**Paleoecology and paleoenvironmental implications of turritelline gastropod-dominated assemblages
from the Gatun Formation (Upper Miocene) of Panama**

Brendan M. Anderson^{1,2}, Austin Hendy^{3,4}, Erynn H. Johnson⁵, Warren D. Allmon^{1,2}

ABSTRACT

Turritelline-dominated assemblages (TDAs) frequently occur in the middle-late Miocene Gatun Formation, and are not uncommon features in the broader fossil record. By gaining a better understanding of the paleoenvironment and taphonomic processes leading to their formation we can gain insight into the conditions in the Western Atlantic (WA) during the Miocene shoaling of the Central American Seaway, as well as the conditions which may lead to TDA formation generally. TDA and non-TDA beds within the Gatun were examined for shell orientation, sclerobiont coverage, drilling predation frequency, and peeling-repair frequency, in addition to sediment composition. The most abundant species, *T. altilira*, was also examined using oxygen isotopic sclerochronology to compare growth rate and conditions during the formation of TDA and non-TDA beds. Mean annual range of temperature (MART) was found to be 6.2°C, with a moderate associated negative O-C correlation. These data confirm the influence of Tropical Eastern Pacific (TEP) upwelling waters in the WA at this time. Upwelling conditions were found to be associated with all *T. altilira*, regardless of their source, indicating that Gatun TDAs are not the result of variation in nutrient supply. Orientation data from within a TDA, grain size, and sclerobiont coverage all suggest that TDAs in the Gatun are the result of variation in sediment supply/winnowing. *T. altilira* was found to live up to 3 years, growing between 50 and 60 mm in the first year of life with a subsequent decline in growth rate. We used the Theoretical Apex System and a calculated minimum number of individuals to determine location and frequency of drilling predation.

1. INTRODUCTION

The Neogene biological and oceanographic history of the Central American Isthmus region, particularly as represented in the middle-late Miocene Gatun Formation (c. 12-9 Ma), has long been of paleontological interest (e.g. Leigh et al., 2014; Toulou, 1909; Woodring, 1957, 1966), as this formation is richly fossiliferous and provides a record of marine life prior to the closure of the Central American Seaway (CAS). The closure of the CAS produced numerous changes in the physical environment in the Western Atlantic (WA), including changes in temperature, salinity, and productivity, while upwelling and related productivity remained approximately similar in the Tropical Eastern Pacific (TEP) after closure of the CAS (Allmon, 2001; Allmon et al., 1996; Hayes et al., 1989; Jackson and Budd, 1996; Jackson and O'Dea, 2013; Leigh et al., 2014; Lessios, 2008; Maier-Reimer et al., 1990; O'Dea et al., 2016; Todd et al., 2002). These changes were associated with substantial biological turnover in the WA demonstrating a dramatic change in nutrient regime (Allmon, 2001; Jackson and Johnson, 2000; Leigh et al., 2014; O'Dea et al., 2016; Smith and Jackson, 2009; Todd et al., 2002).

Despite the abundant evidence for these changes, details of their geographic and oceanographic context remain controversial. Recently Montes et al. (2015) have proposed that the Canal Basin adjacent to where the Gatun Formation was deposited may have been one of the only, potential shallow, marine passages between the Americas. Furthermore, Moreno et al. (2012) and Montes et al. (2015) suggested that the rising El Valle volcanic complex would have further limited seawater transport, while most of Panama was a subaerial peninsula of South America. Conversely, Kirby et al., (2008) considered the Gatun to have been deposited while Panama was a mostly subaerial peninsula of Central America, with a substantial seaway remaining. The Middle Miocene also coincides with trans-isthmian bathyal foraminifera divergence which began ~13 Ma and with some (but not most) shallow water species divergence time estimates (Jackson and O'Dea, 2013; Lessios, 2008; Marko, 2002; Marko and Moran, 2009; O'Dea et al., 2016). Montes et al. (2015) and Bacon et al. (2013, 2016) suggest that significant

terrestrial biotic interchange did not occur then due to unsuitable habitat on the land bridge, rather a marine barrier. Almost all authors agree that the flow of deep and intermediate water was cut off or very limited by 10 Ma (Collins, 1996; Leigh et al., 2014; Osborne et al., 2014; Sepulchre et al., 2014).

Present-day water in the Western Atlantic (WA) is younger, warmer, more saline (~1 per mil at depths above 1000 m), and relatively nutrient-poor, while water in the tropical Eastern Pacific (TEP) is older, less saline, and relatively nutrient-rich (Allmon, 2001; Benway and Mix, 2004; Berger, 1970; Keigwin, 1982; Lessios, 2008; Reid, 1961). The modern TEP has strong upwelling in some regions where trade winds push water away from the EP coast (D'Croz and O'Dea, 2007; Lessios, 2008). In contrast, WA upwelling only occurs in small coastal regions off Colombia and Venezuela (Leigh et al., 2014; Lessios, 2008). Productivity is extremely high in the TEP during upwelling events, however TEP productivity is always higher than the WA (Lessios, 2008).

Complete closure of the CAS during the deposition of the Gatun Formation between 12 and 9 Ma remains unlikely (O'Dea et al., 2016). Caribbean salinity remained in equilibrium with Pacific waters until ~4.2 Ma (Haug and Tiedemann, 1998; Haug et al. 2001; Jackson and O'Dea, 2013; Steph et al., 2006); differences in carbonate deposition between the WA and TEP did not occur until 5-3 Ma (Haug and Tiedemann, 1998; Jackson and O'Dea, 2013); increased heat flux from low to high latitudes occurred at 3 Ma (and possibly also 2 Ma) (Cronin and Dowsett, 1996; Keigwin, 1978, 1982); and the majority of terrestrial taxa which participated in the Great American Biotic Interchange (Marshall et al., 1982) did not cross the isthmus until after 3.5 Ma (Jackson and O'Dea, 2013; Webb, 2006). Ecological structure in the Caribbean did not begin to change until ~3.5 Ma, while extinctions did not intensify until ~2 Ma (Collins, 1996, 1999; Jackson and Johnson, 2000; O'Dea et al., 2007; Smith and Jackson, 2009). This still leaves unresolved the impact of Miocene shoaling of the CAS on the paleoenvironment of the WA.

Turritelline gastropods (family Turritellidae, subfamily Turritellinae; *sensu* Marwick, 1957) are among the most common mollusks in the Gatun Formation and are common components of many

benthic marine assemblages of Early Cretaceous to Recent age worldwide (Allmon, 1988, 2011). Most species are largely sedentary semi-infaunal suspension feeders (Allmon, 2011). They are frequently the most abundant macrofossils in assemblages in which they occur, and turritelline-rich assemblages are frequently recognized in the literature (e.g., Allmon, 2007). Such occurrences have been called “turritelline-dominated assemblages” (Allmon and Knight, 1993), herein referred to as “TDAs” and defined as “macrofaunal assemblages in which turritelline gastropods 1) comprise either at least 20% of the total actual or estimated biomass or at least 20% of the macroscopic individuals in the assemblage, and 2) are at least twice as abundant as any other macroscopic species in the assemblage” (the term “turritelline- rich assemblage” may be used for an assemblage that does not fit these quantitative requirements but in which turritellines are still the most abundant species) (Allmon, 2007). In the Gatun Formation *Turritella* is represented by at least six species: *T. abrupta* Spieker (= *T. robusta* Grzybowski (Olsson, 1964)), *T. altilira* Conrad, *T. bifastigata* Nelson, *T. gatunensis* Conrad, *T. matarucana* Hodson, and *T. mimetes* Brown and Pilsbry (Fig. 1).

Fig. 1. Commonly sampled turritelline species from the Gatun Formation: A) *T. abrupta*, B) *T. matarucana*, C) *T. gatunensis*, D) *T. altilira*.

TDA in modern oceans occur mainly in cooler high-nutrient environments with normal to slightly below normal marine salinities at depths between 10 and 100 m (Allmon, 2011). Fossil TDAs occur in both cool and warm high-nutrient environments, including carbonate environments (Allmon, 2007). *Turritella sensu lato* is the most abundantly represented gastropod genus among the 156 mollusk genera sampled by Jackson et al. (1999) in the Gatun, accounting ~8.4% of more than 121,000 specimens analyzed. This is in striking contrast to the situation in the modern WA, where turritellines are present but rare and only include three species, *T. exoleta* Linnaeus, *T. variegata* Linnaeus, and *T. acropora* Dall. This change in turritelline abundance and diversity occurred in the Late Pliocene (Allmon, 1992, 2001), coincident with and likely caused by a decrease in shallow marine productivity associated

with the closure of the Central American Seaway (Allmon, 1992, 2001). The TEP contains at least 7 modern turritelline species: *T. anactor* Berry, *T. banksi* Reeve, *T. clarionensis* Hertlein & Strong, *T. gonostoma* Valenciennes, *T. leucostoma* Valenciennes, *T. nodulosa* King & Broderip, *T. rubescens* Reeve, several of which may be locally abundant (Keen, 1971; Allmon et al., 1992; Waite and Allmon, 2013).

The Gatun Formation provides an excellent opportunity to examine whether variations in the influence of upwelling waters contribute to the formation of TDAs, as numerous distinct TDAs may be sampled within a well-dated and paleoenvironmentally understood stratigraphic succession. One possible reason for the recurrence of TDAs in the Gatun Formation may be variation in the influence of nutrient-rich TEP upwelling waters to this location (or, alternatively, variation in terrestrial runoff). In order to test this possibility we performed combined $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ isotopic analysis on turritelline shells from within and without TDAs.

2. GEOLOGICAL SETTING

Fig. 2. Extent of the Gatun Formation and distribution of turritelline occurrences. Numbered circles indicate the location of TDAs mentioned in the text; 1. *New Highway cuts at IDAAN plant*, 2. *San Judas*, 3. *Las Lomas*, 4. *Isla Payardi*, 5. *Cativa Hospital*, 6. *Margarita*, and 7. *Gatun Locks*

2.1 Stratigraphy

The study interval includes the lower, middle, and basal upper parts of the Gatun Formation in the Panama Canal Basin of Colon Province, Panama (Figs. 2, 3). Most of the TDAs we studied come from localities in the lower part of the Gatun Formation, although turritellines can be recovered from throughout the formation (Fig. 3). The Gatun Formation is exposed on the northern shores of Gatún Lake, and in roadside exposures, and quarries from Colon to Sabanitas (north-south), and from Maria Chiquita to Gobeia (east-west) (Fig. 2). The formation has an unconformable lower contact with units of different ages in different parts of the Canal Basin, unnamed Cretaceous-Paleocene volcanoclastic sediments in the east, and the Late Oligocene Caimito Formation in the west. The Gatun consists of more than 600 m of siltstone, sandstone, conglomeratic sandstone, and tuff (Coates, 1999; Hendy, 2013) (Fig. 3). The unit encompasses the latest Middle Miocene (late Servallian) through earliest Upper Miocene (early Tortonian), with the TDAs primarily coming from strata dated between 11.5 and 9.5 Ma (Coates et al., 2005; Jackson et al., 1999; Jones and Hendy, unpublished data). Hendy (2013) reported that paleoenvironments of the Gatun varied considerably, with depths ranging from nearshore (4-10 m) to the lower mid-shelf (c. 90-100 m), with most sampled horizons representing soft-bottom habitats of normal salinity. Shallowest depths are generally represented in the lowermost part of the formation, and the deepest in the upper part (Hendy, 2013). The Gatun has been correlated with other tropical Eastern Pacific and Caribbean units that contain abundant turritelline assemblages, including the Angostura (Ecuador), Urumaco (Venezuela), Tubará (Colombia), and Uscari (Costa Rica) formations (Coates et al., 1999; Hendy, unpublished data).

