1 **High-resolution SIMS oxygen isotope analysis on conodont apatite from South**
2 **China and implications for the end-Permian mass extinction**

3
4 Jun Chen ^{a,*}, Shu-zhong Shen ^b, Xian-hua Li ^c, Yi-gang Xu ^a, Michael M. Joachimski ^d,
5 Samuel A. Bowring ^e, Douglas H. Erwin ^f, Dong-xun Yuan ^b, Bo Chen ^b, Hua Zhang ^b, Yue
6 Wang ^b, Chang-qun Cao ^b, Quan-feng Zheng ^g, Lin Mu ^h

7
8 ^a State Key Laboratory of Isotope Geochemistry, Guangzhou Institute of Geochemistry,
9 Chinese Academy of Sciences, Guangzhou 510640, China

10 ^b State Key Laboratory of Palaeobiology and Stratigraphy, Nanjing Institute of Geology and
11 Palaeontology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Nanjing 210008, China

12 ^c State Key Laboratory of Lithospheric Evolution, Institute of Geology and Geophysics,
13 Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100029, China

14 ^d GeoZentrum Nordbayern, Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg, Schlossgarten 5, 91054
15 Erlangen, Germany

16 ^e Department of Earth, Atmospheric, and Planetary Sciences, Massachusetts Institute of
17 Technology, 77 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02139, USA

18 ^f Department of Paleobiology, National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian Institution,
19 MRC-121, Washington, DC 20013-7012, USA

^g Key Laboratory of Economic Stratigraphy and Palaeogeography, Nanjing Institute of
Geology and Palaeontology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Nanjing 210008, China

^h Department of Invertebrate Palaeontology, Nanjing Institute of Geology and
Palaeontology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Nanjing 210008, China

* Corresponding author:

State Key Laboratory of Isotope Geochemistry,
Guangzhou Institute of Geochemistry, Chinese Academy of Sciences
511 Kehua Street, Wushan, Tianhe District, Guangzhou 510640, China

Tel/Fax : +86-20-85290030

E-mail address : junchen@gig.ac.cn (Jun Chen)

Abstract

Understanding the interplay of climatic and biological events in deep time requires
resolving the precise timing and pattern of palaeotemperature changes and their temporal
relationship with carbon cycle variations and biodiversity fluctuations. *In situ* oxygen
isotope analyses of conodont apatite from South China enables us to reconstruct
high-resolution seawater temperature records across the Permian-Triassic boundary (PTB)
intervals in the upper slope (Meishan), lower slope (Shangsi), and carbonate platform
(Daijiagou and Liangfengya) settings. Constrained by the latest high-precision
geochronological dates and high-resolution conodont biozones, we can establish the
temporal and spatial patterns of seawater temperature changes and assess their potential

connections with the carbon cycle disruption and biodiversity decline. We find a rapid warming of ~10 °C during the latest Permian-earliest Triassic that postdated the onset of the negative shift in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ by ~81 kyr (thousand years), the abrupt decline in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ by ~32 kyr and the onset of mass extinction by ~23 kyr, which contradicts previous claims that the extreme temperature rise started immediately before or coincided with the onset of mass extinction. Our new evidence indicates that climate warming was most likely not a direct cause for the main pulse of the end-Permian mass extinction (EPME), but rather a later participant or a catalyst that increased the pace of the biodiversity decline. In addition, a prominent cooling is recorded in the earliest Changhsingian, with the main phase (a drop of ~8 °C in ~0.2 Ma) confined to the lower part of the *C. wangi* zone and synchronous with the positive limb of the carbon isotope excursion (CIE) around the Wuchiapingian-Changhsingian boundary (WCB) in Meishan and Shangsi. Further long-term and high-resolution studies from other sections are needed to confirm the full contexts and underlying dynamics of the WCB “cooling event”.

Keywords: SIMS; Oxygen isotope; Conodont apatite; South China; Climate warming; End-Permian mass extinction

1. Introduction

The catastrophic EPME has long been recognized as the most severe crisis during the Phanerozoic, and marked a fundamental shift in Earth’s ecological structure (Raup and Sepkoski, 1982). Numerous hypotheses have been proposed as the cause(s) of this cataclysm, including bolide impact, ocean anoxia, and flood basalt volcanism (Knoll et al.,

2007; Payne and Clapham, 2012). Severe environmental perturbations related to the Siberian Traps volcanism have been considered by many as one of the most plausible scenarios for the killing mechanism (Campbell et al., 1992; Renne et al., 1995; Kamo et al., 2003; Svensen et al., 2009; Black et al., 2012). This “favored” hypothesis has received strong support from recent high-precision geochronological dates from the Meishan stratotype section (Burgess et al., 2014) and the Siberian Traps (Burgess and Bowring, 2015). A new age model (Burgess and Bowring, 2015) of the Siberian Traps volcanism (explosive, effusive, and intrusive) demonstrated that pyroclastic and lava eruptions predated the onset of the EPME by 300 ± 126 kyr, supporting a causal connection. Furthermore, two-thirds of an estimated 4×10^6 km³ of magma were emplaced/erupted over this ~300-kyr interval, before and during the mass extinction interval. The bulk of intrusive activity began within the mass extinction interval (within 61 ± 48 kyr; Burgess et al., 2014) and continued for at least 500 kyr after the cessation of mass extinction. Although the temporal overlap between the Siberian Traps volcanism and the EPME links the two events, many questions remain unresolved about the nature of the connection. For example, which pulse of the Siberian Traps volcanism is responsible for the EPME? What is the underlying dynamic behind such disparity between the volcanism and biotic crisis? Resolving such questions requires establishing a precise timeline between the environmental deterioration and biodiversity decline, since most large igneous province eruptions (Wignall, 2001; Bond and Wignall, 2014) are expected to impact the Earth’s climate via carbon cycle disruption, short-term cooling followed by long-term warming, and ocean acidification. The negative shift of $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ in whole rock carbonates from the Carnic

Alps of Austria initially suggested climate warming of ~5-6 °C around the PTB, although the possible influences from salinity and/or diagenesis cannot be excluded (Holser et al., 1989), which makes such whole rock $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record unreliable. Conodont apatite is preferred to whole rock carbonates and brachiopod calcites due to its resistance to diagenesis (Luz et al., 1984; Wenzel et al., 2000). Thus the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ signature of conodonts is widely regarded as an applicable proxy for reconstruction of seawater temperatures in the Paleozoic and Triassic (Trotter et al., 2008, 2015; Joachimski et al., 2012; Sun et al., 2012; Romano et al., 2013). Using this methodology, climate change around the EPME was demonstrated on the basis of $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data derived from conodont apatite in South China and Iran. These results indicated that the major seawater temperature increase started immediately before (Joachimski et al., 2012) or at the mass extinction horizon (Schobben et al., 2014) and suggested climate warming as one of the causes of the EPME. Owing to the absence of oxygen isotope data from Bed 25 in Meishan, the base of which corresponding to the onset of the EMPE (Jin et al., 2000; Shen et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2014), it was ambiguous whether the increase of temperatures predates, coincides with, or postdates the onset of mass extinction. Also, available $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data across the EPME (Joachimski et al., 2012; Schobben et al., 2014) were all derived from the conventional isotope ratio mass spectrometry (IRMS) method, which requires large sample size (> 0.5 mg, or 10-50 specimens depending on the size/weight of individuals) and analyzes on “bulk” materials. Since conodonts near the PTB are mostly small in size and of low abundance, particularly within the EPME interval and above, low-yielding conodont samples were excluded from the IRMS analyses, thus reducing the much needed

temporal resolution.

Understanding the interplay between climatic and biological events around the EPME requires resolving the precise timing and pattern of palaeotemperature changes and their temporal relationship with carbon cycle variations and biodiversity fluctuations, which is the aim of this contribution, undertaken through the combination of analytical method, materials selection, and updated temporal framework:

(1) *In situ* SIMS method. We overcome the limitation of conventional IRMS analyses (i.e., sample size) by measuring oxygen isotope compositions of individual conodont elements using the *in situ* secondary ion mass spectrometry (SIMS) method. To eliminate as many diagenetic and preservation artifacts as possibly we followed strict analytical procedures (see Supplementary material for details) and applied with considerable caution on the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variability (Wheeley et al., 2012; Zigaite and Whitehouse, 2014). This technique has been proven to have considerable potential for reconstructing palaeoclimate and palaeoceanography (Trotter et al., 2008, 2015; Rigo et al., 2012; Wheeley et al., 2012), and can significantly increase the spatial and temporal resolutions based on samples with low-yielding conodont elements.

(2) Multiple stratigraphic sections. To resolve the temporal and spatial pattern of palaeotemperature changes across the EPME interval, we generated high-resolution *in situ* oxygen isotope data from four sections in South China (Meishan, Shangsi, Daijiagou and Liangfengya). We selected the condensed Meishan and Shangsi sections, since extensive studies from both sections have produced integrated, high-resolution

geochronological dates (Shen et al., 2011; Burgess et al., 2014), carbon isotopes (Shen et al., 2013), and conodont biostratigraphy (Shen et al., 2013; Yuan et al., 2014). Published IRMS data from both sections (Joachimski et al., 2012; Chen et al., 2013) were also available for comparison with our new SIMS records. Samples from the well-studied Daijiagou (Yuan et al., 2015) and Liangfengya (Yuan and Shen, 2011) sections were also analyzed; both sections were deposited on a shallow carbonate platform during the Permian-Triassic transition, in contrast to Meishan (upper slope) and Shangsi (lower slope) and thus can be used for spatial comparison.

