Pieces of the Puzzle: Lack of Significant C₄ in the late Miocene of southern California

Chelsie N. Bowman ^{a,b,*}, Yang Wang ^{a,b}, Xiaoming Wang ^c, Gary T. Takeuchi ^d, Mark Faull ^e, David P. Whistler ^c, Stephen Kish ^a

^a Department of Earth, Ocean, & Atmospheric Sciences, Florida State University, Tallahassee, Florida 32306, USA,

^b National High Magnetic Field Laboratory, Tallahassee, Florida 32306, USA

^c Department of Vertebrate Paleontology, Natural History Museum of Los Angeles County, 900 Exposition Blvd., Los Angeles, CA 90007, United States

^d Department of Rancho La Brea, La Brea Tar Pits and Museum, 5801 Wilshire Boulevard, Los Angeles, CA 90036, United States

^e Red Rock Canyon State Park, California State Parks, P.O. Box 2406, Tehachapi, CA 93581, United States

*Corresponding author. *Email addresses:* cnb09@my.fsu.edu (C. N. Bowman), ywang@magnet.fsu.edu (Y. Wang)

Abstract

The stable carbon isotope ratios of tooth enamel from 89 herbivores from the Dove Spring Formation (DSF) of the El Paso Basin, western Mojave Desert, California were analyzed to determine if C₄ plants may have present in the late Miocene of southern California. Taxa analyzed include antilocaprids, castorids, camelids, equids, gomphotheriids, merycoidodontids, and rhinocerotids. The atmospheric CO₂-δ¹³C value has varied significantly in the geologic past, leading to changes in the δ¹³C values of plants and tooth enamel. The estimated δ¹³C value of atmospheric CO₂ in the middle to late Miocene is -5.8 ± 0.2 ‰, making the pure C₃ diet cutoff value higher than the modern by ~2 ‰. Given this, much of the evidence of an early spread of C₄, which inappropriately uses the modern C₃ diet cutoff value, may be a false signal from water-stressed C₃ plants and the amount of C₄ biomass in the geologic past may have been over-estimated. The enamel-δ¹³C values of all taxa sampled are -10.1 ± 1.1 ‰ (n=89). Accounting for the changes in the δ¹³C values of atmospheric CO₂, enamel-δ¹³C values from the DSF indicate that herbivores from that area had C₃ diets and lived in an environment dominated by C₃ plants.

Serial enamel isotope data from the DSF revealed negligible intra-tooth variations in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values, confirming that these herbivores consumed C_3 plants year-round. If the C_4 photosynthetic pathway did spread to southern California prior to the rapid, global rise in C_4 in the late Miocene, the taxa sampled did not incorporate C_4 biomass into their diets. The results of the stable carbon isotope analysis, along with the evidence from the rock record and the life habits of the fossil taxa present, indicate that the El Paso Basin consisted of diverse habitats including C_3 grasslands, wooded C_3 grasslands, and riparian forests.

Key Words

C_3/C_4 grasses, Mojave Desert, Carbon isotopes, Miocene, Herbivores, Dove Spring Formation

1. Introduction

C_4 grasses do not exist on all continents, at all latitudes, or at all altitudes, but favor conditions in which they have the competitive advantage over other plant life. Studies of modern plant distribution (e.g. Teeri and Stowe, 1976; Mulroy and Rundel, 1977; Tieszen et al., 1979, 1997; Ehleringer et al., 1997; Edwards et al., 2010) show that C_4 plants have a clear advantage over C_3 plants in habitats with high solar radiation, high day-time growing season temperatures, limited water availability, warm season precipitation, and cool season dryness. Grasses in general are new to geologic history. The initial transition from woody C_3 plants to C_3 grasses likely took place because grasses tend to have a higher tolerance to a wide range of soil factors and climatic extremes (Edwards et al., 2010). Influences such as herbivory and fires, which limit woody plant growth but sustain grasslands, likely played a role in this transition as well (Edwards et al., 2010).

During the Neogene there was a dramatic expansion of C_4 grasses (Cerling et al., 1997). The timing and mechanisms responsible for the expansion of C_4 grasses has been a topic of

considerable debate over the last two decades. Most studies agree that approximately 6-8 Ma, in the late Miocene, there was a rapid, global increase in C₄ ecosystems (e.g. Cerling et al. 1997; Tipple and Pagani, 2007; Edwards et al., 2010). This marks the global expansion of C₄ grasslands after the initial spread of C₃ grasslands in the Oligocene and early Miocene (MacFadden and Cerling, 1996; Cerling et al., 1998; Ehleringer et al., 1997; Latorre et al., 1997; Edwards et al., 2010; Feranec and Pagnac, 2013). Various hypotheses have been proposed to explain this ecological change (e.g. Quade et al., 1989; Cerling et al., 1993, 1997; Wang et al., 1994; Huang et al., 2007; Tipple and Pagani, 2007). Early papers on this topic focus solely on the global event as causing the first appearance of a significant amount of C₄ grasses in localities such as Pakistan (Quade et al., 1989, 1992; Morgan et al., 1994; Cerling et al., 1997), East Africa (Morgan et al., 1994; Cerling et al., 1997), and the Americas (Cerling et al., 1993, 1997; MacFadden et al., 1996; Wang et al., 1994). This event can be correlated nearly worldwide (e.g. Cerling et al., 1997). Although abundant evidence indicates that there was a worldwide, rapid increase in C₄ ecosystems in the late Miocene, there have been several instances where the isotopic signature of C₄ plants has been found in paleosol carbonates and fossil teeth prior to the global C₄ expansion in the late Miocene (Morgan et al., 1994; Fox and Koch, 2003; Fox et al., 2012; ; Cotton et al., 2012; Chen et al., 2015; Feranec and Pagnac, 2013; 2017). This suggests an earlier regional spread of C₄ grasses, although the timing of such an event is not well constrained. These studies suggest that a significant amount of C₄ grasses existed in ecosystems of the middle Miocene in southern California (Feranec and Pagnac, 2013; 2017), as well as Pakistan and Kenya (Morgan et al., 1994), and in the early and middle Miocene in the Great Plains (Fox and Koch, 2003; Fox et al., 2012).

There was likely a dichotomy to the causes that led to the spread of C₄ grasslands in the Miocene, with some factors affecting the spread on a regional scale and others on a global scale. On a global scale, the two hypotheses mentioned most often in recent literature to explain this rise in C₄ biomass are: 1) the decrease in atmospheric CO₂ levels (Ehleringer et al., 1991; Quade et al., 1992; Cerling et al., 1993, 1997, 1998; Wang et al., 1994; MacFadden et al., 1996; MacFadden and Cerling, 1996; Edwards et al. 2010) and 2) global climatic changes leading to the increased low-altitude aridity, fire disturbance, and/or changing seasonality of precipitation regimes (Latorre et al. 1997; MacFadden et al., 1996; MacFadden, 1997; Pagani et al., 1999; Tipple and Pagani, 2007). At low atmospheric CO₂ levels, C₄ plants are favored because of their ability to concentrate CO₂ in the bundle sheath cells while C₃ plants suffer from net photosynthetic loss due to photorespiration (Ehleringer, 2005; Tipple and Pagani, 2007). Most proxy data do not seem to indicate a significant drop in pCO₂ in the middle or late Miocene, which raises speculation on the validity of this hypothesis for the cause of the spread of C₄ grasses (e.g., Pagani et al., 1999; Pearson and Palmer, 2000; Retallack, 2001; Royer et al., 2001; Tipple and Pagani, 2007). Two recent studies (Kurschner et al., 2008; Tripathi et al., 2009), however, show that atmospheric pCO₂ levels may have been close to the C₃-C₄ crossover threshold (~500-550 ppm) during the middle to late Miocene. The possibility of global climatic changes as a cause for the spread of C₄ grasslands is not well explored in the literature and would be difficult to prove through proxy records. Additionally, Cerling et al. (1997) argued that high temperature alone would not be sufficient to cause the late Miocene global C₄ expansion because there have been other times in the geologic past with warm temperatures but no evidence of C₄ biomass.

At the regional level, there are a variety of causes that have been suggested for the spread of C₄ grasses (Tippie & Pagani, 2007; Edwards et al., 2010; Feranec & Pagnac, 2013). Tippie and Pagani (2007) suggest that increased aridity, wind strength, and fire cycles may be the cause of the early spread of C₄ grasslands as evidenced by increased deposition of windblown dust and charcoal in ocean basins. The regional spread of C₄ grasses may have also been driven by changes in seasonality (Wang and Deng, 2005).

