1
2
3 **Radiocarbon Evidence for a Possible Abyssal Front**
4 **Near 3.1 km in the Glacial Equatorial Pacific Ocean**
5

6 L. D. Keigwin^{a*}

7
8 S. J. Lehman^b
9

10 ^aWoods Hole Oceanographic Institution
11 260 Woods Hole Rd.
12 Woods Hole, MA 02543
13

14 ^bUniversity of Colorado
15 INSTAAR Campus Box 450
16 Boulder, CO 80309
17

18 *corresponding author
19 telephone 508 289 2784
20 email: lkeigwin@whoi.edu
21

22 **ABSTRACT**

23 We investigate the radiocarbon ventilation age in deep equatorial Pacific
24 sediment cores using the difference in conventional ¹⁴C age between coexisting
25 benthic and planktonic foraminifera, and integrate those results with similar
26 data from around the North Pacific Ocean in a reconstruction for the last
27 glaciation (15 to 25 conventional ¹⁴C ka). Most new data from both the
28 Equatorial Pacific and the Emperor Seamounts in the northwestern Pacific
29 come from maxima in abundance of benthic taxa because this strategy reduces
30 the effect of bioturbation. Although there remains considerable scatter in the
31 ventilation age estimates, on average, ventilation ages in the Equatorial Pacific
32 were significantly greater below 3.2 km (~3080 ± 1125 yrs, n=15) than in the
33 depth interval 1.9 to 3.0 km (~1610 ± 250 yrs, n=12). When compared to the
34 average modern seawater Δ¹⁴C profile for the North Pacific, the Equatorial
35 Pacific glacial data suggest an abyssal front located somewhere between 3.0
36 and 3.2 km modern water depth. Above that depth, the data may indicate
37 slightly better ventilation than today, and below that depth, glacial Equatorial
38 Pacific data appear to be as old as last glacial maximum (LGM) deep water
39 ages reported for the deep southern Atlantic. This suggests that a glacial
40 reservoir of aged waters extended throughout the circumpolar Southern Ocean

and into the Equatorial Pacific. Renewed ventilation of such a large volume of aged (and, by corollary, carbon-rich) water would help to account for the rise in atmospheric pCO₂ and the fall in $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ as the glaciation drew to a close.

Key Words: radiocarbon; foraminifera; ocean ventilation; Pacific Ocean

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The ocean is the largest reservoir of readily exchangeable carbon on Earth. With ~39,000 gigatonnes of carbon (GTC = 10¹⁵ g C) in the ocean, and ~580 GTC in the recent pre-industrial atmosphere, it is clear that small changes in oceanic carbon storage could cause large changes in the atmospheric CO₂ inventory. For this reason, beginning ~25 years ago with ice core observations that the glacial atmosphere had lower CO₂ levels than today (Barnola et al., 1987; Petit et al., 1999), climatologists have looked to the ocean for evidence that its carbon storage was different in the past. Although the surface ocean readily exchanges with the atmosphere if it is not ice covered, the deep ocean exchanges with the atmosphere only at high latitude locations in the North Atlantic and Southern Oceans. Multiple lines of geochemical evidence indicate this exchange was interrupted during cold episodes of the last glacial cycle, either through the stabilizing effects of low salinity at sites of deep-water formation, sea ice cover at those sites, or both (Boyle, 1988; Duplessy et al., 1988; Sigman et al., 2010).

Unlike other proxies of deep ocean ventilation, radiocarbon comes with a timescale. Deep ocean ¹⁴C content is set by the atmospheric ¹⁴C activity and the extent of surface ocean equilibration with the atmosphere in the formation region, and decreases quantitatively due to radioactive decay in the ocean interior and may be further influenced by mixing. Available data from solitary corals and foraminifera indicate greater ventilation ages during the last ice age in the North Atlantic (Robinson et al. 2005), the South Atlantic (Skinner et al., 2010), and in the southwest Pacific (Skinner et al. 2015), but the most recent compilations from the Equatorial and North Pacific have failed to identify deep water old enough to account for elevated atmospheric ¹⁴C activity during the last glaciation and the subsequent decline that began about 16.5 ka, at least according to simple mass balance calculations (Broecker, 2004; Broecker and Barker, 2007). For example, Broecker et al. (2004) and Broecker et al. (2008) found no signal of poor ventilation at 2 km – 2.8 km water depth in the west equatorial Pacific (WEP), nor did Broecker and Clark (2010) at 4.4 km in the east equatorial Pacific (EEP). Finally, Broecker and Clark (2011) concluded that the interplay between selective dissolution and bioturbation of planktonic foraminifera (Barker et al., 2007) is too significant to extract meaningful

ventilation ages from benthic-planktic age pairs in the deep Pacific. Evidence of significantly older bottom waters than recorded by Broecker and colleagues has been found in cores from intermediate water depths off Baja California (Marchitto et al., 2007), in the Panama Basin (Stott et al., 2009), off the Arabian peninsula (Bryan et al., 2010), in the southwest Pacific (Sikes et al., 2000; Skinner et al., 2015), and in the Southern Ocean (Burke and Robinson, 2012). It has been hypothesized that the deep reservoir mixed with near surface waters in the Southern Ocean and was introduced to Antarctic Intermediate Water (AAIW), yet the signal has not been detected along present-day AAIW pathways located along the western margins of S. America (dePol-Holz et al., 2009) and Africa (Cleroux et al. 2011).

There are several metrics for ^{14}C -based ocean ventilation (e.g. Cook and Keigwin, 2015), and of these we focus here on the difference in conventional ^{14}C ages between coexisting benthic and planktonic foraminifera (BF and PF, respectively) which represents the extent of ^{14}C aging or disequilibrium between the surface and deep ocean. Our new ^{14}C results from several cores in the Equatorial Pacific indicate that below ~ 3.2 km, BF-PF ^{14}C ventilation ages were 3080 ± 1125 years during the glacial interval. The contrast of those old deep waters with younger waters above ~ 3.2 km, when compared to the modern $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ distribution, likely reflects an abyssal front extending from the Southern Ocean into the tropical North Pacific Ocean, although its northern extra-tropical extent remains unclear. In addition to helping explain elevated atmospheric $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ during the glaciation, subsequent ventilation of these old deep waters likely also influenced the postglacial decline of atmospheric $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ and the coincident rise in pCO_2 (Marchitto et al., 2007; Anderson et al. 2009; Burke and Robinson, 2012).

