Heteroaggregation of engineered nanoparticles and kaolin clays in aqueous environments

Hongtao Wang^{*1}, Ya-nan Dong¹, Miao Zhu¹, Xiang Li, Arturo A. Keller², Tao Wang¹,
Fengting Li¹

1. State Key Laboratory of Pollution Control and Resource Reuse, Key Laboratory of Yangtze River Water Environment,
Ministry of Education, College of Environmental Science and Engineering, Tongji University, Shanghai 200092, China; E-mail:
hongtao@tongji.edu.cn;

Fax: +86-21-65985059; Tel.: +86-21-65980567.

2. Bren School of Environmental Science and Management, University of California, Santa Barbara, California, 93106, United
States

ABSTRACT

The increasing and wide use of nanoparticles (NPs), including TiO₂ and Ag NPs, have raised concerns due to their potential toxicity and environmental impacts. Kaolin is a very common mineral in aquatic systems, and there is a very high probability that nanoparticles (NPs) will interact with these clay minerals. We studied the effect of kaolin particles on the aggregation of NPs under different conditions, including the role of pH, ionic strength (IS), and humic acid (HA). We show that kaolin reduces the energy barrier and the Critical Coagulation Concentration (CCC) at pH 4. At pH 8, even though the energy barrier of the system without kaolin increases, kaolin promotes NP aggregation via heteroaggregation. When IS is equal to or greater than the CCC, on the one hand HA promotes aggregation of TiO₂ NPs, but on the other hand HA decreases the rate of Ag NP aggregation because the existence of a surface coating may limit the adsorption of HA on these Ag NPs. In addition, the presence of

HA increases the energy barrier and the CCC of the binary system (kaolin + NPs). Thus, the complex interactions of clay, NPs, IS, pH, and HA concentration determine the colloidal stability of the NPs. We find that kaolin is a potential coagulant for removal of NPs that behave like Ag and TiO₂.

Keywords: Nanoparticles; humic acid; kaolin; critical coagulation concentration; aggregation

1. Introduction

The rapid growth of nanotechnology applications in consumer and industrial products in the past few years has increased the release of nanoparticles (NPs) to the environment (Keller et al. 2013, Theron et al. 2008). TiO₂ NPs are used in many products, including paints, pigments and personal care products, and Ag NPs are used in many consumer products that can result in transfer to the aqueous environment via wastewater treatment plants (WWTPs) (Keller et al. 2013, Lazareva and Keller 2014). A recent study estimated that 10-30%, 3-17% and 4-19% NPs are discarded into water bodies in Asia, Europe and North America respectively and predicted release concentrations of engineered nanomaterials in WWTP effluent of 5-20 µg/L TiO₂ NPs and 0.05-0.2 µg/L Ag NPs (Keller and Lazareva 2013). Westerhoff et al. found effluent concentrations of TiO₂ NPs in WWTPs were still 25 µg/L titanium, even though the WWTPs removed more than 96% of the influent titanium (Westerhoff et al. 2011). The increasing understanding of the toxicity (Chen et al. 2006, Colvin 2003, De Jong et al. 2013, Ghosh et al. 2013, Keller et al. 2010, Olmedo et al. 2005, Song et

al. 2013, Trouiller et al. 2009, Zhang et al. 2007) of these NPs indicates that their potential risk can't be ignored, therefore, their fate, transport and removal need to be better understood.

Kaolin is an abundant clay material, found in many natural waters, and with high potential for wastewater treatment through adsorption due to its large surface area and pore volume (Ma and Wang 2006, Ma et al. 2007). It should be noted that kaolinite is the clay mineral that characterizes/makes up most kaolin (Ross and Kerr 1930). In this paper, we use kaolin to denote the clay material. Kaolin is divided into two kinds: a well-crystallized form (Zettlitz, with a Critical Coagulation Concentration (CCC) ≈ 3 mM NaCl at pH=4, and CCC ≈ 100 mM NaCl at pH=8) and a poorly-crystallized form (KGa-2, unstable at pH=4, CCC $\approx 85 \pm 5$ mM NaCl at pH=9.5). The cation exchange capacity (CEC) of well-crystallized kaolin (≈ 9 meq/100 g) has almost three times greater permanent charge than poorly-crystallized kaolin (3.3 meq/100g) (Tombacz and Szekeres 2006, Van Olphen and Fripiat 1979). Kaolin has one Al-O face and one Si-O face. The Si-O face has a negative charge because of lattice ion replacement. In addition, kaolin has an edge which is around 10-120 nm (Brady et al. 1996, Wan and Tokunaga 2002). Compared with the defective (poorly-crystallized) crystal face, the surface charge density of the pristine (original or untreated) crystal face is higher, and the electric double layer (EDL) is thicker (Wan and Tokunaga 2002). At low IS (10 mmol/L NaCl) and pH < pH_{pzc,edge} (edge point of zero charge, pzc), the thickness of the EDL (Debye length ≈ 3 nm at 10 mmol/L) is larger than

that of the thin lamella, and the dominant EDL extending from the face spills over the edge, screening the positive charge of the edge. This explains why at pH 4 poorly-crystallized kaolin is unstable at any IS, while well-crystallized kaolin is stable at low IS (Tombacz and Szekeres 2004).

Humic substances represent an active and important fraction of natural organic matter (NOM) and they play important roles in the fate and transport of pollutants in the aqueous phase (Aiken 1985, Buffle et al. 1998, Wang et al. 2011, Wang et al. 2010, Zheng et al. 2008). For example, humic acid (HA) affects the stability of NPs through electric forces, steric hindrances, and the bridging effect (Zhu et al. 2014). HA also reduces the removal of TiO₂ NPs by coagulation (Wang et al. 2014, Wang et al. 2013). The presence of NOM, and in particular HA, has been shown to contribute to the instability of Ag NPs at high ionic strength in divalent metallic cation solutions, most likely due to intermolecular bridging with the organic matter (Akaighe et al. 2012).