Isotope evidence from the middle Miocene Barstow Formation (southern California), which is near where the samples in this study were collected both geographically and temporally, reveals an apparent dietary intake of up to 18% C₄ plants by large herbivores in the Barstovian Land Mammal Age (middle Miocene, Feranec and Pagnac, 2013). Feranec and Pagnac (2013) called for the analysis of additional sites that pre-date the global rise in C₄, particularly those of Clarendonian Land Mammal Age (middle to late Miocene), suggesting that data from herbivore tooth enamel from such sites might support the earlier regional spread of C₄ grasses. Knowing the abundance and geographic distribution of C₄ grasses prior to the late Miocene may help to discern the mechanism responsible for the global spread of C₄ ecosystems that took place between 6-8 million years ago (Feranec and Pagnac, 2013).

Here we examine the carbon isotope signatures of fossil tooth enamel of Clarendonian age herbivores of seven families—Antilocapridae, Camelidae, Castoridae, Equidae, Gomphotheriidae, Merycoidodontidae, and Rhinocerotidae—from the Dove Spring Formation of southern California to determine if they have an isotope signature indicative of the consumption of C₄ plants. The data are used to reconstruct the diets and environment of these herbivores and to determine if an early spread of the C₄ photosynthetic pathway took place in this region of southern California prior to the global C₄ expansion in the late Miocene (e.g. Cerling et al. 1997;

Feranec and Pagnac, 2013). The results shed new light on the debate over the timing and extent of the C₄ expansion in the late Neogene.

2. Background

2.1. Carbon isotope fractionation in plants and herbivore tooth enamel

Approximately 85% of terrestrial plants utilize the C₃ photosynthetic pathway, including trees, most shrubs, and cool growing season grasses (MacFadden and Cerling, 1994; Cerling et al., 1997; MacFadden, 1997; Edwards et al., 2010). Warm growing season grasses, sedges, and some halophytic shrubs, consisting of around 10% of terrestrial plants, use the C₄ photosynthetic pathway (MacFadden and Cerling, 1994; Cerling et al., 1997; MacFadden, 1997; Edwards et al., 2010). Crassulacean acid metabolism (CAM) is the third photosynthetic pathway and is relatively uncommon. CAM plants, which are composed primarily of succulents and cacti in arid environments, make up only 5% of terrestrial plants (MacFadden and Cerling, 1994; Latorre et al., 1997; Fox and Fisher, 2004).

Due in part to varying biochemical reactions during photosynthesis and in part to environmental factors, the three photosynthetic pathways fractionate the stable carbon isotopes to different degrees (Ehleringer and Monson, 1993; Cerling et al., 1997; Fox and Koch, 2003; Fox and Fisher, 2004; Tipple and Pagani, 2007). Modern C₃ plants have $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of -20 to -36 ‰, averaging -26.7 ± 2.3 ‰, while C₄ plants have $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values between -9 to -17 ‰, with an average of -12.5 ± 1.1 ‰ (Cerling et al., 1997; Tipple and Pagani, 2007; Kohn, 2010). The differences in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values for C₃ and C₄ plants can be explained by the affinity that the enzyme PEP-C, a key enzyme in C₄ photosynthesis, has for the heavier stable carbon isotope, ¹³C (Tipple and Pagani, 2007). Variation within the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of C₃ plants is primarily a function of environmental factors (Tipple and Pagani, 2007; Kohn, 2010). Water-stressed C₃ plants will tend to have higher

(or less negative) $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values, and thus, plants from open, savanna-like environments typically have higher $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values relative to those from closed-canopy forest environments (Ehleringer and Monson, 1993; Kohn, 2010). In C_4 plants, the range of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values is primarily due to the different variations or enzymatic subtypes of the C_4 photosynthetic pathway (Tippie and Pagani, 2007). CAM plants have $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values that range between and slightly overlap that of C_3 and C_4 plants (Fox and Koch, 2003). CAM plants will not be considered further, however, because they are rarely found outside of deserts and are not considered to be a food source for mammalian herbivores (Fox and Koch, 2003; Fox and Fisher, 2004; Feranec and MacFadden, 2006).

When plants are consumed by herbivores, there is an enrichment in the heavy carbon isotope, ^{13}C , as the carbon fixed in photosynthesis is incorporated into the animal tissue due to the biochemical fractionation of carbon isotopes. For large herbivores, there is an enrichment factor ($\epsilon_{\text{enamel-diet}}$) of +14.1 ‰ for enamel relative to diet (Cerling and Harris, 1999; Tippie and Pagani, 2007). The examination of tooth enamel is often the most reliable way to determine diet composition in animals because enamel is not easily altered during diagenesis due to its high density and low porosity (Wang and Cerling, 1994; Tippie and Pagani, 2007). As a result of the enrichment factor, the carbon isotopic signature of tooth enamel that would represent a C_3 diet typically ranges from -8 to -16 ‰ and a C_4 diet from 0 to +4 ‰ for modern herbivores (Cerling et al., 1997). In most studies, modern or not, an enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of -8 ‰ is used as the cut-off for a pure C_3 diet, with anything higher representing a measurable amount of C_4 plants being consumed (Cerling et al., 1993; Feranec and Pagnac, 2013). For large herbivores, this cut-off enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value corresponds to a diet- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of -22‰, reflecting a dietary intake of C_3 plants experiencing water stress (DeLucia and Schlesinger, 1991; Cerling et al., 1997; Ehleringer

et al., 1998; Kohn, 2010; Wang et al., 2008; Zhang et al., 2012). A $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of +2 ‰ is often used to represent the cut-off for a pure C_4 diet (Passey et al., 2002; Feranec and Pagnac, 2013).

Herbivore tooth enamel represents a spatially averaged carbon isotope signal that is also affected to some degree by selective feeding (MacFadden et al., 1996). Studies tend to focus on only one or a few taxa, rather than a survey of all or most of the local fauna, which has the potential to bias paleoenvironmental reconstructions of C_3/C_4 biomass ratios (Tipple and Pagani, 2007). Uncertainties also exist in using enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values to reconstruct the proportion of C_3 and C_4 plants in the diets of herbivores depending on what end-member $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values are used for pure C_3 and C_4 diets. For example, an enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of -8‰ could indicate either a C_3 diet consisting of water-stressed C_3 plants or consumption of a small amount of C_4 plants. However, the ambiguity in the interpretation of the carbon isotope data in terms of whether C_4 plants are a significant dietary component can be resolved by analyzing the isotopic compositions of serial enamel samples collected along the growth axes of individual teeth (Sharp and Cerling, 1998; Wang et al., 2008; Biasatti et al, 2010; 2012; Stacklyn et al., 2017). C_4 plants are primarily warm season grasses that can only grow in warm summer months in regions with sufficient summer precipitation (Ehleringer et al., 1991; Cerling et al., 1997). Thus, if C_4 plants are present in an environment, they are likely to appear as a seasonal signal in serially sampled tooth enamel (Sharp and Cerling, 1998; Wang et al., 2008; Biasatti et al, 2010). For herbivores consuming C_4 grasses, serial sample $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data are likely to show winters of C_3 consumption and summers of C_4 (or mixed C_3/C_4) consumption (Sharpe and Cerling, 1998; Wang et al., 2008; Biasatti et al, 2010).

The carbon in plants and enamel is derived from the atmosphere, as is the ratio of stable carbon isotopes (Feranec and MacFadden, 2006). The $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of atmospheric CO_2 has

decreased from -6.5 to -8.0 ‰ since the beginning of the Industrial Revolution due to the burning of fossil fuels (Tippie et al., 2010). Proxy records show that the concentration and the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of atmospheric CO_2 have changed over time (e.g. Pagani et al. 1999; Tippie et al., 2010), which would have affected the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of plants (e.g. Feng and Epstein, 1995; Schubert and Jahren, 2012) and ultimately tooth enamel (e.g. Passey et al., 2002). $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data from benthic foraminifera suggest that Miocene atmospheric CO_2 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values would have been even higher or more enriched in ^{13}C (Passey et al., 2002; Tippie et al., 2010). Without accounting for the changes in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of atmospheric CO_2 over geologic time, reconstruction of C_3/C_4 biomass from the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of enamel, and other means, could overestimate the amount of C_4 grasses in animals' diets and ecosystems.