Fig. 3. Stratigraphy of the Gatun Formation (from Hendy, 2013), indicating distribution of turritelline-rich assemblages and location of sampled TDAs.

2.2 Occurrence of TDAs in the Gatun Formation

Hendy (2013) presented quantitative paleoecological data from throughout the Gatun Formation, and demonstrated rapid changes in species abundance, which pointed to discrete changes in depositional paleoenvironments. These data are used here to indicate the frequent occurrence of turritelline-rich assemblages (Figs. 3, 4), including three turritelline species, *T. altilira* (lower and middle members), *T. gatunensis* (middle member), and *T. mataurcana* (lower member). Assemblages that fit the strict definition of TDAs (Allmon, 2007) may be observed in the following locations:

2.2.1. New Highway cuts at IDAAN plant (STRI Loc. 290357; LACMIP Loc. 41710)

The IDAAN outcrop is a fairly new roadcut approximately 3 km SE of San Judas on the newly extended Madden-Colon Highway. This section is stratigraphically the lowest of the seven discussed here, and is likely within 30 m of the base of the Gatun Formation (Hendy, 2013). Woodring's (1957) field localities 136 and 136A and Panama Paleontology Project (PPP) localities 1-11, 12m, 218-223, 231-233, and 490 are stratigraphically closest. The sediments are primarily gray silt, with frequent concretionary beds and abundant scattered macrofossils. Turritelline-rich horizons, comprising *T. matarucana*, occur midway up this section. Approximate age is 11.5-11.0 Ma.

2.2.2. San Judas (STRI Loc. 290307; LACMIP Loc. 41707)

This is an active quarry located NW of Cativa, and approximately 1 km SW of the Mattress Factory site (faunule 36 of Jackson et al., 1999). At least four *T. altilira* dominated assemblages are observed in this section, along with occurrences of *T. gatunensis*, *T. abrupta*, and *T. bifastigata*. Three are located near the present floor of the quarry with the fourth located approximately 10 m higher. Approximate age is 11.0-10.5 Ma. Woodring's (1957) field localities 139 and 139h and PPP localities 3596-3599 are stratigraphically closest.

185

186 2.2.3. *Las Lomas* (STRI Loc. 290308; LACMIP Loc. 41708)

187 This locality is located 0.5 km N of the San Judas Quarry, SE of Cativa. The locality mostly
188 consists of a deflation surface but does contain small unaltered outcrops on its borders, which yield
189 abundant *T. altilira* and common *T. gatunensis*. It is stratigraphically below the San Judas Quarry, with
190 the uppermost TDA at Las Lomas potentially corresponding to the lowermost TDA at San Judas. Both the
191 San Judas and Las Lomas sections are placed in the lower member of the Gatun Formation by Hendy
192 (2013). Approximate age is 11.0-10.5 Ma. Woodring's (1957) field localities 139 and 139h and PPP
193 localities 3635-3640 are stratigraphically closest.

194

195 2.2.4. *Isla Payardi* (STRI Loc. 290306; LACMIP Loc. 41706)

196 This locality, known informally as "Turritellid Hill" (Fortunato, 2007), is located just outside the
197 entrance to the formerly Texaco (now Chevron) Refinery at Isla Payardi, NE of Cativa. This locality was
198 first described by Vokes (1969), and is proximal to Woodring's (1957) field localities 136c-d and PPP
199 localities 1077 and 1079. The fauna from the site comprises faunule 35 of Jackson et al. (1999). It has
200 been placed in the middle member of the Gatun Formation (Jackson et al. (1999), although Hendy
201 (2013) regards this outcrop as belonging to the lower member. The outcrop is a hill that rises about 4
202 meters high, consisting of gray silt and brown shelly fine sand. The top of the outcrop is a deflation lag
203 on the exposed upper surface of an approximately 1 meter thick bed containing an abundant and
204 diverse molluscan fauna dominated by *T. altilira*. Approximate age is 11.0-10.0 Ma.

205

206 2.2.5. *Cativa Hospital* (STRI Loc. 290493)

207 This section was exposed for a short time during 2010-2011 during excavations for a new
208 hospital in the town of Cativa. Field surveys were carried out on strata exposed approximately 400 m

209 NW of the Transisthmian Highway. Woodring's (1957) field locality 141 and PPP localities 46, 484, and
210 485 are stratigraphically closest. These strata are placed at the base of the middle member of the Gatun
211 Formation. Approximate age is 10.5-10.0 Ma.

212

213 2.2.6. Margarita (STRI Loc. 290495)

214 *Turritella attilira*-dominated assemblages occur in several roadcuts along the Madden-Colon
215 highway near the Colon suburb of Margarita. A section (STRI Loc. 290495) was sampled 1 km S of the
216 northern terminus of the newly extended Madden-Colon Highway in the middle member of the Gatun
217 Formation. Woodring's (1957) field locality 142 and PPP Loc. 36 are located nearby this section.
218 Approximate age is 10.5-10.0 Ma.

219

220 2.2.7. Gatún Locks (STRI Loc. 290372, 290490, 290502)

221 Turritelline-dominated assemblages occur in a number of beds in the Gatún Third Locks section,
222 exposed during excavations associated with widening and modernization of the Panama Canal. Multiple
223 turritelline species are represented in TDA's that occur immediately below the Gatún Visitors Center and
224 adjacent to the Lago Gatún shoreline (STRI Loc. 290501) (*T. gatunensis*), and in the walls of the locks,
225 700 m N of the Lago Gatún shoreline (STRI Loc. 290372) (*T. attilira*). These sections are the
226 stratigraphically highest of those discussed here, and occur near the top of the middle member of the
227 Gatun Formation. These sections are equivalent to Woodring's (1957) field localities 146, 153 and 153a,
228 and PPP localities 37-41. Approximate age is 10.0-9.5 Ma.

229

Fig. 4. Stratigraphy and paleobathymetry of the San Judas locality (adapted from Hendy, 2013), and distribution of TDAs examined from the San Judas (2) and correlative Las Lomas (3) localities (see Fig. 2, 3). Letters designate shells which were sampled for isotopic sclerochronologies. Field photographs of the stratigraphically lowest, 3rd lowest and highest TDAs at San Judas corresponding to the indicated beds. Isotopic samples coming from TDAs are shaded dark grey, while samples taken from background assemblages are unshaded.

2.3 Sampling of TDAs in the Gatun Formation

Six TDAs were sampled in the lower Gatun Formation in strata dating between 11 and 10 Ma (Hendy, 2013) (Fig. 4, dark grey). The IDAAN section was the stratigraphically lowest locality sampled. Two stringers were observed at Las Lomas, each only 1 or 2 shells thick, the higher approximately 4 m above the lower. Four in-place TDAs were observed at San Judas (Fig. 4, dark grey layers) and samples were taken both from TDAs and background assemblages. A stringer only 1 or 2 shells thick was present near the current quarry floor. This stringer may correspond to the higher TDA at Las Lomas. ~1.5 m above this TDA was an additional stringer 1 or 2 shells thick. Approximately 20 cm above this stringer was a TDA approximately 8 cm thick, the largest observed at San Judas. The stratigraphically highest was a stringer approximately 4 cm thick located approximately 8 m above this TDA.

2.4 PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION OF FOSSIL ASSEMBLAGES

2.4.1 ORIENTATION

It was possible to observe one TDA in a bedding plane (San Judas, K) (Fig. 5A). Moving water causes turritelline shells to orient with the apex directed towards the source of the current (Allmon and Dockery, 1992; Nagle, 1967; Toots, 1965). The orientation of the apices of 83 shells were assigned to 10-degree sectors; shells which may not have been in-place were excluded. Shells showed a strong preferred orientation with apices towards the west-southwest (N=83, Fig. 5B), indicating flow was primarily unidirectional towards the east-northeast (Nagle, 1967; Toots, 1965). A minor subcomponent opposing this orientation may be related to the close packing of conical shells.

258

259

260 Fig. 5. A. Photograph of a portion of the lowermost TDA at San Judas, exposed on the floor of the quarry.

261 B. Apex orientation data for in-place *T. altilira* in this photo (N=83).

262

263 2.4.2 SEDIMENT SIZE

264 Sediment samples were taken from within the shells of *T. altilira* collected from the
265 stratigraphically highest TDA and from a non-TDA bed approximately 2 m above the second highest TDA.
266 Approximately 30 grains were chosen at random and measured under a light microscope for each
267 sample (N=38 for the TDA, N= 28 for the non-TDA). Sediment size ranged from medium silt to fine sand
268 in both samples (0.04 mm to 0.18 mm and 0.03 to 0.13 mm, respectively). Mean grain size was
269 significantly higher in the TDA bed (0.09 mm (very fine sand), and 0.06 mm (coarse silt), $p < 0.002$).

270

271 3. PALEOECOLOGY

272 3.1 METHODS

273 3.1.1 SAMPLE COLLECTION

Bulk samples of fossil-bearing sediment were collected from Isla Payardi and San Judas. Samples were washed and shells and shell fragments larger than 2 mm were retained. In addition, shells larger than 4 cm were collected from TDAs in-place at San Judas and Las Lomas and non-TDA beds at the San Judas and IDAAN localities for use in oxygen isotopic sclerochronologies. These samples were also evaluated separately when comparing encrustation/infestation frequencies and drilling frequencies as they were all large, relatively complete (>90%) shells.

3.1.2 SCLEROBIONTS

Shells exposed at the sediment/water interface or shallowly buried are subject to colonization by a variety of organisms including some which may leave either body or trace fossils (Taylor and Wilson, 2003). In the Gatun these organisms include both borers such as the sponge *Cliona* and worms, and encrusters such as the gastropod *Petalochonchus* (collectively “sclerobionts”; Brett et al. 2012; Taylor and Wilson, 2003). Endobiont infestation is not restricted to empty shells (Walker 1998), and extensive infestation can occur rapidly for exposed shells (Brett et al., 2011). It seems likely, however, that pristine shells were more rapidly buried than those with sclerobionts (Brett et al., 2011; Geary and Allmon, 1990). Evidence from experimentally deployed shells suggests that burial need not be very deep to inhibit colonization (Brett et al., 2011, 2012; Parsons-Hubbard et al. 1999).