(3) Uniform temporal framework. To constrain the timing and rate of palaeotemperature changes, the stratigraphic depth of all samples are adjusted to a uniform timescale, mainly based on the latest U-Pb ages (Shen et al., 2011; Burgess et al., 2014) and conodont zones (Yuan et al., 2014) from Meishan to correlate with other sections. This results in a high-resolution, time dependent record for the latest Permian-earliest Triassic interval.

2. Studied sections and materials

Conodont samples used in this study were collected from four sections in South China (Fig. 1), which were located at a palaeolatitude of ~25 N° on the Yangtze carbonate platform and its northern marginal basin in the eastern Palaeotethys Ocean during the Late Permian-Early Triassic (Stampfli and Borel, 2004). Sequence stratigraphy and facies analysis (Shen and He, 1991; Shen and Shi, 1995; Wignall and Hallam, 1996; Yin et al., 2001; Song et al., 2013) indicated that the studied sections were deposited in different environmental settings around the PTB, including the upper slope (Meishan), lower slope

(Shangsi), and carbonate platform (Daijiagou and Liangfengya). Details on studied sections (Fig. 2) and materials can be found in the Supplementary material.

3. Biostratigraphic correlation and temporal framework

High-resolution Late Permian-Early Triassic conodont biostratigraphy (Shen et al., 2010; Shen and Mei, 2010), lithostratigraphy (Cao and Zheng, 2007; Yin et al., 2014), and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ chemostratigraphy (Shen et al., 2013) allowed us to correlate the sections with the newly revised conodont-based integrated records from the Meishan stratotype section (Yuan et al., 2014) serving as the standard. After thorough evaluation, the published conodont zones from Shangsi (Jiang et al., 2011; Shen et al., 2011, 2013), Daijiagou (Yuan et al., 2015), and Liangfengya (Yuan and Shen, 2011) were directly applied or accordingly modified as biostratigraphic constraints for intra-regional correlations (Supplementary Tables S1-4).

Several baselines for correlation were first established: **(1)** The PTB is at 42.11 m in Meishan, 100.4 m in Shangsi, 0.58 m in Daijiagou, and 0 m in Liangfengya, defined by the first appearances of *Hindeodus parvus*, except for Shangsi where the first occurrence of *Hindeodus parvus* was proven to be younger than many other occurrences including the FAD (First Appearance Datum) (Nicoll et al., 2002; Henderson, 2006; Jiang et al., 2011). *Hindeodus eurypyge* was regarded as an alternative index for our definition of the PTB in Shangsi (Shen et al., 2011, 2013), that is at the same level as in the restudy of Jiang et al. (2011) where the first occurrences of *Clarkina taylorae* and *Hindeodus changxingensis* defined the PTB. **(2)** The onset of the EPME is defined at the base of Bed 25 (41.93 m) at

Meishan (Jin et al., 2000; Shen et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2014), corresponding to the base of Bed 27 (100.1 m) at Shangsi (Shen et al., 2011, 2013), the base of “boundary clay” (0 m) at Daijiagou (Shen and Shi, 1995), and the base of Bed 29 (-0.51 m) at Liangfengya (Yuan and Shen, 2011). **(3)** The WCB is at 0.88 m (base of Bed 4a-2) in the Meishan stratotype section (Jin et al., 2006) and 84.0 m in Shangsi (Shen et al., 2011, 2013), both of which were defined by the first appearances of *Clarkina wangi*. The exact position of the WCB in Daijiagou is unclear since only sparse conodonts have been recovered from this interval (Yuan et al., 2015). The WCB in Liangfengya is also difficult to determine, although early study at the nearby Beifengjing section (Shen and Shi, 2002) suggested that the base of the Changhsingian is likely ca. 91.5 m below the PTB.

In addition to the conodont zones assigned to each sample, numeric age estimates were also allocated on the basis of sediment accumulation rate calculations for specific intervals in each section (see details in Supplementary Tables S1-4). In the extensively studied Meishan section, the WCB, the onset of the EPME, and the PTB were constrained by recent high-precision geochronology as 254.14 ± 0.07 Ma (Shen et al., 2011), 251.941 ± 0.037 Ma (Burgess et al., 2014), and 251.902 ± 0.024 Ma (Burgess et al., 2014), respectively. Along with ages from other dated ash beds (Shen et al., 2011; Burgess et al., 2014), a high-resolution temporal framework can be established for the WCB-PTB interval in Meishan.

Twelve ash beds from Shangsi have been dated previously; eight of them produced reliable ages which were in agreement with results from the Meishan section at the time they were published (Shen et al., 2011). Subsequent improvements in U-Pb

geochronology yielded more precise and accurate ages in Meishan (Burgess et al., 2014), but such updates are currently unavailable for the Shangsi section. For the convenience of high-precision correlation in a uniform temporal framework, we only use updated ages from Meishan (PTB, mass extinction, and WCB) to calibrate our samples from Shangsi, Daijiagou, and Liangfengya (Supplementary Tables S1-4).

4. *In situ* SIMS method

Using *in situ* SIMS technique to measure the oxygen isotope composition of conodont apatite (Trotter et al., 2008, 2015; Rigo et al., 2012; Wheeley et al., 2012), foraminiferal calcite (Kozdon et al., 2009, 2011), and other faunal materials (Aubert et al., 2012; Blumenthal et al., 2014; Zigaite and Whitehouse, 2014) have been well developed in recent years, with similar analytical procedures among different laboratories. At the CA-SIMS laboratory in the Institute of Geology and Geophysics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, we used a Cameca IMS-1280 SIMS, generally following the methodology developed in the SHRIMP laboratory of the Australian National University (Trotter et al., 2008, 2015). Detailed analytical procedures and protocols are presented in the Supplementary material.

5. Results

Rather than focusing on the mass extinction interval alone, our *in situ* $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ records extend to the latest Wuchiapingian (top of the *C. longicuspida* zone) in Meishan (Figs. 3, 4) and the earliest Changhsingian (base of the *C. wangi* zone) in Shangsi (Fig. 5), thus

217 placing the PTB events within a long-term context. $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ data across the WCB in
 218 Meishan (Fig. 3) show a prominent increase ($\sim 2\text{‰}$), which began immediately above the
 219 WCB (MSD 4a-3, 1.07 m, 19.2‰), and extended into the lower part of the *C. wangi* zone
 220 (MSD 4b-11, 2.59 m, 21.0‰). Although not as in high-resolution as in Meishan, data from
 221 the earliest Changhsingian in Shangsi suggest a similar pattern, which started at 20.3‰
 222 (SHS-283.4, 84.57 m, base of the *C. wangi* zone) and ended at 20.6‰ (SHS-285.0, 86.13
 223 m, lower part of the *C. wangi* zone) (Fig. 5). Without sufficient data below the WCB in both
 224 Meishan and Shangsi to constrain the “real” initiation of this positive shift in $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$, we
 225 tentatively suggest that the increasing phase is confined in the *C. wangi* zone.
 226 Above the increasing phase in the *C. wangi* zone and below the base of the *C. yini* zone,
 227 $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values from both Meishan and Shangsi (Figs. 3, 5) are comparable and
 228 fluctuate around $\sim 21\text{‰}$. Detailed evaluation of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ data from this interval in Meishan
 229 show several shifts, such as the decrease from 22.5‰ (MSD 19-17, 33.69 m) to 20.5‰
 230 (MSD 20-2a~2b, 35.55 m), followed by an immediate return to 22.1‰ (MSD 22-10-base,
 231 39.00 m), both of which occurred at the top of the *C. changxingensis* zone. Due to
 232 different sampling intensity, such shifts in the better resolved Meishan section cannot be
 233 confirmed in Shangsi, Daijiagou, and Liangfengya (Figs. 5-7).
 234 High-resolution data above the base of the *C. yini* zone from all four studied sections (Figs.
 235 4-7) enabled us to correlate and compare the pattern and magnitude of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ changes
 236 in different environmental settings. **(1)** The general trends are nearly identical among four
 237 sections: prior to the onset of the EPME, $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values are high (20.5-21.5‰ in
 238 Meishan, 20.0-21.0‰ in Shangsi, 19.0-20.0‰ in Daijiagou, and 18.5-19.5‰ in

Liangfengya); a dramatic negative shift occurred above the extinction horizon, with
 comparable magnitude of 2.5-3.0‰ across the four sections. Close observations indicate
 that a mild decrease occurs in the *C. yini* zone and is followed by a return to the pre-shift
 level at the mass extinction horizon. As for the minimum of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ value, it appears in
 the middle-to-top of the *C. yini* zone at Meishan and Shangsi but near the very top at
 Daijiagou and Liangfengya. **(2)** Data across the mass extinction horizon from all sections
 suggests that the prominent decrease of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values occurred after the onset of the
 EPME. Using high-resolution data from the well-constrained Meishan section as an
 example (Fig. 4), $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values remain as high as 21.0‰ throughout Beds 24e to 25
 (on *Clarkina*), decrease to 20.1‰ in Bed 26 (on *Clarkina*), dramatically drop to 19.4‰ (on
Clarkina) or 18.6‰ (on *Hindeodus*) in Bed 27-1, and reach the first low of 17.9‰ in Bed
 28 (on *Hindeodus*) and the second low of 17.6‰ in Bed 30-5 (on ramiforms). Given the
 potential offset between *Clarkina* and *Hindeodus* (Joachimski et al., 2012; Chen et al.,
 2013), a conservative comparison based on *Clarkina* alone indicates that the decrease to
 19.4‰ occurred in Bed 27-1, thus the rapid drop in $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ postdated the onset of the
 EPME. **(3)** Although the magnitude of significant decrease above the EPME horizon is
 generally consistent among four sections (2.5-3.0‰), the distinct difference lies with the
 absolute $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values. For instance, $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values at the mass extinction horizon
 are ca. 21.0‰ in Meishan and Shangsi, which is about 1.0-1.5‰ higher than those in
 Daijiagou and Liangfengya. Whether such offsets are related to the differences in
 environmental setting or CAI value of conodont elements (see Supplementary material for
 details) is unclear, and requires further study based on more systematic datasets.