2.2. Study Area

The Dove Spring Formation (DSF, formerly the Ricardo Formation), is located in the El Paso Mountains of southern California (Figure 1; Loomis and Burbank, 1988). The DSF is underlain by the dominantly volcanic middle Miocene Cudahy Camp Formation and overlain by Quaternary deposits representing bajadas and other unconsolidated sediment emanating from the Sierra Nevada mountains (Loomis and Burbank, 1988; Whistler et al., 2009). Whistler et al. (2009) broadly separated the DSF into five lithofacies from which depositional environments are interpreted. The first is comprised of clay, silt, fresh-water limestone, and bedded cherts, which are interpreted as lacustrine deposits. The second lithofacies is the sandstone and conglomerate that make up the cliffs that give Red Rock Canyon its name and are interpreted to be fluvial channel deposits. The third lithofacies is primarily silt, thought to be floodplain and overbank deposits. The fourth is composed of alluvial fan deposits or alluvial fan conglomerates. The fifth lithofacies is made up of paleosols, caliche, and silcretes.

The DSF contains 18 volcanic air-fall vitric ashes that have been correlated throughout the formation and at least 11 have been regionally correlated and radiometrically dated (Figure 2; Loomis and Burbank, 1988; Whistler et al., 2009). This allows the time of deposition of the DSF to be constrained to between 13.5 and 8.5 Ma, from Clarendonian to early Hemphillian, for members one through five and the lower third of member six (Whistler and Burbank, 1992; Whistler et al., 2009). Due to the poor exposure of member six, there are not as many reliable age dates associated with it (Loomis and Burbank, 1988). These ashes also serve as important chronostratigraphic event horizons used throughout the basin for correlation and outlining of fossil range zones (Whistler et al., 2009). These ashes were sourced from the southern Great Basin as well as the Yellowstone “Hot Spot” (Perkins et al., 1998; Perkins and Nash, 2002; Bonnichsen et al., 2008). The two basalt flow sequences, which lie within member four of the DSF, have a source in the Lava Mountains south of the Garlock fault in the Mojave block; the upper basalt sequence is the source of one of the most reliable radiometric age dates in the DSF (Whistler et al., 2009).

The DSF is known for having the most diverse vertebrate fossil assemblage of the southwestern United States, at least 88 genera in 37 families have been found and identified (Whistler et al., 2009; 2013), and the faunas within are largely of Clarendonian Land Mammal Age (Wood et al., 1941; Tedford et al., 1987; 2004). Fossils can be found throughout the formation but are most common in the silt deposits that characterize overbank and floodplain deposits and in the paleosols of member five (Whistler and Burbank, 1992; Whistler et al., 2009). Most fossils are found as a single element, whether it be bone or tooth, or a few associated pieces; partially articulated specimens are uncommon (Whistler et al., 2009). The Dove Spring Formation is also reported as the locality for the possible earliest C₄ macrofossil

(Nambudiri et al., 1978; Tidwell and Nambudiri, 1989) as evidenced by Kranz anatomy and carbon isotopes in plant phytoliths.

This study uses teeth of relatively large herbivores of only 7 of the 37 families present in the DSF: Antilocapridae, Castoridae, Camelidae, Equidae, Gomphotheriidae, Merycoidodontidae, and Rhinocerotidae. The fossil fauna present in the formation are primarily Clarendonian with some of the youngest being Hemphillian, younger than 9.0 Ma (Whistler et al., 2009). This study uses teeth found throughout the DSF. Only two samples were found stratigraphically high enough to be Hemphillian in age and 82 of the samples are Clarendonian age. Five samples have general stratigraphic localities which could denote either age. These fossil materials are an important archive of environmental changes in the southwestern United States. Reconstruction of the diets and habitats of fossil herbivores of the DSF fills in a gap in the global coverage of late Miocene C₄ expansion.

3. Methods

The carbon isotope ratios of 300 enamel samples from 89 fossilized herbivore teeth were analyzed. The fossilized teeth are primarily from the Clarendonian North American Land Mammal Age (12.5 to 9.0 Ma) in the middle and late Miocene of the Dove Spring Formation (Figure 2; Whistler et al., 2009). The teeth come from the camelids (camels and relatives), antilocaprids (North American “antelopes”), gomphotheriids (distantly related to elephants), equids (horses), merycoidodontids (oreodonts), castorids (beavers), and rhinocerotids (rhinoceroses).

Teeth were chosen in order to get permanent teeth (i.e. molars or premolars) from a wide variety of taxa. Bulk samples were taken by drilling along the growth axis of the tooth. Serial samples were taken by drilling in parallel bands perpendicular to the growth axis of the tooth.

The enamel samples were then chemically treated using a procedure adapted from Wang and Deng (2005). Any pieces of enamel incorporated into the powder produced by drilling were ground to powder using a mortar and pestle. Approximately 2-3 mg of enamel powder was soaked in 5% sodium hypochlorite (NaOCl) overnight to remove organic contaminants then rinsed with distilled water. The last rinse was done with 1 M acetic acid (CH₃COOH), the samples were then drained and soaked in 1 M acetic acid overnight to remove non-structural carbonate. The samples were then rinsed with distilled water until a neutral pH was achieved. The treated enamel samples were reacted with 100% phosphoric acid (H₃PO₄) for 72 hours at 25°C to generate carbon dioxide. The carbon and oxygen isotopic ratios of the carbon dioxide were then measured using a Gas Bench II Autocarbonate device connected to a Finnigan MAT Delta Plus XP stable isotope ratio mass spectrometer at Florida State University. All results are reported in standard delta (δ) notation with units reported as parts per thousand or permil (‰) relative to the V-PDB (Vienna Pee Dee Belemnite) standard as:

$$\delta^{13}\text{C} = [({}^{13}\text{C}/{}^{12}\text{C})_{\text{sample}}/({}^{13}\text{C}/{}^{12}\text{C})_{\text{VPDB}} - 1] \times 1000 \quad [1]$$

The analytical precision based on replicate analyses of NBS-19 and lab standards processed with each batch of samples is ±0.1‰ or better for δ¹³C.

For those teeth which were only sampled as serial samples, a proxy bulk sample-δ¹³C value was calculated for the specimen by averaging isotopic ratios of all of the serial samples for the tooth. The mean, standard deviation, and range were calculated for each of the serially-sampled teeth and for the bulk samples of the seven families analyzed in this study. For each specimen, we estimated the average diet-δ¹³C value for the herbivore using an enrichment factor (ε_{enamel-diet}) of +14.1‰ given in Cerling and Harris (1999) for large herbivores. The calculated value represents the average δ¹³C value of the plants each herbivore consumed during

the time that the hydroxyapatite in the tooth sampled was forming, not necessarily the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of the environment.

4. Results

The mean bulk enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of all taxa sampled in this study is -10.1 ± 1.1 ‰ (n=89, 1 S.D.) with values ranging from -13.3 to -6.7 ‰ and a total range of 6.7 ‰ when serial samples have been averaged as a proxy for bulk samples (Table 1). Most of the fossil taxa sampled in this study are most reliably identified to the family level because many are only known from a few disarticulated fossil elements, generally teeth and jaw bones, which are not always sufficiently diagnostic to determine a genus and species. Of the seven families sampled, the gomphotheriids have the lowest (most negative) enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values with a mean value of -11.0 ± 1.1 ‰ (n=24, 1 S.D.). The equids have a range of 4.5 ‰, which is the largest of any of the families sampled. The antilocaprids and equids have the highest enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values with mean values of -9.7 ± 0.9 ‰ (n=15, 1 S.D.) and -9.6 ± 0.9 ‰ (n=27, 1 S.D.), respectively.

Comparing the sampled families, two-tailed t-tests show that the mean bulk enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of most families are not significantly different from one another at a 95% confidence level. A subset of the t-tests that were run is presented in Table 2, including the only tests that showed a significant difference. The mean of the enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of the gomphotheriids are significantly different from those of the antilocaprids ($t=3.84$, $df=37$, $p=0.00047$), camelids ($t=3.38$, $df=37$, $p=0.0017$), and equids ($t=5.02$, $df=49$, $p<0.0001$). Possibly due to the fact that they had many fewer samples, the merycoidodontids were not found to be significantly different from any of the other families. The rhinocerotids and castorids were not included in the t-tests because there were very few samples from those families. Shapiro-Wilk normality tests were done on the five families included in the t-tests to determine the appropriateness of this statistical

measure. The distribution of enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values from each of the five families were normal at 95% confidence interval. Results of these tests are detailed in Supplementary Table 2.

Using the enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values and an enrichment factor (ϵ) of -14.1 ‰ given in Cerling and Harris (1999), we estimated the diet- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values for the DSF herbivores. The estimated diet- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values range from -27.3 to -20.7‰, with a mean of -24.1 ± 1.0 ‰ ($n=89$, 1 S.D.) (Table 1).

