The structural evolution of the deep continental lithosphere

Authors: C.M. Cooper^{1*}, Meghan S. Miller², Louis Moresi³

¹ School of the Environment, Washington State University, PO Box 642812, Pullman
WA 99164-2812, USA, cmcooper@wsu.edu, *Corresponding author

² Department of Earth Sciences, University of Southern California, 3651 Trousdale
Pkwy, Los Angeles, CA 90089, USA

³ School of Earth Sciences, University of Melbourne, McCoy Building, Parkville, VIC,
3010 Australia

Abstract

Continental lithosphere houses the oldest and thickest regions of the Earth's surface. Locked within this deep and ancient rock record lies invaluable information about the dynamics that has shaped and continue to shape the planet. Much of that history has been dominated by the forces of plate tectonics which has repeatedly assembled super continents together and torn them apart - the Wilson Cycle. While the younger regions of continental lithosphere have been subject to deformation driven by plate tectonics, it is less clear whether the ancient, stable cores formed and evolved from similar processes. New insight into continental formation and evolution has come from

24 remarkable views of deeper lithospheric structure using enhanced seismic imaging
25 techniques and the increase in large volumes of broadband data. Some of the most
26 compelling observations are that the continental lithosphere has a broad range in
27 thicknesses (<100 to >300 km), has complex internal structure, and that the thickest
28 portion appears to be riddled with seismic discontinuities at depths between ~ 80 and
29 ~ 130 km. These internal structural features have been interpreted as remnants of
30 lithospheric formation during Earth's early history. If they are remnants, then we can
31 attempt to investigate the structure present in the deep lithosphere to piece together
32 information about early Earth dynamics much as is done closer to the surface. This
33 would help delineate between the differing models describing the dynamics of craton
34 formation, particularly whether they formed in the era of modern plate tectonics, a
35 transitional mobile-lid tectonic regime, or are the last fragments of an early, stagnant-lid
36 planet. Our review paper (re)introduces readers to the conceptual definitions of the
37 lithosphere and the complex nature of the upper boundary layer, then moves on to
38 discuss techniques and recent seismological observations of the continental
39 lithosphere. We then review geodynamic models and hypotheses for the formation of
40 the continental lithosphere through time and implications for the formation and
41 preservation of deep structure. These are contrasted with the dynamical picture of
42 modern day continental growth during lateral accretion of juvenile crust with reference to
43 examples from the Australian Tasmanides and the Alaskan accretionary margin.

44	Contents	
45	1. Introduction	XX
46	2. Continental Lithosphere.....	XX
47	2.1 The complex, dynamic Earth.....	XX
48	3. Seismic Imaging.....	XX
49	3.1 Seismic tomography.....	XX
50	3.2 Discontinuity structures.....	XX
51	3.3 Anisotropic structures.....	XX
52	3.4 Seismic observations.....	XX
53	4. Dynamic Interpretation of Lithospheric Structure.....	XX
54	4.1 Hypotheses based on a pre-plate tectonic regime.....	XX
55	4.2 Hypotheses based on early development of plate tectonics.....	XX
56	5. Comparison with Modern Analogues	XX
57	5.1 Accretion dynamics.....	XX
58	5.2 Examples from Australian Tasmanides and the Alaskan accretionary	
59	margin.....	XX
60	6. Conclusions and Suggestions for Future Work.....	XX
61	7. Acknowledgements.....	XX
62	8. References.....	XX
63		

1. Introduction

Despite serving as home to human civilization, the continental lithosphere is arguably less well understood than the inaccessible oceanic lithosphere. This is because, while the first-order features of the oceanic floor (heat flux, bathymetry and thickness) can be directly attributed to the sea-floor age through plate-tectonics, that same theory fails to provide an equivalent context for continents.

Due to research initiatives such as EarthScope and LITHOPROBE (Clowes et al., 1999), along with greater computational power, there is now an unprecedented view of the sub-crustal interior of continental and cratonic lithosphere. Most of this increased coverage comes from a variety of seismic observations, which by their nature, provide not an exact replication of continental lithosphere, but a glimpse of properties that influence seismic parameters. As such, interpreting this expanded data requires not only a critical analysis as to what would cause variations in seismic properties, but also what geodynamic processes could produce the conditions required to produce an anomaly.

What does this new glimpse into the interior of continents tell us about past conditions and the history of deformation? How do we connect the new observations to other data sets? And more broadly, can we turn this internal gaze into a larger view of the process of building continents?

88

89

90

Laske et al, 2012

Lekic & Ramanovicz, 2011

91

92 **Figure 1.** Two examples of global tectonic regionalization overlain on a shaded relief map from the ETOPO1 (Eakins
 93 & Amante, 2009). (A) the Crust 1.0 model (Laske et al., n.d.) based on ‘shallow’ geophysical observations and
 94 geological provinces where we have amalgamated the 36 distinct crustal types globally into 9 related types for the
 95 continents as described in the legend. (B) is the regionalization of (Lekic & Romanowicz, 2011) clustering analysis of
 96 global seismic tomography into six “similar” styles of lithosphere (“Clusters #1-6”) with no a priori constraints from
 97 near-surface geology. In this model there is no distinction between continental and oceanic regions so we have
 98 applied a translucent mask to emphasize the distribution of the clusters within the continents. The numbering is

arbitrary and matches that chosen by the authors of the study, and we have chosen a color scheme which emphasizes the similarity of old, stable regions in each map.

Global perspectives of the Earth's lithosphere highlight commonalities and differences that can help guide our interpretations of the controls on lithospheric structure and evolution. Figure 1 shows two different global decompositions of the lithosphere that illustrate the first order domains using (A) the top-down analysis of Crust1.0 from all relevant geological and geophysical constraints (Laske et al., n.d.), together with (B) an alternate regionalization based only on clustering similarities in the top 350 km of a global, upper-mantle, seismic tomography model (Lekic & Romanowicz, 2011). Despite having been derived from very different means, some striking similarities exist that serve to highlight the vertical coherence of the lithospheric structure at this broad scale. For example, the cratons and the stable regions are picked out in both (darker blues), and the actively deforming orogens are largely identified with a single cluster (#4, shown in green). It is also not entirely unexpected that there is some similarity between the oceanic lithosphere and the regions of extension and rifting that is observed in the cluster analysis. The deep-seated clustering approach is least helpful in regions where the oceanic lithosphere is subducting beneath or close to the margin of the continent where the deep lithosphere is unrelated to the shallower crust and lithosphere. These clustering analyses suggest that, at a regional scale, deep and shallow lithospheric evolution are linked and deep structure can be related to the long term evolution and history of continental lithosphere.

This is less obvious when looking at a similar global view of continental crust (Figure 2A). The global map of continental crustal thickness, using the litho1.0 data of Pasyanos et al. (2014), is dominated by regions thickened by active orogenesis and broadly corresponds to relief as would be expected for long-wavelength topography supported by Airy isostasy. Crustal thickness appears to be less sensitive to past events (outlined in Figure 2A). However, perhaps more interesting is the dichotomy apparent in the relative thickness of crust to that of the lithosphere overall (Figure 2B) which clearly delineates the stable continental interior from the tectonically mobile regions (cf. clusters 3 and 4 of the Lekic & Romanowicz (2011) analysis). This could be indicating that, at least on the global scale, while the thickness of continental crust may not serve as an indicator of time or preserve deep time events, variations in subcrustal continental lithospheric thickness (and corresponding lithospheric structure) may be potentially providing information about the deep history of deformation in the Earth. Certainly, this is connected, in part, to the preferential preservation of thick, cratonic lithosphere, but it could also be a hint that these regions could be informative in our attempts in interpreting the dynamic settings of the Earth's past.

Figure 2. The thickness of the continental crust (A) and the relative thickness of the continental crust to total lithospheric thickness (B) both derived from the layer thickness maps of litho1.0 (Pasyanos et al., 2014). In A, we have outlined those regions where the depth to the lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary is greater than 250 km.

142

143   1.1 *The complex, dynamic Earth*

144

145   As Earth scientists, we often call upon the tenet - “the present is the key to the past”
146   (Lyell, 1837) - to build analogies between geological observations across large spans of
147   time, appealing to a commonality in the underlying processes. This uniformitarian
148   approach has proven to be useful at explaining how the slow, but persistent nature of
149   change shapes the surface (and interior) of Earth. However, there is an important
150   caveat to the uniformitarian approach that applies to complex dynamical systems (the
151   Earth is certainly included in this category): while the driving processes may not change,
152   and the forcings may evolve gradually, the dynamic system does not necessarily evolve
153   smoothly and may instead jump through one or more catastrophic transitions between
154   distinctive regimes of behavior (e.g. Sanns, 2012).

155

156   We expect the early Earth to have higher overall heat production with a less evolved
157   mantle and less differentiated crust, for example, but, even if we assume the same
158   physical/chemical systems were operating under early-Earth conditions, should we
159   expect to see modern plate tectonics as an outcome (e.g. Dewey, 2007)? If the Earth
160   undergoes transitions in tectonic style, are the cratonic regions “survivors” from the
161   previous regime, or are they a by-product of the transition?

162

163   This shapes the broad context within which we can question the formation and
164   preservation of structure within the continental lithosphere. Is the old, stable lithosphere

preserved because of some gradual stabilization process (e.g., Cooper et al., 2006) or because the conditions of its formation produced regions with a stronger lithospheric column (e.g., Poudjom Djomani et al., 2001)? If the latter, does the stable, cratonic lithosphere represent anomalous regions from the time of formation or typical ones which, by chance, avoided wholesale recycling or reworking (Lenardic et al., 2000)? Are ancient lithospheres truly “forever” (O’Reilly et al., 2001) or susceptible to changing mantle dynamics (Gao et al., 2004; Cooper et al., 2006; Abdelsalam et al., 2011; Guo et al., 2016)? Can we bridge ancient and modern processes to build a continuous conceptual model for continental evolution?

In the modern Earth, continental growth predominantly occurs through the lateral accretion of juvenile crustal material along existing convergent margins driven by the horizontal motion of the oceanic lithosphere (e.g., Cawood et al., 2009). The familiar “conveyer belt” style of subduction is thought to have become active at some point during the Archean (a time period spanning multiple billions of years), perhaps even earlier, though the exact timing is still heavily debated. Shirey & Richardson (2011) argue that it occurred at 3.0 Ga based on the appearance of eclogitic diamonds, which are indicative of modern style subduction. Prior to 3.0 Ga, the inclusions within the ancient diamonds point to a different compositional origin (one that samples the average mantle rather than metamorphosed crust) (Shirey & Richardson, 2011). Recently, Tang et al. (2016) demonstrated a change in the bulk upper crust composition from mafic to felsic also around 3.0 Ga further supporting the onset of plate tectonics around this time. Though Shirey & Richardson (2011) and Tang et al. (2016) argue that

their evidence rules out an earlier start to plate tectonics, other studies push back this date even earlier in Earth's history based on a myriad of other compositional, structural and stratigraphic evidence (e.g., Betts et al., 2002; Chen et al., 2009; Polat & Kerrich, 2006; Kerrich & Polat, 2006; Furnes et al., 2007; Betts et al., 2011; Kusky et al., 2013; Smart et al., 2016).

From a geodynamic point of view, the early viability of modern-style subduction is also unclear. Due to higher mantle temperatures in the past, and the resulting thicker crust, the oceanic lithosphere may have been too buoyant to participate in subduction (Davies, 1992). This assumes a thicker oceanic crust (driven by increased melting due to the higher mantle temperatures) as well as a more vigorous convection and corresponding plate motion, both of which reduce the available negative buoyancy for subduction. However, van Hunen & van den Berg (2008) demonstrate that the rapid transformation to dense eclogite of the thicker oceanic crust, due to higher mantle temperatures, would have increased the negative buoyancy and allowed for subduction during early Earth conditions albeit in a slightly modified manner: subduction may have been episodic with slabs experiencing a significant amount of necking, thinning, delamination or breaking apart. These discrepancies in the style and reduction in the strength of subduction have been proposed to explain the lack of geochemical evidence of modern style subduction prior to 3.0 Ga (van Hunen & van den Berg, 2008). Some of the other hallmark processes of subduction might still have been in operation though occurring in sporadic bursts of activity (for more information about this debate, see van Hunen & Moyen, 2012). Davies (2006) has argued that an early and strong depletion of

incompatible trace elements in the source region for mid-ocean-ridge melting would produce an oceanic crust of comparable thickness to the modern Earth and, correspondingly, a modern-style of subduction. However, the dynamics of subduction in the early Earth and corresponding dynamics continental collision are likely to have been different from their present form (e.g., Sizova et al., 2014).

The earliest continental material preserved in the geological record predates the transition to plate tectonics (the oldest rock on the Earth was dated as 4.28 Ga; O'Neil et al., 2008) and could serve as a witness to whichever mode of tectonic activity was present. Modern-style plate tectonics occurs primarily through lateral translation of continents across the surface of the Earth with a characteristic signature of progressive thickening from the margins inward. A pre-plate tectonic regime with weak or no subduction is likely to have been more dominated by vertical motions. Such conceptual models require that the entire surface of the Earth would have been a single, stagnant plate with vigorous convection beneath. Within this premise, heat from the interior of the early Earth would have been transferred through the lithosphere by conduction (a.k.a. stagnant lid; Moresi & Solomatov, 1995), by rapid and pervasive volcanic eruptions (a.k.a. heat pipe; Moore & Webb, 2013), or by episodic, intermittent, catastrophic bursts of subduction (O'Neill et al., 2007; O'Neill & Debaille, 2014). Each of these conceptual models makes specific predictions for the expected tectonic settings. Within stagnant lid and heat pipe regimes, deformation is driven primarily by vertical motion (small scale drips and delamination, and vertical advection) with the potential for regional, lateral motion as driven by gravitational collapse (Rey et al.,

2014). Episodic subduction suggests a more complex setting that captures both the signatures of subduction, but also periods of stagnant lid convection.

As home to the oldest regions on the Earth (specifically the “cratons” which are defined as the regions of the crust and lithospheric mantle that have not undergone deformation in billions of years), the continental lithosphere should serve as a record for these past conditions. In this paper, we review the current status of the research on the structure and evolution of deep continental lithosphere with a focused gaze into what information can be gained from the similarities and differences between older and younger continental lithosphere. We begin with a discussion of the conceptual definitions used to describe and characterize continental lithosphere. From there, we review recent seismic observations of continental lithosphere and its complex internal structure. We also briefly describe the seismological techniques used to make these observations. We then move on to discuss a number of geodynamical models proposed for the formation of continental lithosphere and the corresponding structures induced during those processes. We follow that section with a comparison between the proposed ancient processes and modern day analogues of continental accretion in Alaska and Australia. Finally, we leave readers with potentially more questions that we initially posed as well suggestions for future work.

2. Continental Lithosphere

The term lithosphere, while in use since 1914 (Barrell, 1914), remains an imprecise concept with different disciplines defining the “layer of strength” in a variety of ways. This is, in part, because it is unclear as to what is the primary control on the strength of

Earth materials (e.g., temperature, composition, pressure) and also because the timescale of loading and response plays an important role in interpreting strength (e.g., Watts et al., 2013). One approach is to treat the lithosphere as the thermal boundary layer or the region encompassing the greatest temperature gradient near the surface of the Earth. In this construct, the base of the lithosphere is defined as the depth at which the temperature depth profile transitions from the steep gradient near the surface to align with the mantle adiabat. The strength is then due primarily to temperature as the mantle's viscosity is temperature dependent and below the lithosphere, the temperature is sufficiently high to consider the material "weak" and subject to viscous, convective deformation (for a full discussion see Eaton et al., 2009). To map out the base of the lithosphere in this manner requires an approach that is sensitive to temperature within the Earth's interior. One approach is to use surface heat flux measurements. The surface heat flux is proportional to the near surface temperature gradient (i.e., Fourier's law of heat conduction). If, then, the amount of heat production from the crust and mantle is known, a regional geotherm (steady state temperature with depth profile) can be derived using surface heat flux measurements (Figure 3).