Nonetheless, our conclusions are not affected by such offsets, since the primary concern is about the temporal relationship between the sudden decrease in $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ and the onset of the EPME, and also whether such pattern can be confirmed across studied sections.

High-precision temporal framework enabled us to assess the timing and rate of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ changes during the Late Permian-earliest Triassic, especially around the EMPE interval (Fig. 8) when the timeline of the well constrained end-Permian carbon isotope excursion (CIE) and mass extinction can be associated. If one accepts that the main phase of positive shift of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ around the WCB is only confined to the lower part of the *C. wangi* zone (Fig. 3), calculation based on our age estimates suggests a prominent rise of $\sim 2\text{‰}$ occurred in about 0.2 Ma (Fig. 8A). After this rapid increase around the WCB and prior to the dramatic decrease that postdated the onset of the EPME, the long-term fluctuations during most of the Changhsingian are around a baseline of $\sim 21\text{‰}$. About 0.1 Ma before the onset of the EPME, comparable data indicate no substantial shifts in $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ (Fig. 8B). Timing of the transient change (mild decrease followed by a return) prior to the onset of the EPME is inconsistent among studied sections, which appeared slightly earlier in Meishan and Shangsi but more close to the onset of the EPME in Daijiagou and Liangfengya, thus indicating local controls rather than global climatic events. Latest geochronological dates from Meishan (Burgess et al., 2014) constrained the onset of the CIE, the abrupt decline in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$, the onset of the EMPE, the PTB, and the cessation of the EPME at 251.999 Ma, 251.950 Ma, 251.941 Ma, 251.902 Ma, and 251.880 Ma, respectively. If one accepts the substantial decrease of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ at 251.918

Ma (corresponding to the base of Bed 27-1 in Meishan; Figs. 4, 8B), a straightforward calculation suggests that the significant warming occurred ~81 kyr after the onset of the CIE, ~32 kyr after the abrupt decline in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$, and ~23 kyr after the onset of the EPME.

6. Discussions

6.1 SIMS and IRMS comparison

The techniques for analyzing oxygen isotope compositions of biogenic phosphates as palaeoenvironmental proxies have been well developed (Kolodny et al., 1983; Shemesh et al., 1983; Luz et al., 1984; Luz and Kolodny, 1985). As biogenic apatite, conodonts can be described by the general formula $\text{Ca}_5\text{Na}_{0.14}(\text{PO}_4)_{3.01}(\text{CO}_3)_{0.16}\text{F}_{0.73}(\text{H}_2\text{O})_{0.85}$ (Pietzner et al., 1968), with oxygen presented in three different sites of the mineral. The conventional IRMS method isolates the PO_4^{3-} group as Ag_3PO_4 , which is then converted to CO as the analyte gas for oxygen isotope measurements (O'Neil et al., 1994; Joachimski et al., 2009). By comparison, the *in situ* SIMS technique utilizes Cs^+ primary ion beam to bombard the exposed smooth surfaces of untreated biogenic phosphates and releases oxygen from all O-bearing compounds (PO_4^{3-} , CO_3^{2-} , and OH^-). Given the difference in analytical principles, offsets between paired $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values derived from IRMS and SIMS methods are expected. Calculations by Wheeley et al. (2012) suggested that the shift in values from a purely PO_4^{3-} signal is likely to be of the order of +0.02-0.7‰ and was supported by paired data from two Silurian conodont samples measured by both SIMS and IRMS techniques, which show offsets of ca. 0.5‰ and 1.0‰ for *Ozarkodina* and

Panderodus, respectively. Measurements on modern shark teeth enameloid suggested that the SHRIMP $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values are systematically higher than IRMS values, such as 0.7‰ (Trotter et al., 2008) or typically by ~0.6-1.3‰ (Trotter et al., 2015). Among the 128 samples from Meishan measured with the *in situ* SIMS technique, 63 have been analyzed with the conventional IRMS method (Joachimski et al., 2012; Chen et al., 2013), which provides us an opportunity to constrain the offset with larger datasets. The phosphorite standard NBS 120c is widely used in the IRMS analyses, and both 21.7‰ and 22.6‰ have been reported (Joachimski et al., 2012; Sun et al., 2012; Chen et al., 2013; Schobben et al., 2014). Although the NBS 120c standard is distributed in the form of calcium phosphate powder that cannot be directly measured with the *in situ* SIMS method, it was used in the IRMS analyses to determine the $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values of our Durango standard (Supplementary Table S6). To compare the IRMS and SIMS data from Meishan, the earlier published IRMS $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values (Joachimski et al., 2012; Chen et al., 2013) were adjusted by subtracting 0.9‰ (Supplementary Database S2, Table S7) based on the now accepted value of NBS 120c of 21.7‰ (Lécuyer et al., 2013). After adjustment, a comparison between the corrected IRMS values and our *in situ* SIMS data (Fig. 9A) shows that the two datasets are linearly correlated and can be expressed by the following regression:

$$\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{SIMS}} = (0.96 \pm 0.08) \delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{IRMS}} + (1.31 \pm 1.70), R^2 = 0.68.$$

Pearson correlation coefficient also suggests a positive relationship (Pearson's $r = 0.82$, $p = 0.00$, $n = 63$). The SIMS values are generally higher than the IRMS ones, with an average offset of +0.5‰ ($\Delta = \delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{SIMS}} - \delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{IRMS}}$, Max. = +2.2, Min. = -0.9); if excluding the

327 rare abnormal data, the offset is typically $\sim 0.0\text{--}1.0\text{‰}$ (average of $+0.5\text{‰}$; Fig. 9B), which is
328 consistent with the reported biases (Trotter et al., 2008, 2015; Wheeley et al., 2012).

329 There is no correlation between the offsets and the stratigraphic depths, thus indicating
330 the offsets are consistently within a specific range (0 to 1‰) that is not time dependent.

332 **6.2 Palaeotemperature calculations**

333 Since the establishment of the phosphate $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ thermometer (Kolodny et al., 1983), several
334 revisions of the phosphate-water fractionation and temperature calibration have been
335 published and no consensus has been reached (Pucéat et al., 2010; Lécuyer et al., 2013;
336 Chang and Blake, 2015). Calculation of seawater temperatures in deep time is subject to
337 some uncertainties. On the premise that $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values measured on conodont apatite are
338 precise and accurate, oxygen isotope composition of seawater from which they precipitate
339 is another variable that determining the calculated temperatures. Although we cannot
340 directly measure $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$, it has been suggested that the secular variations in global
341 mean $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ are generally around $0 \pm 1\text{‰}$ (VSMOW) (Jaffrés et al., 2007), following
342 the glacial-interglacial cycles due to the significant effect from ^{18}O depleted glacial
343 meltwater (Lhomme et al., 2005). For the “ice-free” Late Permian-Early Triassic world
344 (Chumakov and Zharkov, 2003), $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ of -1‰ (VSMOW) is commonly adopted in
345 palaeotemperature calculations (Joachimski et al., 2012; Rigo et al., 2012; Sun et al.,
346 2012; Romano et al., 2013; Trotter et al., 2015).