Of the 89 teeth sampled in this study, 18 were serially sampled (Figure 3). The serial samples come from six of the seven families sampled, including seven equid teeth, three each of camelid and gomphothere teeth, two each of antilocaprid and rhinoceros teeth, and one oreodont tooth. The serial samples allowed for the identification of seasonal variations in diet that may exist due to the varying growing seasons of C_3 and C_4 grasses (Sharpe and Cerling, 1998; Wang et al., 2008; Biasatti et al., 2010). Seasonal signals in serially sampled oxygen isotope data, while not discussed here, served as proof that there has been little to no diagenetic alteration of these enamel samples.

There is no notable seasonal signal present in the carbon isotope data of the serial samples (Figure 3). The mean intra-tooth variation of enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values in the 18 teeth is 0.9 ± 0.3 ‰. Samples LACM156567 and LACM55678, which were fossilized gomphotheriid and *Hipparion forcei* teeth, respectively, both have an intra-tooth variation of enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of 0.5 ‰, which is the lowest of the 18 teeth. The highest intra-tooth enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ variation is 1.5 ‰ in LACM146573, an antilocaprid sample identified as *Paracosoryx furlongi*.

The variation in intra-tooth $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values was larger compared to the intra-tooth $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ variability (Figure 3). Serial sampling of an assortment of the teeth—particularly the equids, camelids, and rhinocerotids—show a strong seasonal signal in the oxygen isotope data,

indicating that the enamel samples, and thus the carbon isotope data, have not been affected by diagenesis (Figure 3).

5. Discussion

5.1 Diets and habitats of herbivores of the Dove Spring Formation

The presence of C₄ grasses in this ecosystem during the middle to late Miocene would lend support to previous work that found measurable amounts of C₄ in the diets of herbivore taxa of the nearby Barstow Formation (Feranec and Pagnac, 2013; 2017) which is several million years older than the DSF. Evidence of C₄ grasses would also offer further support for the early regional spread of C₄ plants prior to the late Miocene worldwide rapid increase in C₄ ecosystems. The absence of C₄ in the diets of the herbivore taxa analyzed in this study would imply that either the grasslands in this area in the middle to late Miocene were C₃ grasslands (Morgan et al., 1994; Cerling et al., 1997) or selective feeding by herbivores on C₃ plants has prevented a C₄ carbon isotopic signal from appearing in the tooth enamel (Feranec and Pagnac, 2013). Selective feeding as a cause of the absence of C₄ seems unlikely, however, given the diversity of taxa sampled.

The enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of all taxa sampled in this study range from -13.3 to -6.7 ‰, with a mean of -10.1 ± 1.1 ‰ (n=89). If the modern cutoff enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of -8 ‰ for a pure C₃ diet was assumed to be applicable in the distant past as the end member for water-stressed C₃ plants (e.g. Feranec and Pagnac, 2013), these enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values would indicate that most herbivores had C₃ diets and only three individuals possibly consumed a small, but measurable, amount of C₄ plants (Figure 4). However, it has been well documented that the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of atmospheric CO₂, the carbon source for plants, has changed over time (e.g. Marino and McElroy, 1991; Passey et al., 2002; Tipple et al., 2010). These changes should have resulted in corresponding changes in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of plants and tooth enamel (Passey et al., 2002; Tipple

et al., 2010). Proxy atmospheric CO₂-δ¹³C records suggest that the δ¹³C values of atmospheric CO₂ during the time period of 8-13 Ma varied from -5.0 ‰ to -6.2 ‰ (Passey et al., 2002). After accounting for these changes in the carbon isotopic composition of atmospheric CO₂, an end-member enamel-δ¹³C value for water-stressed pure C₃ diets of -5.8 ± 0.2 ‰ was calculated for the time period represented by the DSF (~8-12.5 Ma) using -8 ‰ as the cutoff δ¹³C value for modern C₃ diets rather than -10.3 ‰ (Passey et al., 2002). The error of ± 0.2 ‰ given for this value represents an error attributable to temporal variations of the estimated δ¹³C value of atmospheric CO₂ during that time period. Given the value of -5.8 ‰ as the cutoff enamel-δ¹³C value for pure C₃ diets during this portion of the late Miocene, none of the herbivores sampled from the DSF consumed a measurable amount of C₄ plants (Figure 4).

Even disregarding that the cutoff enamel-δ¹³C value for a water stressed C₃ diet in the late Miocene was likely closer to -5.8 ‰ rather than -8 ‰, only 3 out of 300 enamel samples analyzed had an enamel-δ¹³C value higher than -8 ‰. These samples included LACM146616 (-7.8 ‰), the serial sample closest to the root of the tooth, and LACM146623 (-7.4 ‰), both from antilocaprid specimen identified as *Paracosoryx furlongi*, and LACM126135 (-6.7 ‰) from an equid specimen identified as *Megahippus* sp. It is highly unlikely that these three samples represent consumption of C₄ grasses. All three of these samples were from Member 2 of the DSF (Figure 2). *Paracosoryx furlongi* had hypsodont, or high-crowned, teeth and therefore would have been a grazer adapted to eating grasses, but that does not preclude from grazing on C₃ grasses. *Megahippus* sp., however, had brachydont, or low-crowned, teeth that would have been adapted to browsing and would have been worn down significantly by the consumption of grasses. As a likely browser, *Megahippus* sp. having the highest enamel-δ¹³C value is anomalous, this sample was a bulk sample from a complete tooth; perhaps this individual

survived on a diet of relatively water-stressed C₃ plants when this particular tooth was formed (during a drought year).

The antilocaprids are represented in the DSF by the genera *Cosoryx* and *Paracosoryx* as well as two other genera that were not identified in the specimen sampled for this study (Whistler et al., 2009). Their hypsodont teeth combined with the stable carbon isotope values (-9.7 ± 0.9 ‰, n=15) from samples in this family imply that these grazers were feeding on C₃ grasses. Camelids are represented by as many as four genera—*Hemiauchenia* sp., *Procamelus* sp., *Megatypolus* sp., and *Aepycamelus* sp.—in the Dove Spring Formation; the former two are thought to have been grazers, the latter two browsers (Whistler et al., 2009). The camelids are not able to be sufficiently identified by the isolated teeth and jaws that are common to the DSF and many of the specimens from this family that were sampled in this study were identified as ‘small,’ ‘medium,’ or ‘large,’ which may or may not be diagnostic of different genera. The enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values do not lend any diagnostic assistance in assigning the specimen sampled to different groups. Enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values for all of the samples were clustered around the mean at -9.9 ± 0.8 ‰ (n=15). With the mix of life habits present in this family, this would imply that the grazing genera, *Hemiauchenia* and *Procamelus*, were feeding on C₃ grasses. The castorids are only represented by one individual in this study, and the enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of that specimen is -10.2 ‰. This individual, an ancestor to the modern beaver, had hypsodont teeth (Sues, 2000) but is thought to have been a browser (Rybczynski, 2008).

The equids exemplified by six genera in the DSF, some of which have been identified to a species level. Taxa sampled in this study include *Megahippus* sp., *Cormohipparion* sp., *Pliohippus tantalus*, and *Hipparion forcei*, as well as some specimens that are only identified as equids. All of these genera, except *Megahippus*, are hypsodont (Sues, 2000) and assumed to be

391 primarily grazers. The enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of the equid specimens are $-9.6 \pm 0.9 \text{ ‰}$ ($n=27$) and
392 are clustered tightly around the mean with the exception of three outliers at -6.7 ‰ (*Megahippus*
393 sp.), -7.9 ‰ (unidentified equid), and -11.2 ‰ (*Hipparion forcei*). All of the enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values
394 are within the range for pure C_3 diets, suggesting that the equids in this area most likely grazed
395 on C_3 grasses. The unidentified equid with the enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of -7.9 ‰ was not discussed
396 previously as being higher than -8 ‰ because the difference between the values is within the
397 analytical uncertainty ($\pm 0.1 \text{ ‰}$) for carbon isotope analysis and was not considered to be
398 conclusive evidence of the inclusion of C_4 plants in the diet of this individual.

399 The gomphotheriids are represented by two genera in the DSF, *Gomphotherium* and
400 *Amebelodon* (Whistler et al., 2009). The enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of the gomphotheriids are $-11.0 \pm$
401 1.0 ‰ ($n=24$). This family has one of the largest ranges of carbon isotope values (4.3 ‰) of the
402 seven families sampled, second only to the equids (Table 1). The enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values range from
403 -9.0 to -13.3 ‰ . An enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of $\sim -13 \text{ ‰}$ in the Miocene is equivalent to a modern
404 value of $\sim -15 \text{ ‰}$ (given the difference in the carbon isotope composition of atmospheric CO_2
405 between the late Miocene and the present), which is typical of herbivores feeding on plants
406 grown in the understory of a forest. The plotted data appear as though they could represent two
407 groups, one centered around -10 ‰ and another centered around -13 ‰ (Figure 4). This seems to
408 be misleading, however, as members of both genera are present in the former and both
409 *Gomphotherium* and unidentified gomphotheres are present in the latter. Both genera are thought
410 to have been browsers or mixed feeders, but individuals with the low enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values may
411 have preferred the more forested habitats while the others the more open habitats.