3.1.3 EVALUATION OF DRILLING PREDATION

Predatory drill holes represent biotic interactions directly preservable in the fossil record (Alexander and Dietl, 2003; Dudley and Vermeij, 1978; Klompmaker and Kelley, 2015; Li et al., 2011; Vermeij et al., 1980), and the frequency of drilling (DF) is often used as an indication of predation intensity (Allmon et al., 1990; Mallick et al., 2014; Vermeij, 1987). Turritelline shells collected from bulk samples are often broken (Fortunato, 2007), but this does not preclude evaluation of drilling predation if

multiply drilled shells are rare (Johnson et al., in review). For the evaluation of drilling predation, turritelline shell fragments consisting of at least one complete whorl were measured. The range of widths occupied by each specimen could then be used to determine the minimum number of individuals by treating the most common width occupied by all specimens as the *minimum number of individuals* (MNI) (Johnson et al., in review). By this method a minimum number of 341 *T. altilira* individuals were present; MNIs of 75 from Isla Payardi and 266 from San Judas, based on a total of 1,263 fragments from bulk samples. Only 2 shells were observed with multiple drill holes. Therefore the total number of drilled shells should correspond closely with the number of drilled individuals in the collection (Li et al., 2011).

3.1.4 EVALUATION OF CRAB PEELING/REPAIR SCARS

An additional biotic interaction which leaves evidence in the fossil record is the repair scar created when crab peeling predation fails (Molinaro, 2014; Schoener, 1979; Vermeij 1982; Vermeij et al., 1980). Repair scar frequency has been shown to accurately represent attack frequency (Molinaro, 2014), and peeling repair scars are frequently observed in turritellines (Allmon et al., 1990). Minimum size criteria were used to ensure that data taken from bulk samples would be comparable to data available from museum specimens (such as were used by Allmon et al., 1990).

3.1.5 OXYGEN ISOTOPIC SCLEROCHRONOLOGY

Mollusks precipitate shell carbonate in oxygen isotopic equilibrium with seawater, and while carbon isotopes are generally noisier (Andreasson and Schmitz, 1996; Ivany, 2012; Ivany et al., 2003, 2008; Marshall et al., 1996; McConnaughey and Gillikin, 2008), within-individual variations reflect differences in seawater $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ (Ivany, 2012; Tao et al., 2013). Modern and fossil turritellines have been the subjects of numerous stable isotope analyses (Andreasson and Schmitz, 1996, 2000; Jones and Allmon, 1995, 1999; Latal et al., 2006; Teusch et al., 2002; Waite and Allmon, 2013, *in press*; Huyghe et al.,

2015). The Gatun Formation was deposited in a tropical setting (ca. 9.1° N paleolatitude), and therefore oxygen isotopic excursions are presumed to be the result of either temperature changes due to seasonal upwelling or freshening, rather than seasonal temperature fluctuations (Ivany, 2012; Tao et al., 2013).

Upwelling conditions could be indicated by simultaneous negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and positive $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ excursions (Geary et al., 1992; Jones and Allmon, 1995; Killingley and Berger, 1979; Tao et al., 2013). This is due to cool upwelling waters carrying isotopically light dissolved inorganic carbon as a result of preferential export of ^{12}C to deep water by photosynthesizers (Jones and Allmon, 1995; Kroopnick 1974, 1980). In contrast freshwater typically has both isotopically light oxygen and carbon (Jones and Allmon, 1995; Krantz et al., 1987; Tao et al., 2013). In the modern TEP there is substantial seasonal variation in temperature due to seasonal upwelling which is not present in the Southwest Caribbean (D'Croz and O'Dea, 2009; D'Croz and Robertson, 1997; Tao et al., 2013).

Tao et al. (2013) evaluated the degree to which $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values correlated (R) and the sign of the correlations (positive indicative of freshening, negative indicative of upwelling), as well as the observed range in observed $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values for species of modern *Conus* gastropods collected from the TEP and SWC to characterize whether shell carbonate could reliably indicate seawater condition. Although R values often failed to show statistically significant values or visually striking coincident $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ excursions, Tao et al. found good correspondence between observed values and expected ranges. Thus O-C relationships may not be statistically significant, but still faithfully record the relative importance of either upwelling or freshening (Key et al., 2013; Tao et al., 2013). We therefore compared our turritelline data from the Miocene with values observed in these modern *Conus* from the SWC and TEP in order to evaluate whether they were influenced by upwelling waters.

We serially sampled five *T. altilira* found in-place within TDAs and four *T. altilira* found in-place in non-TDA beds for combined ^{13}C and ^{18}O isotopic sclerochronologies (Fig. 4). Additionally 20 shells (12 from TDAs, 7 from non-TDAs, and 1 from Isla Payardi-TDA, status indeterminate), were sampled from

the apical end to a width of 8 mm for comparison of average water conditions during early growth. The samples were washed and cleansed ultrasonically for 5 minutes prior to sampling of the shell with a dental drill. Samples were analyzed at the University of Michigan Stable Isotopes Lab using a Finnigan MAT 251 mass spectrometer coupled to a Finnigan Kiel automated preparation device dedicated to the analysis of carbonates. Analytical error was found to be < 0.1% for both carbon and oxygen.

3.2 RESULTS

3.2.1 SCLEROBIONT COVERAGE

Rates of infestation were generally low in bulk samples from both San Judas and Isla Payardi (Table 1). The most common sclerobionts were *Cliona* (represented by *Entobia* borings), worm borings, and *Petalconchus*. When comparing near-complete shells (shells larger than 4 cm), it was notable that no shells from non-TDAs were infested, while shells target sampled from TDAs had higher rates of infestation than those observed in bulk samples (Table 1). In comparison, Allmon et al. (1995) found higher encrustation rates within than below a TDA, for a TDA associated with stronger upwelling, but similar encrustation rates between another TDA and the bed below for a TDA attributed to lag.

Table 1. Observed rates of encrustation/infestation from bulk samples and rates for large shells (4cm +) collected from TDA and non-TDA beds.

Locality	STRI Sample #s	# of Shell Fragments/ Individuals	<i>Entobia</i>	Rate	Worm Borings	Rate	<i>Petalconchus</i>	Rate	Other Sclerobionts
San Judas	17716, 17721, 17832	1156/266	33	3%/ 12%	35	3%/ 13%	2	0.2%/ 0.8%	1 Bryozoan, 1 Bivalve, 4 Barnacles
Isla Payardi	17833, 42266	92/75	2	2%/ 3%	4	4%/ 5%	0	0	1 Barnacle
TDA beds (large shells)	38176, 38177, 42266	19	4	21%	3	16%	0	0	0

Non-TDA beds (large shells)	38174, 38175, 38176, 38177, 38178	11	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
--------------------------------------	---	----	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

3.2.2 DRILLING PREDATION

Drill holes observed in this study were primarily beveled, indicating naticid predation was more common (Alexander and Dietl, 2003; Dudley and Vermeij, 1978; Li et al., 2011, Vermeij et al., 1980).

Polinices is the most abundant naticid associated with *T. altilira* in the Gatun; however *Naticarius*, *Stigmaulax*, *Natica* and *Tectonatica* have also been recorded (Hendy, 2013). *Eupleura* is uncommonly recorded in the *T. altilira* biofacies (Hendy, 2013), with *Calotrophon*, *Vokesimurex*, *Laevityphis* and *Chicoreus* also present (in that order of frequency).

Observed DFs from bulk samples are reported in table 2 (individual sample data available in tables S1 and S2 for *T. altilira* and *T. gatunensis*, respectively). Across all localities, 62 drill holes (1 shell was drilled twice) were observed in *T. altilira*. No incomplete drill holes were observed. For *T. altilira* present in bulk samples collected from throughout the Gatun, a DF of 0.18 was observed. This is lower than that observed for this species by Allmon et al. (1990) (0.241, Table 2), and substantially lower than the average Miocene DF of turritellines (0.279). This difference is not, however, statistically significant ($p>0.4$) and is similar to other Miocene DFs observed in turritellines (Table S3) (Allmon et al., 1990; Dudley and Vermeij, 1978; Hoffman et al., 1974). This DF is also higher than that observed by Dudley and Vermeij (1978), who examined intact shells larger than 40 mm and found DF of 0.067 ($n=15$) for *T. altilira*. A minimum of 81 *T. gatunensis* were present in samples collected from San Judas with a DF of 0.136, substantially lower than DF observed by Dudley and Vermeij (1978), who found DFs of 0.617 ($n=60$) and 0.80 ($n=10$) for *T. gatunensis*, smaller and larger than 40 mm, respectively (Table 2).

The high drilling rate observed in *T. gatunensis* by Dudley and Vermeij (1978) was not observed here, where the DF was only 0.136 for a minimum number of 81 individuals. The difference between the

observations of Dudley and Vermeij (1978) and the higher drilling rates observed here for *T. altilira* is likely due to the absence from their study of shells and shell fragments smaller than 40 mm as this is where the majority of drill holes were observed in the present study. It should be noted that the MNI system (Johnson et al., in review) can only increase drilling rates when compared with traditional “whole shell” methodologies, and therefore this difference must represent either real environmental variability between our specimens and those used in Dudley and Vermeij (1978), or the post-depositional loss of more apical shell fragments of *T. gatunensis* than *T. altilira*. The former seems more likely, as very small fragments of both *T. altilira* and *T. gatunensis* are present.

T. matarucana was rare in our bulk samples from San Judas. Two individuals were present in one sample (STRI # 17837), the only bulk sample with multiple individuals of *T. matarucana*. The drilling frequency of 0.50 for this sample is most likely an overestimate and should be treated with caution. *T. abrupta* occurs infrequently at the Las Lomas locality as float, but was not recorded in bulk samples from this location. Several specimens (N=15) were collected from float at this location with no regard for drilling status. The observed DF was 0.12, with one specimen bearing an incomplete drill hole, the only incomplete drill hole observed in this study.

Large *T. altilira* were collected from TDAs and non-TDA beds for isotopic analyses, however no special care was taken to exclude drilled specimens from either sample. These samples also yielded DFs of 0.16 for TDAs (n=19) and 0.18 (n=11) for non-TDAs, similar to those found in our bulk samples as these calculations are comparable to non-bulk samples in museum collections (Table 3). This difference in drilling frequency was not statistically significant ($p = 0.87$, t-test). Allmon et al. (1995) did find lower DFs in Plio-Pleistocene TDAs compared to the beds below them (DF = 0.28 vs. 0.21 and 0.32 vs. 0.20).

Table 2. Drilling Frequencies reported for Gatun *Turritella* (*sensu lato*) species.

Species	Size class	N	Drilling frequency (DF)	Citation
<i>altilira</i>	(>40 mm)	15	0.067	Dudley and Vermeij, 1978
	All	20	0.25	Allmon et al., 1990
	All	341 (minimum)	0.179	This study
<i>gatunensis</i>	(<40 mm)	60	0.617	Dudley and Vermeij, 1978
	(>40 mm)	10	0.80	Dudley and Vermeij, 1978
	All	70	0.64	Dudley and Vermeij, 1978
	All	81 (minimum)	0.136	This study

410

411 Table 3. Drilling frequencies observed in large (4cm+ while preserving minimum widths of 2 mm) *T.*

412 *altilira* sampled from particular TDAs and non-TDA intervals.

