**Convergent evidence for the causal involvement of anterior superior temporal gyrus in
auditory single-word comprehension**

Iain DeWitt^a & Josef P. Rauschecker^b

^aBrain Imaging and Modeling Section
NIH/NIDCD
Bldg. 10, Rm. 5D39
10 Center Drive, MSC 1402
Bethesda, MD 20892-1402
USA
+1 301 594 7757
iain.dewitt@nih.gov

^bDepartment of Neuroscience
Georgetown University Medical Center
3970 Reservoir Road NW
New Research Building-WP19
Washington, DC 20007
USA
+1 202 687 8842
rauschej@georgetown.edu

The authors are co-corresponding authors.

1
2
3
4 Although the neural substrates of auditory word recognition have been a topic of inquiry since the
5 heyday of classical neurology (Wernicke, 1874), they remain poorly understood (Bogen &
6 Bogen, 1976; DeWitt & Rauschecker, 2013). The arc of development in classical models was
7 increasingly to propose Wernicke's area, the site of auditory word-form recognition, to lie along
8 the posterior aspect of the superior temporal gyrus (STG) (DeWitt & Rauschecker, 2013).
9 Appreciation of the dual-stream organization of primate auditory cortex (Rauschecker & Scott,
10 2009; Rauschecker & Tian, 2000) initiated a challenge to this perspective, resulting in a
11 reformulation of models of language organization in humans (Binder et al., 2000; Hickok &
12 Poeppel, 2007; Wise et al., 2001). The preponderance of evidence from human functional
13 imaging studies now sites auditory word recognition in anterior STG, near the anterior-lateral
14 aspect of Heschl's gyrus, part of the auditory ventral stream (DeWitt & Rauschecker, 2012).
15 Although findings from lesion studies generally support this conclusion, results from key
16 experiments, namely, those specifically relating lesion site to auditory single-word
17 comprehension, have been lacking (DeWitt & Rauschecker, 2013). A pair of recent studies
18 contributes toward filling this gap (Mesulam, Thompson, Weintraub, & Rogalski, 2015; Roux et
19 al., 2015).

20
21 Roux et al. (2015) report findings from intraoperative stimulation mapping in 90 patients
22 at 2754 cortical sites, extensively sampling STG, supramarginal gyrus (SMG), middle temporal
23 gyrus (MTG), and angular gyrus (AG). Three striking findings emerge from the study (see Figure
24 1A): First, although MTG was extensively surveyed, it was found to be uninvolved in auditory
25 single-word comprehension, as indexed by performance on auditory word-to-picture matching.
26 Second, although stimulation of several SMG/AG sites impaired comprehension, the dominant
27 finding was for comprehension to be impaired by STG stimulation (see Figure 1A, inset).

28
29 Third, analysis of error types shows an anterior-oriented processing hierarchy within
30 STG. Performance on auditory word-to-picture matching involves (i) auditory word-form
31 recognition, (ii) retrieval of the word-form's semantic referents, and (iii) association of one of the
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1 referents to a visual depiction thereof. Roux et al. (2015) classified errors as either “speech
2 discrimination/word deafness errors,” indicating a putative failure to resolve an auditory word-
3 form from sensory input, or “lexical-semantic errors,” indicating putative failure to associate an
4 accurately perceived word-form with a visual depiction of its semantic referent. Word-form
5 analysis (transient word deafness) was associated with mid-to-anterior STG (Figure 1A, yellow
6 markers) while semantic retrieval (matching error) was associated with anterior STG (Figure 1A,
7 orange markers), indicating an anterior orientation in the major processing pathway.

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20 Roux et al.’s (2015) findings complement a recent report from Mesulam et al. (2015).
21
22 Mesulam et al. (2015) quantified cortical atrophy in 67 patients with primary progressive aphasia
23 (PPA) and related that atrophy to auditory single-word comprehension, again via performance on
24 auditory word-to-picture matching. Despite atrophy being present throughout the frontal lobe,
25 temporal lobe and inferior parietal lobule (IPL) in the patient sample, only anterior temporal lobe
26 (ATL) atrophy, *in toto*, was correlated with auditory single-word comprehension (see Figure 1B).
27
28 The correlation of auditory single-word comprehension with ATL atrophy *in toto*, however, may
29 be an artifact of high local spatial correlation in individual patient’s atrophy patterns or an artifact
30 of a common pattern of progression (e.g., involving polar sites early in the progression). A
31 conservative inference would assume a more circumscribed area within the ATL atrophy region
32 to be driving the mapped correlation.

33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44 That Mesulam et al. (2015) did not find atrophy associated with comprehension deficits
45 to extend through mid STG, as found in Roux et al. (2015), may reflect behavioral inclusion
46 criteria that intentionally biased the sample toward high-functioning patients (i.e., few cases
47 exhibiting word deafness). Consistent with this, none of the patients performed at floor level on
48 the auditory comprehension task. Therefore, although definitive conclusion cannot be reached,
49 the atrophy reported by Mesulam et al. (2015) more likely reflects errors in semantic retrieval.
50
51 These considerations place the findings of Mesulam et al. (2015) and Roux et al. (2015) in good
52 agreement.

Mesulam et al.'s (2015) report further dissociates cortical areas supporting syntactic aspects of sentence comprehension from areas involved in auditory single-word comprehension, finding syntactic processing deficits to be associated with IPL lesions in PPA patients, as has been similarly documented in stroke patients (Thothathiri, Kimberg, & Schwartz, 2012). This affirms a role for the dorsal stream in syntactic processing and language evolution (Bornkessel-Schlesewsky & Schlesewsky, 2013; Bornkessel-Schlesewsky et al., 2015; DeWitt & Rauschecker, 2013; Friederici, 2012) and clarifies the role of anterior STG as being chiefly involved in word recognition.