In recent years, the transport of NPs in natural systems, especially the interaction between NPs and clay particles has attracted much attention (Afrooz et al. 2013, Huynh et al. 2012, Labille et al. 2015, Praetorius et al. 2014, Zhao et al. 2015). For example, Liang et al. (2013) studied the transport of Ag NPs and their interaction with clay particles in soils, and Cai et al. (2014) discussed the combined effects of IS and clay particles on the transport of TiO₂ NPs in quartz sand. These studies mainly focused on the effect of pH, IS and clay particles, but some studies show that NOM

also plays an important role in the stability of NPs, such as stabilization due to the adsorption of NOM, or enhanced coagulation due to the bridging effect of NOM (Chen and Elimelech 2007a, Mohd Omar et al. 2014, Zhu et al. 2014). Furthermore, montmorillonite was shown to destabilize engineered NPs due to heteroaggregation (Zhou et al. 2012). Since kaolin is a widely available clay, its role in heteroaggregation should be studied.

The goal of this study was to evaluate the effects of kaolin particles and of NOM on the heteroaggregation of engineered nanoparticles in aqueous environments. In this study, the stability of NPs, NPs-kaolin, NPs-HA, and NPs-kaolin-HA systems were evaluated under different pH and IS conditions. CCC and aggregation rate were used to determine the stability of the NPs via DLS measurements.

2. Methods and materials

2.1 TiO₂ Nanoparticles

TiO₂ Nanoparticles (rutile) were purchased from Sigma-Aldrich Trading Co., Ltd. (Shanghai), product number 53680-10G. According to the manufacturer, the transmission electron microscopy (TEM) size of the nanoparticles is 10 nm × 40 nm (diameter × length); their specific surface area is around 130 to 190 m²/g; their purity is around 99.5%. We used SEM and TEM images to characterize the size and shape of these nanoparticles (Fig. S1), and measured their pH_{pzc} with a Malvern Zetasizer (Fig. S2, pH_{pzc} ~6). An appropriate amount of TiO₂ NPs was placed in Millipore

water and sonicated for 20 min (Qi et al. 2013) to achieve a 1 g/L TiO₂ NP stock suspension. Fresh stock suspensions were prepared daily.

2.2 Ag Nanoparticles

A nanosilver dispersion (25 ml) was purchased from Sigma-Aldrich Trading Co., Ltd. (Shanghai), product number 730807. The diameter of these nanoparticles is around 40 nm (Fig. S4). These particles contain sodium citrate as stabilizer, thus they carry a negative charge at pH 4 and 8. The concentration of the suspension is 20 mg/L. For the experiments the suspension was diluted to 2 mg/L; this was the minimum concentration at which nanoparticles could be detected reliably via Dynamic Light Scattering (DLS).

2.3 Kaolin

Kaolin (K7375) was purchased from Sigma-Aldrich Trading Co., Ltd. (Shanghai). To produce an aqueous slurry, 200 g kaolin and 0.3 g Na₂CO₃ were added to 100 mL Millipore water. To remove and replace the Ca²⁺ contained in the kaolin with Na⁺ so as to meet the requirement of the DLVO calculation (Zhou et al. 2012), the slurry was heated in a water bath at about 80 °C for 2 days then diluted using Millipore water to achieve a nominal concentration of 4 g clay in a 100 ml suspension, following Tombacz and Szekeres (2006). To obtain a fraction smaller than 2 µm, the larger particles were allowed to settle and then the supernatant was separated by decanting. Excess carbonate was eliminated by HCl addition. To obtain monocationic Na-kaolin,

the suspension was treated with 1 M NaCl. After centrifuging the suspension at 3,600 revolutions per minute (RPM), the supernatant was discarded and replaced with fresh solution (0.01 M NaCl). The procedure was repeated three times. The IS of the suspension was progressively lowered, first by washing with Millipore water and then by dialysis against 0.01 M NaCl. A MWCO 12-14K membrane (Spectrumlabs, USA) was used to dialyze the suspension. The progress of dialysis was controlled by measuring the conductivities of inner and outer phases daily. This procedure was repeated five times. The Na-kaolin suspension (≈ 200 g/L) in the dialysis tubes reached an equilibrium state within 4 days (Tombacz and Szekeres 2006). The stock Na-kaolin suspensions were stored at 4 – 5 °C. Before DLS measurements, the stock suspension was diluted using Millipore water to 3 g/L and then centrifuged at 4000 RPM for 3 min. DLS measurements were conducted on the supernatant. The Z-average size of the kaolin particles was around 263 nm, and the TEM images show that the size range of Kaolin can be as great as 500 nm (Fig. S3). As Fig. S5 shows, the kaolin crystal consists of alternating layers of silica tetrahedra and alumina octrahedra and the unit cell of the kaolin lattice has the composition $[\text{Si}_2\text{Al}_2\text{O}_5(\text{OH})_4]$. Each kaolin particle consists of a stack of about 50 sheets of twin-layers, held together with hydrogen bonds. The particles are plate-like and the aspect ratio (particle diameter : particle thickness) is about 5–15, depending on the mechanical treatment of kaolin (Nandi et al. 2009, Solomon and Hawthorne 1983).

2.4 Humic acid preparation

Humic acid (53680-10G) was purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (Shanghai) Trading Co.,

Ltd. The HA stock solution was prepared by dissolving a certain amount of HA powder into deionized water, and adjusting the pH to 11 by adding 0.1 M NaOH, then stirring the solution at 600 RPM for 24 hrs to improve the solution stability. A 0.25 μm filter membrane was used to remove the insoluble fraction. The stock solution was preserved under 5°C. The Total Organic Carbon (TOC) of the HA stock solution was measured using a Shimadzu TOC-V, and the stock solution was diluted to 10.5 mg/L as TOC.