413

Locality	Assemblage	STRI Sample #s	# drilled	# of individuals	Drilling Frequency (DF)
San Judas	Highest TDA	38176	1	4	0.25
	3 rd lowest TDA	38176, 38177	0	5	0
	2nd lowest TDA	38176	1	2	0.50
	Lowermost TDA	38176, 38177	1	5	0.20
Las Lomas	Upper	42270	0	2	0
	Lower	42270	0	1	0
Isla Payardi	Non TDB	38174, 38175	1	2	0.50
IDAAN	Non TDB	38178	0	1	0
San Judas	Non TDB	38176, 38177	1	8	0.125
All TDA	San Judas/ Las Lomas	38176, 38177, 42266, 42270	3	19	0.16
All Non-TDA	Non TDB	38174, 38175, 38176, 38177, 38178	2	11	0.18

414

415

In order to normalize the location of drill holes, we employed the Theoretical Apex System (TAS) described in Johnson et al. (in review) (Fig. 6). The TAS allows for an evaluation of DFs in high-spired shells without restricting the dataset to “intact” shells. As bulk samples collected from the Gatun produce hundreds of *Turritella* shell fragments for every intact shell, this is a potentially vital step in evaluating the ecological interactions of this taxon. The TAS approximates the shape of the shell as a 2 dimensional isosceles triangle and a shell fragment as an isosceles trapezoid and uses the dimensions of the fragment to determine the minimum size of the individual (See Johnson et al., in review).

The TAS can be used to determine the distance of a drill hole from the apex of the theoretical unbroken shell. The distribution of observed drill holes is indicated in Fig. 6. For *T. altilira*, the majority (62%) located within 20 mm of the theoretical apex (Fig. 6a). The average distance from the theoretical apices for *T. altilira* was 17.85 mm, with a median of 14.48 mm. 75% of all drill holes were located between 1.8 mm and 25 mm from the theoretical apex. For *T. gatunensis*, all drill holes were observed within 30 mm of the theoretical apex, with more than half observed within the first 10 mm (Fig. 6b).

Fig. 6. Distribution of drill hole position using the Theoretical Apex System. A. Idealized isosceles triangle representing a fully grown specimen of *T. altilira*. Numbers indicate the number of drill holes located in each 10 mm bin across all specimens of *T. altilira*. A total of 63 drill holes were observed on 61 specimens out of 1,263 shell fragments representing a minimum of 341 individuals. B. Idealized isosceles triangle representing *T. gatunensis*. Numbers indicate the number of drill holes located in each 10 mm bin across all specimens of *T. gatunensis*. 11 boreholes were observed on 11 specimens from 167 shell fragments representing a minimum of 81 individuals. See Johnson et al. (in review) for additional details.

A comparison of drill hole location (measured as distance in mm to the theoretical apex) and outer borehole diameter (OBD) (the diameter of the outer margin of the drill hole) indicates a statistically significant positive relationship for both *T. gatunensis* and *T. altilira* ($R^2 = 0.96$, p value < 0.00001 and $R^2 = 0.55$, p value < 0.00001 , respectively, Fig. S1). This is expected because outer borehole diameter is related to predator size (Allmon et al., 1990; Hagadorn and Boyajian, 1997; Mallick et al., 2014; Wiltse, 1980). Minimum prey size (measured shell length + distance to theoretical apex) similarly correlates with OBD. Hagadorn and Boyajian (1997) found a much lower correlation ($R^2 = 0.19$) for Miocene specimens with a sample that included five species present in four formations from Maryland, Virginia, and Florida (Table S4). The inclusion of shell fragments representing very small individuals using the TAS is largely responsible for these very high R^2 values in our data, as the TAS likely allows for better quantification of small predator/prey interactions (Johnson et al., in review).

3.2.3 CRAB PEELING

In our data, 18 shell fragments of *T. altilira* possessed at least eight whorls and had maximum whorl diameters greater than 1 cm, making them comparable to non-bulk museum specimens (Allmon et al, 1990). Four repaired crab peels were found, yielding a peeling repair frequency of 0.22, similar to

Allmon et al. (1990), who found 0.30 for *T. altilira* in the Gatun. This does appear to be a higher-than-average peeling rate for Miocene turritellines, which had average peeling frequencies of 0.11 (Allmon et al., 1990). We observed two *T. gatunensis* with peeling/repair scars from the San Judas locality. If only specimens with at least eight whorls and maximum whorl diameters greater than 0.5 cm are considered (roughly equivalent to museum specimens, n=13) this represents a peeling/repair frequency of 0.15.

Of the two *T. matarucana* collected from San Judas in a bulk sample one had a peeling/repair scar (frequency=0.5), but this small sample size is not likely to be representative. *T. abrupta* was not collected in bulk samples, as it is only uncommonly present at Las Lomas and no bulk samples were collected from Las Lomas. It is, however, notable that this species has remarkably high levels of peeling/repair. We collected 14 specimens from float at Las Lomas and 4 had peeling/repair scars (frequency of 0.29). Of these, two had single peeling/repair scars, one had three, and one had five scars.

3.2.4 ISOTOPIC SCLEROCHRONOLOGY

Isotopic sclerochronologies are presented in Fig. 7. The TAS (Johnson et al., in review) was used to standardize all sample distances from theoretical apices facilitating comparison among broken specimens. All *T. altilira* appear to have lived for less than 3 years, consistent with most other isotopic analyses of turritellines (Allmon, 2011). All individuals also appear to have grown to lengths between 50 and 60 mm in the first year, with no notable differences between samples from TDA and non-TDA. Whorl addition rate was also similar among all specimens, with ~10 whorls added between 20 and 55 mm. Whorl width at a given ontogenetic stage, which may indicate differences in productivity (Teusch et al., 2002), also showed no statistical difference between TDAs and non-TDAs, $p=0.77$ (t-test), although statistical power is very low (0.05).

No significant differences were observed between TDA and non-TDA with respect to $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ minima (t-test, $p=0.73$, maxima ($p=0.74$), range ($p=0.87$), $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ minima ($p=0.34$) or maxima ($p=0.93$)

(Table 4). R values for the correlation between ^{18}O and ^{13}C (Tao et al., 2013) also did not show any statistically significant differences between TDA and non-TDA samples. Specimens C, G, and K (from TDAs) and E and L (from non-TDAs) all showed statistically significant (at $p < 0.05$) negative correlations (R) between ^{18}O and ^{13}C . The fraction of samples showing significant correlations (5/11) was higher than that observed in modern *Conus* spp. (3/13) (Tao et al., 2013). Specimen B may not preserve a full year's growth, which may have resulted in an unusually low R value; excluding this sample also does not result in a statistically significant difference. All shells showed negative correlations. Analysis of shell averages from the first year of growth also does not appear to indicate any difference between shells obtained from TDAs and non-TDA beds (Fig. 8). The $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ ranges observed were similar to those observed in Lower (1.1) and Middle (1.3) Gatun bivalves ($n=1$ for each) (Teranes et al., 1996).

Table 4. Comparison of mean stable isotope values for *T. altilira* shells obtained from TDA and non-TDA beds.

	TDA mean N=7	Non-TDA mean N=4	p-value (t-test)
$\delta^{18}\text{O}$ Max	-0.64	-0.55	0.74
$\delta^{18}\text{O}$ Min	-1.99	-1.93	0.73
$\delta^{18}\text{O}$ Range (Seasonality)	1.38	1.35	0.87
$\delta^{13}\text{C}$ Max	3.22	3.20	0.93
$\delta^{13}\text{C}$ Min	2.45	2.24	0.34
R value (O vs C)	-0.48	-0.20	0.12 (0.32 excluding B)

Fig. 7. Stable oxygen and carbon isotope profiles for *Turritella altilira* compared to VPDB standard for fossils collected from within TDAs and without TDAs. Stratigraphic location of San Judas and Las Lomas samples is indicated in Fig. 4. Sample E was taken from the IDAAN locality. Temperature data calculated

498 using the equation of Grossman and Ku (1986), assuming a seawater ^{18}O value of 0.25 (Lear et al., 2000).
499 Distances from the apex calculated using the Theoretical Apex System (Johnson et al., *in review*).
500

Turritelline Dominated Assemblages

Non-Turritelline Dominated Assemblages

502

503

Fig. 8. Average $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values (VPDB) by locality. Shells were sampled from the apical end until a width of 8 mm. No trend was observed distinguishing non-TDA shells (brown circles) from TDA shells (Isla Payardi TDA status indeterminate; all others from TDAs designated with orange icons). Variability within individual TDAs exceeded between TDA variability, with the possible exception of the uppermost Las Lomas sample. SJ: San Judas, LL: Las Lomas.

4. DISCUSSION

4.1 ORIENTATION

The strong orientation observed in the lowermost San Judas bed (Fig. 5) implies that winnowing likely contributed to the formation of TDAs in the Gatun Formation. At the inferred paleodepth (~40 m), this orientation is likely the result of strong storm-induced currents (Peters and Loss, 2012), which typically have strong unidirectional components (Morton, 1988). Alternatively this orientation may be

consistent with distributory flow from an open seaway, although broader sedimentary evidence does not support the Gatun as the location of the seaway itself. Von der Heydt and Dijkstra (2005) modeled early Miocene ocean circulation to include a shallow wind-driven westward through the CAS, but with an eastward subsurface flow conferring a net eastward transport through the Seaway. While shoaling began in the middle Miocene, net transport likely continued to be eastward. Nevertheless, evidence for strong current influence in the Gatun Formation is infrequent — and likely associated with short-term depositional events. Thick cross-stratified coquina beds from the overlying Chagres Formation (Hendy, in review) are more likely indicators for any such cross-isthmian circulation.

4.2 PREDATION

Dudley and Vermeij (1978) suggested *T. altilira*'s relatively pronounced spiral ribs as a possible reason for the low observed drilling frequencies in their study. As the heavily ribbed *T. altilira* had higher rates of drilling predation than *T. gatunensis* in this study, however, it does not appear likely that spiral ribs provide any defense against drilling predation. This is consistent with the findings of Allmon et al. (1990), who did not find a relationship between highly sculptured shells and predation intensity. This may be a result of predators locating drill holes between the ribs in larger specimens. The same phenomenon was observed by Tull and Bohning-Gaese (1993), who found that drilling occurred between ridges on *T. leucostoma*, and that the more highly sculptured *T. leucostoma* had higher drilling frequencies than the co-occurring, less sculptured *T. gonostoma*. A similar phenomenon was documented by Klompmaker and Kelley (2015) and Rojas et al. (2015) in bivalves, where naticid gastropods tended to select sites between ribs in strongly ribbed species.

Shell thickness may be a more important deterrent for drilling predation than shell sculpture (Mallick et al., 2014; Tull and Bohning-Gaese, 1993). The generally thicker shell produced by *T. gatunensis* may explain the lower DF observed in bulk samples (0.136 compared to 0.179 for *T.*

gatunensis and *T. altilira*, respectively). This is in strong contrast to the 0.80 DF observed by Dudley and Vermeij (1978), which may be due to differences in localities sampled as *T. gatunensis* is more abundant at Cativa Hospital and Margarita (localities 5 and 6; fig. 3). *T. gatunensis* has a thicker shell than *T. altilira* at the same distance from the apex. Between-sculpture shell thickness of *T. altilira* does not exceed the thickness of *T. gatunensis* at 38 mm in length until *T. altilira* reaches 70 mm in length (Fig. 9).