2.0 METHODS

This paper presents new data on cores from four locations: the northern Emperor Seamounts in the NWP; the Gulf of California; and the west and the east equatorial Pacific (Table 1). Three of the EEP cores were collected in 1978 on R/V Knorr (KNR) cruise 73 by R.P. von Herzen for heat flow studies and were dried out by the time of our sampling. KNR73 piston cores (PCs) 3, 4, and 6 straddle the Equator in a depth transect on the west flank of the East Pacific Rise, from 3.6, 3.7, and 3.8 km water depth, respectively (Figure 1). Core 3PC was studied previously (Boyle and Keigwin 1985) and heavily sampled, so for the present study we sampled the archive half. Samples of three other EEP cores were provided by the curators at Scripps Inst. of Oceanography (PLDS 7G) and Oregon State University (VNTR01-10GC and ME0005 24JC).

Samples from WEP free fall core S67 (FFC) 15, were provided by the Hawaii Institute of Geophysics (HIG).

Sampling and analytical methods are similar to those reported earlier (Keigwin 2004). At each location we relied on $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ stratigraphy and ^{14}C dating of near-surface dwelling planktonic foraminifera (PF) to identify the glacial interval. As discussed previously, we sought to identify peaks in abundance of benthic foraminifera (BF) for ^{14}C measurement, since the burrowing action of animals on the seafloor tends to reduce the amplitude of abundance maxima but it does not usually create peaks (Broecker et al., 1984). For core ME0005 24JC, our sampling of the glacial interval was guided by the chronology of Kienast et al. (2006).

Because the KNR73 cores were dry and brittle, and not easily sampled without disturbance, we scribed the split surface at 1-cm intervals, removed large sections from the liner, and cut them along the scribe lines. Although this breaks up the sample, large pieces were collected and bagged. Small samples (1-2 g) were removed from the bags for preliminary counting. Intervals of abundant BF were re-sampled at 1-cm spacing to identify the level of peak abundance, and again if necessary until enough BF were recovered for ^{14}C measurement (generally $>2\text{ mg CaCO}_3$). Foraminifera were picked from the fraction $>150\text{ }\mu\text{m}$ for both stable isotope and ^{14}C analysis. Where abundance of PF was determined (PCs 3, 4, PLDS 7G, and VNTR01-10GC), samples were microsplit to about 300 individuals and counted ($>150\text{ }\mu\text{m}$ fraction). The other EEP cores were still moist and sliced and bagged as above at SIO and OSU, and the WEP free fall core (FFC) was sampled using paleomagnetic cubes by the curator at HIG.

BF samples were cleaned ultrasonically if necessary, and planktonic samples were cleaned this way only if they were abundant. Smaller samples were put in 1 dram screw cap vials filled completely with distilled water. The vials were shaken to suspend the foraminifera and then quickly hit against the lab bench. This “infrasound” treatment successfully shakes free loosely adhering sediment without too much damage to the shells and is easier to control than ultrasound.

Emperor Seamount results and previously published data from shallow locations in the nearby Okhotsk Sea are based on the benthic foram *Uvigerina* and the planktonic *Neoglobobulimina pachyderma* s. because these are the only species present in the glacial interval that were sufficiently abundant for ^{14}C measurement. During warm episodes of deglaciation, ^{14}C dates were on *Globigerina bulloides* and *Uvigerina*. *Uvigerina* was also analyzed from the

LGM of DSDP Site 480 samples in the Gulf of California (Keigwin and Jones, 1990). In the Equatorial Pacific we dated the PF *Globigerinoides ruber* and *Globigerinoides sacculifer*, and the BF *Nuttalides umbonifera*, *Uvigerina*, and *Cibicidoides*. Low BF abundance and lack of obvious abundance maxima led us to date mixed BF in ME005 24JC, but *Uvigerina* was the most abundant taxon.

Accelerator mass spectrometry (AMS) ^{14}C dating was done using routine methods at the National Ocean Sciences AMS (NOSAMS) facility at Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution and at the Univ. of California, Irvine, for samples graphitized at the Univ. of Colorado. All ^{14}C ages are given as the conventional laboratory reported age, without correction for ocean reservoir effects (Stuiver and Polach, 1977). Most stable isotope measurements were made at NOSAMS on a VG Prism mass spectrometer and some were made on a Finigan 252. Where possible, we made analyses on individual specimens of *Uvigerina*, *Cibicidoides*, or *N. umbonifera*.

3.0 RESULTS

3.1 Equatorial Pacific.

New stable isotope, abundance, and ^{14}C results for Equatorial Pacific cores are summarized in Figure 2 and arranged according to water depth. Stable isotope data are archived at the National Climate Data Center (<http://search.usa.gov/search?affiliate=NCDC&query=paleo>). Where multiple benthic measurements were made at the same level (within 1.0 cm), we report the apparent ventilation age as determined from each benthic species as the difference between the ^{14}C age for that species and the average of the PF ^{14}C ages for that level. All new ^{14}C results and ventilation ages are listed in Table 2. Uncertainty in average PF age is given as the standard error (SE) of the mean of the measurement values or the individual measurement uncertainties summed in quadrature, whichever is larger. Uncertainty of BF-PF ventilation age estimates was calculated as the quadrature sum of the 1σ BF measurement uncertainty and the PF age uncertainty (where only a single PF age is available, the average SE for all PF measurement pairs was used). Where we have AMS dates on multiple BFs from the same stratigraphic level, we calculated ventilation ages for each BF sample separately. Thus, one core depth may provide multiple ventilation age estimates.

For purposes of the present study, we define the glacial interval as between 25 and 15 ^{14}C ka measured in PF. Data are considered to be glacial if

one of a pair of PF dates falls within 1σ of the 15-25 ^{14}C ka window. Above ~3.7 km water depth, the glacial interval (shaded interval in Figures 2-4) is found between about 40 and 80 cm, but at greater water depths it appears closer to the core top. As expected, where $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ is maximum $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ is at or near minimum, and the glacial $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of individual *Cibicidoides* is within the range of previous studies.

The benthic fauna changes as a function of water depth, and of the three genera we counted, only *Cibicidoides* are found at all water depths. At all but the deepest site, in the WEP, and the easternmost site (24JC), *Cibicidoides* reach peak abundance during the glacial interval. Above ~3.7 km there are short maxima (a few cm) of *Cibicidoides* within or just above this interval, and these are usually associated with maxima in *Uvigerina* and sometimes with *N. umbonifera* maxima. However, there are no *Uvigerina* in the WEP at 4.25 km, and there are no *N. umbonifera* above about 3.4 km water depth in the EEP. At the two KNR 73 cores between 3.6 and 3.7 km in the EEP, *N. umbonifera* is most abundant before 25 ^{14}C ka and in the Holocene.