2.5 Buffer solutions

To control pH, 1 mM sodium acetate-acetic acid buffer (pH=4), 1 mM acetic acid-sodium acetate buffer (pH=5 and 6), 1 mM disodium hydrogen phosphate-sodium dihydrogen phosphate buffer (pH=7), and 1 mM boric acid-borax buffer (pH=8) were used.

2.6 Potentiometric acid-base titration (kaolin)

Lower valence cations (such as Fe^{2+} , Mg^{2+}) frequently substitute Si^{4+} or Al^{3+} at the tetrahedra/octahedra sites of kaolin, resulting in net negative charges on the Si-O face. At the edge and Al-O face of the kaolin lamella where the extended Si-Al structure breaks, amphoteric Si-OH and Al-OH groups and thus variable charges develop (Van Olphen 1963). At a pH below $\text{pH}_{\text{pzc,edge}}$, the Si-O face carries negative charges while the edge and Al-O face carry positive charges; at pH higher than the $\text{pH}_{\text{pzc,edge}}$, the entire platelet is negatively charged with a non-uniform charge density (Tombacz and Szekeres 2006).

The $\text{pH}_{\text{pzc,edge}}$ of kaolin can be measured through a potentiometric acid-base titration method (Tombacz and Szekeres 2006). The pH-dependent surface charge of kaolin was determined by potentiometric acid–base titration under a CO_2 -free atmosphere using NaCl to maintain a constant IS (0.1 mM). Before titration the suspensions containing ≈ 1 g/L kaolin were stirred and bubbled with purified nitrogen for an hour. A pH/ion Meter (781, Metrohm) was used to measure the equilibrium titration at 25 °C. The titration was performed by adding NaOH to increase pH from 3 to 9 (Tombacz and Szekeres 2006). The net proton surface excess amount ($\Delta n_{\text{H/OH}}^{\sigma}$, mol/g) is defined as a difference of H^+ and OH^- surface excess amounts ($n_{\text{H}^+}^{\sigma}$ and $n_{\text{OH}^-}^{\sigma}$, respectively) related to unit mass of solid, $\Delta n_{\text{H/OH}}^{\sigma} = n_{\text{H}^+}^{\sigma} - n_{\text{OH}^-}^{\sigma}$. The surface excess amount of any solute, like H^+ and OH^- here, can be determined directly from the initial and equilibrium concentration of solute for adsorption from dilute solution. The $n_{\text{H}^+}^{\sigma}$ and $n_{\text{OH}^-}^{\sigma}$ were calculated at each point of titration from the electrode output using the actual activity coefficient from the slope of H^+/OH^- activity vs. concentration straight lines for background electrolyte titration (Everett 1986). As shown in Fig. S6, the points were calculated from the data of equilibrium titration cycles to test the reversibility of acid–base processes: first a backward titration from pH=5.6 to 3.5 (black squares) with 0.1M HCl solution, then a forward cycle from pH=3.5 to 9.5 (red circle) with 0.1 M NaOH solution, finally a backward titration from pH=9.5 to 3.5 (blue triangles) again. The $\text{pH}_{\text{pzc,edge}}$ of kaolin is 5~6 (Fig.S6).

2.7 Coagulation kinetics

Coagulation kinetics for the various particles were measured by collecting

time-resolved hydrodynamic size data of the particle suspension using DLS (Zetasizer nano, Malvern, UK). NaCl (ranging from 0 to 1.5 M in 0.1 M increments) was used to provide IS. DLS measurements were started immediately after mixing NaCl solution, buffer solution and particles suspension. Each measurement lasted for 30 s. The instrument employs a 633 nm laser with a detection angle of 90°. Data collection was ended after 1 hr or until the hydrodynamic size doubled, depending on whichever criteria was met first (Zhou et al. 2012). The ratio of the coagulation rate in the presence of an energy barrier to that in the absence of an energy barrier is defined as the attachment efficiency (α), which is calculated as follows (Elimelech 1995):

$$\alpha = \frac{1}{W} = \frac{\left(\frac{d_{rH}}{d_t}\right)_{t \rightarrow 0}}{\left(\frac{d_{rH}}{d_t}\right)_{t \rightarrow 0, fast}}$$

Here r_H is the hydrodynamic radius; $(d_{rH}/d_t)_{t \rightarrow 0, fast}$ is the average of the highest, relatively constant rates observed experimentally for a given set of conditions. The CCC is the IS at which α reaches a constant value of unity (Zhou et al. 2012). In this research, k_{fast} , which is equal to $(d_{rH}/d_t)_{t \rightarrow 0, fast}$, was used to reflect the particles' maximum aggregation rate at high IS. As IS increases, the attachment efficiency increases because of screening of the NPs surface charge (reaction-limited cluster aggregation regime, RLCA). When the NaCl concentration reaches and surpasses the CCC, the surface charge of nanoparticles is completely screened, and eliminates the energy barrier (diffusion-limited cluster aggregation regime, DLCA). CCC can be determined by the intersection of RLCA and DLCA (Chen and Elimelech 2007b).

2.8 DLVO calculation

The energy barrier between NPs and clay under different IS and pH in the presence and absence of humic acid was calculated by DLVO theory (see supporting information). Sphere-sphere and sphere-plate models were used to calculate energy barrier for NPs-NPs and NPs-kaolin system. The current experimental conditions justify the applicability of the DLVO theory (Zhou et al. 2012): (1) the particle concentrations are relatively dilute, (2) kaolin is in its sodium form, and (3) the particle charges are relatively low (Fig. S2, Fig S7). To further investigate the effect of humic acid, $\gamma_{HA}^{LW} = 25.77 \text{ mJ/m}^2$ (Hu et al. 2010) at TOC = 1 mg/L was used to calculate the energy barrier under the effect of humic acid. γ_x^{LW} is the Lifshitz-vander Waals component of the surface free energy of the particle (x=p) or the water/humic acid solution (x=w). $\gamma_{water}^{LW} = 21.8 \text{ mJ/m}^2$ (Hu et al. 2010).