Thinner shells may allow *T. altilira* to more rapidly grow through the size class most vulnerable to predation (Paine, 1976; Palmer, 1981, 1990; Tull and Bohning-Gaese, 1993), with most reaching at least 40 mm in 1 year (Fig. 7), may therefore have provided a size refuge against drilling predation (Paine, 1976; Tull and Bohning-Gaese, 1993; Vermeij, 2015). Intensity of drilling predation appears to decrease at large prey sizes (Dudley and Vermeij, 1978), and, for turritellines, shell lengths >4 cm appear to provide this refuge (Paul et al., 2013; Teusch et al., 2002; Tull and Bohning-Gaese, 1993).

T. abrupta represents the thickest shelled turritellid species (Fig. S2) in the assemblage and had the (marginally) lowest DF (0.12). The only individual in this study with an incomplete drill hole was also a *T. abrupta*. This is not particularly surprising as *T. abrupta* has a substantially thicker shell than either *T. altilira* or *T. gatunensis*. This substantially heavier shell may also have contributed to the prevalence of peeling/repair scars in this species. The ability to survive multiple attacks (one individual sustaining five attacks) suggests that prey effectiveness was high. All turritellines examined also develop substantial internal remodeling, including complete filling of apical whorls in *T. abrupta* (Anderson and Allmon, 2015, so it is unclear how shell thickness would compare among individuals of this and other species as they first reached a particular growth stage.

564

565 Fig. 9. *T. altilira* and *T. gatunensis* shell thicknesses. *T. altilira* shell thicknesses given between and at
 566 thickest point in sculpture. Drilling binned by 5 mm size classes.

567

568

569 4.3 PALEOENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS OF ISOTOPIC ANALYSES

570 If the ^{18}O fraction of seawater is known, temperatures can be calculated using the equation of
 571 Grossman and Ku (1986). Seawater isotopic composition can be estimated using estimates of glacial ice
 572 volume and paleolatitude (Ivany et al., 2003; Lear et al., 2000; Zachos, 1994). Modern (non-upwelling)
 573 SWC environments at ~20 m water depth show temperatures ranging between 24 and 29° C and 22 and
 574 26° C at ~50 m water depth (World Ocean Atlas 2001, Conkright et al. 2002, Tao et al., 2013). In modern
 575 upwelling TEP waters (Gulf of Panama) temperatures range between 20 and 28 ° C at 20 m water depth
 576 and 16 to 22° C at 50 m water depth (Tao et al., 2013). Using a seawater ^{18}O fraction of -0.25 for ~10 Ma

(Lear et al., 2000), we can calculate that seasonal temperatures ranged from 21.9° C to 27.9° C in TDAs and from 22.3° C to 28.2° C for non-TDA samples. These are larger temperature ranges than observed in the modern SWC, which may indicate input from TEP upwelling across the CAS.

We do infer significant upwelling influence in the Gatun (11-10.5 Ma, Fig. 10). Samples from TDAs all fall within the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ correlation (R) and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ ranges observed for modern *Conus* from the TEP, or had R values even more strongly negative than those observed in *Conus* (Tao et al., 2013). Samples from non-TDAs largely overlapped with those from TDAs, with the exception of specimen B, likely due to this specimen not having preserved a full year's growth. Even including specimen B, no significant differences were observed in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ correlation (R) between TDAs (-0.48) and non-TDAs (-0.2) $p = 0.12$ (0.32, excluding B). $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ ranges were also highly similar between TDA and non-TDA samples (Fig. 10). Bivalve shells from the Gatun Formation have also shown evidence of seasonal upwelling influence, although sampling was limited to 2 shells, one in the lower Gatun and one in the middle Gatun, and only oxygen isotopic ranges were reported (Teranes et al., 1996).

Fig. 10. Relationship of $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ ranges and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ correlation (R) observed in samples from TDAs (squares) and background assemblages (circles) in the Gatun Formation. Diamonds indicate values obtained from modern *Conus* spp. from the WA (orange) and TEP (purple) (modified from Tao et al., 2013). Note that turritelline specimen B likely has a lower R value because it did not survive a full year. Specimen H is the only sample in the present study which fell within the ranges observed for modern SWC; all other samples fell within ranges observed for TEP *Conus* or exhibited stronger $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ correlations (although some modern *Conus* had broader ranges in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$). All turritellines which survived at least 1 year fell within the mesotrophic range (*sensu* Tao et al., 2013).

Average shell oxygen and carbon isotopic values during early ontogeny were also obtained for 12 *T. altilira* from TDAs, 7 from non-TDAs and one from Isla Payardi and no trend was observed distinguishing TDA from non-TDA shells (Fig. 8). Mean $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ was 2.73 for TDA and 2.78 for non-TDA, a difference which was not statistically significant (t test, $p = 0.72$). Mean $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ was -1.07 for TDA and -1.01 for non-TDA, which was also not statistically significant (t test, $p = 0.72$).

Mean annual range in temperature (MART) was found to be 5.99° C for TDA, and 5.85 °C for non-TDA shells. Excluding sample B, non-TDA MART was 6.6 °C and the MART observed across all samples was 6.2 °C. These values are consistent with those found by Okamura et al. (2013), who reported a MART of 6.1 °C, and Jackson and O’Dea (2013), who found MARTs around 6 °C throughout the Miocene based on a bryozoan zooid size proxy. These values are also similar to the MART of 6° C found at 50 m water depth in modern upwelling TEP waters, while SWC waters have a MART of 4 °C (World Ocean Atlas 2001, Conkright et al. 2002, Tao et al., 2013). Conditions were likely non-analogous to either modern SWC or TEP (O’Dea et al., 2012), reflecting the flow of TEP water (influenced by local upwelling) travelling East across shallow straights into the SWC, rather than local SWC upwelling.

5. CONCLUSIONS

5.1 INTERPRETATION OF TDAs IN THE GATUN

Modern turritellines have been found to live at high densities, with several species observed at densities higher than 1000 individuals per m^2 (Allmon, 1988, 2011, Gaymer and Himmelman, 2008), and 15 cm thick *Turritella* beds can represent less than 100 years of time averaging (Baltzer et al., 2015). Therefore it is possible that TDAs represent actual communities of turritellines from highly productive environments (Allmon, 1988, 1992, 2001, 2011; Gaymer and Himmelman, 2008). Environments where turritellines reach very high abundances are linked to high-nutrient conditions, related either to upwelling or terrestrial runoff (Allmon, 1988, 2011; Jones and Allmon, 1995). Based on the analysis

presented in this paper, TDAs of *T. altilira* in the Gatun Formation seem indicative of the influence of TEP upwelling, but specific TDAs in the Gatun do not appear to indicate environmental conditions significantly different from beds that contain conspecifics at lower densities. There are no significant differences in drilling predation rates between TDAs and non-TDAs. No sclerobionts were found on shells collected from non-TDAs, and TDA shells presented more damage from clionids and worm borings. This suggests that sedimentation rates may have been higher when non-TDAs were formed (sedimentation rates may have been highly variable at this time; Cantalamessa et al., 2007; Hendy, 2013; Kirby et al., 2008; Montes, 2015; Strong et al., 2009), possibly diluting the density of *T. altilira* relative to TDAs, but higher sedimentation rates or slower current speeds may also have been unfavorable for filter-feeding turritellines. As even limited burial appears to give substantial protection from sclerobiont infestation (Brett et al., 2011, 2012), this is not itself sufficient to establish whether variation in sedimentation rate alone could be responsible for TDAs. Further, TDAs showed evidence of reworking, suggesting that winnowing was important for the formation of these deposits.

5.2 GENERAL MODEL OF THE FORMATION OF TDAS

Two factors are prerequisites for the formation of TDAs; a nutrient-rich environment and otherwise appropriate environmental conditions for the species in question. Any particular TDA might be the result of a combination of high live abundance and physical concentration. Jones and Allmon (1995), for example, found broadly similar isotopic values and patterns between TDAs and non-TDA horizons in the Pliocene of Florida and attributed one TDA to strong upwelling and another to upwelling, but also increased time-averaging. Similarly, Allmon and Dockery (1992) reported a TDA which did not appear related to higher-than-background nutrient conditions.

All *T. altilira* shells examined herein (which lived at least one year) show similar upwelling isotopic signals, consistent with previous research linking TDAs with such environments (or to substantial

terrestrial runoff) (Allmon, 1988, 2011; Allmon et al., 1995; ; Allmon and Knight 1993; Fallon et al., 2014; Jones and Allmon, 1995). TDAs of *T. matarucana* appear to be associated with shallower water conditions, while those of *T. altilira* and *T. gatunensis* are more likely to occur in sediments generated further offshore (Hendy, 2013; Fig. S3).

Table 5. Factors which may contribute to the formation of TDAs in contrast to beds where turritellines are present, but at lower density ("non-TDA" herein).

Factor	Description	Support: Gatun	Support: General
Variation in Nutrient Supply	Differing living densities may have been supported by variations in productivity.	Not supported for the Gatun (All influenced by TEP upwelling).	Not systematically tested elsewhere.
Variation in other Environmental Conditions	Preference for particular depths, salinities, or temperatures may variously exclude turritellines or other taxa.	Not supported for the Gatun.	Plausible for other TDAs (Allmon and Dockery, 1992, Baltzer et al., 2015).
Allee Effect	The Allee effect, also known as inverse density dependence, suggests benefits from the presence of conspecifics (Kennedy, 1995, Stephens et al., 1999, Allmon, 2011).	Plausible, but cannot be tested experimentally in an extinct taxon. It is unknown if this affects extant <i>Turritella</i> species.	Plausible, but cannot be tested experimentally in an extinct taxon. It is unknown if this affects extant <i>Turritella</i> species.
Sedimentation Rate	Low sedimentation rates can condense shell beds (and conversely high sedimentation rates can dilute shell beds) if the input of shells is constant in time.	Low rates of colonization or sclerobiont damage suggest that shells in non-TDAs were coated in sediment more rapidly than those which formed TDAs. However, even limited sediment cover may limit subsequent colonization.	Likely important but not sufficient to generate other TDA accumulations (unrealistic sedimentation rates/hiatuses) (e.g., Allmon et al., 1995)
Winnowing	Removal of fine sediments by currents, leaving coarse particles such as shells.	Supported for the Gatun, by both orientation and grain-size data.	Turritelline shells are often recognized as indicators of paleocurrents, but reports of preferred orientations in TDAs are mixed (e.g.

			Allmon and Dockery, 1992, Allmon et al., 1995)
--	--	--	---

These conditions are not themselves sufficient for TDA formation (Table 5). Additional factors including variation in environmental conditions (including nutrient input), and Allee effects could contribute to variation in the size of live turritelline communities. Variations in nutrient supply are not supported for the Gatun, as both TDAs and non-TDAs showed similar levels of influence from upwelling waters. Variations in other environmental conditions such as temperature or salinity may be important in other TDAs, but are not supported for the Gatun. The Allee effect, suggests that individuals may benefit from the presence of conspecifics (Allmon, 2011; Kennedy, 1995; Stephens et al., 1999). This remains a possibility but has not been examined in living populations of *Turritella*.

Further, variations in sediment supply or removal could contribute to the dilution or condensation of shells in the sedimentary record. Low rates of colonization or sclerobiont damage suggest that shells in non-TDAs were more rapidly buried than those which formed TDA. A larger mean grain size within TDAs compared with non-TDA beds and some evidence for strong currents are consistent with winnowing as a factor contributing to the formation of these deposits. Allmon et al. (1995) also noted that badly abraded shells and pristine shells had been found together, indicative of some level of concentration for TDAs observed in the Pliocene Pinecrest Sand of Florida, however the level of concentration necessary to form one bed was a factor of 61.5.