Figure 3. (A) Global surface heat flow measurements (International Heat Flow Commission) plotted by binning the point-measurement datasets to an adaptively-refined triangulation with a minimum resolution of 50 km. Color saturation represents the resolution of the triangulation which washes out progressively such that the coarsest resolution is shown with only 5% saturation. (B) Lithospheric geotherms for continental regions (Artemieva, 2009).

This approach depends on reliable surface heat flux measurements as well as knowledge of the composition of the crust and upper mantle (in particular, the amount of heat producing elements, which control the “curve” in the geotherm - for example, the geotherm is much steeper at shallow depths when there is a high concentration of heat producing elements in the crust) both of which are often lacking (e.g., Rudnick et al., 1998). Moreover, Rudnick et al. (1998) demonstrated the non-uniqueness in this approach; many geotherms “fit” the heat flux data available and it is unclear whether surface heat flux variations are more indicative of variations in crustal heat production or lithospheric thickness. As the Earth cools, the average thickness of the thermal boundary layer increases, and conversely, in the past when the Earth’s mantle was warmer, the thermal boundary layer was thinner (Turcotte & Schubert, 2002). In

addition, local thermal perturbations (for example, due to rifting or mantle upwellings) can thin and weaken the thermal boundary layer. Once the thermal perturbation has dissipated, the thermal boundary layer will thicken as the region cools. Thus, variations in the thickness of the thermal boundary layer can also indicate variations in age, either absolute age as in the case for the oceanic lithosphere (e.g., Müller et al., 2008) or in the amount of time since the last tectono-thermal event in the case of the continental lithosphere.

The lithosphere can also be described as a compositionally distinct region, often referred to as the chemical boundary layer. Specifically, the strength of the lithosphere can be explained not only by cooler temperatures, but also by increased buoyancy and viscosity driven by compositional differences (often explained as a consequence of melt depletion during crust formation (e.g., Pollack, 1986)). As such, the base of the lithosphere is demarcated by a compositional (and rheological) change and efforts to map out lithospheric thickness under this premise must be sensitive to composition. Mantle xenoliths have traditionally been used for this purpose (e.g., Rudnick et al., 1998; Lee et al., 2011). In addition to compositional information, mantle xenoliths also provide a direct sampling of the temperature and pressure conditions of the regions from which they erupted. Coupled with surface heat flux measurements (as discussed above), mantle xenoliths can be used to discriminate between the possible geotherms as derived from Fourier's law and energy conservation (Figure 3B). The base of the lithosphere is then determined as the depth where the xenolith-determined geotherm intersects the mantle adiabat.

314

315 Defining the lithosphere in this fashion assumes that the layer is chemically distinct from
316 the convecting mantle. Jordan (1975a, 1978) pioneered this idea to explain the
317 observation that cratons are neutrally buoyant despite their cold and old interiors.
318 Following the thermal boundary layer approach, Jordan (1975a, 1978) demonstrated
319 that if continental and oceanic lithosphere were the same composition, there would be
320 mass excess underneath continents that is not observed in the global free air gravity
321 anomaly maps. The thermal analysis in cratonic regions indicated cool temperatures
322 extending to great depths, thus necessitating thick continental lithosphere (Jordan's
323 early estimates extended down to 400 km (Jordan, 1978)). To reconcile the thermally
324 required thick continental lithosphere with the negligible free air gravity anomaly (and
325 lack of mass excess), Jordan (1975a, 1978) argued that continental lithosphere (in
326 particular, cratonic lithosphere) has a different composition than oceanic lithosphere.
327 This argument was formalized in the "isopycnic hypothesis" (*iso*=same, *pycnic* =
328 density) which states that at every depth level in the cratonic lithosphere, the negative
329 thermal buoyancy is exactly balanced by a positive chemical buoyancy rendering the
330 region neutrally buoyant (Jordan, 1988). In other words, at each depth, the change in
331 density due to the thermal contraction driven by the temperature difference between the
332 colder cratonic lithosphere and the warmer surrounding mantle is equal to the change in
333 compositional density between the two materials. As the temperature difference
334 diminishes as the geotherm approaches the adiabat, the compositional difference
335 between the continental lithosphere and surrounding mantle also decreases. We
336 should note that isopycnicity is not the same as isostasy. Isostasy describes the vertical

displacement driven by the average density of the entire lithospheric column. Isostasy does provide information about the composition of cratonic lithosphere (isostatic requirements also require positive chemical buoyancy; e.g., Lee et al., 2011; Cammarano et al., 2011), but as a weaker, integral constraint. Isopycnicity, on the other hand, prescribes a compositional stratification based on the thermal structure of cratonic lithosphere.

While mantle xenoliths from cratonic regions do possess significant compositional differences from the average mantle whether the compositional difference occur in a strictly isopycnic configuration is still debated (e.g., Lee et al., 2011). Many argue that the compositional distinction and positive chemical buoyancy of cratonic lithosphere were consequences of melt extraction (e.g., Pollack, 1986; Lee et al., 2011). Dehydration was also likely to occur during melt extraction increasing viscosity and contributing to the intrinsic strength of the lithosphere (e.g., Pollack, 1986; Hirth & Kohlstedt, 1996; Lee et al., 2011). This combination of the positive chemical buoyancy and increased viscosity are suggested to be responsible for lithospheric strength and stability, particularly so in cratonic regions (e.g., Richter 1985; Pollack 1986; Lenardic & Moresi, 1999; Sleep, 2003a; Francois et al., 2013), thus indicating that a chemical boundary layer plays an important role in lithospheric structure.

The base of the chemical boundary layer and the thermal boundary layer need not coincide. Estimates for the thickness of the “lithosphere”, may differ even in the same region depending on the techniques used (e.g., Jones et al., 2010; Eaton et al., 2009).

Generally, geochemically based estimates (which may be sampling the base of the chemical boundary layer) give thinner values for lithospheric thickness than the seismic observations (which may coincide with the base of the thermal boundary layer) (Lee et al., 2011; Steinberger & Becker, 2016). These discrepancies indicate that the transition from the surface of the Earth to the convecting mantle is more complex than a single rigid, layer of strength (lithosphere) on top of a weak mantle (asthenosphere). Likely, the transition encompasses several boundary layers whose thicknesses depend on each other. For example, the chemical boundary layer can influence the thickness of the thermal boundary layer (Lenardic & Kaula, 1996; Cooper et al., 2004; Lee et al., 2005). The chemical boundary layer is assumed to be strong, rigid and resistance to deformation (e.g., Pollack, 1986; Lee et al. 2011). As such, heat is transferred through the chemical boundary layer solely by conduction. Small scale convection can occur within the base of the thermal boundary layer allowing for dripping, shearing and deformation of the material. In the scenario where a chemical boundary layer resides within the thermal boundary layer, the thicker the chemical boundary layer, the more it will dominate the conductive, rigid portion of the thermal boundary layer isolating the potentially deformable region to the base of the thermal boundary layer. This deforming region of the thermal boundary layer is often referred to as the convective sublayer. The thickness and temperature drop across the convective sublayer depends on the thickness of the chemical boundary layer (Cooper et al., 2004; Lee et al., 2005).

Numerical simulations and theoretical scalings demonstrated that the thicker the chemical boundary layer, the closer it approaches the thickness of the thermal boundary

(Cooper et al., 2004; Lee et al., 2005) in a predictable manner. In other words, the thickness of the chemical boundary layer can be used to predict the thickness of the thermal boundary layer (and correspondingly, the thickness of the convective sublayer) and vice versa. For example, this theoretical relationship was observed, and independently confirmed, within the continental lithosphere of North America using seismic observations (Yuan & Romanowicz, 2010) indicating that the idea of nested boundary layers might be a good baseline representative for the structure of continental lithosphere. Recognizing this structure within the observations (and any variations both to and within the basic structure) can serve as the first step needed to illustrate processes that build and shape continental lithosphere. In particular, both a better view and conceptual framework for the complexity of the continental lithospheric structure can provide insight into early Earth and the progression into the present day tectonic regime.

We should note that there are several other historical approaches to defining and describing the lithosphere (e.g., “seismic lid” - Priestley et al., 2009, “tectosphere” - Jordan, 1978, “electric lithosphere” - Jones et al., 2001), but for brevity, we will limit our discussion in this paper to the thermal and chemical boundary layer descriptions of the lithosphere. For more information about the various definitions of the lithosphere, we suggest Eaton et al. (2009), Fischer et al., (2010) and Fischer (2015). Searching for the base of the lithosphere and structure within, whichever definition used, requires a proxy for temperature, composition and/or rheology. Often we turn to seismology to provide that information. In that vein, the lithosphere can also be defined seismologically (e.g.,

Fischer, 2015). The seismological lithosphere can also be described multiple different ways, using different techniques as described in the following section, but can generally be defined as the high-velocity outer layer of the Earth, which typically is underlain by a low-velocity layer and/or a distinct change in observed seismic anisotropy. Within this definition, the challenge becomes determining whether this high-velocity layer coincides with the thermal or chemical boundary layer or, perhaps, even some other physical properties.

In the next section, we describe several seismic imaging techniques as well as showcase observations and interpretations of the internal structure within continental lithosphere.

3. Seismic Imaging

Broadband seismological observations of the continental lithosphere structure provide constraints on seismic velocity, but also estimates of crustal and lithospheric thicknesses, rheological contrasts, presence of anisotropic layers and internal structures that may be related to deformation and/or formation, such as the crustal-mantle boundary (Moho), mid-lithospheric discontinuities (MLDs, defined as seismic discontinuities occurring between the base of the crust and the asthenosphere), or lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary (LAB) . Multiple seismological methods are used for imaging the lithosphere, and these techniques include a range of tomographic methods, velocity discontinuity imaging, and various procedures for mapping changes in

seismic anisotropy. Different approaches in seismic imaging have become the subject of serious debate, as new methods are being developed and existing methodologies are improving in order to exploit the continuously growing, enormous volumes of readily available broad-band data for analysis. Varying approaches and tools are designed for different targets, and a few of those commonly used for lithosphere-scale imaging are briefly summarized here. For a more thorough review, see Fischer (2015).

3.1 Seismic tomography

Global body wave tomography studies robustly image long wavelength (~100s of kilometers) lateral features in the upper (and lower) mantle (see Becker & Boschi (2002) for a summary) with travel-times, highlighting the contrast in velocities and attenuation not only beneath the oceans, but between the active tectonic regions of the continent and their stable cores (cratons). However, due to the near vertical incidence of teleseismic body waves used in P-wave inversions, the depth of the lithosphere is often over-estimated when only P-waves are used. Furthermore, crustal scale velocity perturbations can be difficult to resolve with teleseismic data and global inversions. In addition, the wavelength of structures imaged with global body wave tomography, whether or not they include surface waves in the inversion, are typically not at the scale needed (1-10s of kilometers) to investigate the detailed internal structure of the lithosphere.

Global surface wave tomography, however, is often used to infer the absolute shear-wave velocity structure of the upper mantle and through analysis of various periods of horizontally propagating surface waves. Due to the inherent difference in the types of seismic waves used, there generally is not as much vertical smearing of the velocity structure as is common with body wave tomography. However, due to the integrative properties in surface wave tomography, near-horizontal boundary structures, such as the Moho and LAB can be difficult to image. Joint inversion of S-waves and surface waves (and also normal modes) for global shear wave velocity perturbations provide some of the most comprehensive tomographic models of the upper mantle (e.g., Schaeffer & Lebedev, 2013; French et al., 2013). These models clearly identify subduction zone structures, the difference in thickness of the lithosphere in cratonic environments versus active tectonic regions, and also clearly image the smaller-scale variations in structure within the continental lithosphere as shown in Figure 4, which approach regional scale studies (Schaeffer & Lebedev, 2013).

Figure 4. Global S wave tomography model by Schaeffer & Lebedev (2013) plotted at 150 km depth. The additional shading indicates regions with very thick (>250 km) lithosphere in the litho1.0 model.

Regional tomography studies can provide more detailed images of the structure of the continental lithosphere, and with the ever increasing number of seismic stations the images are constantly improving. Travel-time tomography using only body wave arrivals at densely spaced arrays, such as USArray, have provided “high” resolution images (~10 km) that show the incredible complexity of the continental lithosphere beneath the Moho (see Becker (2012) for a summary). Continent-scale surface wave models (of North America) also clearly illustrate the large (and regional) scale variations in structure (10-100s of kilometers), but more focused studies that use either ballistic (e.g., Wagner et al., 2010; Pollitz & Mooney 2016) or ambient noise (e.g., Lin et al., 2009; Porritt et al., 2011) surface waves techniques confirm this observation and further

illustrate that the continental lithosphere is extremely heterogeneous and complex at the ~10 km scale within both the crust and mantle lithosphere. Similarly, surface wave images of the other continents show lithospheric complexity where there have been extensive seismic deployments such as in Europe (e.g., Zhu et al., 2012) or China (e.g., Bao et al., 2015), and Australia (e.g., Saygin et al., 2012; Fishwick & Rawlinson 2012).

3.2 Discontinuity structures

Layering within the continental lithosphere has long been known (e.g. Mohorovicic, 1910; Gutenberg, 1948; Lehmann, 1961; Hales, 1969), but the complexity, layering, and structures within the outer layer of the Earth continues to be revealed with seismic scattering and discontinuity imaging (e.g., Gaherty & Jordan 1995; Bostock 1998;; Rychert et al., 2007; Savage et al., 2008; Rychert & Shearer 2009; Abt et al., 2010; Miller & Eaton 2010). Receiver function analysis (Langston, 1977; Vinnik 1977; Farra & Vinnik 2000) has become an important tool in mapping sub-horizontal velocity discontinuities in the crust and mantle. P receiver functions (PRFs), which use P-to-s conversions, are commonly used to map the crust-mantle boundary (Moho) and internal crustal structure and are less commonly used for deeper structure due to the potential contamination of crustal multiples at deeper lithospheric depths (Rychert & Shearer, 2009). The raw Ps signal is often weak and so the RFs are generally stacked to improve the signal-to-noise ratio. Then the stacked RFs represent the 1-D (generally) isotropic structure below a seismic station, where the phase delay between P and Ps indicates the depth of discontinuity it arises from, and the amplitude represents the

strength of the impedance contrast at that boundary. S receiver functions (SRFs), which instead use S-to-p conversions, are also a powerful tool for imaging deeper subhorizontal structures such as the lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary (LAB) or mid-lithospheric discontinuities (MLDs) as the signals are not contaminated by crustal multiples, but are limited by their lower frequency content and smaller distance range for appropriate teleseismic events (Yuan et al., 2006). With densely spaced seismometers, more sophisticated methodologies can be used with teleseismic scattered phases to produce either 2D (Bostock 1998; Frederiksen & Bostock 2000) or 3D images (Dueker & Sheehan, 1997) of seismic discontinuities (Rondenay et al., 2005). All these flavors of receiver functions are useful for mapping sharp velocity discontinuities and can provide tight constraints (~1 km) on the depth of these structures. Recent literature has provided global compilations of results that map the internal structure of the continental lithosphere (Fischer et al., 2010; Cooper & Miller, 2014; Hopper et al., 2014; Selway et al., 2014; Rader et al., 2015), which are shown in Figure 6.

3.3 Anisotropic structures

Another seismic observable used to infer deformation within the continental lithosphere and its base is through the detection of seismic anisotropy, which is defined as the dependence of seismic velocities on the direction of wave propagation and polarization. Changes in anisotropy within the continental lithosphere have also been mapped with multiple methods which include, but are not limited to, receiver functions, shear wave splitting, and surface wave tomography. In the oldest centers of the continents, seismic

anisotropy can often be linked to fossil mantle textures, dating from rifting, collision, and accretion events during the formation of the lithosphere (Park & Levin 2002; Yuan & Romanowicz, 2010), but this interpretation is far from simple or widely-proven for different regions or even observed globally (Fouch & Rondenay, 2006; Long & Becker 2010).

For an isotropic, flat-layered Earth structure, tangential component receiver functions should be zero (or contain only incoherent noise in reality), and the radial component receiver function should have signals that are independent of back azimuth and then used to image the discontinuity structures beneath seismic stations as discussed above. However, in practice, coherent and azimuth-dependent signals are observed on both the radial and tangential component receiver functions, which can be used to infer anisotropic structures using a variety of techniques (Bostock, 1998; Savage, 1998; Frederiksen & Bostock, 2000; Schulte-Pelkum et al., 2014). Receiver function analysis of anisotropy can detect sharp vertical variations in anisotropy and dipping layers with better resolution than the other methods discussed here (Fouch & Rondenay, 2006), but are limited by non-linearity and densely spaced seismic stations.