3. Results

3.1 TiO₂ NP-kaolin binary system

Fig. 1 shows the stability of TiO₂ NPs in the absence and presence of kaolin at pH 4 and 8. The stability of TiO₂ NP suspension at pH 8 (CCC $\approx$ 60 mM) is very similar to that at pH 4 (CCC $\approx$ 50 mM). Kaolin is stable at pH 8 (CCC $\approx$ 100 mM) while it aggregates rapidly at pH 4 even at very low IS. At pH 4, the TiO₂ NPs-kaolin binary system is unstable, and the attachment efficiency is 1 even at very low IS (< 1mM). To further determine the interaction of TiO₂ NPs and kaolin, the supernatant turbidity was measured. Table S1 shows that kaolin destabilizes TiO₂ NPs at low IS and pH 4.

Table S2 shows that kaolin increases the aggregation rate of TiO₂ NPs at low IS and pH 4. Based on the structure of kaolin, we propose the following mechanism: due to electrostatic attraction between the Al-O face/edge (+) and Si-O face (-), kaolin rapidly aggregates even in the absence of IS at pH 4; under these conditions TiO₂ NPs (+) are attracted to the Si-O face. Therefore, kaolin promotes the removal of TiO₂ NPs via heteroaggregation, followed by settling of the kaolin aggregates. Compared with pH 4, the system is relatively stable at pH 8, where TiO₂ NPs, kaolin edges, Al-O faces and Si-O faces all carry negative charges, and electrical repulsion increases system stability. However, as IS increases up to the CCC, the aggregation rate of the TiO₂ NPs in the presence of kaolin increases remarkably compared with that in the absence of kaolin (Table S2). Generally the stability of the binary TiO₂-kaolin system decreases slowly from pH 8 to 5, but then becomes very unstable at pH 4 (Table S4). Even near the pH_{pzc} of TiO₂ (~pH 6) the CCC of the binary system is around 50 mM.

3.2 Ag NP-kaolin binary system

Fig. 2 shows that the CCC of Ag NPs is not very pH sensitive, 50 mM at pH 4 and 40 mM at pH 8. The Ag NPs used in this study carry a negative charge at a pH range from 4 to 8 (Fig. S7), due to their citrate coating (Thio et al. 2012). Unlike the TiO₂ NP-kaolin system, kaolin has no distinct destabilization effect on Ag NPs at pH=4 and low IS (IS=0 mM or IS=10 mM, $\alpha \approx 0$ for the Ag+kaolin binary system, hydrodynamic data shown in Fig. S10). In addition, the presence of kaolin increases the CCC at pH 8, because kaolin increases electrical repulsion and the energy barrier

(Fig. S9). Since the size of the TiO₂ NPs (diameter × length of 10 nm × 40 nm) is close to the Ag NPs (diameter = 40 nm), the difference in behavior between TiO₂ NP-kaolin system and Ag NP-kaolin system is likely to be caused by the surface potential. We propose that the same mechanism described above for TiO₂ is also valid for Ag NPs, but the differences in zeta potential at different pH result in a different behavior. At pH 4, Ag NPs (-) might be absorbed on the Al-O face (+) and edge (+). Therefore, the presence of Ag NPs is likely to screen the surface positive potential on the Al-O face and edges, minimizing the interaction between the Al-O face (+) in one particle with the Si-O face (-) of another, as well as the edges (+) and Si-O faces (-), thus resulting in a more stable Ag NP-kaolin system. Though the Ag NP-kaolin system is stable at pH 4, the presence of kaolin reduces the CCC. However, CCC increases sharply from 40 mM at pH 4 to 200 mM at pH 5, and then more slowly to 300 mM at pH 8 (Table S4).

3.3 TiO₂ NP-HA binary system

Fig. 3 shows that the CCCs of the TiO₂ NP-HA binary system are 250 mM at pH 4 and 500 mM at pH 8, which are much higher than without HA; HA makes the system more stable. However, Table S2 indicates that the presence of HA promotes fast TiO₂ aggregation when IS approaches CCC. The adsorption of HA on TiO₂ NPs was reported in our recent work (Zhu et al. 2014). The difference in interactions explains the difference in CCC at pH 4 and pH 8. At pH 4, HA is negative and the surface charge of TiO₂ NPs is positive, so adsorption occurs through electrostatic attraction at

pH < pH_{pzc} (TiO_2 NPs); at pH 8, both the surface charge on the TiO_2 NPs and the charge of HA are negative, so electrostatic repulsion limits the adsorption of HA to the TiO_2 NPs, and HA is absorbed on the TiO_2 NPs via the Ti-O bond (Zhu et al. 2014).

3.4 Ag NP-HA binary system

Fig. 4 and Table 1 show that the CCCs of the Ag NP-HA binary system are 600 mM at pH 4 and 100 mM at pH 8. Table S2 indicates that the presence of HA reduces the aggregation rate of Ag NPs when IS reaches CCC. Ag NPs behave differently from TiO_2 NPs in the presence of HA. Unlike TiO_2 NPs, the zeta potential of Ag NPs barely changes at pH 4 and pH 8 in the presence of HA under different NaCl concentrations (Fig. S7). This may be caused by the citrate coating, which limits the interaction between Ag NPs and HA. Our preliminary results also show that only less than 10% HA was adsorbed onto Ag NPs. Though HA does not adsorb onto the Ag NPs, it still reduces the aggregation rate and increases CCC.

3.5 TiO_2 NP-kaolin-HA ternary system

Fig. 5 and Table 1 show that the CCCs of the TiO_2 NP-kaolin-HA ternary system at pH 8 are 200, 333 and 700 mM when $[HA] = 0.1, 1$ and 10 mg/L, respectively. At pH 4 the system is unstable when $[HA] = 0.1$ mg/L, but the CCC increases to 100 mM at $[HA] = 1$ mg/L and CCC = 300 mM at $[HA] = 10$ mg/L. Table S2 also indicates that although a high concentration of HA (10 mg/L) decreases the aggregation rate

(without kaolin), the additional presence of kaolin increases the aggregation rate of the system. At pH 4 the adsorption of HA (-) on the TiO₂ NPs (+), and Al-O face (+) and edges (+) of kaolin reduces and inverses the surface charge. At pH 8, adsorbed HA increases steric hindrance and thus the CCC. This ternary system is stabilized at 1 mg/L HA from pH 4 to 8 (Table S4), with CCC increasing almost continuously with increasing pH.

