Antarct. Alp.*
 481 *Res.* 35, 18-23.

482 Schindler, D.W., 2009. Lakes as sentinels and integrators for the effects of climate change on
 483 watersheds, airsheds, and landscapes. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 54, 2349-2358.

484 Solovieva, N., Jones, V., Birks, J.H.B., Appleby, P., Nazarova, L., 2008. Diatom responses to
 485 20th century climate warming in lakes from the northern Urals, Russia. *Palaeogeogr.*
 486 *Palaeocl.* 259, 96-106.

487 Thorpe, P.M., 1981. Isotope studies of UK tufa deposits and associated source waters. PhD
 488 dissertation, Oxford: Univerisity of Oxford.

489 Urgenson, L., Schmidt, A.H., Combs, J., Harrell, A.S., Hinckley, T., Yang, Q.X., Ma, Z.Y.,
 490 Li, Y.X., Lü, H.L., MacIver, A., 2014. Traditional livelihoods, conservation and meadow
 491 ecology in Jiuzhaigou National Park, Sichuan, China. *Hum. Ecol.* 42, 481-491.

492 Vázquez-Urbez, M., Arenas, C., Sancho, C., Osácar, C., Auqué, L., Pardo, G., 2010. Factors
 493 controlling present-day tufa dynamics in the Monasterio de Piedra National Park (Iberian
 494 Range, Spain): depositional environmental settings, sedimentation rates and hydrochemistry.
 495 *Int. J. Earth Sci.* 99, 1027-1049.

496 Vet, R., Artz, R.S., Carou, S., Shaw, M., Ro, C.-U., Aas, W., Baker, A., Bowersox, V.C.,
 497 Dentener, F., Galy-Lacaux, C., Hou, A., Pienaar, J.J., Gillett, R., Forti, M.C., Gromov, S.,
 498 Hara, H., Khodzher, T., Mahowald, N.M., Nickovic, S., Rao, P.S.P., Reid, N.W., 2014. A
 499 global assessment of precipitation chemistry and deposition of sulfur, nitrogen, sea salt, base
 500 cations, organic acids, acidity and pH, and phosphorus. *Atmos. Environ.* 93, 3-100.

501 Violante C., Ferreri V., D'Argenio, B and Golubic, S., 1994. Quaternary Travertines at
 502 Rocchetta a Volturno (Isernia, Central Italy): Facies analysis and Sedimentary model of an

organogenic system, In: Field Trip A1 Guidebook for the 15th International Association of Sedimentology Regional Meeting, Ischia, Italy, 3-23.

Wang, J., Bao, W.K., He, B.H., Liu, Y., 2006. Effects of tourism on nitrogen and phosphorus loss in surface runoff in Jiuzhaigou world natural heritage reserve. *Ecol. Environ.* 15, 284-288. In Chinese.

Williamson, C.E., Dodds, W., Kratzm T.K., Palmerm M.A., 2008. Lakes and streams as sentinels of environmental change in terrestrial and atmospheric processes. *Front Ecol. Environ.* 6, 247-254.

Winder, M., Reuter, J.E., Schladow, S.G., 2009. Lake warming favors small-sized planktonic diatom species. *P. Roy. Soc. B-Biol. Sci.* 276, 427-435.

Wolfe, A.P., Baron, J.S., Cornett, J.R., 2001. Anthropogenic nitrogen deposition induces rapid ecological changes in alpine lakes of the Colorado Front Range (USA). *J. Paleolimnol.* 25, 1-7.

Yan, H., Liu Z.H., Deng, G.P., Sun, H.L., Zhang, J.L., 2013. Origin of the tufa at Jiuzhaigou Scenic Spot in Sichuan. *Carsologica Sin.* 1, 15-22. In Chinese.

Yoshimura, K., Liu, Z., Cao, J., Yuan, D., Inokura, Y., Noto, M., 2004. Deep source CO₂ in natural waters and its role in extensive tufa deposition in the Huanglong Ravines, Sichuan, China. *Chem. Geol.* 205, 141-153.

Zhang, J.L., Wang, H.J., Li, D., Zhao, D.M., 2012. An analysis of travertine landscape degradation in Huanglong Ravine of Sichuan, a world's heritage site, and its causes and protection countermeasures. *Acta Geoscientica Sin.* 1, 111-120. In Chinese.

Zhou, X.L., 1998. Influences of geological environment deterioration on Jiuzhaigou Ravine landscape. *Carsologica Sin.* 3, 119-128. In Chinese.