Shear wave splitting analyses, in particular splitting of core phases (SK(K)S), are based upon the properties of birefringence of nearly vertically propagating shear waves beneath seismic stations. The lateral measurements (at multiple stations) of splitting of SKS phases allow for interpretation of the back-azimuthal variation of delay times and fast directions to infer the presence of anisotropic layers or dipping structures in the

mantle, however the depth constraints of these layers is poorly resolved due to the path-integrated effect of anisotropy from the core to the crust (Silver & Chan, 1988; Fouch & Rondenay 2006).

Two types of seismic anisotropy, azimuthal (horizontal) and radial (vertical) anisotropy, can be measured with surface wave methodologies. Radial anisotropy in the upper mantle has been detected with the discrepancy between Rayleigh and Love wave propagation, while the existence of azimuthal anisotropy is determined by changes in directional dependence of the propagation of Rayleigh waves. A major advantage of using surface waves to detect continental lithosphere anisotropy is that the depth of the anisotropic layers are much better constrained than when using body wave (e.g. SKS) measurements. For example, detecting azimuthal anisotropy in the upper mantle from surface waves can illustrate how the orientation of the fast axis of anisotropy changes with depth with more widely spaced stations than with receiver function methods. Many different methods can be used to infer both radial and azimuthal anisotropy within the continents (see Fouch & Rondenay (2006) and Fischer (2015) for reviews).

Further advances are rapidly being made to improve imaging capabilities by jointly inverting different types of data and results, integrating existing models as starting models, utilizing full waveform inversions, developing array based methods, and exploiting faster computational abilities (Julià et al., 2000; Sigloch 2011; Yang et al., 2011; French et al., 2013; Shen et al., 2013; Porritt et al., 2014; Schmandt & Fan-Chi 2014; Calò et al., 2016). These rapid developments have produced detailed structural

images of the continental lithosphere that are providing new observations of the complex formation and deformation that has occurred throughout geologic history.

3.4 Seismic observations

Regardless of the seismic imaging technique, there is a first-order feature that is observed in continental lithospheric structure. The oldest cores of the continents have thicker, fast velocity structure; in contrast, the younger regions of the continents have much thinner lithosphere (Figure 5). Global seismic observations (Figure 4) illustrate that the thick cratonic mantle lithosphere has high velocity in comparison to the same depths beneath the Phanerozoic lithosphere. Some petrological studies suggest compositional variations between two age groups (e.g., Poudjom Djomani et al., 2001), however, recent seismic studies have suggested that there is no systematic difference in the velocity and overall thickness between the Proterozoic and Archean lithosphere (Darbyshire & Eaton, 2010).

More detailed, regional seismic observations illustrate the complexity of the deep continental lithosphere structure both in the cratons and in the tectonically active regions. Regional studies of active convergent margins, for example, image the subducted oceanic lithosphere but also image how the overriding continental lithosphere is deformed and formed by the subduction zone processes (e.g., Gutscher et al., 2000; Humphreys 2009; Schmandt & Humphreys 2010; Miller & Agostinetti 2011; Porritt et al., 2011; Schmandt & Humphreys 2011; Pearce et al., 2012; Levander et al.,

2014; Kim et al., 2014; O'Driscoll & Miller 2015). In the shallow mantle lithosphere a few high-resolution studies have imaged the dipping subducted oceanic lithosphere, mantle wedge and modified structure of the overriding plate (e.g., Bostock et al., 2001; Pearce et al., 2012; Kim et al., 2012; Bostock, 2013), accreted terranes such as the actively subducting Yakutat beneath Alaska (Ferris et al., 2003; Rondenay et al., 2010; Kim et al., 2014), the 55 Ma Siletzia terrane stagnating in the upper mantle beneath northwestern United States (Schmandt & Humphreys, 2011), and collision of continental lithosphere transferred to base of the overriding plate (Eurasia) in the Banda arc of southeast Asia (Porritt et al., 2016). Inboard of subduction zones, but in regions that are still considered tectonically active like the western Americas and the Mediterranean the continental lithosphere continues to be deformed and modified by tectonic processes (van der Hilst & Paul 1994; Wortel & Spakman 2000; Gilbert et al., 2006; Schmandt & Humphreys 2010; Levander & Miller 2012; Bao et al., 2014).

Figure 5. Contours of continental lithosphere thickness taken from the litho1.0 model (Pasyanos et al., 2014). Dark blue are the regions thicker than 250 km and lighter blue are regions between 130 and 250 km in thickness. Thinner regions have not been colored. The background is shaded relief computed for ETOPO1 (Eakins & Amant, 2009). Red polygons indicate the locations of broadband seismic studies that observe structures that have been interpreted to be ancient accreted terranes / terrane boundaries preserved within the continental lithosphere (1 – Bostock, 1998; 2 – Cook et al., 1998; 3 – Parker et al., 2015; 4 – Rondenay et al., 2000; 5 – Levin & Park, 2000; 6 – Pilia et al., 2015).

Away from convergent margins, within the continental interiors, structures imaged seem to be as complex and appear to have characteristics that are reminiscent of modern accretionary structures. Ancient accreted terranes and sutures have been mapped geologically (e.g., Oldow et al., 1989; Betts et al., 2011), and have been mapped by a few active source based studies (BABEL Working Group 1990; Cook et al., 1999; Magnani et al., 2004). Large scale active source seismic experiments, such as Lithoprobe (Hammer et al., 2010), were able to image lithospheric structure across the

entire North American continent from active subduction in the west to the cratonic interior. These efforts provide a link between the structures in the active tectonic regions and those in the stable continental interior. Passive source seismology has also been able to image the structures within the continental lithosphere with impressive resolution (< 1 - 1 km) in select locations (red polygons in Figure 5).

One of the first studies linked the active and passive source seismological experiments in the Slave craton of Canada (Bostock, 1998). This study imaged dipping reflectors from P-to-s conversions that correlate with the shallow reflectors from the Lithoprobe-SNORCLE active source experiment (Cook et al., 1999) interpreted as tectonic boundaries or sutures, suggesting that subduction-like processes were fundamental in assembling the continental lithosphere. Similarly, on the southeastern edge of the Canadian shield, Rondenay et al. (2000) image a subduction zone suture at the Grenville Front using a combination of tomography, SKS splitting, and receiver function techniques. Recently, in the southern Appalachians, receiver functions were used to observe a décollement beneath the fold-thrust belt that transitions into a subhorizontal shear zone inward toward the orogen. This was interpreted as a set of accreted terranes overlying the basement rocks (Parker et al., 2015).

In southeastern Australia, Pilia et al. (2015) found evidence of discrete terranes within the continent that were accreted in the Paleozoic. The fabric of the accreted terrane geometries and deformation history is inferred from seismic anisotropy derived from ambient noise tomography (Figure 9B). Their results suggest that exotic continental

fragments from Paleozoic collision of terranes onto the Proterozoic and Archean core of the Australian continent are preserved and identifiable. Other less well sampled regions on Earth, also suggest the presence of dipping, anisotropic layers in other continental cratons. For example, one study of the Arabian shield also imaged dipping, anisotropic discontinuities in a similar depth range (~80 km) with one seismic station, which could be related to shear zones formed during Proterozoic continent-continent collision (Levin & Park, 2000).

More widespread surveys within the continents observe mid-lithospheric discontinuities (MLDs) with S receiver functions (Selway et al., 2015). The mid-lithospheric discontinuity refers to a seismic discontinuity recorded at a depth range of ~80-120 kilometers, which may or may not be related to the Hales discontinuity or those imaged by the detailed scattered wave images mentioned above. Initially, the MLDs were only identified in sparse locations within the cratons of North America, Australia, and Africa, due to the wide, uneven distribution of broadband seismic stations ~10 years ago e.g. (Wittlinger & Farra 2007; Olsson et al., 2007; Savage et al., 2008; Abt et al., 2010; Miller & Eaton 2010; Ford et al., 2010; Cooper & Miller 2014). As the number of evenly spaced stations increased and additional methods of imaging became available and adapted to the growing volume of data, the number and distribution of MLDs dramatically increased (Figure 6). Furthermore, in some places are the MLDs are observed at multiple depths (Figure 6, inset B, C) within the same region (Yuan & Romanowicz 2010; Lekić et al., 2014; Hopper et al., 2014; Hopper & Fischer 2015; Porritt et al., 2015; Hansen et al., 2015; Calò et al., 2016) and are represented by (most

often) a negative velocity gradient, but occasionally a positive velocity gradient at similar depths. Figure 6 (D, E) shows the distribution of the MLDs with lithospheric thickness and compares this to the global distribution of lithospheric thickness, showing that 80% these features are generally only seen in the thickest 20% (175 km or more) of the continental lithosphere.

Figure 6. (A) Global compilation of observations of S receiver function based mid-lithosphere discontinuities (MLD), color coded by provenance (see text for references) the shading indicates lithospheric thickness in two bands: light gray for lithosphere more than 150 km in thickness, and dark gray for more than 250 km thickness (litho1.0, Pasyanos et al., 2014). (B,C) are representations of the depths of two mid lithosphere discontinuities (MLD1 and MLD2) imaged by Calò et al. (2016). Gaps in the interior of this study indicate regions where the discontinuity surface is absent. (D) Frequency count for the thickness of the lithosphere taken at every point in the litho1.0 model (blue and left axis), and for those points where MLDs have been identified in (green and right axis). (E) Cumulative frequency diagram for the same information (global lithospheric thickness, blue, from thick to thin) and for the lithosphere at locations in (A) where an MLD observation has been made (green, cumulative from thinner to thicker). The litho1.0 model is an icosohedral triangulation of the sphere at approximately 1 degree separation. The MLD information was

691 *projected to the nodes through a weighted average and only those nodes with at least one observation within their*
692 *local support were counted in the histogram. No additional weight was given to multiple observations near any point.*
693

694 Although the stable interiors of the continents are generally thicker (Figure 5), the base
695 of the lithosphere is not observed at a uniform depth. There are differences between
696 each continent and even within an individual craton. For example, the North American
697 craton, which is one of the most well-studied regions, illustrates this point. Beneath the
698 core of the continent as seen in the high velocity structures in Figure 4, around Hudson
699 Bay there is significant variation in the depth (~200 - 325 km) to the LAB (Figure 5) from
700 seismic observations (Darbyshire & Eaton 2010; Porritt et al., 2015). The variation in
701 thickness and structure has been interpreted from broadband seismic studies to be a
702 signature of Archean-Paleoproterozoic tectonics, and the formation of the Trans-
703 Hudson orogen around 1.8 Ga when several Archean terranes were assembled into
704 what is now the Canadian Shield (Bastow et al., 2010). Similarly, the African continent,
705 particularly the South African craton, displays a significant variation (~100 to >300 km)
706 in the lithospheric thickness (e.g. Wittlinger & Farra 2007; Fishwick 2010; Cooper &
707 Miller 2014) indicating that the sequential tectonic assembly of the continent is reflected
708 in the structure of the individual cratons (Begg et al., 2009).

709
710 The continental lithosphere imaged with broadband seismic data suggests that the
711 internal structure, including multiple layers (Moho and MLDs), variable depth to the base
712 of the lithosphere (LAB), and dipping structures, is indicative of the long-term evolution
713 and formation of both the youngest and oldest part of the continents.

4. Dynamic Interpretation of Lithospheric Structure

The techniques discussed above and observations from the global maps highlighted in Figures 1-6, while deeply informative, offer only a static view of the continental lithosphere. What we “see” in these data sets is the sum of all of the geologic events and processes occurring over the history of a region (often spanning millions to billions of years). While the data sets are used to unravel the tectonic events through careful interpretation, further insight can be gained through geodynamic modeling. In particular, geodynamic modeling can help guide our interpretation and determine whether modern and ancient processes produce similar or different lithospheric structure.

As mentioned above, considerable debate revolves around the style of tectonics that operated during the Archean and Proterozoic, when much of the continental lithosphere was formed. The exact timing of the onset of plate tectonics and modern subduction is unresolved (e.g., Furnes et al., 2007; Chen et al., 2009; Smart et al., 2016). Therefore, it is unclear whether the processes that currently shape the continental lithosphere were active and operating in the same manner that they do today. Several hypotheses have been proposed for cratonic lithosphere formation, and they can be categorized into two groups: (1) those that invoke processes unique to the pre-plate tectonic Earth and (2) those that call upon modern day plate tectonic processes. Each offer an explanation for the observed stability of cratonic lithosphere as well as the basic structure of a chemical boundary layer residing within the thermal boundary layer. These hypotheses should

also be able to provide context for the geochemical and seismological observations of cratonic lithosphere. Furthermore, each must also account for the longevity of cratonic lithosphere which is different than solely describing stability.

Regardless of the exact dynamic regime, the conditions experienced by cratonic lithosphere will change with time after formation. For example, convective stresses increase as the Earth cools. This is due to the dependency of the mantle's viscosity on temperature - as the Earth cools, the average mantle temperature decreases and the viscosity increases which nets in increased convective stresses (e.g., Cooper & Conrad, 2009; Sandu et al., 2011). In addition, the condition of isopycnicity, which explains the present day neutral buoyancy of cratonic lithosphere, may not have been met in the past when the mantle was hotter and the average thermal boundary was thinner (Eaton & Perry, 2013). Thus, creating stable and long-lived cratonic lithosphere requires producing a feature that can resist deformation shortly after formation and from that moment onward. The longevity issue prompts some to propose that the composition of cratonic lithosphere can only be produced during the early Earth (O'Reilly et al., 2001; Poudjom Djomani et al., 2001) or that cratonic lithosphere is preferentially buffered from deformation by surrounding, slightly weaker material (Lenardic et al., 2000; Cooper & Conrad, 2009).

We do note that there is evidence that some cratonic regions have not survived to present day (e.g., Gao et al., 2004; Abdelsalam et al., 2011; Guo et al., 2016). This does hint at the possibility that whatever processes form cratonic lithosphere may not

always succeed in building long-lasting stable features. However, for the scope of this paper, we limit our discussion to creating and preserving, rather than destroying, cratonic lithosphere.

Here we outline the arguments for the formation hypotheses as well as outline the predicted lithospheric structure produced by each as well as their explanations for stability and longevity. We will consider these within the framework of the observations made in the previous section as well as critically evaluate their potential to form long lasting, stable lithosphere containing complex structures.

4.1 Hypotheses based on a pre-plate tectonic regime

Much of the debate surrounding the onset of plate tectonics depends on the uncertainty as to how different parameters respond to higher mantle temperatures in the past. Several of the ideas for cratonic formation call upon processes that would only be in operation during times of higher average mantle temperatures. This has the benefit of explaining the seemingly uniqueness of craton lithosphere, but, in some cases, removes the advantage of correlation to modern day processes. The majority of the pre-plate tectonic ideas centralize around primarily vertical motion (Figures 7A & B), as large-scale lateral motion is more indicative of the plate tectonic regime. As such, the lithospheric structure produced in such settings would be indicative of processes driven by upwellings, drips and/or regional lateral motion (in response to isostatic adjustments or gravitational collapse).

784

785 An early idea for craton formation invoked large and deeply seated melting events
786 caused by large mantle plumes (Figure 7A) or upwellings (e.g., Pearson et al., 1995;
787 Robin & Bailey 2009; Aulbach, 2012). It is suggested that the melting occurred through
788 a large single event triggered by a plume (e.g., Pearson et al., 1995). It is speculated
789 that, in the early Earth, the hotter mantle temperatures allowed for incipient melting to
790 occur at greater depths within a plume (e.g., Lee et al., 2011). This would provide a
791 large enough melting event to produce residuum up to several hundreds of kilometers
792 thick. In addition, the higher temperatures promote higher degrees of melting such that
793 the residuum is strongly depleted and dehydrated. This provides the means to make
794 thick, buoyant and highly viscous cratonic lithosphere in a single event. The argument
795 for a single melting event centers around the similar crustal and lithospheric ages in
796 some cratons indicating a coupled origin (e.g., Pearson et al., 1995; Carlson et al., 2000;
797 Griffin et al., 2003; Carlson et al., 2005). Other geochemical evidence, however, argues
798 that the melting associated with cratonic lithosphere occurred at lower pressures (e.g.,
799 Lee, 2006) which calls into question the plume driven large, single melting event.