3.6 Ag NP-kaolin-HA ternary system

Fig. 6 and Table 1 show that the CCCs of the Ag-kaolin-HA ternary system at pH 8 are 300, 500 and 800 mM, while at pH 4 the CCCs are 100, 300, 700 mM when [HA]=0.1, 1 and 10 mg/L, respectively. For Ag NPs, though the adsorption of HA on their surface is very low (the zeta potential barely changes with the addition of 1 mg/L HA), HA still increases the system's CCC and reduces the aggregation rate. This ternary system is even more stable with 1 mg/L HA in the range of pH from 4 to 8 (Table S4).

Table 1-CCC under different conditions at pH 4 and 8 ([TiO₂ NP] =100 mg/L, [Ag NP] =2 mg/L, [kaolin] =50 mg/L, sodium chloride provides ionic strength. CCC in mmol/L, HA in mg/L.)

pH	TiO ₂	kaolin	Ag	TiO ₂ +kaolin	TiO ₂ +HA	kaolin+HA	Ag+kaolin	Ag+HA
8	60	100	40	65	500	250	300	100
4	50	< 1	50	< 1	250	75	40	600
Ternary system (kaolin+)								
pH	TiO ₂ +HA		TiO ₂ +HA		TiO ₂ +HA		Ag+HA	
	(0.1)	(1)	(10)	(0.1)	(1)	(10)	(0.1)	(1)
8	200	333	700	300	500	800		
4	< 1	100	300	100	300	700		

Note: [HA] = 0.1, 1, 10 mg/L

4. Discussion

In the TiO₂ NP-kaolin binary system, the behavior of the kaolin-TiO₂ NP system differs from that observed using montmorillonite and TiO₂ NPs (Zhou et al. 2012). This is due to the structural differences between kaolin and montmorillonite. In the sheet-like structure of montmorillonite, two layers of Si-tetrahedra sandwich one layer of Al-octahedra. Each Si⁴⁺ is coordinated by four O²⁻ and each Al³⁺ is coordinated by six O²⁻. The sheets are bonded together by Si⁴⁺ and Al³⁺ sharing O²⁻ ions (McBride 1994). The pH_{pzc,edge} of montmorillonite is around 6.5 by potentiometric titration (Tombacz and Szekeres 2004). At pH 8, the CCC of the montmorillonite-TiO₂ NP binary system is around 50 mM (1:1 electrolyte) (Zhou et al. 2012). Both the TiO₂ NPs-montmorillonite and TiO₂ NPs-kaolin systems are stable at pH=8 and up to their CCC. However, poorly-crystallized kaolin has a much more distinct destabilization effect on TiO₂ NPs at pH 4 and the system is completely unstable, compared with montmorillonite (CCC≈10 mM) (Zhou et al. 2012). The edge thickness of kaolin (10-120 nm) is greater than that of montmorillonite (thickness ≈ 1 nm). For montmorillonite, since the thickness of the EDL is larger than that of the thin lamella, the dominant EDL extending from the particle faces spills over the edge at low IS, and results in screening the positive edge charge when pH<pH_{pzc,edge} (Tombacz and Szekeres 2004). However, for kaolin the edge thickness is greater than the EDL thickness (Debye length≈10 nm in 1 mmol/L) (Brady et al. 1996), thus the dominant EDL cannot screen the edge and Al-O face, leaving exposed the positively charged

edge and Al-O face region of lamellae at $\text{pH} < \text{pH}_{\text{pzc,edge}}$. Therefore, the energy barriers of Al-O face (+) to Si-O face (-), edge (+) to Si-O face (-) and TiO_2 NPs (+) to Si-O face (-) disappear at $\text{pH} < \text{pH}_{\text{pzc,edge}}$.

In the Ag NP-kaolin binary system, with increasing IS, the EDLs of kaolin and Ag NPs are compressed, and particles begin to aggregate. Table S2 indicates that the presence of kaolin enhances the aggregation rate of Ag NPs when IS reaches CCC. The high aggregation rate of kaolin is the key to promoting the aggregation of Ag NPs via electrostatic attraction (only at pH 4) and heteroaggregation.

In the TiO_2 NP-HA binary system, the existence of HA on the surface of TiO_2 NPs causes steric hindrance to inhibit the TiO_2 NPs interacting with the ions. Therefore, CCC increases in the presence of HA. However, because of a bridging effect, the aggregation and sedimentation rates of TiO_2 NPs are promoted by HA when IS reaches CCC.

In the TiO_2 NP-kaolin-HA ternary system, HA enhances the energy barrier of the system to increase CCC and decrease the aggregation rate. However, the rapid aggregation rate of kaolin, the adsorption of HA, and the heteroaggregation of the TiO_2 NPs influence the behavior of this ternary system.

In the Ag NP-kaolin-HA ternary system, HA contributes with steric hindrance even if

HA is not adsorbed significantly on the NPs. With the addition of HA, the adsorption of HA (-) on the Al-O face (+) and edge (+) reduces and inverses the surface charge of TiO₂ NPs, but there is no effect on the Ag NPs (-). Therefore, the energy barrier and CCC increase. Table S2 also shows that, compared to both NPs, the aggregation rate of the ternary system is more rapid once the CCC is reached.

Although it is reported Ag-NPs form Ag₂S in wastewater during treatment processes and it is less likely that metallic Ag-NPs will be present in surface waters (Kaegi et al. 2013), the use of Ag-NPs and kaolin helps to understand the fundamental mechanisms of heteroaggregation for these coated particles that do not transition from a positive to negative surface charge. These results can be used for input to environmental fate and transport models.