347 Salinity and ice volume are the two main unknowns affecting $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$, the first of which
348 is dependent on the balance between evaporation and precipitation, and the second is
349 determined by the formation and melting of glacial ice sheets. According to the recently
350 published data from the tropical Pacific Ocean (Conroy et al., 2014), the slope of the
351 regression between $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ and salinity is about 0.31‰ psu^{-1} in the mixed layer (0-75 m)
352 and 0.42‰ psu^{-1} in the subsurface (80-500 m); the salinity-depth relationship suggests that
353 local salinity is generally stable in the mixed layer and subsurface. By this standard, a
354 substantial decrease of 0.5‰ in salinity reflects a decrease of only 0.15‰ in $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ for
355 the tropical surface oceans, which is small compared with the uncertainties of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$
356 analyses using IRMS or SIMS. Based on this salinity-depth relationship, in a
357 palaeoenvironment such as the Yangtze carbonate platform and its northern marginal
358 basin (Yin et al., 2014), dramatic sea-level changes that would have caused major shift in
359 salinity (Adkins et al., 2002) sufficient to alter the local $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ seem unlikely.
360 Consequently, we presume that the influence of salinity on $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ was probably
361 minimal. Sedimentological data from eastern Australia (Fielding et al., 2008) indicated
362 eight discrete glacial intervals (C1-C4, and P1-P4) for the Late Paleozoic Ice Age. The
363 timing and duration of the youngest P4 glacial was initially interpreted as 267-260 Ma
364 (Fielding et al., 2008), but recently revised to 260-254.5 Ma based on high-precision dating
365 of tuffs from the Sydney and Bowen basins (Metcalf et al., 2015). Since our investigated
366 time interval postdates the P4 glacial (Fig. 8A), the potential influence of ice volume can
367 also be disregarded.
368 By assuming $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ is constant at -1‰ (VSMOW), comparisons between calculated

temperatures using three different equations (Kolodny et al., 1983; Pucat et al., 2010; Lcuyer et al., 2013) suggest offsets up to 4 C (Supplementary Database S2). But since the $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ value and the equation used for calculation do not affect the relative changes in temperature, we emphasize the trend and magnitude (Figs. 3-7) rather than the absolute temperatures. Using the recent equation from Lcuyer et al. (2013), a 1 shift in $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ would correspond to a temperature change of ~4.5 C, which is the general scale applied to our assessments regarding the magnitude of temperature change.

We also note that the available phosphate $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ thermometers (Kolodny et al., 1983; Pucat et al., 2010; Lcuyer et al., 2013) are only applicable to the IRMS method. If the bias of +0.5 between the SIMS and IRMS values is considered valid, *in situ* $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values need to be systematically reduced by 0.5 prior to the temperature calculations using the IRMS-based $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ thermometers, and the temperature scales presented in Fig. 8 would shift upwards by ~2.3 C.

6.3 Climate cooling around the WCB

Our *in situ* SIMS records from Meishan and Shangsi indicate a prominent cooling around the WCB. Based on current $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ datasets (Figs. 3, 5) and palaeotemperature calculations, we tentatively suggest that this cooling occurred immediately above the WCB, with the main phase (a drop of ~8 C in ~0.2 Ma) confined to the lower part of the *C. wangi* zone.

390 Indications of a Wuchiapingian warming followed by a Changhsingian cooling have been
391 inferred from the fossil evidence in the peri-Gondwanan region (southern Tibet, Salt Range
392 in Pakistan, and Kashmir) (Mei and Henderson, 2001; Shen et al., 2006), which were
393 located in a mesothermal palaeolatitude zone and therefore more sensitive to climate
394 change. For instance, the lower part of the Lopingian sequence (upper part of the Wargal
395 Formation and lower part of the Chhidru Formation) in the Salt Range, Pakistan contains
396 numerous compound rugose corals, warm-water brachiopods and conodonts (e.g.,
397 *Clarkina longicuspidata*, *C. guangyuanensis*) that are very common in South China, and
398 indicates a warm climate during the Wuchiapingian (Kummel and Teichert, 1970; Shen et
399 al., 2006; Chen et al., 2011, 2013). By contrast, the middle and upper parts of the Chhidru
400 Formation is characterized by typical cold-water brachiopods and conodonts such as
401 *Vjalovognathus* and *Merrillina* (Wardlaw and Mei, 1999; Mei and Henderson, 2001). Along
402 the northwestern margin of Pangaea, the biogenic chert succession in the Sverdrup Basin
403 recorded a significant cooling, which is indicated by siliceous sponge-dominated biota in
404 shallow-water chert (Beauchamp and Baud, 2002). In the southern hemisphere, distal
405 glaciomarine facies of the Wuchiapingian were widely deposited in the Sydney, Bowen,
406 and Tasmania basins (Frank et al., 2015). A similar cooling event around the WCB was
407 also recently reported from the continental Karoo Basin, South Africa (Rey et al., in press).
408 These reports suggest cooler condition in the high-latitude, peri-Gondwanan region during
409 the Wuchiapingian-Changhsingian transition, which is in accord with our seawater
410 temperature records from low-latitude South China.

Previous investigations of the Late Permian-Early Triassic interval have mainly concentrated on the PTB and GLB (Guadalupian-Lopingian boundary) events, thus little was known about climate change in association with perturbations of carbon cycle and biodiversity across the WCB. Our records (Figs. 3, 5) provide temporal constraints on the carbon cycle variation, seawater temperature change, and biodiversity pattern during the late Wuchiapingian-early Changhsingian, although the underlying dynamics connecting these changes remain unresolved. Unlike the globally recognized end-Permian CIE, $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ records around the late Wuchiapingian-early Changhsingian suggested spatial and temporal heterogeneity (Shen et al., 2013). Studied sections in South China demonstrated a broad negative excursion with different magnitudes, such as 6.3‰ in Shangsi, 5.3‰ in Matan, and 2.8‰ in Dukou (Shen et al., 2013). This excursion is truncated in the basal part of the Meishan section (Fig. 3) due to a major regression (Wang et al., 2006), but more completely expressed in the long-ranging Shangsi section (Fig. 5). The quantitative marine biodiversity pattern indicated that no significant change in taxon richness across the WCB (Wang et al., 2014): the taxon turnover and diversification rates remained relatively stable during the Wuchiapingian but increased in the early Changhsingian, and the mean longevity of extant taxa rapidly decreased across the WCB (Fig. 4 in Wang et al., 2014). Using the temporal framework we established, onset of the prominent cooling in Meishan lags the first and second minima of $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ by 0.73 Ma and 0.08 Ma, respectively (Fig. 3; calculation based on the accumulation rate in Supplementary Table S1). At the Shangsi section, we can only infer that the cooling phase in the *C. wangi* zone is nearly synchronous with the positive return after the broad negative shift of 6.3‰

and smaller negative shift of 3.0‰ (Fig. 5; Shen et al., 2013) due to absence of long-term $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ records below the WCB.

Schobben et al. (2014) reported coupled $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ (IRMS) data from the Kuh-e-Ali Bashi and Zal sections in northwestern Iran, but indicated no distinct changes in both proxies from the upper Julfa Beds and lower Ali Bashi Formation, which may reflect insufficient sampling within this interval, imprecise correlation of the WCB, or another possibility that the prominent shifts in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ recorded around the WCB in Meishan and Shangsi is likely regional rather than global signals. Further long-term and high-resolution studies around the WCB in Iran, as well as other sections in South China, will be necessary to clarify whether there were any significant events occurred during the late Wuchiapingian-early Changhsingian.

6.4 Carbon cycle disruption, rapid warming, and the end-Permian mass extinction

The end-Permian CIE is widely recognized in marine and non-marine sections (Korte and Kozur, 2010; Shen et al., 2011, 2013; Payne and Clapham, 2012). Evidence from the well-constrained Meishan section indicates that the CIE started at 251.999 ± 0.039 Ma and ended at 251.572 ± 0.069 Ma, with a total duration of 427 ± 79 kyr (Burgess et al., 2014). $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ values exhibit a gradual decrease from +3.9‰ at the beginning, followed by an abrupt decline to a minimum of -3.3‰ immediately below the mass extinction horizon before returning to +1.5‰, and subsequently end with a slight decrease to -1.7‰ (Figs. 3, 4). This pattern has been related to addition of a large amount of ^{13}C -depleted

carbon into the ocean/atmosphere system, although the source remains the subject of controversy (Berner, 2002; Payne and Clapham, 2012).

The *in situ* SIMS technique employed on contemporaneous conodont samples across the EMPE interval from different environmental settings combined with the high-precision temporal framework, increases our understanding of the temporal and spatial pattern of seawater temperature changes prior to, during, and after the EPME (Fig. 8). The systematic offsets in $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values ($\sim 1.0\text{--}1.5\text{‰}$) between the carbonate platform (Daijiagou and Liangfengya) and slope (Meishan and Shangsi) correspond to the difference in CAI values ($\sim 0.5\text{--}1.0$) of analyzed conodont apatite, thus indicating thermal alteration may have impacts on $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values. This supports the conclusion of Wheeley et al. (2012), although an extended quantitative relationship is yet to be established.

Besides this offset, data around the Permian-Triassic transition are highly comparable among studied sections. About 1.5 Ma before the onset of the end-Permian CIE (Fig. 8A), seawater temperatures fluctuate around $\sim 18\text{ °C}$. Between the onset of the CIE and the onset of the EPME (Fig. 8B), transient warming and subsequent cooling is evident among studied sections, although the timing and magnitude differ and likely suggest local controls rather than global climatic signals. Above the EPME horizon, a rapid warming is consistent in timing and magnitude ($\sim 10\text{ °C}$ in $< 20\text{ kyr}$) across shallow carbonate platform (Daijiagou and Liangfengya), upper slope (Meishan), and lower slope (Shangsi), thus suggesting a catastrophic climatic event. Seawater temperatures remained high ($> 30\text{ °C}$) above the PTB and continued to rise until the late Griesbachian (Sun et al., 2012; Romano et al., 2013).