Together, Roux et al. (2015) and Mesulam et al. (2015) provide compelling evidence for the causal involvement of anterior STG in auditory single-word comprehension. Specifically, semantic retrieval appears to depend upon the integrity of STG in a region immediately anterior to the anterior-lateral aspect of Heschl's gyrus. This comports with results from functional imaging (see Figure 1C,D, this commentary) (DeWitt & Rauschecker, 2012) and with an anterior-oriented model of the auditory ventral stream, where auditory word-form recognition occurs in mid-to-anterior STG and semantic retrieval occurs in anterior STG. Further, these regions are dissociated from higher-order aspects of comprehension, namely, syntactic processing.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the National Institute of Deafness and Communication Disorders Intramural Research Program (I.D.), the National Science Foundation (grants BCS-0519127 and OISE-0730255, J.P.R.), the National Institutes of Health (grants R01DC03489 and R01NS052494, J.P.R.) and the Technische Universität München–Institute for Advanced Study (funded by the German Excellence Initiative and the European Union Seventh Framework Programme agreement n° 291763, J.P.R.).

Figure Captions

Figure 1. Semantic retrieval in auditory single-word comprehension is associated with the integrity of anterior STG function, as found in stimulation mapping (A, orange markers) and lesion-symptom mapping (B). Auditory word-form recognition is associated with mid-to-anterior STG, as found in stimulation mapping (A, yellow markers) and meta-analysis of functional imaging (C, D). The meta-analytic results depicted are RGB overlap maps for effects of repetition suppression for phonemes (C, red shading) and auditory words (C, green shading), as well as for tests of speech-related combination sensitivity (D, red shading), invariant representation (D, green shading) and areal specialization (D, blue shading). Notably, when a probability density function is estimated for the reported stimulation mapping foci (A), peak density is found along STG, excluding the most posterior aspect of STG, with the global peak in anterior STG (A, inset). Together, these results imply a processing hierarchy for phonemes, word-forms and semantic retrieval that extends along STG in an anterior-oriented gradient. Adapted from (DeWitt & Rauschecker, 2012; Mesulam et al., 2015; Roux et al., 2015).

References

- Binder, J R, Frost, J A, Hammeke, T A, Bellgowan, P S, Springer, J A, Kaufman, J N, & Possing, E T. (2000). Human temporal lobe activation by speech and nonspeech sounds. *Cereb Cortex*, 10, 512-528.
- Bogen, J E, & Bogen, G M. (1976). Wernicke's region, where is it? *Ann New York Acad Sci*, 280, 834-843. doi: 10.1111/j.1749-6632.1976.tb25546.x
- Bornkessel-Schlesewsky, Ina, & Schlesewsky, Matthias. (2013). Reconciling time, space and function: A new dorsal-ventral stream model of sentence comprehension. *Brain Lang*, 125, 60-76. doi: 10.1016/j.bandl.2013.01.010
- Bornkessel-Schlesewsky, I., Schlesewsky, M., Small, S.L., Rauschecker, J.P. (2015) Neurobiological roots of language in primate audition: common computational properties. *Trends Cogn Sci*, 19,142-150.
- DeWitt, Iain, & Rauschecker, Josef P. (2012). Phoneme and word recognition in the auditory ventral stream. *Proc Nat Acad Sci USA*, 109, E505-514. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1113427109
- DeWitt, Iain, & Rauschecker, Josef P. (2013). Wernicke's area revisited: Parallel streams and word processing. *Brain Lang*, 127, 181-191. doi: 10.1016/j.bandl.2013.09.014
- Friederici, Angela D. (2012). The cortical language circuit: from auditory perception to sentence comprehension. *Trends Cogn Sci*, 16, 262-268. doi: 10.1016/j.tics.2012.04.001
- Hickok, Gregory, & Poeppel, David. (2007). The cortical organization of speech processing. *Nat Rev Neurosci*, 8, 393-402. doi: 10.1038/nrn2113
- Mesulam, M Marsel, Thompson, Cynthia K, Weintraub, Sandra, & Rogalski, Emily J. (2015). The Wernicke conundrum and the anatomy of language comprehension in primary progressive aphasia. *Brain*, in press. doi: 10.1093/brain/awv154
- Rauschecker, Josef P, & Scott, Sophie K. (2009). Maps and streams in the auditory cortex: nonhuman primates illuminate human speech processing. *Nat Neurosci*, 12, 718-724. doi: doi:10.1038/nn.2331
- Rauschecker, Josef P, & Tian, Biao. (2000). Mechanisms and streams for processing of "what" and "where" in auditory cortex. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*, 97, 11800-11806. doi: 10.1073/pnas.97.22.11800
- Roux, Franck-Emmanuel, Miskin, Krassimir, Durand, Jean-Baptiste, Sacko, Oumar, Rehault, Emilie, Tanova, Rositsa, & Demonet, Jean Francois. (2015). Electrostimulation mapping of comprehension of auditory and visual words. *Cortex*, in press.
- Thothathiri, Malathi, Kimberg, Daniel Y, & Schwartz, Myrna F. (2012). The neural basis of reversible sentence comprehension: evidence from voxel-based lesion symptom mapping in aphasia. *J Cogn Neurosci*, 24, 212-222. doi: 10.1162/jocn_a_00118
- Wernicke, C. (1874). *Der aphasische Symptomencomplex*. Breslau: Max Cohn & Weigert.

1
2
3
4 Wise, Richard J S, Scott, S K, Blank, S C, Mummery, C J, Murphy, K, & Warburton, E A.
5 (2001). Separate neural subsystems within "Wernicke's area". *Brain*, 124, 83-
6 95.
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

Figure

Figure 1