The results at pH 4 and 8 were presented since these conditions are further away from the IEP (~6.1) of TiO₂. However, we also measured the CCC and kinetics at pH 5, 6 and 7, to understand the transition as pH increases (Table S4). TiO₂ NPs are easily aggregated and precipitated at pH 6. The CCC of TiO₂ NPs is <1 mM at pH 6. But the CCC of kaolin at pH 6 is much higher (70 mM), and the CCC of kaolin+TiO₂ NPs is 50 mM. For the Ag NPs, there is a transition from high stability at high pH to decreasing stability at low pH for the binary and ternary systems. In consideration that pH 4 and 8 can represent the mechanism of heteroaggregation between clay particles and NPs quite well, we only present the results of pH 4 and 8 in Table 1 and Table S2.

To determine the quantity of NPs destabilized by kaolin through heteroaggregation, we measured the residual NPs in the supernatant of the ternary system by ICP (Table S6). It was found that ~65% TiO_2 NPs were left in the supernatant after a short time for heteroaggregation (240 s at pH 4 and 360 s at pH 8), but only 21% TiO_2 NPs were found in the supernatant after 3 hours of heteroaggregation. Similarly, only 14~17% of Ag NPs were detected in the supernatant after 3 hours of heteroaggregation. This indicates that the TiO_2 and Ag NPs were involved in the heteroaggregation process.

5. Conclusions

The wide presence of clay particles and increasing discharge of NPs makes inevitable their interaction in natural aqueous systems. The complex interaction is determined by the combined effect of pH, IS, and HA. Because of the specific structure of kaolin, several interaction patterns occur under various conditions. The results show that kaolin particles can destabilize both positively and negatively charged NPs under various conditions in the subsurface and open water bodies. However, the presence of HA even at 1 mg/L can significantly modify the outcome, stabilizing the binary and ternary systems. There are significant differences between TiO_2 and citrate-coated Ag NPs, because their pH_{pzc} differ considerably. Although at pH 4 the systems are less stable, they can be quite stable at pH 8 under most conditions, even at very high IS (>200 mM). Since many natural waters have higher pH (7 and greater), this indicates that although the NPs will be adsorbed on kaolin, the presence of HA can result in

significant mobility of the NPs in the water column, but attached to clays. Kaolin can be used as a low-cost and non-hazardous coagulant for NP removal, but the conditions need to be optimized to achieve effective sedimentation if there is HA present.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported in part by the National Natural Science Foundation of China Fund (No. 51108328). The research was also partially supported by 111 Project and the Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities (0400219276 and 0400219184) and State Key Laboratory of Pollution Control and Resource Reuse Foundation (No.PCRRY11011). This material is also partially supported by the U.S. National Science Foundation (NSF) and the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) under Grant DBI-0830117. Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the NSF or EPA. This work has not been subjected to EPA review, and no official endorsement should be inferred. We also acknowledge the valuable comments from anonymous reviewers which help improve the quality of this paper.

REFERENCES

- Afrooz, A.R.M.N., Khan, I.A., Hussain, S.M. and Saleh, N.B. (2013) Mechanistic Heteroaggregation of Gold Nanoparticles in a Wide Range of Solution Chemistry. *Environmental science & technology* 47(4), 1853-1860.
- Aiken, G. (1985) *Humic substances in soil, sediment, and water: geochemistry, isolation, and characterization*, Wiley, New York.
- Akaighe, N., Depner, S.W., Banerjee, S., Sharma, V.K. and Sohn, M. (2012) The effects of monovalent and divalent cations on the stability of silver nanoparticles formed from direct reduction of silver ions by Suwannee River humic acid/natural organic matter. *Science of the Total Environment* 441,

450 277-289.

451 Brady, P.V., Cygan, R.T. and Nagy, K.L. (1996) Molecular controls on kaolinite surface charge. *Journal of*
452 *colloid and interface science* 183(2), 356-364.

453 Buffle, J., Wilkinson, K.J., Stoll, S., Filella, M. and Zhang, J.W. (1998) A generalized description of
454 aquatic colloidal interactions: The three-colloidal component approach. *Environmental science &*
455 *technology* 32(19), 2887-2899.

456 Cai, L., Tong, M., Wang, X. and Kim, H. (2014) Influence of Clay Particles on the Transport and
457 Retention of Titanium Dioxide Nanoparticles in Quartz Sand. *Environmental science & technology*
458 48(13), 7323-7332.

459 Chen, H.W., Su, S.F., Chien, C.T., Lin, W.H., Yu, S.L., Chou, C.C., Chen, J.J.W. and Yang, P.C. (2006)
460 Titanium dioxide nanoparticles induce emphysema-like lung injury in mice. *Faseb Journal* 20(13),
461 2393-+.

462 Chen, K.L. and Elimelech, M. (2007a) Influence of humic acid on the aggregation kinetics of fullerene
463 (C60) nanoparticles in monovalent and divalent electrolyte solutions. *Journal of colloid and*
464 *interface science* 309(1), 126-134.

465 Chen, K.L. and Elimelech, M. (2007b) Influence of humic acid on the aggregation kinetics of fullerene
466 (C₆₀) nanoparticles in monovalent and divalent electrolyte solutions. *Journal of*
467 *Colloid and Interface Science* 309(1), 126-134.

468 Colvin, V.L. (2003) The potential environmental impact of engineered nanomaterials. *Nature*
469 *Biotechnology* 21(10), 1166-1170.

470 De Jong, W.H., Van Der Ven, L.T.M., Sleijffers, A., Park, M.V.D.Z., Jansen, E.H.J.M., Van Loveren, H. and
471 Vandebriel, R.J. (2013) Systemic and immunotoxicity of silver nanoparticles in an intravenous 28
472 days repeated dose toxicity study in rats. *Biomaterials* 34(33), 8333-8343.