As filter feeders turritellines may also respond to different levels of sediment input. It is possible that *T. altilira* preferred environments with lower sedimentation rates or stronger currents and therefore were present at lower abundances in environments where they were also likely to be diluted by sediment. TDAs are much more common in clear water environments than very fine sand, silts or muds (Fig. S4; 75% of occurrences in sand or limestone rather than clay or silty substrates, although if limestone and sands are considered separately there is no statistical difference among all three; Tukey

p-values ≤ 0.05 ; sedimentologic data from Allmon, 2007). In at least one other case where TDAs were present associated with silt, shells also appeared to be strongly oriented (Allmon and Dockery, 1992). In Fig. 11, we present a generalized model for the formation of TDAs.

Fig. 11. Schematic diagram indicating the environmental factors and depositional factors which result in turritelline dominated fossil assemblages. High nutrient environments, either related to upwelling or fluvial input remain a necessary prerequisite but it appears that recognizable individual shell beds of *Turritella* in the Gatun are the result of physical concentration rather than being records of large live communities or the result of variations in the influence of upwelling waters.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank Jose Santiago, Liliana Londono and Carlos Jaramillo at the Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute for their assistance. AH acknowledges funding from U.S. National Science Foundation (NSF) grant 0966884 (OISE, EAR, DRL) that supported field work, Ricardo Perez for donating the Toyota vehicles used for fieldwork, and the Direccion de Recursos Minerales for providing collecting permits. BMA thanks the Geological Society of America (via a student research grant) and the Jovarn Foundation (administered by the Paleontological Research Institution) for financial support, and thanks Linda Ivany and Greg Dietl for helpful discussions. This is a contribution of the NSF Partnerships for International Research and Education Panama Canal Project (PCP-PIRE).

717 LITERATURE CITED

718

719 Alexander, R.R., Dietl, G.P., 2003. The Fossil Record of Shell-Breaking Predation on Marine Bivalves and
720 Gastropods, in: Kelley, P.H., Kowalewski, M., Hansen, T.A. (Eds.), *Predator—Prey Interactions in*
721 *the Fossil Record*. Springer US, Boston, MA, pp. 141-176.

722

723 Allmon, W. D. (1988). Ecology of living turritelline gastropods (Prosobranchia, Turritellidae): Current
724 knowledge and paleontological implications. *Palaios* 3: 259-284.

725

726 Allmon, W.D., 1992, Role of nutrients and temperature in extinction of turritelline gastropods in the
727 northwestern Atlantic and northeastern Pacific. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,*
728 *Palaeoecology* 92:41-54.

729

730 Allmon, W.D., 2001, Nutrients, temperature, disturbance, and evolution: a model for
731 the Late Cenozoic marine record of the Western Atlantic. *Palaeogeography,*
732 *Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 166: 9-26.

733

734 Allmon, W.D., 2007, Cretaceous marine nutrients, greenhouse carbonates, and the abundance of
735 turritelline gastropods. *Journal of Geology* 115(5): 509-524.

736

737 Allmon, W.D., 2011, Natural history of turritelline gastropods (Cerithiidea: Turritellidae): A status
738 report. *Malacologia* 54(1-2):159-202.

739

740 Allmon, W.D., Dockery, D.T., 1992. A turritelline gastropod-dominated bed in the Byram Formation
741 (Oligocene) of Mississippi. *Mississippi Geology* 13: 29-35.
742

743 Allmon, W.D., Knight, J.L., 1993. Paleoecological significance of a turritelline gastropod-dominated
744 assemblage in the Cretaceous of South Carolina. *Journal of Paleontology* 67: 355-360.
745

746 Allmon, W.D., D.S. Jones, and N. Vaughan, 1992, Observations on the biology of *Turritella gonostoma*
747 Valenciennes (Prosobranchia, Turritellidae) from the Gulf of California. *The Veliger* 35(1):52-63.
748

749 Allmon, W.D., Nieh, J.C., Norris, R.D., 1990. Drilling and Peeling of turritelline gastropods since the Late
750 Cretaceous. *Palaeontology* 33: 595-611.
751

752 Allmon, W.D., Rosenberg, G., Portell, R.W., Schindler, K., 1996. Diversity of Pliocene-Recent Mollusks in
753 the Western Atlantic: Extinction, origination, and environmental change, in: Jackson, J.B.C.,
754 Budd, A.F., Coates, A.G. (Eds.), *Evolution and Environment in Tropical America*. University of
755 Chicago Press, Chicago.
756

757 Allmon, W.D., Spizuco, M.P., Jones, D.S., 1995. Taphonomy and paleoenvironment of two turritellid-
758 gastropod-rich beds, Pliocene of Florida. *Lethaia* 28, 75-83.

759 Anderson, B.M., Allmon, W.D., 2015. Septa Aren't Rare in Gastropods!, *Geological Society of America*
760 *Abstracts with Programs*, Baltimore, MD, p. 139.

761 Andreasson, F.P., Schmitz, B., 1996. Winter and summer temperatures of the early middle Eocene of
762 France from *Turritella* $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ profiles. *Geology* 24, 1067-1070.
763

764 Andreasson, F.P., Schmitz, B., 2000. Temperature seasonality in the early middle Eocene North Atlantic
 765 region: Evidence from stable isotope profiles of marine gastropod shells. Geological Society of
 766 America Bulletin 112, 628-640.
 767
 768 Andrews, H.E., 1974. Morphometrics and Functional Morphology of *Turritella*-Mortoni. Journal of
 769 Paleontology 48, 1126-1140.
 770
 771 Bacon, C.D., Molnar, P., Antonelli, A., Crawford, A.J., Montes, C., Vallejo-Pareja, M.C., 2016. Quaternary
 772 glaciation and the Great American Biotic Interchange. Geology 44, 375-378.
 773
 774 Bacon, C.D., Mora, A., Wagner, W.L., Jaramillo, C.A., 2013. Testing geological models of evolution of the
 775 Isthmus of Panama in a phylogenetic framework. Botanical Journal of the Linnean Society 171,
 776 287-300.
 777
 778 Baltzer, A., Mokeddem, Z., Goubert, E., Lartaud, F., Labourdette, N., Fournier, J., Bourillet, J.-F., 2015.
 779 The “*Turritella* Layer”: A Potential Proxy of a Drastic Holocene Environmental Change on the
 780 North–East Atlantic Coast, in: C.W. Finkl (Ed.), Sediment Fluxes in Coastal Areas. Springer, pp. 3-
 781 21.
 782
 783 Benway, H.M., Mix, A.C., 2004. Oxygen isotopes, upper-ocean salinity, and precipitation sources in the
 784 eastern tropical Pacific. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 224: 493-507.
 785
 786 Berger, W.H., 1970. Biogenous deep-sea sediments: fractionation by deep-sea circulation. Geological
 787 Society of America Bulletin 81: 1385-1402.

788

789 Brett, C.E., Parsons-Hubbard, K.M., Walker, S.E., Ferguson, C., Powell, E.N., Staff, G., Ashton-Alcox, K.A.,
790 Raymond, A., 2011. Gradients and patterns of sclerobionts on experimentally deployed bivalve
791 shells: Synopsis of bathymetric and temporal trends on a decadal time scale. *Palaeogeogr*
792 *Palaeocl* 312: 278-304.

793

794 Brett, C.E., Smrecak, T., Hubbard, K.P., Walker, S., 2012. Marine sclerobiofacies: Encrusting and
795 endolithic communities on shells through time and space, *Earth and Life*. Springer, pp. 129-157.

796

797 Cantalamessa, G., Di Celma, C., Ragaini, L., Valleri, G., Landini, W., 2007. Sedimentology and high-
798 resolution sequence stratigraphy of the late middle to late Miocene Angostura Formation
799 (western Borbón Basin, northwestern Ecuador). *Journal of the Geological Society* 164, 653-665.

800

801 Carriker, M.R., Yochelson, E.L., 1968. Recent gastropod boreholes and Ordovician cylindrical borings.
802 U.S. Geological Survey Professional Paper 593-B, B1-B26.

803

804 Coates, A., 1999. Lithostratigraphy of the Neogene strata of the Caribbean coast from Limon, Costa Rica,
805 to Colon, Panama. *Bulletins of American Paleontology* 113, 17-37.

806

807 Coates, A.G., McNeill, D., Aubry, M., Berggren, W., Collins, L.S., 2005. An introduction to the geology of
808 the Bocas del Toro Archipelago, Panama. *Caribbean Journal of Science* 41, 374-391.

809

810 Collins, L., 1996. Environmental changes in Caribbean shallow waters relative to the closing tropical
811 American seaway. *Evolution and environment in tropical America*, 130-167.

812

813 Collins, L., 1999. The Miocene to recent diversity of Caribbean benthic foraminifera from the Central
814 American isthmus. Diversidad de foraminifera caribeño béntico del istmo centroamericano del
815 Mioceno hasta recientemente. *Bulletins of American Paleontology*, 91-105.

816

817 Conkright ME, Locarnini RA, Garcia HE, O'Brien TD, Boyer TP, Stephens C, Antonov JI, 2002.
818 World Ocean Atlas 2001: objective analyses, data statistics, and figures, CD-ROM
819 documentation, National Oceanographic Data Center, Silver Spring, MD. p. 17.

820

821 Cronin, T.M., Dowsett, H.J., 1996. Biotic and oceanographic response to the Pliocene closing of the
822 Central American Isthmus. *Evolution and environment in tropical America*, 76-104.

823

824 D'Croz, L., O'Dea, A., 2007. Variability in upwelling along the Pacific shelf of Panama and implications for
825 the distribution of nutrients and chlorophyll. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 73, 325-340.

826

827 D'Croz, L., O'Dea, A., 2009. Nutrient and chlorophyll dynamics in Pacific Central America (Panama).
828 *Smithsonian Contributions to the Marine Sciences* 38, 335-344.

829

830 D'Croz, L., Robertson, D., 1997. Coastal oceanographic conditions affecting coral reefs on both sides of
831 the Isthmus of Panama, *Proceedings of the 8th International Coral Reef Symposium*, pp. 3-205.

832

833 Dudley, E.C., Vermeij, G.J., 1978. Predation in Time and Space: Drilling in the Gastropod *Turritella*.
834 *Paleobiology* 4, 436-441.