412 The merycoidodontids are represented by one genus, *Merychyus*. The enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values
413 of the merycoidodontids are $-10.3 \pm 1.1 \text{ ‰}$ ($n=5$) and are all within the range for a pure C_3 diet.

Microwear studies of other Miocene oreodont teeth suggest that this genus was likely one of browsers and mixed feeders (Mihlbachler and Solounias, 2006). The rhinocerotids are represented by two genera in the DSF, *Aphelops* and *Teleoceras*. Only one individual from each genus was sampled with enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of -10.1 ‰ and -11.0 ‰, respectively, both values representing pure C_3 diets. *Aphelops* was a relatively long-limbed, brachydont rhino comparable to the modern day browsing black rhino (MacFadden, 1998). *Teleoceras* was a hypsodont, short-limbed rhino originally thought to be an amphibious grazer due to its hippo-like morphology (MacFadden, 1998). Based on enamel- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data from both *Aphelops* and *Teleoceras*, MacFadden (1998) suggested that neither was primarily aquatic, i.e., *Teleoceras* was most likely a mixed feeder or a C_3 grazer in this environment.

Further proof of a lack of C_4 plants in this ecosystem comes from the serial enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data from individual teeth (Figure 3) showing little or no intra-tooth carbon isotopic variations. In environments where C_4 biomass is being consumed, a seasonal change in diet would be expected because C_4 grasses are warm growing season grasses. This should result in a noticeable seasonal signal in the serially sampled enamel of grazers as they alternate between feeding on C_3 plants in cooler seasons and C_4 plants in warmer seasons (Sharpe and Cerling, 1998; Wang et al., 2008; Biasatti et al., 2010). The lack of significant variability in the stable carbon isotope data for the serial samples, particularly in the known grazers such as the equids and antilocaprids, lends further support for the inference from the bulk enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data that C_4 grasses were not present in this environment—or at the very least, C_4 grasses were not being consumed. The small amount of intra-tooth variability present in serial samples is more likely due to changes in water-stress and/or differences in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of different C_3 plants being consumed, rather than consumption of C_4 vegetation.

The reconstructed diet- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values for the DSF herbivores are $24.1 \pm 1.0\text{‰}$, varying from -27.3 to -20.7‰ . After accounting for changes in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of atmospheric CO_2 (Tippie et al., 2010), these values are equivalent to modern diet- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of -29 to -23‰ (averaging $-26 \pm 1\text{‰}$) and well within the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ range of modern C_3 plants (Kohn, 2010). The abundance of fluvial and lacustrine rocks in the DSF suggests the presence of a persistent lake in the center of the basin fed by ephemeral braided streams (Loomis and Burbank, 1988; Whistler et al., 2009). Aridity is a commonly cited cause in the literature for the early regional spread of C_4 grasses (e.g. Tippie and Pagani, 2007; Edwards et al., 2010; Feranec and Pagnac, 2013). However, the reconstructed $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of plants consumed by the DSF herbivores and the rock record, as well as the presence of fossil taxa such as castorids (beavers) and fish, all indicate that the El Paso Basin ecosystem was not particularly arid in the middle and late Miocene, in stark contrast to its present-day desert environment. The relatively large range of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values also suggests that the basin had a diverse range of habitats including riparian forests and open habitats such as grasslands and/or wooded grasslands.

5.2 Pieces of the Puzzle—The Dove Spring and Barstow formations

Feranec and Pagnac (2013) reported enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data from the Barstow Formation, which they interpreted as indicating that C_4 grasses had spread into southern California in the middle Miocene and supporting the hypothesis of an early regional spread of C_4 grasses prior to the late Miocene global C_4 expansion. The study used -8‰ as an enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ cutoff value for a pure C_3 diet and $+2\text{‰}$ as the cutoff value for a pure C_4 diet, with values in between representing a spectrum of partial C_4 consumption (Feranec and Pagnac, 2013). As a result of this selection of end-member enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values for pure C_3 and C_4 diets, Feranec and Pagnac (2013) find that up to 18% C_4 grasses were being consumed by ungulates in the paleoecosystem of the Barstow

Formation of southern California. They conclude that additional evidence from other localities with C₄ grasses earlier than late Miocene would provide support for local factors (e.g. aridity, fire) rather than a global factor (e.g. CO₂) as the driving mechanisms for the spread of C₄ grasses (Tippie and Pagani, 2007; Edwards et al., 2010; Feranec and Pagnac, 2013).

The Barstow Formation is middle Miocene in age (Tedford et al., 2004). The fossils analyzed by Feranec and Pagnac (2013) have an age range from ~ 14 to 13 Ma, and are several million years older than the late Miocene global C₄ expansion (Cerling et al., 1993; 1997). According to Feranec and Pagnac (2013), “paleoecosystems from the Clarendonian land mammal age seem particularly important” because they encompass the time period just prior to the global rise in C₄ and could support either an abrupt spread of C₄ biomass or a more gradual increase in abundance. As stated previously, the DSF is circa Clarendonian age and has yielded no evidence of a measurable amount of C₄ biomass from the enamel of the seven herbivore families sampled in this study or in previous studies (Cerling et al., 1997). This lends support to an abrupt spread of C₄ biomass in the late Miocene rather than a gradual increase in abundance. If there were indeed C₄ plants in the paleoecosystem of the Barstow Formation, as suggested by Feranec and Pagnac (2013), it is interesting that we can find no evidence in the DSF. The DSF is both geographically and temporally near the Barstow Formation in the Mojave Desert, only separated by the El Paso Mountains and a few 10’s of kilometers (Figure 1).

As discussed in the previous section, the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of atmospheric CO₂ has changed over time and was higher in the past than today (Tippie et al., 2010). The reconstructed $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of atmospheric CO₂ in the middle Miocene were even higher than those in the late Miocene (Passey et al., 2002; Tippie et al., 2010), suggesting that the maximum enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value for a pure C₃ diet could be as high as -5 ‰ (Figure 5). If the changes in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of

atmospheric CO₂ over time are taken into account so that an enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ cutoff value for C₃ diets appropriate for the middle Miocene is used, the enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of the ungulates of the Barstow Formation would be well within the range for a pure C₃ diet (Figure 5b). Thus, available enamel carbon isotope data, after accounting for changes in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of atmospheric CO₂, show no clear evidence of an early expansion of the C₄ photosynthetic pathway in southern California as suggested previously (Feranec and Pagnac, 2013). The next step would be to look for evidence of C₄ in paleoenvironments of Hemphillian age or younger in southern California to determine if C₄ plants were present in this area during the ‘global’ rapid increase in C₄ ecosystems. Presently, most plants in the Mojave desert are either C₃ or CAM plants due to a combination of the regional precipitation regime and the aridity (Teeri and Stowe, 1976; Mulroy and Rundel, 1977; Tieszen et al., 1979, 1997; Ehleringer and Monson, 1993; Ehleringer et al., 1997; Edwards et al., 2010). The question now becomes: have C₄ plants ever represented a significant portion of the biomass in southern California?

Tentative evidence of C₄ biomass has been found in the DSF, in the form of petrified grasses with Kranz anatomy (Nambudiri et al., 1978; Tidwell and Nambudiri, 1989), but its reliability is questionable. The original publication claimed that petrified C₄ grasses evidenced by both stable carbon isotope analysis and the presence of Kranz anatomy had been found in the Sperry Hills and Last Chance Canyon of the Ricardo Formation, now the DSF (Nambudiri, et al., 1978). The Sperry Hills, and related Sperry Wash, are actually south of Death Valley near the San Bernadino County line, not in Kern County, California where the DSF is located (Figure 1). Additionally, the Sperry Hills and Sperry Wash are latest Miocene to Pliocene or Pleistocene in age, not middle to late Miocene in age as is the DSF (Tidwell and Nambudiri, 1990). Also problematic is the fact that ‘Last Chance Canyon’ is not a locality name in the DSF but rather is

a local place name and encompasses a large stratigraphic range from the base of the DSF to the bottom of the lower basalt flow sequences, the top of Member 3. Just above what is considered to be Last Chance Canyon are steep slopes representing even younger strata within the Dove Spring Formation that these grasses also could have come from (Nambudiri et al., 1978). At best these findings represent the possibility of C₄ biomass in the El Paso Basin ecosystem even if no C₄ grasses were being consumed by the herbivores of that time, but the results are likely misleading due to the imprecise locality information available for the collection site of these petrified grasses.