Zhou, Y.Z., Dong, C.Y., Zhou, X.S., Chen, Y.N., 1986. A preliminary investigation of aquatic organisms in Jiuzhaigou. *Sichuan J. Zool.* 5, 15-17. In Chinese.

Zhu, C.K., 2007. Study on the correlation of lake water environment and algae in the core

529 area of Jiuzhaigou. Master thesis. Chongqing: Southwest University. In Chinese.

Figures

Figure 1. Maps illustrating (a) the location of Jiuzhaigou and (b) the locations of the sampling sites of runoff (Qiao, 2012) and wet deposition (Qiao et al., 2015a) in Jiuzhaigou.

535

536

537 Figure 2. Annual mean air temperature at the Nuorilang Center in Jiuzhaigou from 2003 to
538 2014 and at the Songpan National Meteorological Station (SNMS) from 1951 to 2014. The
539 data of SNMS were derived from the China Meteorological Data Sharing Service System
540 ([www. http://cdc.nmic.cn/home.do](http://cdc.nmic.cn/home.do)) and the data of Jiuzhaigou were from Jiuzhaigou
541 Administrative Bureau.

Figure 3. Comparison of S_{Ic} and pH between runoff and wet deposition measured in Jiuzhaigou during April 2010 and May 2011. The data of pH were from Qiao et al. (2015a) and Qiao et al. (2012) and the S_{Ic} values were calculated in this study.

Figure 4. Ca^{2+} concentrations ($\mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$), pH, and SIc in the solutions mixed by runoff and wet deposition at volume ratios of $V_{\text{runoff}} : V_{\text{wet deposition}}$ from 1:0 to 0:1 in Jiuzhaigou in August 2010 and April 2011. The solutions having a ratio of 1:0 were runoff samples collected at the 11 sites shown in Figure 1b. The solutions having a ratio of 0:1 were wet deposition samples collected at the Long Lake Meteorological Station. The grey dots represent mean values; the lower and upper limits of boxes represent 25% and 75% percentiles, respectively; the lines in the boxes represent median values; and, the lower and upper whisker lines represent the minimum and maximum values, respectively.

Figure 5. Temperature measured in the top layer (0-5 cm) of the runoff (depth<1 m and no canopy coverage of trees and shrubs) at 80 sites in Jiuzhaigou. $p<0.05$: the temperature was significantly higher at the sites with increased biomass of green algae than that with low biomass of green algae.

Table

Table 1. The alkalinity, conductivity, ionic concentrations, and pH of runoff and wet deposition samples collected in Jiuzhaigou. The unit of ionic concentrations and alkalinity are in $\mu\text{mol L}^{-1}$. The unit of conductivity is in $\mu\text{S cm}^{-1}$.

Parameter	Runoff ^a			Wet deposition ^b			p^c
	N	Range	Mean	N	Range	Annual VWM	
pH	21	7.77-8.60	8.27	36	5.06-8.01	5.95	0.00
Conductivity	21	276-431	342	36	3.43-155.3	12.67	0.00
Alkalinity	21	2413-4143	3418	36	0-857 ^d	126 ^d	0.00
Mg^{2+}	21	419.0-595.8	537.6	36	15.3-35.9	41.1	0.00
Ca^{2+}	21	1148-2182	1545	36	14.5-406.1	149.8	0.00
SO_4^{2-}	21	116.5-294.7	201.7	36	19.7-85.3	70.5	0.00
K^+	21	9.2-64.4	16.1	36	0.9-767.6	21.2	0.25
Na^+	21	36.6-68.0	59.1	36	7.7-304.3	38.0	0.00
F^-	21	24.8-40.9	35.8	36	11.5-59.2	21.0	0.00
Cl^-	21	17.9-30.8	24.7	36	6.8-1003.2	37.2	0.32
NH_4^+	21	0.0-6.1	0.9	36	0.2-61.2	13.4	0.00
NO_3^-	21	5.2-24.9	13.9	36	6.2-34.8	12.7	0.51
TIN	21	5.2-29.4	14.8	36	6.4-84.2	26.1	0.01

^a Monitored in August 2010 and April 2011 in Qiao (2012); ^b Monitored from April 2010 to August 2011 in Qiao et al. (2015a); ^c This study, $p < 0.05$: the difference between wet deposition and runoff is statistically significant at the 0.05 level; ^d Estimated by using Eq. 2 in this study; N: number of samples; VWM: Volume Weighted Mean; TIN, total inorganic nitrogen.