835

836 Fallon, T.J., Whorley, T.L., Harries, P.J., Brian, A., Slattery, J.S., 2014. Reconstructing the
 837 paleoenvironment and paleoecology of a *Turritella*-rich horizon in the Plio-Pleistocene Jackson
 838 Bluff Formation of the Florida Panhandle, North American Paleontological Convention. The
 839 Paleontological Society Special Publications, Gainesville, Florida, p. 31.
 840
 841 Fortunato, H., 2007. Naticid gastropod predation in the Gatun Formation (late middle Miocene),
 842 Panama: preliminary assessment. *Palaeontol Z* 81, 356-364.
 843
 844 Gaymer, C.F., Himmelman, J.H., 2008. A keystone predatory sea star in the intertidal zone is controlled
 845 by a higher-order predatory sea star in the subtidal zone. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 370,
 846 143-153.
 847
 848 Geary, D.H., Allmon, W.D., 1990. Biological and physical contributions to the accumulation of Strombid
 849 gastropods in a Pliocene shell bed. *Palaaios* 5, 259-272.
 850
 851 Geary, D.H., Brieske, T.A., Bemis, B.E., 1992. The influence and interaction of temperature, salinity, and
 852 upwelling on the stable isotopic profiles of strombid gastropod shells. *Palaaios* 7, 77-85.
 853
 854 Grossman, E.L., Ku, T.-L., 1986. Oxygen and carbon isotope fractionation in biogenic aragonite:
 855 temperature effects. *Chemical Geology: Isotope Geoscience Section* 59, 59-74.
 856
 857 Hagadorn, J.W., Boyajian, G.E., 1997. Subtle changes in mature predator-prey systems; an example from
 858 Neogene *Turritella* (Gastropoda). *Palaaios* 12, 372-379.
 859

860 Haug, G.H., Tiedemann, R., 1998. Effect of the formation of the Isthmus of Panama on Atlantic Ocean
861 thermohaline circulation. *Nature* 393, 673-676.

862

863 Haug, G.H., Tiedemann, R., Zahn, R., Ravelo, A.C., 2001. Role of Panama uplift on oceanic freshwater
864 balance. *Geology* 29, 207-210.

865

866 Hayes, P.E., 1989. Paleooceanography of the eastern equatorial Pacific during the Pliocene: a high-
867 resolution radiolarian study. *Paleoceanography* 4, 57-74.

868

869 Hendy, A.J.W., 2013. Spatial and stratigraphic variation of marine paleoenvironments in the Middle-
870 Upper Miocene Gatun Formation, Isthmus of Panama. *Palaios* 28, 210-227.

871

872 Hendy, A.J.W., Jones, D., de Gracia, C., and Vélez-Juarbe, J., in review. Paleoeology of the Chagres
873 Formation (latest Miocene) of Panama: reinterpreting the paleoenvironment of a vertebrate-
874 rich marine fauna. *Journal of Geology*.

875 Hoffman, A., Pisera, A., Ryszkiewicz, M., 1974. Predation by muricid and naticid gastropods on the Lower
876 Tortonian mollusks from the Korytnica clays. *Acta Geologica Polonica* 24, 249-260.

877

878 Huyghe, D., Lartaud, F., Emmanuel, L., Merle, D., Renard, M., 2015. Palaeogene climate evolution in the
879 Paris Basin from oxygen stable isotope ($\delta^{18}O$) compositions of marine molluscs. *Journal of the*
880 *Geological Society* 172, 576-587.

881

882 Ivany, L.C., 2012. Reconstructing paleoseasonality from accretionary skeletal carbonates- challenges and
883 opportunities, in: Ivany, L.C., Huber, B.T. (Eds.), *Reconstructing Earth's Deep-Time Climate- The*

884 State of the Art in 2012. Paleontological Society Short Course. The Paleontological Society
885 Papers, pp. 133-165.
886
887 Ivany, L.C., Lohmann, K.C., Hasiuk, F., Blake, D.B., Glass, A., Aronson, R.B., Moody, R.M., 2008. Eocene
888 climate record of a high southern latitude continental shelf: Seymour Island, Antarctica.
889 Geological Society of America Bulletin 120, 659-678.
890
891 Ivany, L.C., Wilkinson, B.H., Jones, D.S., 2003. Using stable isotopic data to resolve rate and duration of
892 growth throughout ontogeny: An example from the surf clam, *Spisula solidissima*. Palaios 18,
893 126-137.
894
895 Jackson, J.B., Budd, A.F., 1996. Evolution and environment: introduction and overview. Evolution and
896 Environment in Tropical America. University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1-20.
897
898 Jackson, J.B.C., Johnson, K.G., 2000. Life in the last few million years. Paleobiology 26, 221-235.
899
900 Jackson, J.B.C., O'Dea, A., 2013. Timing of the oceanographic and biological isolation of the Caribbean
901 Sea from the tropical Eastern Pacific Ocean. Bulletin of Marine Science 89, 779-800.
902
903 Jackson, J., Todd, J., Fortunato, H., Jung, P., 1999. Diversity and assemblages of Neogene Caribbean
904 mollusca of lower Central America. Diversidad y gremios de moluscos del Neogeno caribeño de
905 la parte inferior de Centroamérica. Bulletins of American Paleontology., 193-230.
906

907 Johnson, E.H., Anderson, B.M., Allmon, W.D., *In review*. Can we learn anything from all those pieces?
 908 Obtaining data on drilling predation from fragmented high-spired gastropod shells. *Palaios*.
 909

910 Jones, D.S., Allmon, W.D., 1995. Records of upwelling, seasonality and growth in stable isotope profiles
 911 of Pliocene mollusk shells from Florida. *Lethaia* 28, 61-74.
 912

913 Jones, D.S., Allmon, W.D., 1999. Pliocene marine temperatures on the west coast of Florida: estimates
 914 from mollusk shell stable isotopes, in: J.H. Wrenn, J.-P.S., and S.A.G. Leroy (Ed.), *The Pliocene:*
 915 *Time of Change*. American Association of Stratigraphic Palynologists Foundation, Dallas, Texas,
 916 pp. 241-250.
 917

918 Keen, A.M., 1971. Sea shells of tropical west America: marine mollusks from Baja California to Peru, 2nd
 919 ed. Stanford University Press, Stanford, CA.
 920

921 Keigwin, L.D., 1978. Pliocene closing of the Isthmus of Panama, based on biostratigraphic evidence from
 922 nearby Pacific Ocean and Caribbean Sea cores. *Geology* 6, 630-634.
 923

924 Keigwin, L., 1982. Isotopic paleoceanography of the Caribbean and East Pacific: role of Panama uplift in
 925 late Neogene time. *Science* 217, 350-353.
 926

927 Kennedy, J.J., 1995. The courtship, pseudo-copulation behaviour and spermatophore of *Turritella*
 928 *communis* Risso 1826 (Prosobranchia: Turritellidae). *Journal of molluscan studies* 61, 421-434.
 929

930 Key, M.M., Hollenbeck, P.M., O'Dea, A., Patterson, W.P., 2013. Stable isotope profiling in moderate

931 marine bryozoan colonies across the Isthmus of Panama. *Bulletin of Marine Science* 89, 837-856.

932

933 Killingley, J.S., Berger, W.H., 1979. Stable isotopes in a mollusk shell: detection of upwelling events.

934 *Science* 205, 186-188.

935

936 Kirby, M.X., Jones, D.S., MacFadden, B.J., 2008. Lower Miocene stratigraphy along the Panama Canal and

937 its bearing on the Central American Peninsula. *PLoS One* 3, e2791.

938

939 Klompmaker, A.A., Kelley, P.H., 2015. Shell ornamentation as a likely exaptation: evidence from

940 predatory drilling on Cenozoic bivalves. *Paleobiology* 41, 187-201.

941

942 Kojumdjieva, E., 1974. Les gastéropodes perceurs et leurs victimes du Miocène de Bulgarie de nord-

943 ouest. *Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Bulletin of the Geological Institute (Series Paleontology)*

944 23, 5-24.

945

946 Krantz, D.E., Williams, D.F., Jones, D.S., 1987. Ecological and paleoenvironmental information using

947 stable isotope profiles from living and fossil molluscs. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,*

948 *Palaeoecology* 58, 249-266.

949

950 Kroopnick, P., 1974. The dissolved O₂-CO₂-¹³C system in the eastern equatorial Pacific, *Deep Sea*

951 *Research and Oceanographic Abstracts*. Elsevier, pp. 211-227.

952

953 Kroopnick, P., 1980. The distribution of ¹³C in the Atlantic Ocean. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*

954 49, 469-484.

955

956 Latal, C., Piller, W.E., Harzhauser, M., 2006. Shifts in oxygen and carbon isotope signals in marine
 957 molluscs from the Central Paratethys (Europe) around the Lower/Middle Miocene transition.
 958 *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 231, 347-360.

959

960 Lear, C.H., Elderfield, H., Wilson, P.A., 2000. Cenozoic deep-sea temperatures and global ice volumes
 961 from Mg/Ca in benthic foraminiferal calcite. *Science* 287, 269-272.

962

963 Leigh, E.G., O'Dea, A., Vermeij, G.J., 2014. Historical biogeography of the Isthmus of Panama. *Biol Rev*
 964 *Camb Philos Soc* 89, 148-172.

965

966 Lessios, H.A., 2008. The Great American Schism: Divergence of marine organisms after the rise of the
 967 Central American Isthmus. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics* 39, 63-91.

968

969 Li, R.-Y., Young, H.R., Zhan, R.-B., 2011. Drilling predation on scaphopods and other molluscs from the
 970 Upper Cretaceous of Manitoba, Canada. *Palaeoworld* 20, 296-307.

971

972 Maier-Reimer, E., Mikolajewicz, U., Crowley, T., 1990. Ocean general circulation model sensitivity
 973 experiment with an open Central American Isthmus. *Paleoceanography* 5, 349-366.

974

975 Mallick, S., Bardhan, S., Das, S.S., Paul, S., Goswami, P., 2014. Naticid drilling predation on gastropod
 976 assemblages across the K–T boundary in Rajahmundry, India: New evidence for escalation
 977 hypothesis. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 411, 216-228.

978

979 Marko, P.B., 2002. Fossil calibration of molecular clocks and the divergence times of geminate species
 980 pairs separated by the Isthmus of Panama. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* 19, 2005-2021
 981
 982 Marko, P.B., Moran, A.L., 2009. Out of sight, out of mind: high cryptic diversity obscures the identities
 983 and histories of geminate species in the marine bivalve subgenus *Acar*. *Journal of Biogeography*
 984 36, 1861-1880.
 985
 986 Marshall, J.D., Pirrie, D., Clarke, A., Nolan, C.P., Shaman, J., 1996. Stable-isotopic composition of skeletal
 987 carbonates from living Antarctic marine invertebrates. *Lethaia* 29, 203-212.
 988
 989 Marshall, L.G., Webb, S.D., Sepkoski, J.J., Raup, D.M., 1982. Mammalian evolution and the great
 990 American interchange. *Science* 215, 1351-1357.
 991
 992 Marwick, J., 1957. Generic revision of the Turritellidae. *Journal of Molluscan Studies* 32, 144-166.
 993
 994 McConnaughey, T.A., Gillikin, D.P., 2008. Carbon isotopes in mollusk shell carbonates. *Geo-Mar Lett* 28,
 995 287-299.
 996
 997 Molinaro, D.J., Stafford, E.S., Collins, B.M.J., Barclay, K.M., Tyler, C.L., Leighton, L.R., 2014. Peeling out
 998 predation intensity in the fossil record: A test of repair scar frequency as a suitable proxy for
 999 predation pressure along a modern predation gradient. *Palaeogeogr Palaeocl* 412, 141-147.
 1000