Our results suggest a lag of ~25 kyr (Fig. 8B) between the rapid decline in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ and the rapid increase in seawater temperatures. However, the “boundary clay” at Meishan (Beds 25 and 26) was likely deposited more rapidly than the micritic limestone of Bed 27, suggesting that the lag could have been much less than 25 kyr. Global sea surface temperature does not respond quickly to climate forcing due to the thermal inertia of the ocean mixed layer and the exchange between the surface and deeper ocean (Hansen et al., 2011; Hansen and Sato, 2012). The lag of the climate response can be characterized by a climate response function, with a full response requiring at least a millennium (Hansen et al., 2011). Massive greenhouse gases released from the Siberian Traps volcanism (Svensen et al., 2009) and/or other contemporaneous volcanism (Yin et al., 1992) is likely the principal forcing that governed climate trends during the latest Permian-earliest Triassic. On millennium or longer time scales, the enhanced energy resulted from volcanic eruptions is mainly absorbed by the ocean through intake in the mixed layer and heat exchange between the surface and deeper ocean. Given a world with high continent and deep ocean during the Permian-Triassic transition (Yin and Song, 2013), full mixing in the vast Panthalassa and Tethys Oceans would take longer than usual, hence the extended delay of climate response, which makes the lag we observed plausible.

Whether rapid warming caused the catastrophic EPME depends on the pattern of mass extinction (e.g., onset, acme, and cessation). Using a confidence interval approach, the pattern of marine mass extinction was first established at the Meishan section, which revealed a single catastrophic event between Beds 25 and 28 (Jin et al., 2000). Later

quantitative biostratigraphic studies using the constrained optimization approach (Shen et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2014) based a dataset of 1450 species from 18 sections across South China and the peri-Gondwanan region confirmed the conclusion that the onset and cessation of mass extinction occurred at Bed 25 and 28, respectively. Despite different views on the extinction pattern (see discussions in Wang et al., 2014), a common ground is accepted that the onset of the EPME occurred at the base of Bed 25 in Meishan. Our calculated seawater temperatures from Meishan (Figs. 4, 8B) are ~18.3 °C throughout Beds 24e and 25 (*Clarkina*), increase to 22.5 °C in Bed 26 (*Clarkina*) and then jump to 27.2 °C in Bed 27-1 (average of *Clarkina* and *Hindeodus*) before reaching a maximum of 32.4 °C in Bed 28 (*Hindeodus*). Therefore, significant warming clearly postdated the onset of the EPME, and the temperature rise cannot be considered a direct cause for the main pulse of the EPME. Nonetheless, the high rate of temperature rise (~10 °C in < 20 kyr) probably increased the pace of mass extinction, which is now constrained to have lasted for only 61 ± 48 kyr (Burgess et al., 2014).

Although our data suggests that climate warming clearly postdated the main pulse of the EPME (corresponding to Bed 25 at Meishan), we are not arguing against the involvement of the Siberian Traps volcanism in the environmental deterioration and biodiversity decline around the mass extinction horizon, since the carbon cycle disruption (Rothman et al., 2014), changes in pH (Payne et al., 2010; Hinojosa et al., 2012; Clarkson et al., 2015) and redox conditions (Cao et al., 2009) of the ocean temporally overlapped with the Siberian Traps volcanism (Burgess and Bowring, 2015). Pyroclastic and lava eruptions of the Siberian Traps began long (> 200 kyr) before the initial negative shift of $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ (Fig.4 in

Burgess and Bowring, 2015), suggesting that early explosive magmatism did not initiate dramatic feedback in the global carbon cycle. It was probably until around 251.999 ± 0.039 Ma when a tipping point was reached after sustained input and accumulation of greenhouse gases, the disruption of the carbon cycle started, followed by the abrupt negative shift of $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ at 251.950 ± 0.042 Ma and the onset of mass extinction at 251.941 ± 0.037 Ma. Protracted degassing of CO_2 from recycled crust in the mantle plume head (Sobolev et al., 2011) provides a plausible explanation for the initial non-response and subsequent progressive decrease in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$. By their estimation, the magnitude of the CIE would be 4.9‰ if all plume-related CO_2 migrated to the surface, and 3.5‰ with the migration of only half of the volume (Sobolev et al., 2011). Judging from the overall trend and magnitude of the CIE (Korte and Kozur, 2010; Shen et al., 2013), it is likely only around half of the plume-related CO_2 was released prior to the onset of the EPME. The rapid decline of $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ across the mass extinction horizon and continuing negative shift in the earliest Triassic are probably the consequences of subsequent massive release through contact metamorphism of carbon-rich and sulphur-rich sediments (Erwin, 2006; Svensen et al., 2009), superimposed on the remnant plume-related degassing. In the absence of robust evidence to identify main pulse(s) of the Siberian Traps volcanism, our seawater temperature record may be interpreted as an indirect monitor for the volcanic processes. A new age model for the extrusive and intrusive magmatism of the Siberian Traps (Burgess and Bowring, 2015) suggested that the majority of extrusive magmatism occurred between 252.20 ± 0.12 Ma and 251.901 ± 0.061 Ma, and the intrusive magmatism started at 251.907 ± 0.067 Ma and continued for at least 500 kyr

after the cessation of mass extinction. If we accept that the substantial temperature rise occurred in Beds 27-28 at Meishan (Fig. 8B) and consider the potentially biased sample coverage for the older sills (Burgess and Bowring, 2015), a restricted interval of the overlap (~251.918-251.880 Ma) between the lava eruption and intrusive magmatism is likely responsible for the rapid climate warming.

7. Conclusions

In situ oxygen isotope analyses on conodont apatite from four sections in South China (Meishan, Shangsi, Daijiagou, and Liangfengya) provides a high-resolution relative seawater temperature record of the Late Permian-Early Triassic. Constrained by the latest high-precision geochronology and high-resolution conodont biostratigraphy, we can place the temperatures in both temporal and spatial perspectives. Coupled with $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ data and biodiversity pattern, our results shed light on the causal links between the environmental changes and biological crisis, especially across the catastrophic EPME interval. Key findings in this study are:

(1) A prominent cooling occurred in the earliest Changhsingian, with the main phase (a drop of ~8 °C in ~0.2 Ma) confined to the lower part of the *C. wangi* zone and synchronous with the positive limb of the CIE around the WCB at Meishan and Shangsi. Full contexts and underlying dynamics of the “WCB events” await further confirmation from other sections.

(2) After the cooling event, seawater temperatures fluctuated during most the Changhsingian. Transient warming and subsequent cooling is recorded between the

onset of negative shift in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ and the onset of the EMPE, which probably represents the last pulse of the long-term fluctuations rather than any significant climatic events. Evidence such as gradual decline in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ and the absence of substantial changes in the temperature record suggests that the Siberian Traps magmatism and/or other contemporaneous volcanism had not reached their full potential at the onset of mass extinction.

(3) Above the extinction horizon, a dramatic warming ($\sim 10^\circ\text{C}$ in < 20 kyr) is consistent in timing and magnitude across the upper slope (Meishan), lower slope (Shangsi), and carbonate platform (Daijiagou and Liangfengya), accompanied with ocean acidification and continued decrease in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$, thus indicating a catastrophic event that is likely related to massive degassing during a restricted interval (~ 251.918 - 251.880 Ma) of the Siberian Traps volcanism.

(4) The lags between the abrupt decline in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$, the onset of the EMPE, and the rapid temperature increase suggest that climate warming was most likely not a direct cause for the main pulse of the EPME (corresponding to Bed 25 at Meishan), but rather a later participant or a catalyst that increased the pace of the biodiversity decline.

(5) Comparison based on a suite of 63 conodont samples from the Meishan section that have been measured by both SIMS and IRMS methods suggests that the SIMS $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values are generally higher than the IRMS ones, with an average offset of $+0.5\text{‰}$.

Acknowledgments

We thank G.Q. Tang, Y. Liu, X.X. Ling, and H.X. Ma for assistance with the SIMS analyses.

We are also grateful to Zivile Zigaite and Charles Henderson for their constructive reviews and Jisuo Jin for his editorial handling. This research was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (41290260, 41203008), National Basic Research Program of China (2011CB808900), State Key Laboratory of Isotope Geochemistry (SKLIG-QD-12-02), State Key Laboratory of Palaeobiology and Stratigraphy (123111, 20131101). S.A. Bowring's participation was supported by National Science Foundation (EAR-0807475). This is contribution No. IS-2162 from GIGCAS.

References

- Adkins, J.F., McIntyre, K., Schrag, D.P., 2002. The Salinity, Temperature, and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ of the Glacial Deep Ocean. *Science* 298, 1769-1773.
- Aubert, M., Williams, I.S., Boljkovac, K., Moffat, I., Moncel, M.H., Dufour, E., Grun, R., 2012. *In situ* oxygen isotope micro-analysis of faunal material and human teeth using a SHRIMP II: A new tool for palaeo-ecology and archaeology. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 39, 3184-3194.
- Beauchamp, B., Baud, A., 2002. Growth and demise of Permian biogenic chert along northwest Pangea: Evidence for end-Permian collapse of thermohaline circulation. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 184, 37-63.
- Berner, R.A., 2002. Examination of hypotheses for the Permo-Triassic boundary extinction by carbon cycle modeling. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 99, 4172-4177.
- Black, B.A., Elkins-Tanton, L.T., Rowe, M.C., Peate, I.U., 2012. Magnitude and consequences of volatile release from the Siberian Traps. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 317,

608 363-373.