The abundance of *G. ruber*, *G. sacculifer*, and total planktonic foraminifera also show substantial variability (Figure 3). The two *Globigerinoides* spp. represent about 10% of the planktonic fauna, on average, and they reach a broad maximum in abundance during deglaciation. Abundances are lower during the glacial and the Holocene (~upper 20 cm), and (oddly) in the two cores with the thickest Holocene sections, the more solution-susceptible *G. ruber* (Berger, 1970) is consistently least abundant.

3.2 Northwest Pacific.

Of the many ^{14}C dated sites in the NWP, results from two examples are presented in Figure 4 (see also Cook and Keigwin, 2015). All cores from this region contain abundant *Uvigerina* during deglaciation [Keigwin, 1998], but abundance of this genus during the LGM is usually lower, and we have not found clear glacial peaks in BF abundance deeper than 3.3 km on the northern Emperor Seamounts. In both RNDB 11PC and Vinogradov 37 GGC (3225 and 3300 m, respectively, on Detroit Seamount) it was necessary to sample both the working and the archived halves of the cores in order to obtain a datable number of *Uvigerina*. Figure 4 shows only the 11 PC data, as an example. The shape of the small LGM *Uvigerina* peak at ~110 cm is identical in each half of the core, and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ measurement of individual *Uvigerina*, the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ on *N. pachyderma* s., and the dates on *N. pachyderma* s. all indicate that the small LGM peak did not result from down core reworking of specimens from the much larger deglacial peaks. The three deglacial peaks yield PF ^{14}C ages that are all between 13.08 and 13.14 ^{14}C ka.

In contrast to the results at Detroit Seamount (50°N), Tenji Seamount core RNDB 13PC (49°N) has two LGM BF peaks, based on $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and PF ^{14}C ages (Figure 4). This core also has three deglacial maxima in *Uvigerina* abundance, with 4 PF ages of between 13.00 and 13.66 ^{14}C ka. Late in deglaciation, 13PC has two additional BF abundance maxima, but the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data do not reach the expected Holocene minimum of $<3.5\text{‰}$. The accompanying trigger core (13PG) has only one late deglacial BF maximum and we consider that core to be more reliable than the piston core because it captures the expected Holocene $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ minimum.

4.0 DISCUSSION

Our observations of millennial scale changes in BF abundance in the EEP are evidently new. The abundance patterns in Figure 2 have not been noted previously, presumably because earlier sampling of EEP cores was done too coarsely to resolve the millennial-scale events described here. (Most of the BF peaks in the NWP and the EEP occur within a 5 cm interval of core.) Furthermore, most previous authors have not measured the dry mass of their sediment samples so it is impossible to know if there have been changes in absolute BF abundance.

Despite the generally low sedimentation rates in our cores (all $<7\text{ cm/kyr}$ except for ME0005 24JC, $>20\text{ cm/kyr}$), where present, benthic foram abundance maxima are several times larger than background values (Figure 2). This suggests that they result from some process significant enough to survive the effects of bioturbation. As bioturbation has often compromised detection of possible millennial scale climate signals in the Equatorial Pacific, the strong BF abundance signal documented here may hold promise for regional (and beyond) correlation of events.

Below, we first consider possible contributions of surface ocean fertility and sediment transport to observed BF abundance maxima, followed by a discussion of the possible influences of dissolution and bioturbation on our ^{14}C results. We then present a basin-wide compilation of glacial BF-PF ventilation ages by depth that appears to indicate a widespread abyssal front in the glacial Pacific.

4.1 Significance of BF abundance changes.

4.1.a. *BF abundance maxima and export production of organic carbon.*

A long history of studies concluded there must have been higher surface ocean fertility in the EEP during glacial maxima (Arrhenius, 1952; Rea et al.,

1991; Herguera and Berger, 1991). At the eastern end of our study area, in the Panama Basin, *Uvigerina* is thought to respond to increased export production of carbon in terms of both increased size and abundance (Pedersen et al., 1988). Loubere (1991) made a statistical regression of BF species percentages and surface productivity in EEP core tops and found the fauna highly responsive to productivity. In particular he noted that *Uvigerina*, *Cibicidoides* and *Melonis barleeanum* are associated with highest organic export fluxes close to the Equator. Conversely, *N. umbonifera* was found to be typical of a lower productivity assemblage that is more prominent south of 5°S. Based on Loubere's (1991) work, our EEP results indicate highest productivity occurred generally in the late glacial/early deglacial interval, a conclusion supported by geochemical evidence for changing redox conditions (Berger et al., 1983).

In the Panama Basin, a broad deglacial maximum in the mass accumulation rate of organic carbon and cooling of the sea surface has been documented by Kienast et al. (2006), with a mid-point PF conventional ¹⁴C age of ~13.9 ka. Far to the northwest on the Emperor Seamount chain, mass accumulation rates of opal, calcium carbonate, organic carbon, and benthic foraminiferal abundance, indicate higher fertility during the last deglaciation compared to the LGM and the Holocene (Keigwin et al., 1992; Keigwin 1998). High export production was confirmed by accumulation rates determined by Th normalization in nearby cores (Crusius et al. 2004; Kohfeld and Chase, 2011), and in the Gulf of Alaska by increased diatom export, Ba/Al, and CaCO₃ (Galbraith et al. 2007). Galbraith et al. (2007) argued that these changes occurred abruptly in the Gulf of Alaska at the onset of the Bolling/Allerod interval in the North Atlantic region (~14.5 cal. ka), with ¹⁴C age constraints from loosely bracketing conventional PF ages of 13.0 and 15.1 ¹⁴C ka.

Among our EEP cores, PLDS 7G, VNTR01 10GC and KNR73-3PC contain BF abundance maxima with PF ¹⁴C ages of ~14.15, 14.18 and 14.73 ¹⁴C ka, respectively (Fig. 2) that indicate that they may be broadly synchronous with the previously documented productivity increase in the Panama Basin (Kienast et al., 2006), after allowing for possible regional gradients of deglacial reservoir age of several hundreds of years (Lindsay et al. 2015.; Rae et al. 2014). Similarly, the multiple BF abundance peaks with PF ¹⁴C ages of 13.0 to 13.6 ¹⁴C ka in our NWP cores (Fig. 4) may be related to the sudden increase in productivity in the northern Pacific (Keigwin et al. 1992; Galbraith et al. 2007; Kohfeld and Chase, 2011).