800

801 Others have suggested that the cratonic lithosphere was formed through diapirism and
802 vertical tectonics where dense volcanic material is moved vertically deeper into the
803 mantle in response to a density inversion (Figure 7B). In this scenario, cratonic crust
804 and lithosphere is made through successive sorting events. Robin & Bailey (2009)
805 assumed that this process was driven by an unstable compositional stratification
806 caused by the emplacement of mafic volcanics on top of felsic crust. The density

807 inversion and incubation of the more radiogenic felsic crust could drive ductile
808 deformation and the development of domes and keels (Sandiford et al., 2004). Robin &
809 Bailey (2009) argue that the cratonic lithosphere could have formed by the successive
810 vertical accumulation of the residuum generated from melting the mafic volcanics that
811 moved downward during the keeling process or from melting driven from delamination
812 events often referred to as “sagduction” (Bédard, 2006; Bédard et al., 2013). While the
813 diapirism can explain the dome and keel structure of some Archean crust (e.g.
814 Sandiford et al., 2004) and potentially provides an explanation for the coeval evolution
815 of the crust and lithosphere, it has not yet been demonstrated that it is possible to form
816 a root several hundred kilometers thick through the vertical migration of dense melts.

Figure 7. Conceptual sketches of craton formation. Gray arrows show sense of motion. Red arrows indicate melt transport. (A) Melting event trigger by large mantle plume as described in Pearson et al., (1995) and Lee et al., (2011). (B) Burial/reworking and sorting of dense materials (e.g., Robin & Bailey, 2009; Moore & Webb, 2013; Sizova et al., 2015). Though not explicitly shown in this sketch, diapirism can further aid the resorting of dense materials. (C) Lithospheric thickening through the amalgamation of arc material (e.g., Jordan, 1978). (D) Thrust stacking and imbrication of buoyant oceanic lithosphere (e.g., Bostock, 1998).

Similarly, another proposed tectonic setting for the early Earth, the heat pipe regime, allows for the rapid removal of heat through pervasive, localized volcanism as well as the development of thick lithosphere via vertical transport. It was first proposed to explain heat loss on Venus and Io (e.g., Turcotte 1989; Armann et al., 2012; Moore 2001), both terrestrial bodies demonstrating little horizontal motion, but significant volcanism. The heat pipe mode allows for efficient cooling of the hot interiors (e.g. as induced by tidal heating in the case of Io or heat from the decay of radioactive elements for Venus(e.g., Turcotte 1989; Armann et al., 2012; Moore 2001)) without invoking plate tectonics. This idea was extended to the early Earth to explain the removal of heat in conditions wherein plate tectonics might not be operating. The early Earth's mantle was hotter in the past due to the higher amount of radioactive elements and residual heat from the formation of the planet, yet early estimates of the temperature gradient across the lithosphere suggests surface heat flux values similar to present day (Burke et al., 1978). During a heat pipe mode of convection, the entire surface acts as a single plate and rapid, localized volcanic eruptions connect, as "pipes", the hot, convecting mantle to the surface, effectively removing heat. The volcanic eruptions pile up on the surface burying cooler regions of the lithosphere and thus, building a cool, thick lithosphere even in the midst of a hotter mantle. Depending on eruption rates, the rapid and

successive volcanism described in Moore & Webb (2013) might also explain the observation of coeval cratonic crust and lithosphere (e.g., Pearson et al., 1995; Carlson et al., 2000; Carlson et al., 2005). This process also would promote melting at shallow depths satisfying the geochemical requirement for low pressure melt production (Lee, 2006). In a modified form of the heat-pipe hypothesis, which included the possibility of intracrustal melting in addition to rapid volcanism, Sizova et al. (2015) demonstrated that eruption of melts followed by their burial and dynamic overturning could generate the observed Archean crustal composition and depleted mantle lithosphere.

An additional formation hypothesis that could have also operated within (or as a consequence from) a heat pipe or other early Earth tectonic regimes calls upon the gravitational collapse of thick lithosphere (Rey et al., 2014). This idea proposes the surface of the Earth, though immobilized by stagnant lid convection, is divided into regions of thick, continental lithosphere and oceanic lithosphere. The authors propose that variations in the thickness of the early lithosphere could have driven horizontal gravitational forces sufficient to cause yielding of the adjacent thinner oceanic lithosphere simultaneously initiating subduction and collapse within the continental lithosphere (Rey et al., 2014). The gravitational collapse initiates decompression melting at the base of the continental lithosphere. This melting event introduces depleted residue at the base of the thinned continental lithosphere. In this model, the lithosphere continues to thicken and strengthen via cooling. The authors also propose that as subduction develops, the cratonic lithosphere along the newly formed margins will experience metasomatism further characterizing the geochemical signature of cratonic lithosphere (Rey et al., 2014). This hypothesis depends on the assumption of

pre-existing regions of thick and buoyant cratonic lithosphere. The authors argue that these regions would have formed by differentiation within buoyant oceanic plateaus (possibly akin to the dome and keel behavior) (Rey et al., 2014). There is also significant tradeoff between rheological parameters of the initial cratonic lithosphere and oceanic lithosphere necessary to allow for the gravitational collapse and subsequent initiation of subduction. The initial cratonic lithosphere needed to be strong enough to maintain a thickness differential, but weak enough to eventually, catastrophically collapse. Regardless, this mechanism does provide a unique and one-off scenario to form thick and stable cratonic lithosphere without invoking plate tectonics.

All of these hypotheses are capable of forming a strong, thick chemical boundary layer residing within the thermal boundary layer. Stability and longevity within these scenarios are provided by the unique composition and rheology induced by the high degree melting. The lithosphere produced by a single, plume melting event would exhibit compositional stratification due to the gradual decline of melt-depletion in the plume structure with depth (e.g., Lee et al., 2011) whereas the others might produce compositional stratification due to the progressive layering of dense residuals (e.g., Rey et al., 2014). All would produce planar structures related to the melting event(s). Recently, there has been observational evidence for a mid-lithospheric discontinuity (MLD) in Ontong Java Plateau interpreted as a remnant of the melting event that formed the oceanic plateau (Tharimena et al., 2016). This suggests a mechanism for producing MLDs observed within cratonic lithosphere produced by large melting events associated with plumes or successive volcanic eruptions. However, these hypotheses fail to

describe the more complex nature, mentioned above, of some of the MLDs observed within the cratonic regions that show continuous dipping surfaces (e.g., Bostock, 1998; Miller & Eaton, 2010) and even multiple MLDs in a single location (e.g., Hopper et al 2015; Calò et al., 2016) suggesting a differing origin than melting events alone, at least in those areas.

4.2 Hypotheses based on early development of plate tectonics

There are several lines of evidence that suggest that plate tectonics could have been in operation during formation of the cratonic lithosphere. These range from geochemical signatures of subduction within cratonic mantle xenoliths (e.g., Lee, 2006) to seismic imaging of complex structure deep within the cratonic lithosphere (Bostock, 1998; Miller & Eaton, 2010; Yuan & Romanowicz, 2010; Cooper & Miller, 2014; Wirth & Long, 2014; Hopper & Fischer 2015; Calò et al., 2016). Indeed, seismological observations seem to be converging on the idea that the pervasive mid-lithospheric discontinuity observed in the thick, Precambrian lithosphere is a likely relic from formation (Bostock, 1998; Bastow et al., 2010; Miller & Eaton, 2010; Yuan & Romanowicz, 2010; Cooper & Miller, 2014; Wirth & Long, 2014; Hopper & Fischer, 2015; Calò et al., 2016). In the framework of plate tectonics, cratonic lithosphere was formed by thickening pre-existing lithosphere in a subduction zone setting. Early proponents of this idea suggest that cratons were formed through the thrust stacking of buoyant oceanic lithosphere incapable of participating in subduction (Bostock, 1998) or through the amalgamation of arc material (Jordan, 1978). Both of these processes are dominated by lateral motion and large-

scale deformation (Figures 7C & D). Indeed, a puzzling component of this hypothesis is the capacity for high-deforming processes to form stable, long-lived features.

Cooper et al. (2006) demonstrated the feasibility of forming stable lithosphere either through thrust stacking of buoyant oceanic lithosphere or accretion/accumulation of arc lithosphere. The authors used a combination of numerical simulations and theoretical scaling relationships to map out the parameters that allowed for thickening of lithospheric material over a downwelling in a convection cell. Two scenarios arose: the lithospheric material thickening via localized deformation (akin to thrust stacking) or through viscous deformation (more indicative of arc amalgamation) (Cooper et al., 2006). Both required the initial material to be buoyant so as to resist entrainment into the mantle downwelling. Indeed, this limitation is what drove Jordan (1978) and Bostock (1998) to suggest either arc lithosphere or buoyant oceanic lithosphere as the thickened proto-cratonic lithosphere. The material must be sufficiently buoyant to explain the observed compositional buoyancy, but also remain neutrally (or positively) buoyant (Jordan, 1978) both at the time of formation and subsequent evolution in a cooling Earth.

The differing styles of thickening (thrust stacking vs amalgamation) observed within the simulations depended on the rheological properties of lithosphere (Cooper et al., 2006). Deformation occurred through a localized manner along shear bands in simulations with stronger, more viscous lithospheric material whereas those with weaker, less viscous material deformed in a distributed fashion with no distinguishable shearing (Cooper et

al., 2006). Thus, the manner of lithosphere thickening invoked to explain craton formation is dependent on the rheology of the proto-cratonic lithosphere. Gray et al. (2010) also demonstrated the controls that rheology plays on simulations of continental collision, though this study focused more on the crustal influence on deformation rather than the entire lithosphere. Regardless of the differing rheological framework, both styles of thickening produced thick, stable features within the simulations wherein deformation within the lithosphere ceased, or significantly decreased (small-scale dripping occurred along the base of the viscously thickened lithosphere, but large-scale deformation ended), even though convection continued (Cooper et al., 2006).

The act of the thickening itself drove the transition to stability within these simulations. As the lithospheric thickness increased, the effective yield stress increased (necessary to cease localized shearing) as well as the integrated buoyancy (suppressing entrainment, delamination or dripping) (Cooper et al., 2006). Both of these conditions depend not only on the material properties of the lithosphere, but also on the dynamic setting of the convecting mantle. In other words, to turn off yielding within the lithosphere the effective yield strength must be higher than the convective stresses. To resist entrainment, the integrated buoyancy must exceed the negative thermal buoyancy of the mantle downwelling. Thus to achieve longevity, the lithosphere must exceed a critical thickness to ensure stability not only in the past dynamic setting when formed (e.g., Lenardic & Moresi, 1999), but also sufficiently thick to offset the increase in convective stresses and negative thermal buoyancy of the cooling, thermal boundary layer (Cooper et al., 2006). The progressive cooling of the cratonic lithosphere itself will

958 contribute to an additional strengthening due to the temperature-dependent rheology.
959 This is a necessity for the more distributed thickening regime which does allow for small
960 drips to form at the base of the lithosphere. Cooling of the temperature-dependent
961 lithosphere will help suppress potential thinning from these drips (Molnar et al., 1998).
962 The localized thickening (or thrust stacking) behavior does not experience these drips
963 due to the high viscosity required for the behavior to develop, but stability through this
964 process does assume healing of shear zones once the stresses to promote yielding are
965 no longer present (Cooper et al., 2006).

966

967 Much like the Rey et al. (2014) continental collapse model, all of these models requires
968 assuming *a priori* an initial lithospheric material that is buoyant from the onset. This is
969 where these lines of models run into difficulty, in particular, the thrust stacking of
970 buoyant oceanic lithosphere. The buoyancy in the buoyant oceanic lithosphere is
971 supplied by thick basaltic crust (a consequence of greater melt production driven by
972 higher mantle temperatures in the past). This buoyancy is most likely not a permanent
973 condition as basalt transitions to the denser eclogite under pressure. In present day
974 subduction zones, the density change associated with this metamorphic reaction helps
975 drive the downward motion of the subducting oceanic lithosphere (Peacock, 1993). If
976 cratonic lithosphere is formed by the progressive thickening of buoyant oceanic
977 lithosphere, buoyancy would be lost if a significant portion of the basaltic crust
978 transforms to eclogite once at depth. Arc lithosphere is also problematic as mafic
979 cumulates are the complementary residue to the more felsic or intermediate buoyant
980 crust (e.g., Rudnick, 1995). Thus, it is unclear that the buoyancy required to thicken

either material through lateral motion can be achieved without preferentially removing the dense material either during thickening (Kay & Kay, 1993; Krystopowicz & Currie, 2013; Wood, 2014) or post formation through the overturn of the entire thickened lithosphere (Percival & Pysklywec, 2007).

Regardless whether thrust stacking of buoyant oceanic lithosphere, arc accumulation or continental collision, the thickening of the lithosphere as driven by lateral motion introduces complex structure at depth. Cooper & Miller (2014) expanded upon the earlier models in a manner that highlighted structures that would arise from such large-scale deformation. The authors show that if deformation occurred in a more distributed manner, horizontal planar features would be produced, but if deformation localized into shear zones, dipping structures developed in the lithospheric interior (Cooper & Miller, 2014) - see also Figure 8C). Similar studies (e.g., Gray et al., 2010) also show the dependency of lithospheric structure on deformation style. This provides an explanation for the varied nature of lithospheric structure in differing cratons regions; thickening driven by lateral motion can produce a range of features depending on the rheological conditions. This suggests that some form of lateral accretion was likely at work during the formation of cratonic lithosphere given the observed complexity within the deep structure, though there are still many unanswered questions about the origin of the material that has been thickened and whether the thickening process was driven by true plate tectonic behavior or by the transition toward modern day processes.

5. Comparison with Modern Analogues

While geodynamic models clearly suggest a mobile-lid, laterally-driven model of thickening of the Archean lithosphere was responsible for the widely observed, dipping structures, the extent to which this process is comparable to modern accretion is still an open question. It is useful, then, to examine what we know about the structural aftermath of the lateral assembly of continental lithosphere in the modern Earth.

5.1 Accretion dynamics

The nature of plate tectonics is to draw any material on an oceanic plate inexorably into collision with a subduction zone. Whether such material is recycled into the mantle or accreted onto the overriding plate is determined by dynamic considerations related to the relative buoyancy and strength of the ingested material, the subducting slab and whether the overriding plate is sufficiently deformable to accommodate the incoming material.

For example, two-dimensional models of oceanic plateaus colliding with subduction zones by Arrial & Billen (2013) show that eclogitization of the plateau crust inhibits accretion by increasing slab negative buoyancy with the potential for underplating of the plateau after slab break-off. Tetreault & Buiter (2012) argue that the strength of the incoming material is important in allowing a buoyant anomaly to be sliced at the base from the down-going plate and emplaced on the over-riding plate. van Hunen & Allen (2011) show how congestion of the subduction zone by a strongly-buoyant continental ribbon can lead to slab break-off and stalled convergence.

1026

1027 In a two dimensional cross-section, the structural signatures of these forms of accretion
1028 are integrated in a study by Vogt & Gerya (2014) who propose three distinct modes of
1029 accretion. (1) Frontal accretion in which the terrane butts up against the overriding plate,
1030 and remains vertically coherent with the underlying oceanic lithosphere after slab
1031 breakoff. (2) Basal accretion in which the plateau is significantly underthrust below the
1032 overriding plate, is sheared from the oceanic, downgoing plate, and stranded after
1033 subduction restarts. This produces a dipping structure akin to that in Figure 8C. (3) An
1034 underplating mode in which the buoyant plateau rebounds after partial subduction and
1035 is emplaced vertically into the lithosphere behind the arc. These modes are described in
1036 terms of plateau collision but can be generalized to the subduction of any buoyant
1037 anomaly carried by the sea-floor.