609 Blumenthal, S.A., Cerling, T.E., Chritz, K.L., Bromage, T.G., Kozdon, R., Valley, J.W.,
610 2014. Stable isotope time-series in mammalian teeth: *In situ* $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ from the innermost
611 enamel layer. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 124, 223-236.

612 Bond, D.P.G., Wignall, P.B., 2014. Large igneous provinces and mass extinctions: An
613 update, in: Keller, G., Kerr, A.C. (Eds.), *Volcanism, Impacts, and Mass Extinctions: Causes and Effects*: Geological Society of America Special Paper 505. The
614 Geological Society of America, Boulder, pp. 29-55.

615

616 Burgess, S.D., Bowring, S., 2015. High-precision geochronology confirms voluminous
617 magmatism before, during, and after Earth's most severe extinction. *Sci. Adv.* 1,
618 e1500470.

619 Burgess, S.D., Bowring, S.A., Shen, S.Z., 2014. High-precision timeline for Earth's most
620 severe extinction. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 111, 3316-3321.

621 Campbell, I.H., Czamanske, G.K., Fedorenko, V.A., Hill, R.I., Stepanov, V., 1992.
622 Synchronism of the Siberian Traps and the Permian-Triassic Boundary. *Science* 258,
623 1760-1763.

624 Cao, C.Q., Love, G.D., Hays, L.E., Wang, W., Shen, S.Z., Summons, R.E., 2009.
625 Biogeochemical evidence for euxinic oceans and ecological disturbance presaging
626 the end-Permian mass extinction event. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 281, 188-201.

627 Cao, C.Q., Zheng, Q.F., 2007. High-resolution lithostratigraphy of the Changhsingian
628 stage in Meishan section D, Zhejiang. *Journal of Stratigraphy* 31, 14-22 (in Chinese).

629 Chang, S.J., Blake, R.E., 2015. Precise calibration of equilibrium oxygen isotope

630 fractionations between dissolved phosphate and water from 3 to 37 °C. *Geochim.*
631 *Cosmochim. Acta* 150, 314-329.

632 Chen, B., Joachimski, M.M., Shen, S.Z., Lambert, L.L., Lai, X.L., Wang, X.D., Chen, J.,
633 Yuan, D.X., 2013. Permian ice volume and palaeoclimate history: Oxygen isotope
634 proxies revisited. *Gondwana Res.* 24, 77-89.

635 Chen, B., Joachimski, M.M., Sun, Y.D., Shen, S.Z., Lai, X.L., 2011. Carbon and conodont
636 apatite oxygen isotope records of Guadalupian-Lopingian boundary sections: Climatic
637 or sea-level signal? *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 311, 145-153.

638 Chumakov, N.M., Zharkov, M.A., 2003. Climate during the Permian-Triassic biosphere
639 reorganizations. Article 2. Climate of the Late Permian and Early Triassic: General
640 inferences. *Stratigr. Geol. Correl.* 11, 361-375.

641 Clarkson, M.O., Kasemann, S.A., Wood, R.A., Lenton, T.M., Daines, S.J., Richoz, S.,
642 Ohnemueeller, F., Meixner, A., Poulton, S.W., Tipper, E.T., 2015. Ocean acidification
643 and the Permo-Triassic mass extinction. *Science* 348, 229-232.

644 Conroy, J.L., Cobb, K.M., Lynch-Stieglitz, J., Polissar, P.J., 2014. Constraints on the
645 salinity–oxygen isotope relationship in the central tropical Pacific Ocean. *Mar. Chem.*
646 161, 26-33.

647 Erwin, D.H., 2006. *Extinction : how life on earth nearly ended 250 million years ago.*
648 Princeton University Press, Princeton, N.J.

649 Fielding, C.R., Frank, T.D., Birgenheier, L.P., Rygel, M.C., Jones, A.T., Roberts, J., 2008.
650 Stratigraphic imprint of the Late Palaeozoic Ice Age in eastern Australia: a record of
651 alternating glacial and nonglacial climate regime. *J. Geol. Soc. London* 165, 129-140.

652 Frank, T.D., Shultis, A.I., Fielding, C.R., 2015. Acme and demise of the late Palaeozoic ice
 653 age: A view from the southeastern margin of Gondwana. *Palaeogeogr.*
 654 *Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 418, 176-192.

655 Hansen, J., Sato, M., 2012. Paleoclimate implications for human-made climate change, in:
 656 Berger, A., Mesinger, F., Sijacki, D. (Eds.), *Climate Change*. Springer-Verlag Wien,
 657 Vienna, pp. 21-47.

658 Hansen, J., Sato, M., Kharecha, P., von Schuckmann, K., 2011. Earth's energy imbalance
 659 and implications. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* 11, 13421-13449.

660 Henderson, C.M., 2006. Beware of your FO and be aware of the FAD. *Permophiles* 47,
 661 8-9.

662 Hinojosa, J.L., Brown, S.T., Chen, J., DePaolo, D.J., Paytan, A., Shen, S.Z., Payne, J.L.,
 663 2012. Evidence for end-Permian ocean acidification from calcium isotopes in biogenic
 664 apatite. *Geology* 40, 743-746.

665 Holser, W.T., Schönlaub, H.P., Attrep, M., Boeckelmann, K., Klein, P., Magaritz, M., Orth,
 666 C.J., Fenninger, A., Jenny, C., Kralik, M., Mauritsch, H., Pak, E., Schramm, J.M.,
 667 Stattegger, K., Schmoller, R., 1989. A unique geochemical record at the
 668 Permian/Triassic boundary. *Nature* 337, 39-44.

669 Jaffrés, J.B.D., Shields, G.A., Wallmann, K., 2007. The oxygen isotope evolution of
 670 seawater: A critical review of a long-standing controversy and an improved geological
 671 water cycle model for the past 3.4 billion years. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* 83, 83-122.

672 Jiang, H.S., Lai, X.L., Yan, C.B., Aldridge, R.J., Wignall, P., Sun, Y.D., 2011. Revised
 673 conodont zonation and conodont evolution across the Permian-Triassic boundary at

674 the Shangsi section, Guangyuan, Sichuan, South China. *Global. Planet. Change.* 77,
675 103-115.

676 Jin, Y.G., Wang, Y., Henderson, C., Wardlaw, B.R., Shen, S.Z., Cao, C.Q., 2006. The
677 Global Boundary Stratotype Section and Point (GSSP) for the base of Changhsingian
678 Stage (Upper Permian). *Episodes* 29, 175-182.

679 Jin, Y.G., Wang, Y., Wang, W., Shang, Q.H., Cao, C.Q., Erwin, D.H., 2000. Pattern of
680 marine mass extinction near the Permian-Triassic boundary in South China. *Science*
681 289, 432-436.

682 Joachimski, M.M., Breisig, S., Buggisch, W., Talent, J.A., Mawson, R., Gereke, M.,
683 Morrow, J.R., Day, J., Weddige, K., 2009. Devonian climate and reef evolution:
684 Insights from oxygen isotopes in apatite. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 284, 599-609.

685 Joachimski, M.M., Lai, X.L., Shen, S.Z., Jiang, H.S., Luo, G.M., Chen, B., Chen, J., Sun,
686 Y.D., 2012. Climate warming in the latest Permian and the Permian-Triassic mass
687 extinction. *Geology* 40, 195-198.

688 Kamo, S.L., Czamanske, G.K., Amelin, Y., Fedorenko, V.A., Davis, D.W., Trofimov, V.R.,
689 2003. Rapid eruption of Siberian flood-volcanic rocks and evidence for coincidence
690 with the Permian-Triassic boundary and mass extinction at 251 Ma. *Earth Planet. Sci.*
691 *Lett.* 214, 75-91.

692 Knoll, A.H., Bambach, R.K., Payne, J.L., Pruss, S., Fischer, W.W., 2007. Paleophysiology
693 and end-Permian mass extinction. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 256, 295-313.

694 Kolodny, Y., Luz, B., Navon, O., 1983. Oxygen isotope variations in phosphate of biogenic
695 apatites, I. Fish bone apatite - rechecking the rules of the game. *Earth Planet. Sci.*

696 Lett. 64, 298-404.

697 Korte, C., Kozur, H.W., 2010. Carbon-isotope stratigraphy across the Permian-Triassic
698 boundary: A review. J. Asian Earth Sci. 39, 215-235.

699 Kozdon, R., Kelly, D.C., Kita, N.T., Fournelle, J.H., Valley, J.W., 2011. Planktonic
700 foraminiferal oxygen isotope analysis by ion microprobe technique suggests warm
701 tropical sea surface temperatures during the Early Paleogene. Paleocyanography 26.

702 Kozdon, R., Ushikubo, T., Kita, N.T., Spicuzza, M., Valley, J.W., 2009. Intratest oxygen
703 isotope variability in the planktonic foraminifer *N. pachyderma*: Real vs. apparent vital
704 effects by ion microprobe. Chem. Geol. 258, 327-337.

705 Kummel, B., Teichert, C., 1970. Stratigraphy and Paleontology of the Permian-Triassic
706 Boundary Beds, Salt Range and Trans-Indus Ranges, West Pakistan, in: Kummel, B.,
707 Teichert, C. (Eds.), Stratigraphic Boundary Problems-Permian and Triassic of West
708 Pakistan. The University Press of Kansas, Lawrence, pp. 1-110.