In the four EEP cores in which we have counted planktonic foram abundance, highest abundances generally occur during deglaciation, but the broad deglacial rise in planktonic species does not usually contain abundant benthic taxa (Fig. 3). Although planktonic foraminifera are most abundant

during the deglacial interval, we cannot be sure to what extent this reflects preservation rather than productivity (Berger, 1992, for example), or sediment focusing (Marcantonio et al., 2001; Kienast et al., 2006).

4.1.b. *Sediment transport.* Although there is strong evidence for high productivity in the NWP during deglaciation and in the EEP during glaciation, it remains possible that peaks in BF abundance could be an artifact of extensive winnowing of clay and silt. In the case of extreme and persistent winnowing, BF peaks could be created. However, in order to explain increases in benthic abundance by factors of 5 or 10, such as during the Holocene or the events at ~14.7 and 15.5 ^{14}C ka in cores 3PC and 4PC, respectively (Figure 2), enrichment by winnowing would have necessarily produced substantially condensed intervals. Our dating of these cores was not designed to test this possibility, but the depth distribution of PF ^{14}C ages in 3PC and 4PC is inconsistent with the presence of large discontinuities. At the Emperor Seamounts, each site has multiple deglacial peaks in *Uvigerina* associated with similar PF ^{14}C ages of ~13.1 ^{14}C ka, but the maximum abundances at core 11PC are ~50/g whereas at core 13PC it is ~28/g. If these events resulted from winnowing, then one would expect more winnowing at 11PC, yet based on the *Uvigerina* $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, the two cores have similar rates of sedimentation.

4.2. Planktonic age bias due to selective dissolution and bioturbation.

Barker et al. (2007) noted that the effects of selective dissolution of surface dwelling planktonic species such as *G. sacculifer* and *G. ruber* compared to deeper-dwelling planktonics, variable residence time of shells in the sediment surface mixed layer, and low rates of sedimentation can combine to create ^{14}C age offsets between different PF species from the same sediment sample. The conceptual model predicts that relatively dissolution prone species will show a young ^{14}C age bias with respect to dissolution resistant species, as a result of selective removal of older tests from the mixed layer population. Broecker and Clark (2011) proposed that this effect could lead to artificially large ventilation ages that are based on the difference between BF ^{14}C dates and PF ^{14}C dates from co-deposited dissolution prone surface dwelling species. For example, they noted that in four of seven deep water core tops from the equatorial Pacific that are today bathed by calcite undersaturated water, *G. sacculifer* has a ^{14}C age about 1000 years younger than solution-resistant planktonic species. Comparison of PF ages from paired measurements of *G. ruber* and *G. sacculifer* in cores 3PC and 4PC provide some insight into the importance of this process in the deep EEP as, even though both species are

surface-dwellers, *G. ruber* is known to be less resistant to dissolution than *G. sacculifer* (Berger, 1970).

We find no statistically meaningful inter-species age difference across all available *G. ruber* and *G. sacculifer* measurement pairs ($n = 17$, Table 3). If we break the pairs out according to time intervals (based on average PF ^{14}C ages) corresponding broadly to the Holocene (0-10 ^{14}C ka), deglaciation (10-15 ^{14}C ka), and the glacial period (15-25 ^{14}C ka), we find that only for the deglacial period is *G. ruber* measurably younger than *G. sacculifer* (-233 ± 112 ^{14}C yr, $n = 6$). For the glacial interval, the relationship is marked by large variation in both magnitude and sign ($+59 \pm 745$ ^{14}C yr, $n = 7$). These results, along with an analysis of the absolute deviation of the inter-species differences (Table 3), suggest that the observed age differences are largely randomized by bioturbation and generally do not preserve systematic offsets that might arise from differential dissolution in the mixed layer or from ecological habitat preferences (which are expected to be similar in the EEP for these two species, for example, Watkins et al. 1996). The results are, furthermore, largely insensitive to the placement of age boundaries in the analysis.

We also note that the effect described by Barker et al. (2007) is based on modern ocean observations and late Holocene sediment that reflect especially corrosive conditions on the sea floor. However, glacial and deglacial sediment is generally thought to be better preserved than Holocene sediment in the Equatorial Pacific. All other things being equal, the impacts of selective dissolution and young PF age biases should then be greater in the Holocene than during the glaciation and deglaciation, reducing rather than enhancing observed differences in ventilation age that might otherwise arise due to relative aging of Pacific deep water during glacial times. Our Holocene observations are limited to only two cores (3, 4PC), but with BF-PF ventilation ages of 1000 to 2000 years, they are close to the expected values based on modern observations (~ 1600 yrs; Broecker et al., 1984). As we describe below, BF-PF ventilation ages in the glacial and early deglacial deep Equatorial Pacific are much higher and more variable. In our view, the largest contribution to uncertainty is from bioturbation which, for PFs, we estimate conservatively to be on the order of ± 500 yr based on absolute deviations of PF age pairs for the glacial period (Table 3). Since we have sampled BFs at local peaks of absolute abundance, uncertainties in BF ages from sediment mixing should be minimized, and are likely more than adequately captured by differences in ventilation age for different BF species sampled at or near the same stratigraphic level (Fig. 2, Fig. 5).

4.3. Equatorial and North Pacific BF-PF ventilation age.

There is general agreement that there were significant changes in the deep circulation of the North Pacific during the past ~25 ka, as evident in various proxy data (Boyle and Keigwin, 1985; Zahn et al., 2001; Keigwin, 1998; Ohkushi et al., 2003; Galbraith et al., 2007; Okazaki et al. 2010; Lund et al. 2011). Of the many proxies brought to bear on the subject, ^{14}C has been of recent interest because of the suggestion that the deep ocean may have driven the deglacial atmospheric pCO_2 increase and $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ decrease if long-sequestered CO_2 was released to the atmosphere as deep ocean ventilation increased after the glacial period (Hughen et al., 2004; Broecker et al. 2004; Marchitto et al. 2007; Skinner et al. 2010). Okazaki et al. (2010) compiled available BF -PF ^{14}C age pairs from North Pacific locations and concluded that BF-PF ventilation ages began to decrease beginning 20-19 calendar ka and remained ~500-1000 ^{14}C yr lower than during the early LGM until the end of Heinrich Event 1 (H-1, 17.5 to 15 cal. ka), suggesting that deep water may have been produced somewhere in the region to depths as great as 3 km during the interval. More recently, Rae et al. (2014) showed that ventilation of the deep NEP (3640 m) improved suddenly during “the middle of H-1” based on a brief but seemingly robust collapse of the age difference in two BF-PF pairs. ^{14}C results from another NEP core indicate that ventilation at 2.7 km was the same during the last glaciation as today (Lund et al. 2011). On the other hand, Jaccard and Galbraith (2013) suggest that bottom waters at 2400 m (and deeper) were poorly ventilated until ~ 15 calendar ka based on measurements of authigenic uranium in NWP core 13PC. Aside from four BF-PF pairs of Shackleton et al. (1988) and the previous work of and Broecker et al. (2004, 2008) and Broecker and Clark (2010), ours are the only other deep water ventilation estimates from the Equatorial Pacific.