473 Elimelech, M.G., J.; Jia, X.; Williams, R (1995) *Particle Deposition and Aggregation: Measurement,*
474 *Elsevier: New York.*

475 Everett, D.H. (1986) Reporting data on adsorption from solution at the solid/solution interface. *Pure*
476 *and Applied Chemistry* 58, 967-984.

477 Ghosh, M., Chakraborty, A. and Mukherjee, A. (2013) Cytotoxic, genotoxic and the hemolytic effect of
478 titanium dioxide (TiO₂) nanoparticles on human erythrocyte and lymphocyte cells in vitro. *Journal*
479 *of Applied Toxicology* 33(10), 1097-1110.

480 Hu, J.-D., Zevi, Y., Kou, X.-M., Xiao, J., Wang, X.-J. and Jin, Y. (2010) Effect of dissolved organic matter on
481 the stability of magnetite nanoparticles under different pH and ionic strength conditions. *Science*
482 *of the Total Environment* 408(16), 3477-3489.

483 Huynh, K.A., McCaffery, J.M. and Chen, K.L. (2012) Heteroaggregation of Multiwalled Carbon
484 Nanotubes and Hematite Nanoparticles: Rates and Mechanisms. *Environmental science &*
485 *technology* 46(11), 5912-5920.

486 Kaegi, R., Voegelin, A., Ort, C., Sinnet, B., Thalmann, B., Krismer, J., Hagendorfer, H., Elumelu, M. and
487 Mueller, E. (2013) Fate and transformation of silver nanoparticles in urban wastewater systems.
488 *Water research* 47(12), 3866-3877.

489 Keller, A., McFerran, S., Lazareva, A. and Suh, S. (2013) Global life cycle releases of engineered
490 nanomaterials. *Journal of nanoparticle research* 15(6), 1-17.

491 Keller, A.A. and Lazareva, A. (2013) Predicted Releases of Engineered Nanomaterials: From Global to
492 Regional to Local. *Environmental Science & Technology Letters* 1(1), 65-70.

493 Keller, A.A., Wang, H.T., Zhou, D.X., Lenihan, H.S., Cherr, G., Cardinale, B.J., Miller, R. and Ji, Z.X. (2010)

494 Stability and Aggregation of Metal Oxide Nanoparticles in Natural Aqueous Matrices.
 495 Environmental science & technology 44(6), 1962-1967.

496 Labille, J., Harns, C., Bottero, J.-Y. and Brant, J.A. (2015) Heteroaggregation of titanium dioxide
 497 nanoparticles with natural clay colloids. Environmental science & technology.

498 Lazareva, A. and Keller, A.A. (2014) Estimating Potential Life Cycle Releases of Engineered
 499 Nanomaterials from Wastewater Treatment Plants. ACS Sustainable Chemistry & Engineering.

500 Liang, Y., Bradford, S.A., Simunek, J., Heggen, M., Vereecken, H. and Klumpp, E. (2013) Retention and
 501 Remobilization of Stabilized Silver Nanoparticles in an Undisturbed Loamy Sand Soil.
 502 Environmental science & technology 47(21), 12229-12237.

503 Ma, H.-Z. and Wang, B. (2006) Multifunctional micro-sized modified kaolin and its application in
 504 wastewater treatment. Journal of hazardous materials 136(2), 365-370.

505 Ma, H., Wang, B. and Wang, Y. (2007) Application of molybdenum and phosphate modified kaolin in
 506 electrochemical treatment of paper mill wastewater. Journal of hazardous materials 145(3),
 507 417-423.

508 McBride, M.B. (1994) Environmental chemistry of soils, Oxford university press.

509 Mohd Omar, F., Abdul Aziz, H. and Stoll, S. (2014) Aggregation and disaggregation of ZnO nanoparticles:
 510 Influence of pH and adsorption of Suwannee River humic acid. Science of the Total Environment
 511 468, 195-201.

512 Nandi, B.K., Goswami, A. and Purkait, M.K. (2009) Adsorption characteristics of brilliant green dye on
 513 kaolin. Journal of hazardous materials 161(1), 387-395.

514 Olmedo, D.G., Tasat, D.R., Guglielmotti, M.B. and Cabrini, R.L. (2005) Effect of titanium dioxide on the
 515 oxidative metabolism of alveolar macrophages: An experimental study in rats. Journal Of
 516 Biomedical Materials Research Part A 73A(2), 142-149.

517 Praetorius, A., Labille, J., Scheringer, M., Thill, A., Hungerbühler, K. and Bottero, J.-Y. (2014)
 518 Heteroaggregation of Titanium Dioxide Nanoparticles with Model Natural Colloids under
 519 Environmentally Relevant Conditions. Environmental science & technology 48(18), 10690-10698.

520 Qi, J., Ye, Y.Y., Wu, J.J., Wang, H.T. and Li, F.T. (2013) Dispersion and stability of titanium dioxide
 521 nanoparticles in aqueous suspension: effects of ultrasonication and concentration. Water Science
 522 and Technology 67(1), 147-151.

523 Ross, C.S. and Kerr, P.F. (1930) THE KAOLIN MINERALS¹. Journal of the American Ceramic Society 13(3),
 524 151-160.

525 Solomon, D.H. and Hawthorne, D.G. (1983) Chemistry of pigments and fillers, Wiley.

526 Song, U., Jun, H., Waldman, B., Roh, J., Kim, Y., Yi, J. and Lee, E.J. (2013) Functional analyses of
 527 nanoparticle toxicity: A comparative study of the effects of TiO₂ and Ag on tomatoes
 528 (*Lycopersicon esculentum*). Ecotoxicology And Environmental Safety 93, 60-67.

529 Theron, J., Walker, J.A. and Cloete, T.E. (2008) Nanotechnology and water treatment: Applications and
 530 emerging opportunities. Critical Reviews in Microbiology 34(1), 43-69.