709 Lécuyer, C., Amiot, R., Touzeau, A., Trotter, J., 2013. Calibration of the phosphate $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
710 thermometer with carbonate-water oxygen isotope fractionation equations. Chem.
711 Geol. 347, 217-226.

712 Lhomme, N., Clarke, G.K.C., Ritz, C., 2005. Global budget of water isotopes inferred from
713 polar ice sheets. Geophys. Res. Lett. 32, L20502.

714 Luz, B., Kolodny, Y., 1985. Oxygen isotope variations in phosphate of biogenic apatites,
715 IV. Mammal teeth and bones. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 75, 29-36.

716 Luz, B., Kolodny, Y., Kovach, J., 1984. Oxygen isotope variations in phosphate of biogenic
717 apatites, III. Conodonts. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 69, 255-262.

718 Mei, S.L., Henderson, C.M., 2001. Evolution of Permian conodont provincialism and its
 719 significance in global correlation and paleoclimate implication. *Palaeogeogr.*
 720 *Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 170, 237-260.

721 Metcalfe, I., Crowley, J.L., Nicoll, R.S., Schmitz, M., 2015. High-precision U-Pb CA-TIMS
 722 calibration of Middle Permian to Lower Triassic sequences, mass extinction and
 723 extreme climate-change in eastern Australian Gondwana. *Gondwana Res.* 28, 61-81.

724 Nicoll, R.S., Metcalfe, I., Wang, C.Y., 2002. New species of the conodont genus *Hindeodus*
 725 and the conodont biostratigraphy of the Permian-Triassic boundary interval. *J. Asian*
 726 *Earth Sci.* 20, 609-631.

727 O'Neil, J.R., Roe, L.J., Reinhard, E., Blake, R.E., 1994. A rapid and precise method of
 728 oxygen isotope analysis of biogenic phosphate. *Israel J. Earth Sci.* 43, 203-212.

729 Payne, J.L., Clapham, M.E., 2012. End-Permian mass extinction in the oceans: An ancient
 730 analog for the twenty-first century? *Annu.Rev.Earth Planet.Sci.* 40, 89-111.

731 Payne, J.L., Turchyn, A.V., Paytan, A., DePaolo, D.J., Lehrmann, D.J., Yu, M.Y., Wei, J.Y.,
 732 2010. Calcium isotope constraints on the end-Permian mass extinction. *Proc. Natl.*
 733 *Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 107, 8543-8548.

734 Pietzner, H., Vahl, J., Werner, H., Ziegler, W., 1968. Zur chemischen Zusammensetzung
 735 und Mikromorphologie der Conodonten. *Palaeontographica* 128, 115-152.

736 Pucéat, E., Joachimski, M.M., Bouilloux, A., Monna, F., Bonin, A., Motreuil, S., Moriniere,
 737 P., Henard, S., Mourin, J., Dera, G., Quesne, D., 2010. Revised phosphate-water
 738 fractionation equation reassessing paleotemperatures derived from biogenic apatite.
 739 *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 298, 135-142.

740 Raup, D.M., Sepkoski, J.J., 1982. Mass extinctions in the marine fossil record. *Science*
741 215, 1501-1503.

742 Renne, P.R., Zhang, Z.C., Richards, M.A., Black, M.T., Basu, A.R., 1995. Synchrony and
743 Causal Relations between Permian-Triassic Boundary Crises and Siberian Flood
744 Volcanism. *Science* 269, 1413-1416.

745 Rey, K., Amiot, R., Fourel, F., Rigaudier, T., Abdala, F., Day, M.O., Fernandez, V., Fluteau,
746 F., France-Lanord, C., Rubidge, B.S., Smith, R.M., Viglietti, P.A., Zipfel, B., Lécuyer,
747 C., in press. Global climate perturbations during the Permo-Triassic mass extinctions
748 recorded by continental tetrapods from South Africa. *Gondwana Res.*

749 Rigo, M., Trotter, J.A., Preto, N., Williams, I.S., 2012. Oxygen isotopic evidence for Late
750 Triassic monsoonal upwelling in the northwestern Tethys. *Geology* 40, 515-518.

751 Romano, C., Goudemand, N., Vennemann, T.W., Ware, D., Schneebeil-Hermann, E.,
752 Hochuli, P.A., Bruhwiler, T., Brinkmann, W., Bucher, H., 2013. Climatic and biotic
753 upheavals following the end-Permian mass extinction. *Nat. Geosci.* 6, 57-60.

754 Rothman, D.H., Fournier, G.P., French, K.L., Alm, E.J., Boyle, E.A., Cao, C.Q., Summons,
755 R.E., 2014. Methanogenic burst in the end-Permian carbon cycle. *Proc. Natl. Acad.*
756 *Sci. U. S. A.* 111, 5462-5467.

757 Schobben, M., Joachimski, M.M., Korn, D., Leda, L., Korte, C., 2014. Palaeotethys
758 seawater temperature rise and an intensified hydrological cycle following the
759 end-Permian mass extinction. *Gondwana Res.* 26, 675-683.

760 Shemesh, A., Kolodny, Y., Luz, B., 1983. Oxygen isotope variations in phosphate of
761 biogenic apatites, II. Phosphorite rocks. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 64, 405-416.

762 Shen, S.Z., Cao, C.Q., Henderson, C.M., Wang, X.D., Shi, G.R., Wang, Y., Wang, W.,
 763 2006. End-Permian mass extinction pattern in the northern peri-Gondwanan region.
 764 *Palaeoworld* 15, 3-30.

765 Shen, S.Z., Cao, C.Q., Zhang, H., Bowring, S.A., Henderson, C.M., Payne, J.L., Davydov,
 766 V.I., Chen, B., Yuan, D.X., Zhang, Y.C., Wang, W., Zheng, Q.F., 2013. High-resolution
 767 $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ chemostratigraphy from latest Guadalupian through earliest Triassic in South
 768 China and Iran. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 375, 156-165.

769 Shen, S.Z., Crowley, J.L., Wang, Y., Bowring, S.A., Erwin, D.H., Sadler, P.M., Cao, C.Q.,
 770 Rothman, D.H., Henderson, C.M., Ramezani, J., Zhang, H., Shen, Y.N., Wang, X.D.,
 771 Wang, W., Mu, L., Li, W.Z., Tang, Y.G., Liu, X.L., Liu, L.J., Zeng, Y., Jiang, Y.F., Jin,
 772 Y.G., 2011. Calibrating the end-Permian mass extinction. *Science* 334, 1367-1372.

773 Shen, S.Z., He, X.L., 1991. Changhsingian brachiopods assemblage sequence in
 774 Zhongliang Hill, Chongqing. *Journal of Stratigraphy* 15, 189-196.

775 Shen, S.Z., Henderson, C.M., Bowring, S.A., Cao, C.Q., Wang, Y., Wang, W., Zhang, H.,
 776 Zhang, Y.C., Mu, L., 2010. High-resolution Lopingian (Late Permian) timescale of
 777 South China. *Geol. J.* 45, 122-134.

778 Shen, S.Z., Mei, S.L., 2010. Lopingian (Late Permian) high-resolution conodont
 779 biostratigraphy in Iran with comparison to South China zonation. *Geol. J.* 45, 135-161.

780 Shen, S.Z., Shi, G.R., 1995. Biostratigraphy and correlation of several Permian-Triassic
 781 boundary sections in southwestern China. *J. Southeast Asian Earth Sci.* 12, 19-30.

782 Shen, S.Z., Shi, G.R., 2002. Paleobiogeographical extinction patterns of Permian
 783 brachiopods in the Asian-western Pacific region. *Paleobiology* 28, 449-463.

784 Sobolev, S.V., Sobolev, A.V., Kuzmin, D.V., Krivolutsкая, N.A., Petrunin, A.G., Arndt,
785 N.T., Radko, V.A., Vasiliev, Y.R., 2011. Linking mantle plumes, large igneous
786 provinces and environmental catastrophes. *Nature* 477, 312-316.

787 Song, H.J., Wignall, P.B., Tong, J.N., Yin, H.F., 2013. Two pulses of extinction during the
788 Permian-Triassic crisis. *Nat. Geosci.* 6, 52-56.

789 Stampfli, G.M., Borel, G.D., 2004. The TRANSMED Transects in Space and Time:
790 Constraints on the Paleotectonic Evolution of the Mediterranean Domain, in: Cavazza,
791 W., Rouse, F., Spakman, W., Stampfli, G.M., Ziegler, P. (Eds.), *The TRANSMED*
792 *Atlas: The Mediterranean Region from Crust to Mantle*. Springer, Berlin Heidelberg,
793 pp. 1-141.

794 Sun, Y.D., Joachimski, M.M., Wignall, P.B., Yan, C.B., Chen, Y.L., Jiang, H.S., Wang, L.N.,
795 Lai, X.L., 2012. Lethally hot temperatures during the Early Triassic greenhouse.
796 *Science* 338, 366-370.

797 Svensen, H., Planke, S., Polozov, A.G., Schmidbauer, N., Corfu, F., Podladchikov, Y.Y.,
798 Jamtveit, B., 2009. Siberian gas venting and the end-Permian environmental crisis.
799 *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 277, 490-500.