6. Conclusions

In this study, the stable carbon isotopic composition of fossil herbivore tooth enamel from seven mammalian herbivore families was analyzed to determine if C₄ plants were present in the El Paso Basin of southern California in the middle to late Miocene. The enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of herbivores from the Miocene DSF are -10.1 ± 1.1 ‰ (n=89), ranging from -13.3 to -6.7 ‰. Calculations based on the reconstructed- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of paleo-atmospheric CO₂ and the modern cutoff enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of -8 ‰ for pure C₃ diets give an average $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ cutoff value for pure C₃ diets of -5.8 ± 0.2 ‰ for the time interval 8 – 12.5 Ma. This implies that previous studies using the modern cutoff enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of -8 ‰ as the end member value for a pure C₃ diet for Miocene herbivores most likely have overestimated the amount of C₄ in diets or yielded a false signal of C₄ presence. After accounting for the changes in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value of atmospheric CO₂, enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values from the DSF indicate that herbivores in the El Paso Basin in the middle and late Miocene had primarily C₃ diets and lived in an environment dominated by C₃ plants. The present-day El Paso Basin is a desert with sparse vegetation dominated by C₃ and CAM plants. The results of the stable carbon isotope analysis, along with the evidence from the rock record,

and the life habits of the fossil taxa present—both grazers and browsers—indicate a very different environment in this area during the middle and late Miocene. The carbon isotope data suggest that the environment in the El Paso Basin in the middle to late Miocene likely had a diversity of habitats ranging from C_3 grasslands or wooded C_3 grasslands to riparian forests.

The lack of seasonal signal in the carbon isotope data of the serial enamel samples from individual teeth provides further evidence that these herbivores consumed C_3 plants year round and that there were probably little to no C_4 grasses (warm season grasses) available for consumption in their habitats. The results from this study do not support an earlier regional C_4 expansion, prior to the rapid increase in global C_4 biomass in the late Miocene, in southern California. If the C_4 photosynthetic pathway did spread to southern California prior to the rapid increase in C_4 ecosystems in the late Miocene, it was not a significant food source as the various herbivore taxa sampled did not incorporate C_4 grasses into their diets.

Acknowledgements

We thank Bruce Barnett, Janine Giambalvo, Bill Parker, Leroy Odom, Jorge Natal, and Hilary Dennis for their valuable input and assistance with this project. This work was performed at the National High Magnetic Field Laboratory, which is supported by National Science Foundation Cooperative Agreement No. DMR-1157490 and the State of Florida.

The materials for this study were provided by the Department of Vertebrate Paleontology at the Natural History Museum of Los Angeles County (LACM). Thanks to Samuel A. McLeod and Vanessa R. Rhue of the LACM for providing loans of the materials studied herein. Fossil collecting was conducted under permits from the California State Department of Parks and Recreation and the United States Department of Interior, Bureau of Land Management. Forty-five years of field work was supported by the LACM and its Foundation with supplemental

support from various other granting agencies acknowledged in detail in Whistler and Burbank, 1992.

References

- Bonnichsen, B., Leeman, W.P., Honjo, N., McIntosh, W.C., and Godchaux, M.M., 2008. Miocene silicic volcanism in southwestern Idaho: geochronology, geochemistry, and evolution of the central Snake River Plain. *Bulletin of Volcanology*, 70, 1407-1418.
- Biasatti, D., Wang, Y., and Deng, T., 2010. Strengthening of the East Asian summer monsoon revealed by a shift in seasonal patterns in diet and climate after 2-3 Ma in northwest China. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 297, 12-25.
- Biasatti, D., Wang, Y., Gao, F., Xu, Y., Flynn, L., 2012. Paleoecologies and Paleoclimates of Cenozoic Mammals from Southwest China: Evidence from Stable Carbon and Oxygen Isotopes. *Journal of Asian Earth Sciences*, 44, 48-61.
- Cerling, T., Wang, Y., and Quade, J., 1993. Expansion of C₄ ecosystems as an indicator of global ecological change in the late Miocene. *Nature*, 361, 344-345.
- Cerling, T. E., Harris, J. M., and MacFadden, B. J., 1997. Carbon isotopes, diets of North American equids, and the evolution of North American C₄ grasslands. In H. Griffiths (Ed.), *Stable isotopes: Integration of biological, ecological, and geochemical processes*, 363-379. Oxford: Bios Scientific Publishers.
- Cerling, T.E., Harris, J., MacFadden, B., Leakey, M., Quade, J., Eisenmann, V., and Ehleringer, J.R., 1997. Global vegetation change through the Miocene/Pliocene boundary. *Nature*, 389, 153-158.

574 Cerling, T.E., Ehleringer, J.R., and Harris, J.M., 1998. Carbon dioxide starvation, the
 575 development of C₄ ecosystems, and mammalian evolution. *Philosophical Transactions of*
 576 *the Royal Society of London*, 353, 159-171.

577 Cerling, T.E., and Harris, J.M., 1999. Carbon isotope fractionation between diet and bioapatite in
 578 ungulate mammals and implications for ecological and paleoecological studies.
 579 *Oecologia*, 120, 347-363.

580 Chen, S.T., Smith, S.Y., Sheldon, N.D., Stromberg, C.A.E., 2015. Regional-scale variability in
 581 the spread of grasslands in the late Miocene. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol* 437, 42-52.

582 Cotton, J.M., Sheldon, N.D., 2012. High-resolution isotopic record of C₄ photosynthesis in a
 583 Miocene grassland. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol* 337, 88-98.

584 DeLucia, E.H., Schlesinger, W.H., 1991. Resource-use efficiency and drought tolerance in
 585 adjacent Great Basin and Sierran plants. *Ecology*, 72, 51–58.

586 Edwards, E., Osborne, C., Stromberg, C., and Smith, S., 2010. The Origins of C₄ Grasslands:
 587 Integrating Evolutionary and Ecosystem Science. *Science*, 328, 587-591.

588 Ehleringer, J.R., Sage R.F., Flanagan L.B., and Pearcy R.W., 1991. Climate change and the
 589 evolution of C₄ photosynthesis. *Trends Ecology and Evolution*, 6, 95-99.

590 Ehleringer, J.R., and Monson, R.K., 1993. Evolutionary and ecological aspects of photosynthetic
 591 pathway variation. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics*, 24, 411-439.

592 Ehleringer, J.R., Cerling, T.E., and Helliker, B.R., 1997. C₄ photosynthesis, atmospheric CO₂,
 593 and climate. *Oecologia*, 112, 285-299.

594 Ehleringer, J.R., Rundel, P.W., Palma, B., Mooney, H.A., 1998. Carbon isotope ratios of
 595 Atacama Desert plants reflect hyperaridity of region in northern Chile. *Rev Chil Hist Nat*
 596 71, 79–86

597 Feng, X., and Epstein, S., 1995. Carbon isotopes of trees from arid environments and
 598 implications for reconstructing atmospheric CO₂ concentration. *Geochimica et*
 599 *Cosmochimica Acta*, 59 (12), 2599-2608.

600 Feranec, R.S., and MacFadden, B.J., 2006. Isotopic discrimination of resource partitioning
 601 among ungulates in C₃-dominated communities from the Miocene of Florida and
 602 California. *Paleobiology*, 32, 191-205.

603 Feranec, R.S., and Pagnac, D., 2013. Stable carbon isotope evidence for the abundance of C₄
 604 plants in the middle Miocene of southern California. *Palaeogeography*,
 605 *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology*, 388, 42-47.

606 Feranec, R.S., and Pagnac, D., 2017. Hypsodonty, horses, and the spread of C₄ grasses during the
 607 middle Miocene in southern California. *Evolutionary Ecology Research*, 18, 201-223.

608 Fox, D.L., and Koch, P., 2003. Tertiary history of C₄ biomass in the Great Plains, USA.
 609 *Geology*, 31, 809-812.

610 Fox, D.L., and Fisher, D.C., 2004. Dietary reconstruction of Miocene *Gomphotherium*
 611 (Mammalia, Proboscidea) from the Great Plains region, USA, based on the carbon
 612 isotope composition of tusk and molar enamel. *Palaeogeography*, *Palaeoclimatology*,
 613 *Palaeoecology*, 206, 311-335.