1001 Montes, C., Cardona, A., Jaramillo, C., Pardo, A., Silva, J.C., Valencia, V., Ayala, C., Pérez-Angel, L.C.,
 1002 Rodriguez-Parra, L.A., Ramirez, V., Niño, H., 2015. Middle Miocene closure of the Central
 1003 American Seaway. *Science* 348, 226-229.
 1004
 1005 Moreno, J.F., Foster, D.A., Montes, C., Rooney, R., and Jaramillo, C., 2012. Implications of late Miocene
 1006 volcanism for closing the Panamanian Seaway. *Geological Society of America Abstracts with*
 1007 *Programs*, 44, 60.
 1008
 1009 Morton, R.A., 1988. Nearshore responses to great storms. *Geological Society of America Special Papers*
 1010 229, 7-22.
 1011
 1012 Nagle, J.S., 1967. Wave and current orientation of shells. *Journal of Sedimentary Petrology* 37, 1124-
 1013 1138.
 1014 O'Dea, A., Hoyos, N., Rodriguez, F., Degracia, B., De Gracia, C., 2012. History of upwelling in the Tropical
 1015 Eastern Pacific and the paleogeography of the Isthmus of Panama. *Palaeogeogr Palaeocl* 348,
 1016 59-66.
 1017 O'Dea, A., Lessios, H.A., Coates, A.G., Eytan, R.I., Restrepo-Moreno, S.A., Cione, A.L., Collins, L.S., de
 1018 Queiroz, A., Farris, D.W., Norris, R.D., Stallard, R.F., Woodburne, M.O., Aguilera, O., Aubry, M.P.,
 1019 Berggren, W.A., Budd, A.F., Cozzuol, M.A., Coppard, S.E., Duque-Caro, H., Finnegan, S., Gasparini,
 1020 G.M., Grossman, E.L., Johnson, K.G., Keigwin, L.D., Knowlton, N., Leigh, E.G., Leonard-Pingel, J.S.,
 1021 Marko, P.B., Pyenson, N.D., Rachello-Dolmen, P.G., Soibelzon, E., Soibelzon, L., Todd, J.A.,
 1022 Vermeij, G.J., Jackson, J.B., 2016. Formation of the Isthmus of Panama. *Sci Adv* 2, e1600883.

1023 O'Dea, A., Jackson, J.B., Fortunato, H., Smith, J.T., D'Croz, L., Johnson, K.G., Todd, J.A., 2007.
 1024 Environmental change preceded Caribbean extinction by 2 million years. Proceedings of the
 1025 National Academy of Sciences 104, 5501-5506.

1026 Okamura, B., O'Dea, A., Taylor, P., Taylor, A., 2013. Evidence of El Niño/La Niña–Southern Oscillation
 1027 variability in the Neogene-Pleistocene of Panama revealed by a new bryozoan assemblage-
 1028 based proxy. Bulletin of Marine Science 89, 857-876.

1029 Olsson, A.A., 1964. Neogene mollusks from northwestern Ecuador. Paleontological Research Institution,
 1030 Ithaca, NY.

1031 Osborne, A.H., Newkirk, D.R., Groeneveld, J., Martin, E.E., Tiedemann, R., Frank, M., 2014. The seawater
 1032 neodymium and lead isotope record of the final stages of Central American Seaway closure.
 1033 Paleoceanography 29, 715-729.

1034

1035 Paine, R.T., 1976. Size-limited predation: an observational and experimental approach with the *Mytilus*-
 1036 *Pisaster* interaction. Ecology 57, 858-873.

1037

1038 Palmer, A.R., 1981. Do carbonate skeletons limit the rate of body growth? Nature 292, 150-152.

1039

1040 Palmer, A.R., 1990. Predator size, prey size, and the scaling of vulnerability: hatchling gastropods vs.
 1041 barnacles. Ecology, 759-775.

1042

1043 Parsons-Hubbard, K.M., Callender, W.R., Powell, E.N., Brett, C.E., Walker, S.E., Raymond, A.L., Staff,
 1044 G.M., 1999. Rates of burial and disturbance of experimentally-deployed molluscs: Implications
 1045 for preservation potential. Palaios 14, 337-351.

1046

1047 Paul, G., Das, A., Bardhan, S., Mondal, S., 2013. Predation on Recent Turritelline gastropods from the

1048 Indian subcontinent and comparison with a revised global database. *Malacologia* 56, 193-213.

1049 Peters, S.E., Loss, D.P., 2012. Storm and fair-weather wave base: A relevant distinction? *Geology* 40, 511-

1050 514.

1051 Reid, J.L., 1961. On the temperature, salinity, and density differences between the Atlantic and Pacific

1052 oceans in the upper kilometre. *Deep Sea Research* (1953) 7, 265-275.

1053

1054 Rojas, A., Hendy, A., and Dietl, G.P., 2015. Edge-drilling behavior in the predatory gastropod *Notocochlis*

1055 *unifasciata* (Lamarck, 1822) (Caenogastropoda, Naticidae) from the Pacific coast of Panama:

1056 taxonomic and biogeographical implications. *Vita Malacologica* 13, 63-72.

1057

1058 Schoener, T.W., 1979. Inferring the properties of predation and other injury-producing agents from

1059 injury frequencies. *Ecology* 60, 1110-1115.

1060

1061 Sepulchre, P., Arsouze, T., Donnadieu, Y., Dutay, J.C., Jaramillo, C., Le Bras, J., Martin, E., Montes, C.,

1062 Waite, A.J., 2014. Consequences of shoaling of the Central American Seaway determined from

1063 modeling Nd isotopes. *Paleoceanography* 29, 176-189.

1064

1065 Smith, J.T., Jackson, J.B.C., 2009. Ecology of extreme faunal turnover of tropical American scallops.

1066 *Paleobiology* 35, 77-93.

1067

1068 Steph, S., Tiedemann, R., Prange, M., Groeneveld, J., Nurnberg, D., Reuning, L., Schulz, M., Haug, G.H.,
 1069 2006. Changes in Caribbean surface hydrography during the Pliocene shoaling of the Central
 1070 American Seaway. *Paleoceanography* 21: PA 4221.

1071 Stephens, P.A., Sutherland, W.J., Freckleton, R.P., 1999. What is the Allee effect? *Oikos* 87, 185-190.
 1072

1073 Strong, N., Francheschi, P., Jaramillo, C., Farris, D., Montes, C., and O'Dea, A., 2009. Biological response
 1074 to high flux rates of pyroclastics in fluvial and nearshore shallow marine environments in the
 1075 Panama Canal Basin. *Geological Society of America Abstracts with Programs*. Vol. 41 (7), 133.

1076 Tao, K, Robbins, JA, Grossman, EL, O'Dea, A. 2013 Quantifying upwelling and freshening in nearshore
 1077 tropical environments using stable isotopes in modern tropical American gastropods. *Bulletin of*
 1078 *Marine Science* 89, 815-835.
 1079

1080 Teranes, J.L., Geary, D.H., Bemis, B.E., 1996. The oxygen isotopic record of seasonality in Neogene
 1081 bivalves from the Central American Isthmus. *Evolution and Environment in Tropical America*.
 1082 The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 105-129.
 1083

1084 Teusch, K.P., D.S. Jones, and W.D. Allmon, 2002, Morphological variation in a turritellid gastropod from
 1085 the Pleistocene to Recent of Chile: associations with upwelling intensity. *Palaaios*, 17, 366-377.
 1086

1087 Todd, J.A., Jackson, J.B., Johnson, K.G., Fortunato, H.M., Heitz, A., Alvarez, M., Jung, P., 2002. The
 1088 ecology of extinction: molluscan feeding and faunal turnover in the Caribbean Neogene. *Proc*
 1089 *Biol Sci* 269, 571-577.
 1090

- 1091 Toots, H., 1965. Orientation and distribution of fossils as environmental indicators, in: DeVoto RH, B.R.
 1092 (Ed.), Sedimentation of the late Cretaceous and Tertiary outcrops, Rock Spring Uplift. . Wyoming
 1093 Geological Association, Casper, pp. 219–229.
 1094
- 1095 Toulou, F., 1909. Eine jungertiäre Fauna von Gatun am Panama-Kanal. Jahrbuch der Kaiserlich-Königlichen
 1096 Geologischen Reichsanstalt 59, 673-760.
 1097
- 1098 Taylor, P.D., Wilson, M.A., 2003. Palaeoecology and evolution of marine hard substrate communities.
 1099 Earth-Science Reviews 62, 1-103.
- 1100 Tull, D.S., Bohning-Gaese, K., 1993. Patterns of drilling predation on gastropods of the family
 1101 Turritellidae in the Gulf-of-California. Paleobiology 19, 476-486.
- 1102 Vermeij, G.J., 1982. Gastropod shell form, breakage, and repair in relation to predation by the crab
 1103 *Calappa*. Malacologia 23, 1-12.
- 1104 Vermeij, G.J., 1987. Evolution and escalation: an ecological history of life. Princeton University Press,
 1105 Princeton, NJ.
- 1106 Vermeij, G.J., 2015. Gastropod skeletal defences: land, freshwater, and sea compared. Vita Malacologica
 1107 13, 1-25.
 1108
- 1109 Vermeij, G.J., Zipser, E., Dudley, E.C., 1980. Predation in Time and Space - Peeling and Drilling in Terebrid
 1110 Gastropods. Paleobiology 6, 352-364.
- 1111 Vokes, E.H., 1969. The genus *Trojana* (Mollusca: Gastropoda) in the new world. Tulane Studies in
 1112 Geology and Paleontology 7(2):75-83.

1113 von der Heydt, A., Dijkstra, H.A., 2005. Flow reorganizations in the Panama Seaway: A cause for the
 1114 demise of Miocene corals? Geophysical Research Letters, 32.
 1115
 1116 Waite, R., Allmon, W.D., 2013. Observations on the iology and sclerochronology of *Turritella*
 1117 *leucostoma* (Valenciennes, 1832; Cerithioidea: Turritellidae) from the Gulf of California.
 1118 American Malacological Bulletin 31, 297-310.
 1119
 1120 Waite, R., Allmon, W.D., *in press*. Observations on the biology and sclerochronology of
 1121 "*Turritella*" *duplicata* (Linnaeus, 1758) (Cerithioidea, Turritellidae) from southern Thailand.
 1122 Malacologia
 1123
 1124 Walker, S.E., 1998. Endobionts on modern and fossil *Turritella* from the northern Gulf of California
 1125 region. Ichnos: An International Journal of Plant & Animal Traces 6, 99-115.
 1126
 1127 Webb, S.D., 2006. The Great American Biotic Interchange: Patterns and processes. Ann Mo Bot Gard 93,
 1128 245-257.
 1129
 1130 Wiltse, W.I., 1980. Predation by juvenile *Polinices duplicatus* (Say) on *Gemma gemma* (Totten). Journal
 1131 of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 42, 187-199.
 1132
 1133 Woodring, W.P., 1957, Geology and paleontology of Canal Zone and adjoining parts of
 1134 Panama: U.S. Geological Survey Professional Paper, 306 (A), 1–145.
 1135

1136 Woodring, W.P., 1966. The Panama land bridge as a sea barrier. Proceedings of the American
1137 Philosophical Society 110, 425-433.
1138
1139 Zachos, J.C., Stott, L.D., Lohmann, K.C., 1994. Evolution of early Cenozoic marine temperatures.
1140 Paleoceanography 9, 353-387.
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159