531 Thio, B.J.R., Montes, M.O., Mahmoud, M.A., Lee, D.-W., Zhou, D. and Keller, A.A. (2012) Mobility of
 532 Capped Silver Nanoparticles under Environmentally Relevant Conditions. Environmental science
 533 & technology 46(13), 6985-6991.

534 Tombacz, E. and Szekeres, M. (2004) Colloidal behavior of aqueous montmorillonite suspensions: the
 535 specific role of pH in the presence of indifferent electrolytes. Applied Clay Science 27(1-2), 75-94.

536 Tombacz, E. and Szekeres, M. (2006) Surface charge heterogeneity of kaolinite in aqueous suspension
 537 in comparison with montmorillonite. Applied Clay Science 34(1-4), 105-124.

538 Trouiller, B., Reliene, R., Westbrook, A., Solaimani, P. and Schiestl, R.H. (2009) Titanium Dioxide
 539 Nanoparticles Induce DNA Damage and Genetic Instability In vivo in Mice. *Cancer Research*
 540 69(22), 8784-8789.
 541 Van Olphen, H. (1963) Introduction to clay colloid chemistry.
 542 Van Olphen, H. and Fripiat, J. (1979) Data handbook for clay minerals and other non-metallic materials.
 543 Pergamon, New York.
 544 Wan, J.M. and Tokunaga, T.K. (2002) Partitioning of clay colloids at air-water interfaces. *Journal of*
 545 *colloid and interface science* 247(1), 54-61.
 546 Wang, H., Qi, J., Keller, A.A., Zhu, M. and Li, F. (2014) Effects of pH, ionic strength and humic acid on
 547 the removal of TiO₂ nanoparticles from aqueous phase by coagulation. *Colloids and Surfaces A:*
 548 *Physicochemical and Engineering Aspects* 450(0), 161-165.
 549 Wang, H.T., Keller, A.A. and Clark, K.K. (2011) Natural organic matter removal by adsorption onto
 550 magnetic permanently confined micelle arrays. *Journal of hazardous materials* 194, 156-161.
 551 Wang, H.T., Keller, A.A. and Li, F.T. (2010) Natural Organic Matter Removal by Adsorption onto
 552 Carbonaceous Nanoparticles and Coagulation. *Journal of Environmental Engineering-Asce*
 553 136(10), 1075-1081.
 554 Wang, H.T., Ye, Y.Y., Qi, J., Li, F.T. and Tang, Y.L. (2013) Removal of titanium dioxide nanoparticles by
 555 coagulation: effects of coagulants, typical ions, alkalinity and natural organic matters. *Water*
 556 *Science And Technology* 68(5), 1137-1143.
 557 Westerhoff, P., Song, G.X., Hristovski, K. and Kiser, M.A. (2011) Occurrence and removal of titanium at
 558 full scale wastewater treatment plants: implications for TiO₂ nanomaterials. *Journal of*
 559 *Environmental Monitoring* 13(5), 1195-1203.
 560 Zhang, X.Z., Sun, H.W., Zhang, Z.Y., Niu, Q., Chen, Y.S. and Crittenden, J.C. (2007) Enhanced
 561 bioaccumulation of cadmium in carp in the presence of titanium dioxide nanoparticles.
 562 *Chemosphere* 67(1), 160-166.
 563 Zhao, J., Liu, F., Wang, Z., Cao, X. and Xing, B. (2015) Heteroaggregation of Graphene Oxide with
 564 Minerals in Aqueous Phase. *Environmental science & technology* 49(5), 2849-2857.
 565 Zheng, Z., He, P.J., Zhang, H. and Shao, L.M. (2008) Role of dissolved humic substances surrogates on
 566 phthalate esters migration from sewage sludge. *Water Science and Technology* 57(4), 607-612.
 567 Zhou, D.X., Abdel-Fattah, A.I. and Keller, A.A. (2012) Clay Particles Destabilize Engineered
 568 Nanoparticles in Aqueous Environments. *Environmental science & technology* 46(14), 7520-7526.
 569 Zhu, M., Wang, H., Keller, A.A., Wang, T. and Li, F. (2014) The effect of humic acid on the aggregation of
 570 titanium dioxide nanoparticles under different pH and ionic strengths. *Science of the Total*
 571 *Environment* 487(0), 375-380.

Figure 1

Fig. 1 (a) Attachment efficiency of kaolin, TiO_2 NPs, and kaolin+ TiO_2 NPs binary system ($[\text{kaolin}]=50 \text{ mg/L}$, $[\text{TiO}_2]=10 \text{ mg/L}$); (b) Proposed mechanism of kaolin and TiO_2 NPs interaction

Figure 2

Fig. 2 (a) Attachment efficiency of Ag NPs and Ag NPs+kaolin binary system ($[kaolin]=50$ mg/L, $[Ag\ NPs]=5$ mg/L); (b) Proposed mechanism of Ag NPs and kaolin interaction

Figure 3

Fig. 3 (a) Attachment efficiency of TiO_2 NPs and TiO_2 NPs +HA binary system ($[\text{TiO}_2]=10$ mg/L, $[\text{HA}]=1$ mg/L); (b) Proposed mechanisms of TiO_2 NP aggregation as a function of IS at pH 8 and pH 4 in the presence and absence of HA

Figure 4

Fig. 4 (a) Attachment efficiency of Ag NPs and Ag NPs + HA binary system ($[Ag]=5$ mg/L, $[HA]=1$ mg/L); (b) Proposed mechanism of Ag NPs aggregation as a function of IS at pH 8 and pH 4 in the presence and absence of HA

Figure 5

Fig. 5 Attachment efficiency of TiO₂-kaolin-HA ternary system ([kaolin]=50 mg/L, [TiO₂]=10 mg/L)

Figure 6

Fig. 6 Attachment efficiency of Ag-kaolin-HA ternary system ([kaolin]=50 mg/L, [Ag]=5 mg/L)