1038

1039 Some accretionary orogenic belts remain active for hundreds of millions of years during
1040 which time they accumulate a collage of terranes including arcs, back-arc, and micro-
1041 continents or continental ribbons (Wilhem et al., 2012). The age of the subducting plate
1042 will vary in time and along the strike of the margin, each of the multiple incoming
1043 terranes will have different physical characteristics that influence the style of accretion,
1044 and the nature of the overriding plate is itself evolving. Examples of Phanerozoic and
1045 Mesozoic accretionary orogens include the Altaïds in central Asia (Wilhem et al., 2012),
1046 Tasmanides along the eastern margin of Gondwana (Glen, 2005) and the North
1047 American Cordillera (Johnston, 2001).

1048

1049 The along-strike variability nature of the margin in North America (see map from
1050 Hildebrand (2013) for an example) reminds us that modeling in cross section is a
1051 significant simplification of the true Earth. Three-dimensional dynamic models that
1052 include laterally varying structures in both the overriding and incoming plate are
1053 essential in trying to understand these complex structure observed on Earth.
1054
1055 Moresi et al. (2014) and Betts et al. (2015) developed 3D models of the accretion of
1056 plateaus, oceanic large igneous provinces, and continental ribbons. Their models trace
1057 the entire lifecycle of an accreting terrane from collision, to underthrusting/suturing,
1058 indentation into the overriding plate, and finally to the point where subduction re-starts
1059 with the terrane becoming part of the upper plate. A representative of such a model is
1060 illustrated in Figure 8 (A, B & D) and shows snapshots of the accretion of a small (125
1061 km radius, shown in cross section), medium (250 km) and large (500 km radius)
1062 buoyant anomaly representing an oceanic plateau (Moresi & Willis, 2015; Betts et al.,
1063 2015). In all of the simulations, the plateau dimension is a small fraction of the overall
1064 length of the convergent margin allowing the subduction system to evolve smoothly
1065 through the accretion event and recover.

1066
1067 The smallest plateau (125 km radius - shown with orange markers) is partly eroded from
1068 beneath and the remainder is accreted at the edge of the continental margin (Figure 8 A
1069 & D). The suture is vertical near the surface, then transitions to a dipping feature at
1070 depth. A small slab window forms as the plateau is stripped from the oceanic
1071 lithosphere. The dipping section of the suture is stripped away once subduction restarts

(in Figure 8D this occurs between 65 and 70 Myr). For both the larger plateaus, the structure of the suture is similar, but the buoyant material indents significantly inboard into the margin which undergoes shortening close to the indenter, lateral escape, and modest extension in the lithosphere adjacent to the collision forming an orocline in the overriding plate. The restarting of subduction behind the indenter is through a buckling of the oceanic lithosphere driven by the adjacent, intact slab and this buckling overturns the rear of the accreted terrane and entrains a small section of the oceanic crust. The original suture is inboard of the new slab and remains undisturbed in this case.

Figure 8. Three dimensional models of accretion of (A) a 250 km and (B) a 500 km radius oceanic plateau (shown with orange markers) into a deformable margin (snapshots of movies from Moresi & Willis (2015) showing only their marker surfaces). The oceanic plate is grey with a yellow strain-marker grid. The continental crust is dark blue with a light grid. Transitional crust is cyan with a grey grid. The indenting plateau is orange. The plate boundary is a purple dotted line. The dark, dashed line indicates the position of the trench at the onset of collision. The colored lines indicate the cross-sectional view of the pre-collision lower-plate lithosphere (green), the plateau (red), and the post-collision lower-plate lithosphere (blue). (C) shows the correspondence between the high-resolution 2D, thermal-mechanical models of Cooper & Miller (2014) and the compositional-mechanical 3D models. (D) is a cross section through the collision of a 125 km radius plateau showing all material elements (Betts et al., 2015) and illustrating a geometry similar to that of the Yakutat subduction and accretion.

The congestion of the subduction zone drives horizontal compression of the margin lithosphere ahead of the indenter/plateau similar to the geometry modeled by Cooper & Miller (2014) as shown in Figure 8C, and their analysis of the conditions for localized versus distributed deformation can be applied in the plane perpendicular to the collision. However, as the indenter/plateau also produces lateral extrusion of the lithosphere, there is significant strike-slip deformation which, when localization occurs, forms the classical escape-tectonics pattern of faulting (e.g., Tapponnier et al., 1982 and shown in Moresi et al., 2014). This has the potential to greatly complicate the analysis of a long-lived accretionary margin with multiple cycles of interpenetrating collision.

5.2 Examples from Australian Tasmanides and the Alaskan accretionary margin

To place these models in context, we briefly discuss two examples: 1) southeast Australia: the collision of the Selwyn block with the extensive, Paleozoic Gondwana accretionary margin (Figure 9) which has remained unmodified by a subsequent ocean

1110 closure (Foster & Gray, 2000); and 2) southern Alaska: the ongoing accretion of the
1111 Yakutat block in the eastern end of the Aleutian/Alaskan subduction zone (Figure 10).

1112

1113 The structural evolution of the accretion of the Selwyn block, and the associated
1114 Lachlan fold belt and orocline system in Australia has been extensively documented by
1115 Cayley (2011) and coworkers, and supports the dynamic framework for accretion
1116 outlined above. Recent observations of seismic anisotropy and interpretation of
1117 magnetic fabric, together with regional tomographic imaging further support the causal
1118 connection between the indentation of the Selwyn block, the associated fold belt, and
1119 the surrounding orocline (Rawlinson et al., 2014; Pilia et al., 2015).

1120

1121 Figure 9 shows a simplified geological map of the accreted Selwyn block (the northern
1122 tip of the VanDieland microcontinent as outlined in red in Figure 9C) showing the
1123 Lachlan orocline which is thought to be composed of the dissected remnants of the pre-
1124 accretion margin and arc. The curved, red arrow shows the approximate sense of
1125 motion of the tectonic escape during collision. Note the later (Devonian) arc that
1126 indicates where the subduction zone re-established itself post-accretion. The seismic
1127 evidence for the oroclinal fabric (Figure 9B) and the indented block (Figure 9C) is taken
1128 from Rawlinson et al. (2014) and Pilia et al. (2015), respectively.

Figure 9. (A) is a simplified regional tectonic map of the southern and central Tasmanides superimposed on a magnetic intensity map of eastern Australia (Moresi et al., 2014). The curved red arrow shows the sense of overall motion predicted by numerical models and inferred from the geological and geophysical interpretation of Cayley (2011). (B) the orientation of the seismic fast direction (dark red vectors) superimposed on magnetic data with an interpretation of the inferred fabric shown in blue (Rawlinson et al., 2014). (C) Seismic shear-wave velocity anomalies at 25 km from the regional tomographic model of Pilia et al. (2015) with their outline of the seismic signature of the Selwyn block at depth (red contour).

A modern example of collision of a buoyant plateau at a continental convergent margin is at the eastern end of the Aleutian subduction zone. This collision is the most recent in a series of accreted terranes that have formed the northern Cordillera (Figures 8 and 11C). This collision results in a section of flat-slab subduction due to the underthrusting of the

Yakutat Plateau (Eberhart-Phillips et al., 2006). The Yakutat terrane continues to actively collide with the margin, (Figure 10E: Freymueller et al., 2008), bisect the Chugach terrane and results in accentuating the curvature of the Alaskan orocline. Previous sutures have been reactivated in strike-slip deformation (Figure 10 C&D) and now form part of the orocline and associated lateral escape (Glen, 2004).

(E)

Figure 10. (A-C) Seismic discontinuity imaging from (Kim et al., 2014) in southern Alaska showing a profile (B-B') that cuts obliquely across the subducting portion of the Yakutat terrane. The interpreted seismic images show the low-velocity Pacific oceanic crust and the westernmost extent of the Yakutat terrane being subducted beneath the Chugach terrane on the North American plate. The arrows indicate the position of the Yakutat in both the GRT based images (see Kim et al., (2014) for details) and the stacked P receiver functions. (D) shows a simplified tectonic map of Alaska (Colpron et al., 2007) that highlights the long history of accretion, the present day orocline, and the dissection of the margin by the incoming Yakutat block. The yellow patch indicates the approximate extent of the subducted Yakutat crust from (Eberhart-Phillips et al., 2006) and the red line is the location of the profile (B-B') in the

left hand column (A-C). (Eberhart-Phillips et al., 2006). (E) Freymueller et al. (2008) block rotation model for the Alaskan syntaxis showing the Yakutat block indenter and the escape of material westward and southward.

P receiver functions results (Figure 10A-C) concentrated across the southern half of central Alaska effectively image the Yakutat Plateau offshore (Worthington et al., 2012; Christeson et al., 2013), through the forearc (including the Yakutat-Pacific boundary) (Kim et al., 2014), and northward below the Alaska Range and major strike-slip Denali Fault (Ferris et al., 2003; Rondenay et al., 2010; Brennan et al., 2011) illustrating sharp structures at quite fine resolution (a few kilometers).

As the models show in Figure 8, the slab can flatten and/or break off in response to congestion by anomalously buoyant crust. This will result in trench advance in this section. The majority of the subduction zone is not congested and will continue to subduct although with an enhanced tendency to retreat (a geometrical requirement to accommodate the escape of material from the collision). The Yakutat collision (Figure 10) appears to follow these general observations and has a similar morphology to the Lachlan orocline (Figure 9). Of particular note is that, in both cases, there has been considerable lateral movement of the previously-accreted terranes through re-activation of the original suture zones. If the Yakutat collision is typical of an accreting terrane, the present shallow-dipping, underthrust section associated with flat-slab subduction, would be highly modified and, presumably, detached from the colliding section of the terrane by strike-slip reactivation of the shallow suture (Denali Fault).

6. Conclusions and Suggestions for Future Work

There are some commonalities between modern accretion processes, the structures they produce and the structures preserved within older, cratonic lithosphere (Figure 8). In particular, modern accretion introduces features (Figure 10) reminiscent of the dipping structures observed in cratonic regions. It is interesting to note that a significant portion of deformation in modern accretion settings is accommodated by strike-slip motion which may not be captured in deeper lithospheric structure. Tracking anisotropy patterns, however, seems to be a way to locate the signature of accretion once the orogeny is complete. This approach may also be applicable for mapping out fabric associated with ancient orogenic events (e.g., Wirth & Long, 2014; Pilia et al., 2015). In addition, while vertical tectonics are still in operation on modern Earth (e.g., lithospheric drips in the western United States, see Zandt et al., 2004 and West et al., 2009), it is unclear as to whether these events are part of the accretionary process or a consequence of other controls on continental deformation. If the latter, these more modern events could also serve as modern analogues to test against the hypotheses of craton formation that invoke vertical tectonics.

Regardless, continued mapping of a more detailed view of the structure within continental lithosphere can help continue to determine the similarities between modern and ancient accretion as well as provide valuable information about the composition and rheology of cratonic lithosphere. Within models of lithospheric deformation, the structure produced is dependent on its material properties as well as the dynamic setting (Cooper et al., 2006; Gray et al., 2010; Cooper & Miller, 2014). Dipping

1225 structures are more indicative of localized deformation occurring in shear zones in
1226 strong lithosphere. Planar features result from distributed deformation in weaker
1227 lithosphere. Planar features could also be produced by melting events as described in
1228 the dynamics section. Placing the structural observations within the geodynamic
1229 context can help winnow the candidates for proto-cratonic lithosphere (i.e., buoyant
1230 oceanic lithosphere, arc lithosphere or potentially another unexplored option).

1231

1232 The observational similarities between modern and ancient lithosphere suggests that
1233 lateral accretion of lithospheric material played a role in craton formation especially
1234 when coupled with geodynamic models that demonstrate the processes that produce
1235 similar structures. However, whether this lateral motion was a consequence of fully
1236 developed plate tectonic behavior or of a potentially, unstable transition period between
1237 regimes still remains to be resolved. The transition from whichever early tectonic
1238 regime in operation in the early Earth to plate tectonics was most likely not
1239 instantaneous and probably tumultuous. Understanding this transition could help
1240 provide a solution for the observed differences between modern and ancient accretion.
1241 We do note that most of the geodynamic simulations for craton formation and/or
1242 continental collision during the early Earth are limited to the two-dimensional geometric
1243 framework. Further work would be advanced by exploring three-dimensional studies.

1244

1245 While the more complex structure of continental lithosphere does share similarities with
1246 modern accretion, there are still many unanswered questions, setting the stage for
1247 exciting avenues of future work. For example, modern accretion does not seem to

1248 produce as thick a lithosphere; why not? Is making thick lithosphere limited to the
1249 Archean and Proterozoic? If the proto-cratonic lithosphere is either buoyant oceanic or
1250 arc lithosphere, what are the steps of removing dense material while still maintaining the
1251 stability and thickness associated with the present day state of cratonic lithosphere?
1252 What would accretion in the early Earth look like if driven by weaker subduction zones
1253 as proposed by van Hunen & van den Berg (2008) or if it occurred as a consequence of
1254 the breakdown of the heat pipe regime (Moore & Webb, 2013)?
1255
1256 Another intriguing question is the ability for the lithosphere to retain or lose evidence of
1257 deformation. Cratonic lithosphere appears to have a long memory of past deformation.
1258 Is this dependent on unique material properties or the lack of exposure to additional
1259 deformation? Interestingly, younger lithosphere, at times, also retains evidence of past
1260 events. Recently, McKenzie et al. (2015) observed that when global lithospheric
1261 thickness maps were reconstructed to the configuration of Pangea that the thicker
1262 regions aligned in a continuous manner. This suggests that today's regions of thicker
1263 lithosphere (minus cratonic regions) are holding on to the evidence of the last
1264 continental collision. However, perplexingly, most of the observed mid-lithospheric
1265 discontinuities (MLDs) are in cratonic regions. Is this because younger lithosphere does
1266 not retain them as easily or because the deformation is accommodated differently?
1267 Furthermore, there is significant evidence that suture zones and other features are often
1268 reactivated in more modern settings (Holdsworth et al., 2001). Yet, if some of the
1269 observed structures in cratonic lithosphere are suture zones, what makes them resistant
1270 to reactivation? Does this indicate healing or lack of sufficient and/or appropriately

1271 oriented stresses? And does this connect to other pressing questions about craton
1272 stability such as why have some cratonic regions have deformed and been “destroyed”
1273 (Gao et al., 2004; Abdelsalam et al., 2011; Guo et al., 2016) while other seems to
1274 deflect deformation to their exteriors (e.g., Koptev, et al, 2015)?

1275

1276 We should note that there are other interpretations for the source of the mid-lithospheric
1277 discontinuities including phase transitions (Selway et al., 2015) or partial melting (Thybo
1278 & Perchuc, 1997) indicative of late stage (or near present day) modification to the
1279 continental lithosphere or grain boundary sliding (Selway et al., 2015; Karato et al.,
1280 2015). Regional studies, as proposed below, would help further delineate between
1281 these differing explanations for the mid-lithospheric discontinuities. Even if the
1282 presence and nature of the mid-lithospheric discontinuities prove to be less than
1283 relevant to the tectonic evolution story, there are plenty of other techniques, several of
1284 which mentioned, that can be used to investigate the deep structure of the continental
1285 lithosphere.

1286

1287 We can start addressing many of these unanswered and pressing questions with
1288 additional focused, regional studies of both cratonic and accretion settings that couple
1289 seismic imaging, gravity, and magnetotelluric studies. Similar approaches such as
1290 (Jones et al., 2002; Afonso et al., 2016) can help further identify and detail
1291 characteristics of modern and ancient deformation. Focus should also be made to
1292 chronicle the differences between cratonic lithosphere from different regions (both
1293 geochemically and seismologically). Too often it is tempting to group regions based on

1294 similarities into one conceptual model (such as in the cluster approach of Figure 1) and
1295 leave it at that. Perhaps, however, the differences in cratonic lithosphere may further
1296 highlight the processes at play during their formation and may suggest that not all
1297 cratonic lithosphere was formed in the same manner. Finally, we argue for continued
1298 collaboration between observationalists and geodynamicists. Some of the early
1299 mysteries of the Earth are trapped deep within the continents. We are moving closer to
1300 piecing the clues together, but it will certainly take a team effort.