Whereas Okazaki et al. (2010) compiled ventilation data from the North Pacific in a time series, here we compile the data they used along with more recently published data and our new results into a single depth reconstruction, but with distinct labels for results from the NWP, NEP, EEP and WEP (Figure 5). In our analysis we consider primarily the BF-PF ventilation age, since this metric does not involve assumptions regarding reservoir age effects or calibration to calendrical age, as may be needed to estimate physical ventilation age using decay trajectories (c.f. Adkins and Boyle, 1997). Thus, plotted results are not subject to potentially significant uncertainties regarding the magnitude and spatial distribution of past surface reservoir ages, but ventilation ages with respect to the coeval atmosphere may be more variable than indicated by the reconstruction based on BF-PF age.

We also lump together all results for which any one of the associated conventional PF ^{14}C ages lies within 1σ of 15 to 25 ^{14}C ka, a relatively broad interval that includes both the LGM and H-1. The approach is deliberately inclusive so as to maximize the number of (still relatively sparse) observations under consideration and because climatically and oceanographically significant events documented elsewhere are not always well resolved in the Pacific Ocean. For example H-1 is not directly evident in the Pacific as an armada of icebergs and is otherwise difficult to identify with certainty. Furthermore, as has been noted previously (Keigwin et al., 1992; Skinner and Shackleton, 2005), Pacific BF $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data lag Atlantic data because of the long interbasin transit time, so from that perspective the end of the LGM in the deep Pacific is younger than in the Atlantic. Glaciological evidence from Hawaii indicates the LGM persisted in the North Pacific until about 15 ka (Blard et al., 2007).

The glacial BF-PF ventilation age results are given in Figure 5 along with an estimate of the basin-wide average $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ in modern seawater (solid red line, upper X axis scale) by depth from the World Ocean Circulation Experiment (<http://cdiac.ornl.gov/oceans/glodap/>), and were averaged over the North Pacific between the Equator and 55°N by R. M. Key (pers. comm.). Data used in making Figure 5 are listed as SOM Table 1. Equivalent sea water ^{14}C ages (open red symbols) are effectively relative to that of the pre-nuclear, pre-industrial atmosphere and have been corrected by 400 yrs for presentation on the BF-PF age scale (lower X axis). Formal uncertainties for the apparent ventilation ages were described earlier and are listed in Table 2; a more realistic assessment may be provided by the observed spread in BF-PF age differences for different cores from similar depths in the same ocean region or, (for the new results) for different BF species sampled at or near the same stratigraphic level. Since the glacial data span a relatively large age interval, some of the observed spread may reflect authentic time dependent variability of BF-PF ventilation age. As we will show below, however, plausible time-dependent variations (i.e., Okazaki et al. 2010) do not appear to have influenced the overall structure of the BF-PF depth profile.

Despite the observed scatter, the glacial age sediment data are roughly consistent with the modern sea water ^{14}C profile at depths above ~ 3.2 km (Figure 5). A distinctive break relative to the modern profile occurs about 3.1 km in the sediment results from the Equatorial Pacific; data between 1.9 and 3 km average 1610 ± 250 yrs, whereas deeper data fall consistently on the “old” side of the modern profile, with an average BF-PF ventilation age of 3080 ± 1125 yrs. Taken at face value, these results record a pronounced abyssal front between shallower, well ventilated waters and deeper, poorly ventilated waters in the Equatorial Pacific at a modern water depth of 3.0 to 3.2 km. The

impression of a front is reinforced by consistency of equatorial Pacific and North Pacific results above 3.0 km. Four BF-PF pairs from 3.2 km in the EEP (Shackleton et al. 1988) are consistent with a front at or just above this depth (SOM Fig. 2), but are excluded from Fig. 5 since, unlike the other EEP data, they are based on PF measurements in *N. dutertrei* which may be biased old (potentially reducing BF-PF with respect to other data shown) (Barker et al., 2007). Inclusion of these data would yield a deep Equatorial Pacific BF-PF average of 2890 ± 1100 yr.

In order to evaluate the possible influence of time-dependent variation in our reconstruction, we separate glacial results into two age classes, greater or less than $\sim 19.6 \pm 0.4$ calendar ka, corresponding to the transition to younger BF-PF ventilation age documented above ~ 3 km in the North Pacific (Okazaki et al. 2010). This age break corresponds to conventional PF ^{14}C ages greater or less than 17.0 ^{14}C ka in our results (Table 2), with an age spread after calibration that incorporates large uncertainty in the surface reservoir age (ΔR of 0-600 in CALIB 7.1, after Stuiver and Reimer 1993) but which nevertheless securely identifies samples older than the transition indicated by Okazaki et al. (2010). For the deep Equatorial Pacific, there is no statistically significant difference of BF-PF age for pre- and post transition samples; “pre-transition” samples are 2850 ± 870 yr ($n=9$) and “post-transition” samples are 3440 ± 1440 yr ($n=6$) and 2920 ± 750 yr ($n=5$) when the oldest (6050 yr) sample is excluded. Most importantly, the large contrast with results above and below 3.1 km is maintained both within and across the two age classes, as can be seen in separately annotated symbols in Figure 5. We also note that some of the time-dependent variation reconstructed by Okazaki et al. (2010) may relate to changes in the range of depths represented by their core selection, since the largest BF-PF ages in the North Pacific appear to be in “pre-transition” samples from 2.4 to 2.9 km.