614 Fox, D.L., Honey, J., Martin, R., and Pelaez-Campomanes, P., 2012. Pedogenic carbonate stable
 615 isotope record of environmental change during the Neogene in the southern Great Plains,
 616 southwest Kansas, USA: Carbon isotopes and the evolution of C₄-dominated grasslands.
 617 *Geological Society of America Bulletin*, 124, 444-462.

618 Huang, Y., Clemens, S., Li, W., Wang, Y., and Prell, W., 2007. Large-scale hydrological change
 619 drove the late Miocene C₄ plant expansion in the Himalayan foreland and Arabian

620 Peninsula. *Geology*, 35, 531-534.

621 Kohn, M.J., 2010. Carbon isotope compositions of terrestrial C₃ plants as indicators of
622 (paleo)ecology and (paleo)climate. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of*
623 *the United States of America*, 107, 19691-19695.

624 Kurschner, W.M., Kvacek, Z., and Dilcher, D.L., 2008. The impact of Miocene atmospheric
625 carbon dioxide fluctuations on climate and the evolution of terrestrial ecosystems.
626 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 105,
627 449-453.

628 Lambert, W.D., and Shoshani, J., 1998. The Proboscidea, *in* Janis, C., Scott, K.M., and Jacobs,
629 L., eds., *Evolution of Tertiary Mammals of North America*, v. 1: New York, Cambridge
630 University Press, 606-622.

631 Latorre, C., Quade, J., and McIntosh, W.C., 1997. The expansion of C₄ grasses and global
632 change in the late Miocene: Stable isotope evidence from the Americas. *Earth and*
633 *Planetary Science Letters*, 146, 83-96.

634 Loomis, D., and Burbank, D., 1988. The stratigraphic evolution of the El Paso basin, southern
635 California: Implications for the Miocene development of the Garlock fault and uplift of
636 the Sierra Nevada. *Geological Society of America Bulletin*, 100, 12-28.

637 MacFadden, B.J., and Cerling, T.E., 1994. Fossil horses, carbon isotopes, and global change.
638 *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, 9, 481-486.

639 MacFadden, B.J., and Cerling, T.E., 1996. Mammalian herbivore communities, ancient feeding
640 ecology, and carbon isotopes: A 10 million-year sequence from the Neogene of Florida.
641 *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology*, 16, 103-115.

642 MacFadden, B.J., Cerling, T.E., and Prado, J., 1996. Cenozoic terrestrial ecosystem evolution in

643 Argentina: Evidence from carbon isotopes of fossil mammal teeth. *Palaios*, 11, 319-327.
 644 MacFadden, B.J., 1997. Origin and evolution of the grazing guild in New World terrestrial
 645 mammals. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, 12, 182-187.
 646 MacFadden, B.J., 1998. Tale of two Rhinos: Isotopic Ecology, Paleodiet and Niche
 647 Differentiation in *Aphelops* and *Teleoceras* from the Florida Neogene. *Paleobiology*, 24,
 648 274-286.
 649 MacFadden, B.J., Solounias, N., and Cerling, T.E., 1999. Ancient diets, ecology, and extinction
 650 of 5-million-year-old horses from Florida. *Science*, 283, 824-827.
 651 Marino, B.D., and McElroy, M.B., 1991. Isotopic composition of atmospheric CO₂ inferred from
 652 carbon in C₄ plant cellulose. *Nature*, 349, 127-131.
 653 Muhlbachler, M.C., and Solounias, N., 2006. Coevolution of Tooth Crown Height and Diet in
 654 Oreodonts (Merycoidodontidae, Artiodactyla) Examined with Phylogenetically
 655 Independent Contrasts. *Journal of Mammalian Evolution*, 13 (1), 11-36.
 656 Morgan, M.E., Kingston, J.D., and Marino, B.D., 1994. Carbon isotopic evidence for the
 657 emergence of C₄ plants in the Neogene from Pakistan and Kenya. *Nature*, 367, 162-165.
 658 Mulroy, T.W., and Rundel, P.W., 1977. Annual plants: adaptations to desert environments.
 659 *Bioscience*, 27, 109-114.
 660 Nambudiri, E.M.V., Tidwell, W.D., Smith, B.N., and Hebbert, N.P., 1978. A C₄ plant from the
 661 Pliocene. *Nature*, 276, 816-817.
 662 Pagani, M., Arthur, M.A., and Freeman, K.H., 1999. Late Miocene atmospheric CO₂
 663 concentrations and the expansion of C₄ grass. *Science*, 285, 876-878.

664 Passey, B.H., Cerling, T.E., Perkins, M.E., Voorhies, M.R., Harris, J.M., and Tucker, S. T.,
 665 2002. Environmental Change in the Great Plains: An Isotopic Record from Fossil Horses.
 666 The Journal of Geology, 110, 123-140.

667 Pearson, P., and Palmer, M., 2000. Atmospheric carbon dioxide concentrations over the past 60
 668 million years. Nature, 406, 69-699.

669 Perkins, M.E., Brown, H.F., Nash, B.P., McIntosh, W., and Williams, S.K., 1998. Sequence, age,
 670 and source of silicic fallout tuffs in the middle to late Miocene basins of the northern
 671 Basin and Range Province. Geological Society of America Bulletin, 110, 344-360.

672 Perkins, M.E., and Nash, B.P., 2002. Explosive silicic volcanism of the Yellowstone hotspot: the
 673 ash fall tuff record. Geological Society of America Bulletin, 114, 367-381.

674 Quade, J., Cerling, T.E., and Bowman, J., 1989. Development of Asian monsoon revealed by
 675 marked ecological shift during the latest Miocene in northern Pakistan. Nature, 342, 163-
 676 166.

677 Quade, J., Cerling, T.E., Barry, J.C., Morgan, M.E., Pilbeam, D.R., Chivas, A.R., and van der
 678 Merwe, N.J., 1992. A 16-Ma record of paleodiet using carbon and oxygen isotopes in
 679 fossil teeth from Pakistan. Chemical Geology, 94, 183-192.

680 Retallack, G., 2001. A 300-million-year record of atmospheric carbon dioxide from fossil
 681 cuticles. Nature, 411, 287-290.

682 Royer, D., Wing, S., Beerling, D., Jolley, D., Koch, P., Hickey, L., and Berner R., 2001.
 683 Paleobotanical evidence for near present-day levels of atmospheric CO₂ during part of the
 684 Tertiary. Science, 292, 2310-2313.

685 Rybczynski, N, 2008. Woodcutting behavior in beavers (Castoridae, Rodentia): estimating
 686 ecological performance in a modern and a fossil taxon. Paleobiology, 34(3),389-402.

Schubert, B.A., and Jahren, A.H., 2012. The effect of atmospheric CO₂ concentration on carbon isotope fractionation in C₃ land plants. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 96, 29-43.

Sharpe, Z.D., and Cerling, T.E., 1998. Fossil isotope records of seasonal climate and ecology: Straight from the horse's mouth. *Geology*, 26, 219-222.

Stacklyn, S., Wang, Y., Jin, C., Wang, Y., Sun, F., Zhang, C., Jiang, S., Deng, T., 2017. Carbon and oxygen isotopic evidence for diets, environments and niche differentiation of early Pleistocene pandas and associated mammals in South China. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*. 468, 351–361.

Sues, H.D., 2000. Evolution of Herbivory in Terrestrial Vertebrates: Perspectives from the fossil record: New York, Cambridge University Press, 257 p.

Tedford, R.H., Albright, L.B., III, Barnosky, A.D., Ferrusquía-Villafranca, I., Hunt, R.M., Jr., Storer, J.E., Swisher, C.C., III, Voorhies, M.R., Webb, S.D., and Whistler, D.P., 2004. Mammalian biochronology of the Arikareean through Hemphillian interval (Late Oligocene through Early Pliocene Epochs). In *Late Cretaceous and Cenozoic Mammals of North America*, ed. M.O. Woodburne, New York, Columbia University Press, 169-231.

Tedford, R.H., Galusha, T., Skinner, M.F., Taylor, B.E., Fields, R.W., Macdonald, J.R., Rensberger, J.M., Webb, S.D., and Whistler, D.P., 1987. Faunal succession and biochronology of the Arikareean through Hemphillian interval (Late Oligocene through earliest Miocene epochs) in North America. In *Cenozoic mammals of North America, geochronology and biostratigraphy*, ed. M.O. Woodburne, Berkeley, University of California Press, 153-210.

709 Teeri, J., and Stowe, L., 1976. Climatic patterns and the distribution of C₄ grasses in North
710 America. *Oecologia*, 23, 1-12.