800 Trotter, J.A., Williams, I.S., Barnes, C.R., Lécuyer, C., Nicoll, R.S., 2008. Did cooling
801 oceans trigger Ordovician biodiversification? Evidence from conodont thermometry.
802 *Science* 321, 550-554.

803 Trotter, J.A., Williams, I.S., Nicora, A., Mazza, M., Rigo, M., 2015. Long-term cycles of
804 Triassic climate change: a new $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record from conodont apatite. *Earth Planet. Sci.*
805 *Lett.* 415, 165-174.

806 Wang, Y., Sadler, P.M., Shen, S.Z., Erwin, D.H., Zhang, Y.C., Wang, X.D., Wang, W.,
 807 Crowley, J.L., Henderson, C.M., 2014. Quantifying the process and abruptness of the
 808 end-Permian mass extinction. *Paleobiology* 40, 113-129.

809 Wang, Y., Shen, S.Z., Cao, C.Q., Wang, W., Henderson, C.M., Jin, Y.G., 2006. The
 810 Wuchiapingian-Changhsingian boundary (Upper Permian) at Meishan of Changxing
 811 County, South China. *J. Asian Earth Sci.* 26, 575-583.

812 Wardlaw, B.R., Mei, S.L., 1999. Refined conodont biostratigraphy of the Permian and
 813 lowest Triassic of the Salt and Khizor Ranges, Pakistan, in: H. F., Y., J. N., T. (Eds.),
 814 Proceedings of the International conference on Pangea and the Paleozoic-Mesozoic
 815 transition. China University of Geosciences Press, Wuhan, pp. 154-156.

816 Wenzel, B., Lécuyer, C., Joachimski, M.M., 2000. Comparing oxygen isotope records of
 817 Silurian calcite and phosphate - $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ compositions of brachiopods and conodonts.
 818 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 64, 1859-1872.

819 Wheelley, J.R., Smith, M.P., Boomer, I., 2012. Oxygen isotope variability in conodonts:
 820 Implications for reconstructing Palaeozoic palaeoclimates and palaeoceanography. *J.*
 821 *Geol. Soc. London* 169, 239-250.

822 Wignall, P.B., 2001. Large igneous provinces and mass extinctions. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* 53,
 823 1-33.

824 Wignall, P.B., Hallam, A., 1996. Facies change and the end-Permian mass extinction in
 825 S.E. Sichuan, China. *Palaos* 11, 587-596.

826 Yin, H.F., Huang, S., Zhang, K.X., Hansen, H.J., Yang, F.Q., Ding, M.H., Bie, X.M., 1992.
 827 The effects of volcanism on the Permo-Triassic mass extinction in South China, in:

828 Sweet, W.C., Yang, Z.Y., Dickins, J.M., Ying, H.F. (Eds.), Permo-Triassic events in the
829 eastern Tethys. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, pp. 146-157.

830 Yin, H.F., Jiang, H.S., Xia, W.C., Feng, Q.L., Zhang, N., Shen, J., 2014. The end-Permian
831 regression in South China and its implication on mass extinction. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* 137,
832 19-33.

833 Yin, H.F., Song, H.J., 2013. Mass extinction and Pangea integration during the
834 Paleozoic-Mesozoic transition. *Sci China Ser D* 56, 1791-1803.

835 Yin, H.F., Zhang, K.X., Tong, J.N., Yang, Z.Y., Wu, S.B., 2001. The Global Stratotype
836 Section and Point (GSSP) of the Permian-Triassic Boundary. *Episodes* 24, 102-114.

837 Yuan, D.X., Chen, J., Zhang, Y.C., Zheng, Q.F., Shen, S.Z., 2015. Changhsingian
838 conodont succession and the end-Permian mass extinction event at the Daijiagou
839 section in Chongqing, Southwest China. *J. Asian Earth Sci.* 105, 234-251.

840 Yuan, D.X., Shen, S.Z., 2011. Conodont succession across the Permian-Triassic
841 boundary at the Liangfengya section, Chongqing, South China. *Acta Palaeontol. Sin.*
842 50, 420-438.

843 Yuan, D.X., Shen, S.Z., Henderson, C.M., Chen, J., Zhang, H., Feng, H.Z., 2014. Revised
844 conodont-based integrated high-resolution timescale for the Changhsingian Stage
845 and end-Permian extinction interval at the Meishan sections, South China. *Lithos* 204,
846 220-245.

847 Zigaite, Z., Whitehouse, M., 2014. Stable oxygen isotopes of dental biomineral:
848 differentiation at the intra- and inter-tissue level of modern shark teeth. *GFF* 136,
849 337-340.

Figure captions

Figure 1. (A) Palaeogeographic reconstruction for the Late Permian (Stampfli and Borel, 2004) and (B) locality map (Shen et al., 2013) showing the positions of studied sections in South China. 1. Meishan; 2. Shangsi; 3. Daijiagou; 4. Liangfengya.

Figure 2. Field photos showing the PTB intervals at Meishan (A), Shangsi (B), Daijiagou (C), and Liangfengya (D), with the onset of the end-Permian mass extinction and the P-T boundary marked as red and green lines, respectively.

Figure 3. Compiled $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ record (including new *in situ* SIMS data in this study, and published IRMS data from Joachimski et al., 2012 and Chen et al., 2013), $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carbon}}$ record (Shen et al., 2013; Burgess et al., 2014), and raw taxon richness curve (generated by Y. Wang using CONOP) from the Meishan stratotype section, all scaled to the thickness of strata. Lithology, revised conodont biozones (see details in Supplementary Tables S1) (Yuan et al., 2014), and U-Pb ages for dated ash beds (Shen et al., 2011; Burgess et al., 2014) are provided. Cyan band represents the prominent increase of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ (cooling) in the lower part of the *C. wangi* zone; light yellow band indicates the rapid decrease of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ (warming) above the mass extinction horizon; and the span in between is regarded as the long-term fluctuations interval.

Figure 4. Close-up of *in situ* $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carbon}}$ records across the latest Permian-earliest Triassic interval at Meishan, with insert of high-resolution *in situ* $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ data prior to, during, and after the EPME. Lithology, number and thickness of each bed, and conodont zones are presented. Note that immediately before the EPME

(i.e., Bed 24e-f) and at the mass extinction horizon (i.e., Bed 25), $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values remain high as $\sim 21\text{‰}$, which clearly indicates no elevation in seawater temperatures at the onset of the EPME.

Figure 5. $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ (including new *in situ* SIMS data in this study, and published IRMS data from Joachimski et al., 2012) and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carbon}}$ records from the Shangsi section, all scaled to the thickness of strata. Lithology, conodont zones (see details in Supplementary Tables S2), and insert of high-resolution *in situ* $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ data across the EPME are provided.

Figure 6. $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carbon}}$ records from the Daijiagou section, all scaled to the thickness of strata. Insert showing the close-up of the $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ data from the EPME interval; ranges of conodont species, $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carbon}}$ and its correlation with other PTB sections can be found in Yuan et al. 2015.

Figure 7. $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ record from the Liangfengya section, scaled to the thickness of strata. Bed numbers and lithology from Shen and He (1991), but see a more recent description in Yuan and Shen (2011) where conodont biostratigraphy was also presented.

Figure 8. (A) *In situ* $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ records from Meishan, Shangsi, Daijiagou, and Liangfengya, constrained by a uniform temporal framework to demonstrate the timing and magnitude of changes. Palaeotemperature scales are based on the IRMS-based equation from Lécuyer et al. (2013), without considering the average offset of $+0.5\text{‰}$ (this study) between the SIMS and IRMS values. Cyan and light yellow bands represent the prominent “WCB cooling” and “PTB warming” events, respectively. (B) Comparative *in situ* $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ records from the upper slope (Meishan), lower slope (Shangsi), and carbonate platform

(Daijiagou and Liangfengya) prior to, during, and after the EPME suggesting a concurrent increase of seawater temperatures (~10 °C) postdates both the abrupt decline in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{carb}}$ and the onset of mass extinction, thus indicating climate warming was not a direct cause for the main pulse of the EPME (corresponding to Bed 25 at Meishan). Distinctions for “cool”, “warm”, and “hot” conditions are relative, not definitive. Palaeotemperature scales are also based on the IRMS-based equation from Lécuyer et al. (2013).

Figure 9. (A) Comparison between the SIMS and IRMS data based on a suite of 63 samples from Meishan that have been measured by both methods (Supplementary Tables S7), indicating a positive correlation. (B) The differences between paired SIMS and IRMS $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{apatite}}$ values ($\Delta = \delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{SIMS}} - \delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{IRMS}}$, Mean = +0.5‰, Max. = +2.2‰, Min. = -0.9‰) against the stratigraphic depth, suggesting the offsets are consistently within a specific range (0 to 1‰) that is not time dependent.

Appendix A. Supplementary material

Supplementary data (Supplementary text, Tables S1-S7, Databases S1-S2) to this article can be found online at XXX.

Figure 3

Figure 4

PTB interval at Meishan

Figure 5

Shangsi, Sichuan

Figure 6

Daijiagou, Chongqing

Figure 7

Liangfengya, Chongqing

Figure 8

Figure 9