Any possible northern manifestation of poorly ventilated waters within the deep N. Pacific remains difficult to evaluate from our compilation of results. Above ~ 3.1 km, both the northern and Equatorial Pacific measurements indicate similar BF-PF ventilation ages. This is likely a robust finding, since similar methods were employed in both areas (most NWP results used our methods; Cook and Keigwin, 2015). Below ~ 3.1 km, there is a paucity of glacial BF-PF age pairs from the northern N. Pacific that meet our criteria for co-deposition (within 1 cm). Of these, 2 come from the relatively brief “middle H-1” ventilation event documented in the NEP by Rae et. al. (2014) and, they suggest, these were associated with a dramatic increase in the surface ocean reservoir age (leading to under-representation of the actual deep water ^{14}C age from BF-PF age pairs). We note that many of the deepest northern N. Pacific

cores come from areas where today the surface ocean reservoir age appears to be locally elevated (see map of core depths vs. estimated pre-nuclear surface water ^{14}C age in Supplementary online Figure 1. If the estimated recent, pre-nuclear reservoir age distribution (Rubin and Key, 2002) reflects the potential for locally- or regionally- anomalous increases in reservoir age during the glacial and/or deglacial periods, results from deeper N. Pacific cores in Fig. 5 may under-represent actual deep water ^{14}C ages with respect to the larger number of records available from above ~ 3.1 km. Nonetheless, there is as yet no clear ^{14}C evidence for excessive glacial aging of deep waters in the northern N. Pacific. The single new BF-PF age pair characterizing the deep NWP, as noted in section 3.2, ultimately required sampling of the archive half of Vinogradov 37GGC in order to obtain enough *Uvigerina* for dating. Given that this is the only result for the deep NWP, more work in the region is clearly needed.

Radiocarbon data from the LGM of the subtropical western North Atlantic indicate apparent ventilation ages of only about 1500 years in cores as deep as 4.7 km (Keigwin, 2004). Evidently the very old deep water we find in the Equatorial Pacific Ocean did not extend substantially unmixed into the deep western North Atlantic. In the South Atlantic at ~ 3.8 km Skinner et al. (2010) also measured LGM BF-PF ventilation ages of about 1500 years. However, they also identified large changes in the surface reservoir age, suggesting that that deep South Atlantic benthic ^{14}C ages were 3500 to 4000 yrs older than the coeval atmosphere during the LGM. Values in this range were maintained for ~ 6 kyr, with a maximum at ~ 19 calendar ka BP. In Figure 5 we show prior estimates of $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ (vs. coeval atmosphere) for these data as a box centered at 3.8 km depth to represent a likely end-member value for Lower Circumpolar Deep Water (LCDW) (Burke and Robinson, 2012). Projection of these results from the $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ (vs. atmosphere) axis onto the BF-PF age axis carries some uncertainties related to possible local deviations from mean ocean surface reservoir age, but the overall impression is that both the deep Equatorial Pacific and deep Southern Ocean were comparably aged during much of the LGM. We thus posit a direct connection between the two locations via mixing with LCDW as in the present day ocean, implying that similarly old waters may have had a circumpolar distribution during part or all of the glacial period.

Thus, we argue that both the Southern Ocean (Skinner et al. 2015), and much of the world's most voluminous ocean basin harbored a potentially vast reservoir of old carbon. Broecker et al. (2004) estimated that the volume and degree of deep ocean ^{14}C depletion needed to account for the equilibrium change in $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ of glacial atmosphere and remaining portions of the ocean was much larger than seemed plausible given existing observational constraints.

However, Burke and Robinson (2012) suggest that recent observations of abyssal depletion during the LGM, comparable in degree to those documented here, would be sufficient to account for subsequent transient depletion of the atmosphere and surface ocean during deglaciation. The complementary observations of deglacial atmospheric $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ and CO_2 change (Machitto et al. 2007) suggest a common cause relating to improved ventilation of the ocean's deepest waters (Toggweiler et al., 2006).

CONCLUSIONS

Our study of deep ocean ventilation ages based on the difference in ^{14}C ages of coexisting benthic and planktonic foraminifera in cores from the deep Equatorial Pacific and Northwest Pacific reveals the following:

1. Maxima in absolute abundance of benthic foraminifera are common in both the NWP and most Equatorial Pacific sites during the Holocene, the deglaciation, and the glacial period. They appear to be related to higher fertility during glaciation in the EEP and during deglaciation in both regions. Abundance of planktonic foraminifera is lowest in the late Holocene, intermediate during the glacial, and highest during deglaciation.
2. In the EEP, paired ^{14}C measurements of *G. sacculifera* and *G. ruber* do not reveal systematic differences of age that might arise from ecological preferences or differential dissolution in the sediment mixed layer. Variations in the sign and magnitude of inter-species age differences can be attributed largely to bioturbation.
3. Our few Holocene apparent ventilation ages from the EEP fall in the 1000 to 2000 year range, similar to today. However, deglacial and glacial values are both larger and more variable (1500 to 6000 years), with a mean of ~ 3100 yrs that is greater than anything observed previously in the shallower Equatorial and North Pacific. Data above about 2 km indicate slightly younger ventilation ages compared to the modern (GLODAP) mean sea water depth ^{14}C profile for the same region. A large contrast of apparent ventilation age (~ 1500 yrs) above and below 3.1 km in the Equatorial Pacific is emphasized by comparison to the modern data, suggesting a front in BF-PF ventilation age near that depth.
4. The large BF-PF ^{14}C differences for >3.1 km in the glacial equatorial Pacific indicate bottom waters that may be comparably aged to the Lower Circumpolar Deep Water in the South Atlantic. Thus, there may have been a

600 circupolar distribution of old water that extended as far as the equatorial Pacific
601 and that was likely sufficient to have caused the transient decrease in
602 atmospheric radiocarbon activity during deglaciation.

603 604 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

605 We thank Mary Carman for helping prepare samples for geochemical
606 analysis, Al Gagnon for providing the stable isotope data, and the staffs at
607 NOSAMS and UC Irvine for radiocarbon measurements. Chad Wolak and
608 Patrick Cappa assisted with sample preparation at the Univ. of Colorado. Bob
609 Key has been especially generous with his time in compiling North Pacific
610 WOCE data for our reconstructions. We also thank Ning Zhao for providing
611 ¹⁴C results from EEP core 24J, and Colin Lindsay for preparing the
612 supplementary figure. We are also grateful to the curators at HIG, OSU, and
613 SIO for carefully sampling cores in their collections. The manuscript was
614 greatly improved by the thoughtful comments of Luke Skinner and an
615 anonymous reviewer. This work was funded by NSF grants OCE-1031224 and
616 OCE-0424861 to LDK and 0851391 to SJL.