711 Tidwell, W.D., and Nambudiri, E.M.V., 1989. *Tomlinsonia Thomassonii*, gen. et sp. nov., A
712 permineralized grass from the Upper Miocene Ricardo Formation, California. Review of
713 Palaeobotany and Palynology, 60, 165-177.

714 Tidwell, W.D., and Nambudiri, E.M.V., 1990. *Tomlinsonia Stichkania* sp. nov., A
715 permineralized grass from the Pliocene to (?)Pleistocene China Rance Beds in Sperry
716 Wash, California. *Botanical Gazette*, 151, 263-274.

717 Tieszen, L.L., Senyimba, M.M., Imbamba, S.K., and Troughton, J.H., 1979. The distribution of
718 C₃ and C₄ grasses along an altitudinal and moisture gradient in Kenya. *Oecologia*, 37,
719 337-350.

720 Tieszen, L.L., Reed, B.C., Bliss, N.B., Wylie, B.K., and DeJong, D.D., 1997. NDVI, C₃ and C₄
721 production, and distributions in Great Plains grassland land cover classes. *Ecological*
722 *Applications*, 7, 59-78.

723 Tipple, B.J., and Pagani, M., 2007. The Early Origins of Terrestrial C₄ Photosynthesis. *Annual*
724 *Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, 35, 435-461.

725 Tipple, B.J., Meyers, S.R., and Pagani, M., 2010. Carbon isotope ratio of Cenozoic CO₂: A
726 comparative evaluation of geochemical proxies. *Paleoceanography*, 25, 1-11.

727 Tripathi, A.K., Roberts, C.D., and Eagle, R.A., 2009. Coupling of CO₂ and ice sheet stability over
728 major climate transitions of the last 20 million years. *Science*, 326, 1394-1397.

729 Wang, Y., Cerling, T. E. and MacFadden, B. J., 1994. Fossil horses and carbon isotopes: new
730 evidence for Cenozoic dietary, habitat, and ecosystem changes in North America.
731 *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 107, 269-279.

732 Wang, Y., and Cerling, T. E., 1994. A model of fossil tooth and bone diagenesis: implications for
733 paleodiet reconstruction from stable isotopes. *Palaeogeography, Paleoclimatology,*
734 *Paleoecology*, 107, 281-289.

735 Wang, Y., and Deng, T., 2005. A 25 m.y. isotopic record of paleodiet and environmental change
736 from fossil mammals and paleosols from the NE margin of the Tibetan Plateau. *Earth and*
737 *Planetary Science Letters*, 236, 322-338.

738 Wang, Y., Kroumhout, E., Zhang, C., Xu, Y., Parker, W., Deng, T., and Qiu, Z., 2008. Stable
739 isotopic variations in modern herbivore tooth enamel, plants, and water on the Tibetan
740 Plateau: Implications for paleoclimate and paleoelevation reconstructions.
741 *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 260, 359-374.

742 Whistler, D.P., and Burbank, D.W., 1992. Miocene biostratigraphy and biochronology of the
743 Dove Spring Formation, Mojave Desert, California, and characterization of the
744 Clarendonian land mammal age (late Miocene) in California. *Geological Society of*
745 *America Bulletin*, 104, 644-658.

746 Whistler, D.P., Takeuchi, G.T, Groves, L.T. , and Wang, X., 2013. Western Mojave Desert
747 Geology and Vertebrate Paleontology with Special Emphasis on the Dove Spring
748 Formation, Field Trip Guidebook Society of Vertebrate Paleontology 73rd Annual
749 Meeting, Los Angeles, California. Los Angeles, Natural History Museum of Los Angeles
750 County, 68 p.

751 Whistler, D.P., Tedford, R.H., Takeuchi, G.T., Wang, X., Tseng, Z., and Perkins, M.E., 2009.
752 Revised Miocene biostratigraphy and biochronology of the Dove Spring Formation,
753 Mojave Desert, California. *Museum of Northern Arizona Bulletin*, 65, 331-362.

754 Wood, H.E., Chaney, R.W., Clark, J., Colbert, E.H., Jepsen, G.L., Reeside, J.B., Jr., and Stock,
755 C., 1941. Nomenclature and correlation of the North American continental Tertiary.
756 Bulletin of the Geological Society of America 52, 1-48.

757 Zhang, C., Wang, Y., Li, Q., Wang, X., Deng, T., Tseng, Z., Takeuchi, G., Xie, G., Xu, Y.,
758 2012. Diets and environments of late Cenozoic mammals in the Qaidam Basin, Tibetan
759 Plateau: evidence from stable isotopes. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 333-334,
760 70-82.

List of Tables:

Table 1. Summary statistics of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data for the seven large herbivore families from the Dove Spring Formation, southern California.

Table 2. Results of two-tailed t-test for unpaired data with equal variance for significant differences between mean isotopic values of different herbivore families from the Dove Spring Formation, southern California. df: degrees of freedom, t: t-value, p: t probability

List of Figures:

Figure 1. Locality map showing the location of the Dove Spring Formation, the Barstow Formation, and the Sperry Hills in southern California.

Figure 2. Simplified stratigraphic column of the Dove Spring Formation denoting the positions of the 18 ash beds, numbered to the left of the column, correlated throughout the formation (see Loomis and Burbank, 1988 and Whistler et al., 2009 for detailed discussion of stratigraphy). Radiometric age dates (Whistler et al., 2009 and references therein) are to the left of the numbered ash beds, the * indicates those dates coming from the basalt flows that define the upper and lower boundaries of Member 4. Relative stratigraphic positions of the samples analyzed in this study are denoted under Approximate Fossil Location. (Adapted from Whistler et al., 2009.)

Figure 3. Intra-tooth carbon and oxygen isotopic variations in four of the serially sampled teeth from the Dove Spring Formation, southern California. Lack of seasonal signal in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data gives further evidence that no C_4 grasses were being consumed in this environment in the middle to late Miocene. The pronounced seasonal signal in the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data make it unlikely that the enamel samples have been affected by diagenesis.

Figure 4. $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of tooth enamel from the seven herbivore families examined in this study. Each circle represents a bulk sample or an averaged serial sample value with 89 total. The blue shaded area below -5.8 ‰ represents all carbon isotopic values that correspond to a middle to late Miocene pure C_3 diet, the additional line at -8 ‰ represents the modern cutoff value for pure C_3 diets (see text for explanation).

Figure 5. Reconstructions of (a) $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of atmospheric CO_2 (red) with 90% confidence intervals (green) from Tipple et al. (2010), and (b) enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values for average C_3 , water-stressed C_3 and average C_4 diets, with the width of the curve corresponding to the 90% confidence intervals in (a). Also shown are the means and ranges of enamel- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of herbivores from Dove Spring Formation (this study) and Barstow Formation (Feranec and Pagnac, 2013).

Table 1

Taxon	Common Name	N	Mean $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ (‰)	S. D. (‰)	Range (‰)
Antilocapridae	Antelope	15	-9.7	0.9	-7.4 to -10.7
Camelidae	Camel	15	-9.9	0.8	-8.6 to -11.1
Castoridae	Beaver	1	-10.2	-	-
Equidae	Horse	27	-9.6	0.9	-6.7 to -11.2
Gomphotheriidae	Elephant	24	-11	1	-9.1 to -13.3
Merycoidodontidae	Oreodont	5	-10.3	1.1	-8.9 to -11.6
Rhinocerotidae	Rhino	2	-10.6	0.7	-10.1 to -11.0
Herbivore Overall		89	-10.1	1.1	-6.7 to -13.3
Estimated Diet			-24.2	1	-20.8 to -27.4

Table 2

	Mean difference (‰)	df	t	p
Antilocapridae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs. Merycoidodontidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$	0.6	18	1.18	0.25
Equidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs. Antilocapridae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$	-0.1	40	-0.26	0.79
Equidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs. Camelidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$	0.3	40	1.12	0.26
Equidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs. Gomphotheriidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$	1.4	49	5.02	<.0001
Equidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs. Merycoidodontidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$	0.7	30	1.53	0.14
Gomphotheriidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs. Antilocapridae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$	1.3	37	3.84	0.00047
Gomphotheriidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs. Camelidae- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$	1	37	3.38	0.0017

List of Tables:

Table 1. Summary statistics of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data for the seven large herbivore families from the Dove Spring Formation, southern California.

Table 2. Results of two-tailed t-test for unpaired data with equal variance for significant differences between mean isotopic values of different herbivore families from the Dove Spring Formation, southern California. df: degrees of freedom, t: t-value, p: t probability