1301

1302 **7. Acknowledgements**

1303

1304 We thank Erika Rader for providing a list of MLD locations, Andrew Schaeffer for
1305 providing his tomography model. We also thank Norm Sleep, Lydia DiCaprio and one
1306 anonymous reviewer for their comments, encouragement and insight during the review
1307 process. The authors would like to acknowledge support from: NSF EAR-1112820
1308 (Cooper), NSF CAREER grant EAR-1054638 (Miller), and Australian Research Council
1309 Discovery Grants: DP130101946 and DP150102887 (Moresi).

8. References

- Abdelsalam, M.G., Gao, S.S. & Liegeois, J.-P., 2011. Upper mantle structure of the Saharan Metacraton. *Journal of African Earth Sciences*, 60(5), pp.328–336.
- Abt, D.L., Fischer, K.M., French, S.W., Ford, H.A., Yuan, H. & Romanowicz, B., 2010. North American lithospheric discontinuity structure imaged by Ps and Sp receiver functions. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 115(B9). Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2009jb006914>.
- Afonso, J.C., Moorkamp, M. & Fullea, J., 2016. Imaging the Lithosphere and Upper Mantle. In *Geophysical Monograph Series*. pp. 191–218.
- Armann, M., Marina, A. & Tackley, P.J., 2012. Simulating the thermochemical magmatic and tectonic evolution of Venus's mantle and lithosphere: Two-dimensional models. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets*, 117(E12). Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2012je004231>.
- Arrial, P.-A. & Billen, M.I., 2013. Influence of geometry and eclogitization on oceanic plateau subduction. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 363, pp.34–43.
- Artemieva, I.M., 2009. The continental lithosphere: Reconciling thermal, seismic, and petrologic data. *Lithos*, 109(1-2), pp.23–46.
- Aulbach, S., 2012. Craton nucleation and formation of thick lithospheric roots. *Lithos*, 149, 16–30.
- BABEL Working Group, 1990. Evidence for early Proterozoic plate tectonics from seismic reflection profiles in the Baltic shield. *Nature*, 348(6296), pp.34–38.

- 1331 Bao, X., Song, X., & Li J., 2015. High-resolution lithospheric structure beneath Mainland China
1332 from ambient noise and earthquake surface-wave tomography. *Earth and Planetary*
1333 *Science Letters*, 417, pp.132–141.
- 1334 Bao, X., Eaton, D.W. & Guest, B., 2014. Plateau uplift in western Canada caused by lithospheric
1335 delamination along a craton edge. *Nature Geoscience*, 7(11), pp.830–833.
- 1336 Barrell, J., 1914. The Strength of the Earth's Crust. *The Journal of Geology*, 22(8), pp.729–741.
- 1337 Bastow, I.D., Thompson, D.A., Wookey, J., Kendall, J.-M., Helffrich, G., Synder, D.B., Eaton,
1338 D.W., & Darbyshire, F., 2010. Precambrian plate tectonics: Seismic evidence from northern
1339 Hudson Bay, Canada. *Geology*, 39(1), pp.91–94.
- 1340 Becker, T.W. & Boschi, L., 2002. A comparison of tomographic and geodynamic mantle models.
1341 *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 3(1). Available at:
1342 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2001gc000168>.
- 1343 Bédard, J.H., 2006. A catalytic delamination-driven model for coupled genesis of Archaean crust
1344 and sub-continental lithospheric mantle. *Geochimica et cosmochimica acta*, 70(5),
1345 pp.1188–1214.
- 1346 Bédard, J.H., Harris, L.B., & Thurston, P.C., 2013. The hunting of the snArch, *Evolving Early*
1347 *Earth*, 229, pp.20-48.
- 1348 Begg, G.C., Griffin, W.L., Natapov, L.M., O'Reilly, S.Y., Grand, S.P., O'Neill, C.J., Hronsky,
1349 M.A., Poudjom Djomani, Y., Swain, C.J., Deen, T., & Bowden, P., 2009. The lithospheric
1350 architecture of Africa: Seismic tomography, mantle petrology, and tectonic evolution.
1351 *Geosphere*, 5(1), pp.23–50.
- 1352 Betts, P.G., Giles, D., Lister, G., & Frick, L., 2002. Evolution of the Australian lithosphere.

- 1353 *Australian Journal of Earth Sciences*, 49(4), pp.661–695.
- 1354 Betts, P.G., Moresi, L.-N., Miller, M.S., & Willis, D., 2015. Geodynamics of oceanic plateau and
 1355 plume head accretion and their role in Phanerozoic orogenic systems of China. *Geoscience*
 1356 *Frontiers*, 6(1), pp.49–59.
- 1357 Betts, P.G., Giles, D. & Aitken, A., 2011. Palaeoproterozoic accretion processes of Australia and
 1358 comparisons with Laurentia. *International Geology Review*, 53(11-12), pp.1357–1376.
- 1359 Bostock, M.G., 1998. Mantle stratigraphy and evolution of the Slave province. *Journal of*
 1360 *Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 103(B9), pp.21183–21200.
- 1361 Brennan, P.R.K., Gilbert, H. & Ridgway, K.D., 2011. Crustal structure across the central Alaska
 1362 Range: Anatomy of a Mesozoic collisional zone. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*,
 1363 12(4). Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2011gc003519>.
- 1364 Burke, K., Kevin, B. & Kidd, W.S.F., 1978. Were Archean continental geothermal gradients
 1365 much steeper than those of today? *Nature*, 272(5650), pp.240–241.
- 1366 Calò, M., Bodin, T. & Romanowicz, B., 2016. Layered structure in the upper mantle across
 1367 North America from joint inversion of long and short period seismic data. *Earth and*
 1368 *Planetary Science Letters*, 449, pp.164–175.
- 1369 Cammarano, F., Tackley, P., & Boschi, L., 2011. Seismic, petrological and geodynamical
 1370 constraints on thermal and compositional structure of the upper mantle: global
 1371 thermochemical models. *Geophysical Journal International*, 187(3), 1301-1318.
- 1372 Carlson, R. W., Boyd, F. R., Shirey, S. B., P. E. Janney, T. L. Grove, S. A. Bowring, M. D.
 1373 Schmitz, J. C. Dann, D. R. Bell, J. J. Gurney, S. H. Richardson, M. Tredoux, A. H. Menzies,
 1374 D. G. Pearson, R. J. Hart, A. H. Wilson, D. Moser, 2000. Continental Growth, Preservation,

1375 and Modification in Southern Africa. *GSA today: a publication of the Geological Society of*
1376 *America*, 10(2), pp.1–7.

1377 Carlson, R.W., Pearson, D.G. & James, D.E., 2005. Physical, chemical, and chronological
1378 characteristics of continental mantle. *Reviews of Geophysics* , 43(1). Available at:
1379 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2004rg000156>.

1380 Cawood, P.A., Kröner, A., Collins, W.J., Kusky, T.M., Mooney, W.D., & Windley, B.F., 2009.
1381 Accretionary orogens through Earth history. *Geological Society, London, Special*
1382 *Publications*, 318(1), pp.1–36.

1383 Cayley, R.A., 2011. Exotic crustal block accretion to the eastern Gondwanaland margin in the
1384 Late Cambrian–Tasmania, the Selwyn Block, and implications for the Cambrian–Silurian
1385 evolution of the Ross, Delamerian, and Lachlan orogens. *Gondwana Research*, 19(3),
1386 pp.628–649.

1387 Chen, C.-W., Rondenay, S., Evans, R.L., & Snyder, D.B., 2009. Geophysical detection of relict
1388 metasomatism from an Archean (approximately 3.5 Ga) subduction zone. *Science*,
1389 326(5956), pp.1089–1091.

1390 Christeson, G.L., Van Avendonk, H.J.A., Gulick, S.P.S., Reece, R.S., Pavlis, G. & Pavlis, T.L.,
1391 2013. Moho interface beneath Yakutat terrane, southern Alaska. *Journal of Geophysical*
1392 *Research, [Solid Earth]*, 118(9), pp.5084–5097.

1393 Clowes, R.M., Cook, F., Hajnal, Z., Hall, J., Lewry, J., Lucas, S., and Wardle, R., 1999,
1394 Canada's LITHOPROBE Project (Collaborative, multidisciplinary geoscience research
1395 leads to new understanding of continental evolution): Episodes, v. 22, p. 3–20.
1396

1397 Colpron, M., Nelson, J.L., & Murphy, D.C., 2007. Northern Cordilleran terranes and their

1398 interactions through time. *GSA today: a publication of the Geological Society of America*,
1399 17(4), p.4.

1400 Cook, F.A., van der Velden, A., Hall, K., & Roberts, B., 1999. Frozen subduction in Canada's
1401 Northwest Territories: Lithoprobe deep lithospheric reflection profiling of the western
1402 Canadian Shield. *Tectonics*, 18(1), pp.1–24.

1403 Cooper, C.M., Lenardic, A., Levander, A., & Moresi, L.-N., 2006. Creation and preservation of
1404 cratonic lithosphere: Seismic constraints and geodynamic models. In *Geophysical*
1405 *Monograph Series*. pp. 75–88.

1406 Cooper, C.M. & Conrad, C.P., 2009. Does the mantle control the maximum thickness of
1407 cratons? *Lithosphere*, 1(2), pp.67–72.

1408 Cooper, C.M. & Miller, M.S., 2014. Craton formation: Internal structure inherited from closing of
1409 the early oceans. *Lithosphere*, 6(1), pp.35–42.

1410 Darbyshire, F.A. & Eaton, D.W., 2010. The lithospheric root beneath Hudson Bay, Canada from
1411 Rayleigh wave dispersion: No clear seismological distinction between Archean and
1412 Proterozoic mantle. *Lithos*, 120(1-2), pp.144–159.

1413 Davies, G.F., 1992. On the emergence of plate tectonics. *Geology*, 20(11), p.963.

1414 Davies, G.F., 2006, Gravitational depletion of the early Earth's upper mantle and the viability of
1415 early plate tectonics, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, (243), pp.376–382.

1416 Dewey, J.F., 2007. The secular evolution of plate tectonics and the continental crust: An outline.
1417 In *Geological Society of America Memoirs*. pp. 1–7.

1418 Dueker, K.G. & Sheehan, A.F., 1997. Mantle discontinuity structure from midpoint stacks of
1419 converted P to S waves across the Yellowstone hotspot track. *Journal of Geophysical*

- 1420   *Research, [Solid Earth]*, 102(B4), pp.8313–8327.
- 1421   Eakins, C. & Amante, B.W., 2009. *Etopo1: 1 Arc-Minute Global Relief Model: Procedures, Data*
 1422   *Sources and Analysis*, National Geophysical Data Center, NOAA. Available at:
 1423   [http://books.google.com/books/about/Etopo1_1_Arc_Minute_Global_Relief_Model.html?hl=](http://books.google.com/books/about/Etopo1_1_Arc_Minute_Global_Relief_Model.html?hl=&id=23MJywAACAAJ)
 1424   http://books.google.com/books/about/Etopo1_1_Arc_Minute_Global_Relief_Model.html?hl=&id=23MJywAACAAJ.
- 1425   Eaton, D. W., Darbyshire, F., Evans, R. L., Grütter, H., Jones, A. G., & Yuan, X., 2009. The
 1426   elusive lithosphere–asthenosphere boundary (LAB) beneath cratons. *Lithos*, 109(1), 1-22.
- 1427   Eaton, D.W. & Perry, H.K.C., 2013. Ephemeral isopycnicity of cratonic mantle keels. *Nature*
 1428   *geoscience*, 6(11), pp.967–970.
- 1429   Eberhart-Phillips, D., Christensen, D.H., Brocher, T.M., Hansen, R., Ruppert, N.A., Haeussler,
 1430   P.H., & Abers, G.A., 2006. Imaging the transition from Aleutian subduction to Yakutat
 1431   collision in central Alaska, with local earthquakes and active source data. *Journal of*
 1432   *Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 111(B11). Available at:
 1433   <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2005jb004240>.
- 1434   Farra, V. & Vinnik, L., 2000. Upper mantle stratification by P and S receiver functions.
 1435   *Geophysical Journal International*, 141(3), pp.699–712.
- 1436   Ferris, A., Abers, G.A., Christensen, D.H., & Veenstra, E., 2003. High resolution image of the
 1437   subducted Pacific (?) plate beneath central Alaska, 50–150 km depth. *Earth and Planetary*
 1438   *Science Letters*, 214(3-4), pp.575–588.
- 1439   Fischer, K.M., 2015. Crust and Lithospheric Structure - Seismological Constraints on the
 1440   Lithosphere-Asthenosphere Boundary. In *Treatise on Geophysics*. pp. 587–612.
- 1441   Fischer, K.M., Ford, H.A., Abt., D.L., & Rychert, C.A., 2010. The Lithosphere-Asthenosphere

- 1442 Boundary. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, 38(1), pp.551–575.
- 1443 Fishwick, S., 2010. Surface wave tomography: Imaging of the lithosphere–asthenosphere
1444 boundary beneath central and southern Africa? *Lithos*, 120(1-2), pp.63–73.
- 1445 Fishwick, S. & Rawlinson, N., 2012. 3-D structure of the Australian lithosphere from evolving
1446 seismic datasets. *Australian Journal of Earth Sciences*, 59(6), pp.809–826.
- 1447 Ford, H.A., Fischer, K.M., Abt, D.L., Rychert, C.A., & Elkins-Tanton, L.T., 2010. The
1448 lithosphere–asthenosphere boundary and cratonic lithospheric layering beneath Australia
1449 from Sp wave imaging. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 300(3-4), pp.299–310.
- 1450 Foster, D.A. & Gray, D.R., 2000. Evolution and Structure of the Lachlan Fold Belt (Orogen) of
1451 Eastern Australia. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, 28(1), pp.47–80.
- 1452 Fouch, M.J. & Rondenay, S., 2006. Seismic anisotropy beneath stable continental interiors.
1453 *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 158(2-4), pp.292–320.
- 1454 Francois, T., Burov, E., Meyer, B., & Agard, P., 2013, Surface topography as key constraint on
1455 thermo-rheological structure of cratons, *Tectonophysics*, 602, pp. 106-123.
- 1456 Frederiksen, A.W. & Bostock, M.G., 2000. Modelling teleseismic waves in dipping anisotropic
1457 structures. *Geophysical Journal International*, 141(2), pp.401–412.
- 1458 French, S., Lekic, V. & Romanowicz, B., 2013. Waveform tomography reveals channeled flow at
1459 the base of the oceanic asthenosphere. *Science*, 342(6155), pp.227–230.
- 1460 Freymueller, J.T., Woodard, H., Cohen, S., Cross, R., Elliot, J., Larsen, C., Hreinsdottir, S., &
1461 Zweck, C., 2008. Active deformation processes in Alaska, based on 15 years of GPS
1462 measurements. In *Geophysical Monograph Series*. pp. 1–42.

- 1463 Furnes, H., de Wit, M., Staudigel, H., Rosing, M., & Muehlenbachs, K., 2007. A Vestige of
1464 Earth's Oldest Ophiolite. *Science*, 315(5819), pp.1704–1707.
- 1465 Gaherty, J.B. & Jordan, T.H., 1995. Lehmann discontinuity as the base of an anisotropic layer
1466 beneath continents. *Science*, 268(5216), pp.1468–1471.
- 1467 Gao, S., Rudnick, R.L., Yuan, H.L., Liu, X.M., Liu, Y.S., Xu, W.L., Ayers, J., Wang, X.C., &
1468 Wang, Q.H., 2004. Recycling lower continental crust in the North China craton. *Nature*,
1469 432(7019), pp.892–897.
- 1470 Gilbert, H., Susan, B. & George, Z., 2006. Lithospheric and upper mantle structure of central
1471 Chile and Argentina. *Geophysical Journal International*, 165(1), pp.383–398.
- 1472 Glen, J.M.G., 2004. A kinematic model for the southern Alaska orocline based on regional fault
1473 patterns. In *Special Paper 383: Orogenic curvature: Integrating paleomagnetic and*
1474 *structural analyses*. pp. 161–172.
- 1475 Glen, R.A., 2005. The Tasmanides of eastern Australia. *Geological Society, London, Special*
1476 *Publications*, 246(1), pp.23–96.
- 1477 Gray, R., Robert, G. & Pysklywec, R.N., 2010. Geodynamic models of Archean continental
1478 collision and the formation of mantle lithosphere keels. *Geophysical Research Letters*,
1479 37(19). Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2010gl043965>.
- 1480 Griffin, W.L., O'Reilly, S.Y., Abe, N., Aulbach, S., Davies, R.M., Pearson, N.J., Doyle, B.J., &
1481 Kivi, K., 2003. The origin and evolution of Archean lithospheric mantle. *Precambrian*
1482 *Research*, 127(1-3), pp.19–41.
- 1483 Guo, Z., Afonso, J., Qashqai, M.T., Chen, & J.Y.S., 2016. Thermochemical structure of the
1484 North China Craton from multi-observable probabilistic inversion: Extent and causes of

1485 cratonic lithosphere modification. *Gondwana Research*, 37, pp.252–265.