Figure and Table Captions

Table 1. Equatorial and North Pacific locations discussed in this paper.

Table 2. Accelerator Mass Spectrometer results generated as part of this study. Glacial interval data used in Figure 5 are shown in bold.

Table 3: PF ^{14}C age pair agreement expressed as either *G. ruber* – *G. sacculifer* relative or absolute deviation, in ^{14}C yr. Absolute deviations are independent of sign.

Figure 1. Location of a depth transect of sediment cores down the East Pacific Rise, and (inset) other core sites from the Equatorial and North Pacific used in ventilation reconstructions in this paper. Note that we were unable to get a meaningful isotope stratigraphy from core GS7202-15.

Figure 2. Stable isotope ratios and ^{14}C dates (top row), BF abundance data (middle row), and age-depth data with ventilation ages (bottom row) for 6 Equatorial Pacific cores. Shaded interval marks extent of the glacial interval as defined by PF ^{14}C ages between 15 and 25 ka, $\pm 1 \sigma$. In the stable isotope row, *Cibicidoides* $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ are solid and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ are open circles. In the middle and bottom rows, *Uvigerina* data are solid black circles, *Cibicidoides* data are green squares, *N. umbonifera* are open triangles. In the bottom row, *G. ruber* data are plotted in red, and *G. sacculifer* data are plotted in blue.

Figure 3. Planktonic foraminiferal abundance for the four Equatorial Pacific cores with highest accumulate rates. The left hand axis shows abundance per gram of *G. ruber* (red triangles) and *G. sacculifera* (blue squares), and the right axis shows the abundance of total planktonic foraminifera (black). Note that the *Globigerinoides* species are about 10% of the planktonic fauna. Shaded interval marks the extent of the glacial interval, and green lines indicate samples where apparent ventilation ages were determined.

Figure 4. Oxygen isotope ratios, benthic foraminiferal abundances and ^{14}C results on two cores from the northern Emperor Seamounts, northwest Pacific Ocean, as in Figure 2. Top row: solid symbols are the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and abundance of *Uvigerina*, open symbols are the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of *Uvigerina*, and red symbols are $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ of *N. pachyderma* s. The data indicate the upper 30 cm of core 13PC may be disturbed, by comparison to the data from the pilot core (13PG) shown as squares. Middle row shows *Uvigerina* abundance, and bottom row shows BF and PF ^{14}C dates in age-depth format.

Figure 5. Glacial BF-PF ventilation ages from different Pacific Ocean regions (legend, solid symbols) vs. present day sediment core depth along with average modern seawater $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ (solid red line, corresponding to upper X axis) and ^{14}C age (open red symbols, corresponding to lower X axis) for the North Pacific (R. Key pers. comm.) as described in the text. Seawater ^{14}C ages have been adjusted by 400 yrs for presentation on the BF-PF age difference scale. Solid BF-PF data points with white centers are those that are older than $\sim 19.6 \pm 0.4$ calendar ka, corresponding to ~ 17.0 ^{14}C ka. A previous estimate

of glacial Lower Circumpolar Deep Water (LCDW) $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ vs. atmosphere (Skinner et al. 2010) is given for comparison (Burke and Robinson 2012).

SOM Figure 1. Map of estimated surface reservoir ages (contours, in years) for the pre-nuclear era (from GLODAP; see Section 4.3 for details) for waters overlying core sites used in our reconstruction of LGM ventilation. The core sites are color-coded according to depth.

SOM Figure 2. This figure is identical to Figure 5, except that it includes the 4 BF-PF ventilation pairs from Shackleton et al. (1988).

Figure 1

FIGURES

Figure 2a

Figure 2b

Figure 3

Figure 4

Figure 5

Table 1. Equatorial and North Pacific locations discussed in this paper.

Core	Depth (m)	Latitude	Longitude
ME0005-24JC	2941	0.022°N	086.463°W
GS7202-15	2986	3.267°N	097.833°W
PLDS 7G	3253	3.338°S	102.453°W
VNTR01 10GC	3410	4.507°S	102.015°W
KNR73 3PC	3606	0.374°S	106.179°W
KNR73 4PC	3681	1.848°N	110.268°W
KNR73 6PG	3806	4.002°N	114.187°W
S67 15FFC	4250	1.608°S	162.558°E
RNDB 10PC	2364	51.296°N	167.665°E
RNDB 11PC	3225	51.073°N	167.975°E

Table 2. Accelerator Mass Spectrometer results generated as part of this study. Glacial interval data used in Figure 5 are shown in bold.