1486 Gutenberg, B., 1948. On the layer of relatively low wave velocity at a depth of about 80
 1487 kilometers, *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America*, 38, pp. 121-148.

1488

1489 Gutscher, M.-A. Spakman, W., Bijwaard, H., & Engdahl, E., 2000. Geodynamics of flat
 1490 subduction: Seismicity and tomographic constraints from the Andean margin. *Tectonics*,
 1491 19(5), pp.814–833.

1492 Hales, A.L., 1969. A seismic discontinuity in the lithosphere. *Earth and Planetary Science*
 1493 *Letters*, 7(1), pp.44–46.

1494 Hammer, P.T.C., Clowes, R.M., Cook, F.A., van der Velden, A.J., & Vasudevan, K., 2010. The
 1495 Lithoprobe trans-continental lithospheric cross sections: imaging the internal structure of
 1496 the North American continent, Lithoprobe Publication 1487. *Canadian Journal of Earth*
 1497 *Sciences*, 47(5), pp.821–857.

1498 Hansen, S.M., Dueker, K. & Schmandt, B., 2015. Thermal classification of lithospheric
 1499 discontinuities beneath USArray. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 431, pp.36–47.

1500 Hildebrand. R.S., 2013, Mesozoic assembly of the North American Cordillera: *Geological*
 1501 *Society of America, Special Paper*, 495, 162p.

1502 Holdsworth, R.E., Stewart, M., Imber, J., & Strachan, R.A., 2001. The structure and rheological
 1503 evolution of reactivated continental fault zones: a review and case study. *Geological*
 1504 *Society, London, Special Publications*, 184(1), pp.115–137.

1505 Hopper, E., Ford, H.A., Fischer, K.M., Lekic, V. & Fouch, M.J., 2014. The lithosphere–
 1506 asthenosphere boundary and the tectonic and magmatic history of the northwestern United
 1507 States. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 402, pp.69–81.

1508 Hopper, E. & Fischer, K.M., 2015. The meaning of midlithospheric discontinuities: A case study
 1509 in the northern U.S. craton. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 16(12), pp.4057–
 1510 4083.

1511 Humphreys, E., 2009. Relation of flat subduction to magmatism and deformation in the western
 1512 United States. *Geological Society of America Memoirs*, 204(0), pp.85–98.

1513 Johnston, S.T., 2001. The Great Alaskan Terrane Wreck: reconciliation of paleomagnetic and
 1514 geological data in the northern Cordillera. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 193(3-4),
 1515 pp.259–272.

1516 Jones, A.G., Ferguson, I.J., Chave, A.D., Evans, R.L., & McNeice, G.W., 2001. Electric
 1517 lithosphere of the Slave craton. *Geology*, 29(5), p.423.

1518 Jones, A. G., Plomerova, J., Korja, T., Sodoudi, F., & Spakman, W., 2010. Europe from the
 1519 bottom up: a statistical examination of the central and northern European lithosphere–
 1520 asthenosphere boundary from comparing seismological and electromagnetic observations.
 1521 *Lithos*, 120(1), 14-29.

1522 Jones, A.G., Snyder, D., Hanmer, S., Asudeh, I., White, D., Eaton, D., & Clarke, G., 2002.
 1523 Magnetotelluric and teleseismic study across the Snowbird Tectonic Zone, Canadian
 1524 Shield: A Neoarchean mantle suture? *Geophysical Research Letters*, 29(17), pp.10–1–10–
 1525 4.

1526 Jordan, T. H., 1975. The continental tectosphere, *Reviews of Geophysics*, 13(3), 1–12,
 1527 doi:10.1029/RG013i003p00001.

1528 Jordan, T.H., 1978. Composition and development of the continental tectosphere. *Nature*,
 1529 274(5671), pp.544–548.

1530 Jordan, T. H., 1988. Structure and formation of the continental tectosphere. *Journal of Petrology*,
1531 (1), 11-37.

1532 Julià, J., Ammon, C.J., Herrmann, R.B., & Correig, A.M., 2000. Joint inversion of receiver
1533 function and surface wave dispersion observations. *Geophysical Journal International*,
1534 143(1), pp.99–112.

1535 Karato, S.-I., Olugboji, T., & Park, J., 2015. Mechanisms and geologic significance of the mid-
1536 lithosphere discontinuity in the continents. *Nature Geoscience*, 8(7), pp.509–514.

1537 Kay, R.W. & Kay, S.M., 1993. Delamination and delamination magmatism. *Tectonophysics*,
1538 219(1-3), pp.177–189.

1539 Kerrich, R. & Polat, A., 2006. Archean greenstone-tonalite duality: Thermochemical mantle
1540 convection models or plate tectonics in the early Earth global dynamics? *Tectonophysics*,
1541 415(1-4), pp.141–165.

1542 Kim, Y., Abers, G.A., Li, J., Christensen, D., Calkins, J., & Rondenay, S., 2014. Alaska
1543 Megathrust 2: Imaging the megathrust zone and Yakutat/Pacific plate interface in the
1544 Alaska subduction zone. *Journal of Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 119(3), pp.1924–
1545 1941.

1546 Koptev, A., Calais, E., Burov, E., Leroy, S., & Gerya, T., 2015. Dual continental rift systems
1547 generated by plume-lithosphere interaction. *Nature Geoscience*, 8(5), 388-392.

1548 Krystopowicz, N.J. & Currie, C.A., 2013. Crustal eclogitization and lithosphere delamination in
1549 orogens. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 361, pp.195–207.

1550 Kusky, T.M., Windley, B.F., Safonova, I., Wakita, K, Wakabayashi, J., Polat, A., & Santos, M.,
1551 2013. Recognition of ocean plate stratigraphy in accretionary orogens through Earth

1552 history: A record of 3.8 billion years of sea floor spreading, subduction, and accretion.
 1553 *Gondwana Research*, 24(2), pp.501–547.

1554 Langston, C.A., 1977, Corvallis, Oregon, crustal and upper mantle receiver structure from
 1555 teleseismic P and S waves: *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America*, v. 67, p. 713-
 1556 724,

1557 Laske, G., Masters, G. & Ma, Z., Update on CRUST1. 0—A 1-degree global model of Earth's
 1558 crust. In *Geophysical Research Abstracts*. EGU General Assembly. European Geophysical
 1559 Union, pp. EGU2013–2658.

1560 Lee, C.-T.A., 2006. Geochemical/petrologic constraints on the origin of cratonic mantle. In
 1561 *Geophysical Monograph Series*. pp. 89–114.

1562 Lee, C.-T.A., Luffi, P. & Chin, E.J., 2011. Building and Destroying Continental Mantle. *Annual*
 1563 *Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, 39(1), pp.59–90.

1564 Lehmann, I., 1961. S and the Structure of the Upper Mantle. *Geophysical Journal International*,
 1565 4, pp.124–138.

1566 Lekic, V. & Romanowicz, B., 2011. Tectonic regionalization without a priori information: A
 1567 cluster analysis of upper mantle tomography. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 308(1-
 1568 2), pp.151–160.

1569 Lekić, V., Vedran, L. & Fischer, K.M., 2014. Contrasting lithospheric signatures across the
 1570 western United States revealed by Sp receiver functions. *Earth and Planetary Science*
 1571 *Letters*, 402, pp.90–98.

1572 Lenardic, A., & Kaula, W. M., 1996. Near-surface thermal/chemical boundary layer convection
 1573 at infinite Prandtl number: two-dimensional numerical experiments. *Geophysical Journal*

- 1574   *International*, 126(3), 689-711.
- 1575   Lenardic, A., & Moresi, L. N., 1999. Some thoughts on the stability of cratonic lithosphere:
1576   effects of buoyancy and viscosity. *Journal of Geophysical Research [Solid Earth]*, 104(B6),
1577   12747-12758.
- 1578   Lenardic, A., Moresi, L. & Mühlhaus, H., 2000. The role of mobile belts for the longevity of deep
1579   cratonic lithosphere: The Crumple Zone Model. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 27(8),
1580   pp.1235–1238.
- 1581   Levander, A., Bezada, M.J., Niu, F., Humphreys, E.D., Palomeras, I., Thurner, S.M., Masy, J.,
1582   Schmitz, M., Gallart, J., Carbonell, R., & Miller, M.S., 2014. Subduction-driven recycling of
1583   continental margin lithosphere. *Nature*, 515(7526), pp.253–256.
- 1584   Levander, A. & Miller, M.S., 2012. Evolutionary aspects of lithosphere discontinuity structure in
1585   the western U.S. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 13(7). Available at:
1586   <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2012gc004056>.
- 1587   Levin, V. & Park, J., 2000. Shear zones in the Proterozoic lithosphere of the Arabian Shield and
1588   the nature of the Hales discontinuity. *Tectonophysics*, 323(3-4), pp.131–148.
- 1589   Lin, F.-C., Ritzwoller, M.H., & Snieder, R., 2009. Eikonal tomography: surface wave tomography
1590   by phase front tracking across a regional broad-band seismic array. *Geophysical Journal*
1591   *International*, 177(3), pp.1091–1110.
- 1592   Long, M.D. & Becker, T.W., 2010. Mantle dynamics and seismic anisotropy. *Earth and*
1593   *Planetary Science Letters*, 297(3-4), pp.341–354.
- 1594   Lyell, C., 1837. *Principles of Geology*.
- 1595   Magnani, M.B., Miller, K.C., Levander, A., & Karlstrom, K., 2004. The Yavapai-Mazatzal

1596 boundary: A long-lived tectonic element in the lithosphere of southwestern North America.
 1597 *Geological Society of America Bulletin*, 116(9), p.1137.

1598 McKenzie, D., Daly, M.C., & Priestley, K., 2015. The lithospheric structure of Pangea. *Geology*,
 1599 43(9), pp.783–786.

1600 Miller, M.S. & Agostinetti, N.P., 2011. Erosion of the continental lithosphere at the cusps of the
 1601 Calabrian arc: Evidence from S receiver functions analysis. *Geophysical Research Letters*,
 1602 38(23). Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2011gl049455>.

1603 Miller, M.S. & Eaton, D.W., 2010. Formation of cratonic mantle keels by arc accretion: Evidence
 1604 from S receiver functions. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 37(18). Available at:
 1605 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2010gl044366>.

1606 Mohorovičić, A., 1910. Potres od 8.X 1909. Jahrbuch des meteorologischen observatoriums in
 1607 Zagreb (Agram) für das Jahr 1909, 1–56. English translation, 1992. Earthquake of 1909
 1608 October 8. *Geofizika*, 9, 3–55.

1609

1610 Molnar, P., Houseman, G.A., & Conrad, C.P., 1998. Rayleigh-Taylor instability and convective
 1611 thinning of mechanically thickened lithosphere: effects of non-linear viscosity decreasing
 1612 exponentially with depth and of horizontal shortening of the layer. *Geophysical Journal*
 1613 *International*, 133(3), pp.568–584.

1614 Moore, W., 2001. The Thermal State of Io. *Icarus*, 154(2), pp.548–550.

1615 Moore, W.B. & Webb, A.A.G., 2013. Heat-pipe Earth. *Nature*, 501(7468), pp.501–505.

1616 Moresi, L.N., Betts, P.G., Miller, M.S., & Cayley, R.A., 2014. Dynamics of continental accretion.
 1617 *Nature*, 508(7495), pp.245–248.

- 1618 Moresi, L. N. & Solomatov, V.S., 1995. Numerical investigation of 2D convection with extremely
1619 large viscosity variations, *Physics of Fluids*, 7, 2154–2162.
- 1620 Moresi, L.N. & Willis, D., 2015. Time Dependent Behaviour of Congested Subduction. Available
1621 at: http://www.elementsmagazine.org/supplements/e11_2_Moresi_Willis_Movies.html.
- 1622 Müller, R.D., Sdrolias, M., Gaina, C. & Roest, W.R., 2008. Age, spreading rates, and spreading
1623 asymmetry of the world's ocean crust. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 9(4).
1624 Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2007gc001743>.
- 1625 Nokleberg, W.J., Parfenov, L.M., Monger, J.W.H., Norton, I.O., Khanchuk, A.I., Stone, D.B.,
1626 Scotese, C.R., Scholl, D.W., & Fujita, K., 2001. *Phanerozoic Tectonic Evolution of the*
1627 *Circum-North Pacific*, United States Geological Survey. Available at:
1628 <http://pubs.usgs.gov/pp/2000/1626/>.
- 1629 Nokleberg, W.J., Plafker, G. & Wilson, F.H., Geology of south-central Alaska. In *The Geology of*
1630 *Alaska*. pp. 311–366.
- 1631 O'Driscoll, L.J. & Miller, M.S., 2015. Lithospheric discontinuity structure in Alaska, thickness
1632 variations determined by Sp receiver functions. *Tectonics*, 34(4), pp.694–714.
- 1633 Oldow, J.S., Bally, A.W., Ave Lallemant, H.G. & Leeman, W.P., 1989. Phanerozoic evolution of
1634 the North American Cordillera; United States and Canada. In *The Geology of North*
1635 *America—An Overview*. pp. 139–232.
- 1636 Olsson, S., Roberts, R.G., & Böövarsson, R., 2007. Analysis of waves converted from S to P in
1637 the upper mantle beneath the Baltic Shield. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 257(1-2),
1638 pp.37–46.
- 1639 O'Neil, J., Carlson, R.W., Francis, D., & Stevenson, R.K., 2008. Neodymium-142 Evidence for

- 1640 Hadean Mafic Crust. *Science*, 321(5897), pp.1828–1831.
- 1641 O'Neill, C., Lenardic, A., Moresi, L.N., & Lee, C.-T. A., 2007. Episodic Precambrian subduction.
1642 *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 262(3-4), pp.552–562.
- 1643 O'Neill, C. & Debaille, V., 2014. The evolution of Hadean–Eoarchaeon geodynamics. *Earth and*
1644 *Planetary Science Letters*, 406, pp.49–58.
- 1645 O'Reilly, S.Y., Griffin, W.L., Poudjom Djomani, Y.H. & Morgan, P., 2001. Are Lithospheres
1646 Forever? Tracking Changes in Subcontinental Lithospheric Mantle Through Time. *GSA*
1647 *Today: a publication of the Geological Society of America*, 11(4), p.4.
- 1648 Parker, E.H., Jr., Hawman, R.B., Fischer, K.M., & Wagner, L.S., 2015. Constraining lithologic
1649 variability along the Alleghanian detachment in the southern Appalachians using passive-
1650 source seismology. *Geology*, 43(5), pp.431–434.
- 1651 Park, J. & Levin, V., 2002. Seismic Anisotropy: Tracing Plate Dynamics in the Mantle. *Science*,
1652 296(5567), pp.485–489.
- 1653 Parsons, B., Barry, P. & Sclater, J.G., 1977. An analysis of the variation of ocean floor
1654 bathymetry and heat flow with age. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 82(5), pp.803–827.
- 1655 Pasyanos, M.E., Masters, T.G., Laske, G., & Ma, Z., 2014. LITHO1.0: An updated crust and
1656 lithospheric model of the Earth. *Journal of Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 119(3),
1657 pp.2153–2173.
- 1658 Peacock, S.M., 1993. The importance of blueschist → eclogite dehydration reactions in
1659 subducting oceanic crust. *Geological Society of America bulletin*, 105(5), pp.684–694.
- 1660 Pearce, F.D., Rondenay, S., Sachpazi, M., Charalampakis, M. & Royden, L.H., 2012. Seismic
1661 investigation of the transition from continental to oceanic subduction along the western

1662 Hellenic Subduction Zone. *Journal of Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 117(B7).
 1663 Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2011jb009023>.

1664 Pearson, D.G., Carlson, R.W., Shirey, S.B., Boyd, F.R. & Nixon, P.H., 1995. Stabilisation of
 1665 Archaean lithospheric mantle: A ReOs isotope study of peridotite xenoliths from the
 1666 Kaapvaal craton. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 134(3-4), pp.341–357.

1667 Percival, J.A. & Pysklywec, R.N., 2007. Are Archean lithospheric keels inverted? *Earth and*
 1668 *Planetary Science Letters*, 254(3-4), pp.393–403.

1669 Pilia, S., Rawlinson, N., Cayley, R.A., Bodin, T., Musgrave, R., Reading, A.M., Direen, N.G., &
 1670 Young, M.K., 2015. Evidence of micro-continent entrainment during crustal accretion.
 1671 *Scientific Reports*, 5, p.8218.

1672 Polat, A. & Kerrich, R., 2006. Reading the geochemical fingerprints of Archean hot subduction
 1673 volcanic rocks: Evidence for accretion and crustal recycling in a mobile tectonic regime. In
 1674 *Geophysical Monograph Series*. pp. 189–213.

1675 Pollack, H.N., 1986. Cratonization and thermal evolution of the mantle. *Earth and Planetary*
 1676 *Science Letters*, 80(1-2), pp.175–182.

1677 Pollitz, F.F. & Mooney, W.D., 2016. Seismic velocity structure of the crust and shallow mantle of
 1678 the Central and Eastern United States by seismic surface wave imaging. *Geophysical*
 1679 *Research Letters*, 43(1), pp.118–126.

1680 Porritt, R.W., Miller, M.S., O'Driscoll, L., & Teofilo da Costa, L., 2016. Continent–arc collision in
 1681 the Banda Arc imaged by ambient noise tomography. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*,
 1682 449, pp.246–258.

1683 Porritt, R.W., Allen, R.M., Boyarko, D.C., & Brudzinski, M.R., 2011. Investigation of Cascadia

1684 segmentation with ambient noise tomography. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 309(1-
1685 2), pp.67–76.

1686 Porritt, R.W., Allen, R.M. & Pollitz, F.F., 2014. Seismic imaging east of the Rocky Mountains
1687 with USArray. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 402, pp.16–25.

1688 Porritt, R.W., Miller, M.S. & Darbyshire, F.A., 2015. Lithospheric architecture beneath Hudson
1689 Bay. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 16(7), pp.2262–2275.

1690 Poudjom Djomani, Y.H., O'Reilly, S.Y., Griffin, W.L., & Morgan, P., 2001. The density structure
1691 of subcontinental lithosphere through time. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 184(3-4),
1692 pp.605–621.

1693 Rader, E., Emry, E., Schmerr, N., Frost, D., Cheng, C., Menard, J., Yu, C.-Q., and Geist, D.,
1694 2015, Characterization and Petrological Constraints of the Midlithospheric Discontinuity:
1695 *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, v. 16, p. 3484-3504, 10.1002/2015GC005943.

1696 Rawlinson, N., Arroucau, P., Musgrave, R., Cayley, R., Young, M., & Salmon, M., 2014.
1697 Complex continental growth along the proto-Pacific margin of East Gondwana. *Geology*,
1698 42(9), pp.783–786.

1699 Rey, P.F., Coltice, N. & Flament, N., 2014. Spreading continents kick-started plate tectonics.
1700 *Nature*, 513(7518), pp.405–408.

1701 Richter, F.M., 1985. Models for the Archean thermal regime. *Earth and Planetary Science*
1702 *Letters*, 73(2-4), pp.350–360.

1703 Robin, C.M.I. & Bailey, R.C., 2009. Simultaneous generation of Archean crust and subcratonic
1704 roots by vertical tectonics. *Geology*, 37(6), pp.523–526.

1705 Rondenay, S, Bostock, M., Hearn, T.M., White, D.J., & Ellis, R.M., 2000. Lithospheric assembly

1706 and modification of the SE Canadian Shield: Abitibi-Grenville teleseismic experiment.
 1707 *Journal of Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 105(B6), pp.13735–13754.

1708 Rondenay, S., Bostock, M., & Fischer, K.M., 2005. Multichannel inversion of scattered
 1709 teleseismic body waves: Practical considerations and applicability. In *Geophysical*
 1710 *Monograph Series*. pp. 187–203.

1711 Rondenay, S., Montési, L.G.J., & Abers, G., 2010. New geophysical insight into the origin of the
 1712 Denali volcanic gap. *Geophysical Journal International*, 182(2), pp.613–630.

1713 Rudnick, R.L., 1995. Making continental crust. *Nature*, 378(6557), pp.571–578.

1714 Rudnick, R.L., McDonough, W.F. & O'Connell, R.J., 1998. Thermal structure, thickness and
 1715 composition of continental lithosphere. *Chemical Geology*, 145(3-4), pp.395–411.

1716 Rychert, C.A., Rondenay, S. & Fischer, K.M., 2007. P -to- S and S -to- P imaging of a sharp
 1717 lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary beneath eastern North America. *Journal of*
 1718 *Geophysical Research*, 112(B8). Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2006jb004619>.

1719 Rychert, C.A. & Shearer, P.M., 2009. A global view of the lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary.
 1720 *Science*, 324(5926), pp.495–498.

1721 Sandiford, M., Van Kranendonk, M.J., & Bodorkos, S., 2004. Conductive incubation and the
 1722 origin of dome-and-keel structure in Archean granite-greenstone terrains: A model based
 1723 on the eastern Pilbara Craton, Western Australia. *Tectonics*, 23(1). Available at:
 1724 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2002tc001452>.

1725 Sandu, C., Lenardic, A., O'Neill, C.J., & Cooper, C.M., 2011. Earth's evolving stress state and
 1726 the past, present, and future stability of cratonic lithosphere. *International Geology Review*,
 1727 53(11-12), pp.1392–1402.

- 1728 Sanns, W., 2012. Catastrophe Theory. In *Mathematics of Complexity and Dynamical Systems*.
1729 pp. 32–48.
- 1730 Savage, B., Brian, S. & Silver, P.G., 2008. Evidence for a compositional boundary within the
1731 lithospheric mantle beneath the Kalahari craton from S receiver functions. *Earth and*
1732 *Planetary Science Letters*, 272(3-4), pp.600–609.
- 1733 Savage, M.K., 1998. Lower crustal anisotropy or dipping boundaries? Effects on receiver
1734 functions and a case study in New Zealand. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, [Solid
1735 *Earth*], 103(B7), pp.15069–15087.
- 1736 Saygin, E., Erdinc, S. & Kennett, B.L.N., 2012. Crustal structure of Australia from ambient
1737 seismic noise tomography. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, [Solid Earth], 117(B1).
1738 Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2011jb008403>.
- 1739 Schaeffer, A.J. & Lebedev, S., 2013. Global shear speed structure of the upper mantle and
1740 transition zone. *Geophysical Journal International*, 194(1), pp.417–449.
- 1741 Schmandt, B. & Fan-Chi, L., 2014. P and S wave tomography of the mantle beneath the United
1742 States. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 41(18), pp.6342–6349.
- 1743 Schmandt, B. & Humphreys, E., 2010. Complex subduction and small-scale convection
1744 revealed by body-wave tomography of the western United States upper mantle. *Earth and*
1745 *Planetary Science Letters*, 297(3-4), pp.435–445.
- 1746 Schmandt, B. & Humphreys, E., 2011. Seismically imaged relict slab from the 55 Ma Siletzia
1747 accretion to the northwest United States. *Geology*, 39(2), pp.175–178.
- 1748 Schulte-Pelkum, V., Vera, S.-P. & Mahan, K.H., 2014. A method for mapping crustal
1749 deformation and anisotropy with receiver functions and first results from USArray. *Earth*

- 1750   *and Planetary Science Letters*, 402, pp.221–233.
- 1751   Selway, K., Heather, F. & Peter, K., 2015. The seismic mid-lithosphere discontinuity. *Earth and*
 1752   *Planetary Science Letters*, 414, pp.45–57.
- 1753   Shen, W., Ritzwoller, M.H. & Schulte-Pelkum, V., 2013. A 3-D model of the crust and uppermost
 1754   mantle beneath the Central and Western US by joint inversion of receiver functions and
 1755   surface wave dispersion. *Journal of Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 118(1), pp.262–
 1756   276.
- 1757   Shirey, S.B. & Richardson, S.H., 2011. Start of the Wilson cycle at 3 Ga shown by diamonds
 1758   from subcontinental mantle. *Science*, 333(6041), pp.434–436.
- 1759   Sigloch, K., 2011. Mantle provinces under North America from multifrequency P wave
 1760   tomography. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 12(2). Available at:
 1761   <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2010gc003421>.
- 1762   Silver, P.G. & Chan, W., 1988. Implications for continental structure and evolution from seismic
 1763   anisotropy. *Nature*, 335(6185), pp.34–39.
- 1764   Sizova, E., Gerya, T. & Brown, M., 2014. Contrasting styles of Phanerozoic and Precambrian
 1765   continental collision. *Gondwana Research*, 25(2), pp.522–545.
- 1766   Sizova, E., T. V. Gerya, K. Stüwe, and M. Brown, 2015. Generation of felsic crust in the
 1767   Archean: A geodynamic modeling perspective, *Precambrian Research*, 271, 198–224,
 1768   doi:10.1016/j.precamres.2015.10.005.
- 1769   Sleep, N.H., 2003b, Survival of Archean cratonic lithosphere, *Journal of Geophysical Research*,
 1770   *[Solid Earth]*, 108(B6). Available at <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2001JB000169>.
- 1771   Smart, K.A., Tappe, S., Stern, R.A., Webb, S.J., & Ashwal, L.D., 2016. Early Archaean tectonics

1772 and mantle redox recorded in Witwatersrand diamonds. *Nature Geoscience*, 9(3), pp.255–
1773 259.

1774 Steinberger, B. & Becker, T.W., 2016. A comparison of lithospheric thickness models.
1775 *Tectonophysics*. Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tecto.2016.08.001>.

1776 Tang, M., Chen, K. & Rudnick, R.L., 2016. Archean upper crust transition from mafic to felsic
1777 marks the onset of plate tectonics. *Science*, 351(6271), pp.372–375.

1778 Tapponnier, P., Le Peltzer, G., Le Dain, A.Y., & Cobbold, P.R., 1982. Propagating extrusion
1779 tectonics in Asia: New insights from simple experiments with plasticine. *Geology*, 10(12),
1780 p.611.

1781 Tetreault, J.L. & Buiter, S.J.H., 2012. Geodynamic models of terrane accretion: Testing the fate
1782 of island arcs, oceanic plateaus, and continental fragments in subduction zones. *Journal of*
1783 *Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 117(B8). Available at:
1784 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2012jb009316>.

1785 Tharimena, S., Rychert, C.A., & Harmon, N., 2016. Seismic imaging of a mid-lithospheric
1786 discontinuity beneath Ontong Java Plateau. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 450,
1787 pp.62–70.

1788 Thybo, H. & Perchuc, E., 1997. The Seismic 8degrees Discontinuity and Partial Melting in
1789 Continental Mantle. *Science*, 275(5306), pp.1626–1629.

1790 Turcotte, D.L., 1989. A heat pipe mechanism for volcanism and tectonics on Venus. *Journal of*
1791 *Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 94(B3), pp.2779–2785.

1792 Turcotte, D.L. & Oxburgh, E.R., 1967. Finite amplitude convective cells and continental drift.
1793 *Journal of Fluid Mechanics*, 28(01), p.29.

- 1794 Turcotte, D.L. & Schubert, G., 2002. *Geodynamics*, Cambridge University Press.
- 1795 van der Hilst, R. & Paul, M., 1994. Tectonic implications of tomographic images of subducted
1796 lithosphere beneath northwestern South America. *Geology*, 22(5), p.451.
- 1797 van Hunen, J. & Allen, M.B., 2011. Continental collision and slab break-off: A comparison of 3-D
1798 numerical models with observations. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 302(1-2), pp.27–
1799 37.
- 1800 van Hunen, J. & van den Berg, A.P., 2008. Plate tectonics on the early Earth: Limitations
1801 imposed by strength and buoyancy of subducted lithosphere. *Lithos*, 103(1-2), pp.217–235.
- 1802 van Hunen, J. & Moyen, J.-F., 2012. Archean Subduction: Fact or Fiction? *Annual Review of*
1803 *Earth and Planetary Sciences*, 40(1), pp.195–219.
- 1804 Vinnik, L.P., 1977. Detection of waves converted from P to SV in the mantle. *Physics of the*
1805 *Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 15(1), pp.39–45.
- 1806 Vogt, K. & Gerya, T.V., 2014. From oceanic plateaus to allochthonous terranes: Numerical
1807 modelling. *Gondwana Research*, 25(2), pp.494–508.
- 1808 Wagner, L., Forsyth, D.W., Fouch, M.J., & James, D.E., 2010. Detailed three-dimensional shear
1809 wave velocity structure of the northwestern United States from Rayleigh wave tomography.
1810 *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 299(3-4), pp.273–284.
- 1811 Watts, A. B., Zhong, S.J., & Hunter, J., 2013. The Behavior of the Lithosphere on Seismic to
1812 Geologic Timescales, *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Science*, 41(1), 443–468,
1813 doi:10.1146/annurev-earth-042711-105457.
- 1814 West, J. D., Fouch, M. J., Roth, J. B., & Elkins-Tanton, L. T., 2009. Vertical mantle flow
1815 associated with a lithospheric drip beneath the Great Basin. *Nature Geoscience*, 2(6), 439–

1816 444.

1817 Wilhem, C., Windley, B.F. & Stampfli, G.M., 2012. The Altaids of Central Asia: A tectonic and
 1818 evolutionary innovative review. *Earth-Science Reviews*, 113(3-4), pp.303–341.

1819 Wirth, E.A. & Long, M.D., 2014. A contrast in anisotropy across mid-lithospheric discontinuities
 1820 beneath the central United States--A relic of craton formation. *Geology*, 42(10), pp.851–
 1821 854.

1822 Wittlinger, G. & Farra, V., 2007. Converted waves reveal a thick and layered tectosphere
 1823 beneath the Kalahari super-craton. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 254(3-4), pp.404–
 1824 415.

1825 Wood, R., 2014. *Exploring the decoupling and removal of dense material during lithospheric*
 1826 *thickening as applicable to craton formation*. Master of Science in Geology. Washington
 1827 State University.

1828 Wortel, M.J. & Spakman, W., 2000. Subduction and slab detachment in the Mediterranean-
 1829 Carpathian region. *Science*, 290(5498), pp.1910–1917.

1830 Worthington, L.L., Van Avendonk, H.J.A., Gulick, S.P.S., Christeson, G.L., & Pavlis, T.L., 2012.
 1831 Crustal structure of the Yakutat terrane and the evolution of subduction and collision in
 1832 southern Alaska. *Journal of Geophysical Research, [Solid Earth]*, 117(B1). Available at:
 1833 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2011jb008493>.

1834 Yang, Y., Shen, W., & Ritzwoller, M.H., 2011. Surface wave tomography on a large-scale
 1835 seismic array combining ambient noise and teleseismic earthquake data. *Earthquake*
 1836 *Science*, 24(1), pp.55–64.

1837 Yuan, H. & Romanowicz, B., 2010. Lithospheric layering in the North American craton. *Nature*,

1838 466(7310), pp.1063–1068.

1839 Yuan, X. Kind, R., Li, X., & Wang, R., 2006. The S receiver functions: synthetics and data
 1840 example. *Geophysical Journal International*, 165(2), pp.555–564.

1841 Zandt, G., Gilbert, H., Owens, T. J., Ducea, M., Saleeby, J., & Jones, C. H., 2004. Active
 1842 foundering of a continental arc root beneath the southern Sierra Nevada in California.
 1843 *Nature*, 431(7004), 41–46.

1844 Zhu, H., Bozdog, E., & Tromp, J., 2012. Structure of the European upper mantle revealed by
 1845 adjoint tomography. *Nature Geoscience*, 5(7), pp.493–498.

1846

1847

1848

1849