core name	water depth, m	core interval	taxa	Accession number	Conventiona 14C age, yrs	error 1s	mean PF age	mean pair uncertainty	RMS on PF pairs*	BF-PF	RMS on BF-PF
DSDP 480	655	1-1, 109-112 cm	Uvigerina	OS-47995	17,650	120				650	177
"	"	"	G.b., N.p.d.	WHG-184	17,000	130					
RNDB 13PG	2380	5-7	G. bulloides	OS-100199	9,550	40				1,550	64
"	"	13	Uvigerina	OS-100200	12,000	50					
"	"	"	G. bulloides	OS-99821	10,450	40					
"	"	13.5	G. bulloides	OS-66096	10,000	55					
RNDB 13PC	2380	16	U. peregrina	OS-66200	7,690	45				-630	57
"	"	15-17	G. bulloides	OS-71380	8,320	35					
"	"	27.5	Uvigerina	OS-100201	9,780	45				-670	60
"	"	"	G. bulloides	OS-99822	10,450	40					
"	"	52.5	U. peregrina	OS-66097	14,800	65				1,700	96
"	"	"	G. bulloides	OS-66098	13,100	70					
"	"	60.5-61.5	pachy + bullo	CAMS 130534	13,660	90					
"	"	"	Uvigerina	OS-56810	16,000	85				2,340	124
"	"	70.5-71.5	U. hispid	OS-71383	15,650	95				2,650	118
"	"	"	G. bulloides	OS-71384	13,000	70					
"	"	72	Uvigerina	OS-99826	14,900	75				1,850	90
"	"	"	G. bulloides	OS-99823	13,050	50					
"	"	80.5	Uvigerina	OS-44153	17,350	90				1,450	108
"	"	"	N. pachy s.		15,900	60					
"	"	100-101	U. hispid	OS-71381	20,100	160				2,600	194
"	"	"	N. pachy s.	OS-71382	17,500	110					
"	"	107-109	N. pachy s.	OS-99827	19,650	110					
RNDB 5GGC	2804	75-77	Uvigerina	OS-44155	21,900	160				2,450	200
"	"	"	N.p.s.	OS-44154	19,450	120					
ME0005-24JC	2941	290-292	G. ruber + sacc	OS-112029	15,300	70					
"	"	290-292	mixed BF	OS-112030	16,950	80				1,650	106
"	"	352-354	G. sacculifera	OS-112031	18,400	95					
"	"	352-354	mixed BF	OS-112032	20,400	170				2,000	195
RNDB 11PC	3225	65	Uvigerina	OS-99824	14,250	55				1,150	74
"	"	"	G. bulloides	OS-99825	13,100	50					
"	"	71.5-72.5	G. bulloides	CAMS-130532	13,080	60					
"	"	"	Uvigerina	OS-57609	14,400	85				1,320	104
"	"	75.5-76.5	G. bulloides	CAMS-130533	13,140	70					
"	"	"	Uvigerina	OS-57485	14,200	80				1,060	106
"	"	108-112	Uvigerina	OS-40772	16,650	110				1,700	139
"	"	108-109	N.p.s.	OS-40773	14,950	85					
PLDS 7G	3253	37-38	Uvigerina	OS-97443	16,800	110				2,650	130
"	"	"	Cibicidoides	OS-97444	17,400	120				3,250	139
"	"	"	G. ruber	OS-97721	14,100	60	14,150	70	100		
"	"	"	G. sacc.	OS-97445	14,200	80					
"	"	42-43	Uvigerina	OS-97446	19,700	150				3,275	186
"	"	"	Cibicidoides	OS-97447	19,100	150				2,675	186
"	"	"	G. ruber	OS-97448	16,150	100	16,425	110	156		
"	"	"	G. sacc.	OS-97449	16,700	120					
"	"	48-49	Uvigerina	OS-97450	20,400	160				2,725	197
"	"	"	Cibicidoides	OS-97451	20,600	160				2,925	197
"	"	"	G. ruber	OS-97452	18,000	120	17,675	115	163		
"	"	"	G. sacc.	OS-97453	17,350	110					
VNTR01-10GGC	3410	30-31	G. sacc.	OS-95335	12,200	45	12,025	58	83		
"	"	"	G. ruber	OS-95343	11,850	70					
"	"	34-35	G. sacc.	OS-95342	14,250	55	14,175	55	78		
"	"	34-35	G. ruber	OS-95160	14,100	55					
"	"	34-35	Cibicidoides	OS-95422	18,400	100				4,225	114
"	"	46-47	G. sacc.	OS-95333	22,100	85	22,200	88	124		
"	"	46-47	G. ruber	OS-95159	22,300	90					
"	"	46-47	Uvigerina	OS-95418	24,300	130				2,100	157
"	"	46-47	Cibicidoides	OS-95168	25,700	130				3,500	157
"	"	50-51	G. sacc.	OS-95161	26,200	120	25,750	125			
"	"	"	G. ruber	OS-95332	25,300	130					
KNR73 3PC	3606	22-23	G. sacculifera	NSRL-18131	3,555	15				581	
"	"	22-23	N. umbonifera	NSRL-18137	5,605	25				2,050	582
"	"	31-32	G. ruber	NSRL-18133	6,830	25	6,620	23	32		
"	"	31-32	G. sacculifera	NSRL-18132	6,410	20					
"	"	31-32	N. umbonifera	NSRL-18136	8,070	30				1,450	38
"	"	64-66	Uvigerina	NSRL-14565	17,470	110				2,743	127
"	"	65-67	Cibicidoides	NSRL-14566	17,690	90				2,963	110
"	"	65-66	G. ruber	NSRL-14567	14,610	80	14,728	63	92		
"	"	65-66	G. sacculifera	NSRL-14568	14,845	45					
"	"	80-82	N. umbonifera	NSRL-18134	24,630	230				2,250	298
"	"	81-82	G. ruber	NSRL-14569	22,160	190	22,380	190	269		
"	"	81-82	G. sacculifera	NSRL-14570	22,600	190					
"	"	89-90	G. ruber	NSRL-14571	25,240	250	25,520	240	340		
"	"	89-90	G. sacculifera	NSRL-14572	25,800	230					
"	"	89-91	N. umbonifera	NSRL-18135	28,240	420				2,720	484
KNR73 4PC	3681	17.5-18.5	N. umbonifera	NSRL-16555	6,235	40				1,065	582
"	"	17.5-18.5	G. sacculifera	NSRL-16556	5,170	15					
"	"	27.5-28.5	G. ruber	NSRL-16557	6,695	25	6,488	23	32		
"	"	27.5-28.5	G. sacculifera	NSRL-16558	6,280	20					
"	"	27.5-28.5	N. umbonifera	NSRL-16559	8,450	50				1,963	55
"	"	42.5-44.5	Uvigerina	NSRL-16560	16,350	70				5,785	75
"	"	42.5-43.5	G. sacculifera	NSRL-16562	10,755	25	10,565	28	39		
"	"	42.5-43.5	G. ruber	NSRL-16563	10,375	30					
"	"	43.5-44.5	G. ruber	NSRL-16564	11,920	45	12,010	38	54		
"	"	43.5-44.5	G. sacculifera	NSRL-16565	12,100	30					
"	"	43.5-44.5	Cibicidoides	NSRL-16561	16,920	130				4,910	135
"	"	53.5-56.5	N. umbonifera	OS-52610	21,600	110				6,050	133
"	"	53-56	Uvigerina	OS- 61025	17,350	85				1,800	113
"	"	53.5-56.5	Cibicidoides	OS-52618	18,600	90				3,050	117
"	"	53.5-56.5	G. sacculifera	OS-52617	15,500	75	15,550	75	106		
"	"	53.5-56.5	G. ruber	OS-52619	15,600	75					

Table 3: PF 14C age pair agreement expressed as either *G. ruber* – *G. sacculifer* relative or absolute deviation, in 14C yr

Quantity:	<i>n</i>	Mean (±SD) of relative deviation	Mean (±SD) of absolute deviation
All pairs	17	94 ± 856	581 ± 619
0 – 10 ka	2	418 ± 4	418 ± 4
10 – 15 ka	6	-233 ± 112	233 ± 112
15 – 25 ka	7	59 ± 745	587 ± 396
15 – 26 ka	9	239 ± 1152	850 ± 761